United Nations GENERAL ASSEMBLY

TENTH SESSION Official Records



FOURTH COMMITTEE, 5

MEETING

Monday, 21 November 1955, at 10.45 a.m.

New York

CONTENTS

	Pag
Agenda item 13:	
Report of the Trusteeship Council (continued)	24

Chairman: Mr. Luciano JOUBLANC RIVAS (Mexico).

AGENDA ITEM 13

Report of the Trusteeship Council (A/2933, T/L.500, T/L.579 and Add.1, T/L.591, T/L.602, T/L.609, T/L.617) (continued)

GENERAL DEBATE (continued)

- 1. Ato Yilma DERESSA (Ethiopia) said that he had listened with interest to the Italian Observer's statement at the 514th meeting, as Ethiopia had been foremost in advocating independence and self-determination for the Trust Territory of Somaliland and, moreover, eagerly awaited the delimitation of the frontier, which had long been a danger and which had, on one occasion, nearly become a disaster threatening Ethiopia's very existence. His Government was anxious to secure Ethiopia against unlimited frontier revisions and alterations.
- 2. His delegation was dismayed to hear advanced in the Committee claims to Ethiopian territory identical with those that had contributed so much to the collapse of the organization which had preceded the United Nations and to which the Ethiopian Government had been loyally attached. The appeals for the revision of Ethiopia's southeastern frontier were being pressed in direct defiance of the treaty which determined the frontier.
- The negotiations between the Ethiopian and Italian Governments had reached the formal stage in June 1953, when the Ethiopian Minister of Foreign Affairs, noting that the earlier conversations had not yet reached the point where actual delimitation would be useful and practicable, had proposed that the two Governments should designate negotiators to discuss and establish the guiding principles as a first step. In September 1953 the Italian Government had accepted that proposal. It had thus been clear that the discussion of the guiding principles, in other words the determination or definition of the frontier line as established by the Convention between Ethiopia and Italy signed on 16 May 1908, had necessarily become the first step to be taken. His delegation had already pointed out, at the eighth and ninth sessions of the General Assembly, that the frontier line must be determined before the delimitation procedure was initiated.
- 4. It was again the Ethiopian Government which, in June 1955, had taken the initiative and asked for the

- resumption of discussions directly with the late Ambassador of Italy; consequently it was not correct to say, as the Italian Observer had done at the 514th meeting, that it was the Italian Government which was taking the initiative in the negotiations. On that occasion, the Ethiopian Minister of Foreign Affairs had stated that article 1 of the Trusteeship Agreement for Somaliland under Italian administration required that the boundaries should be determined by the international treaties concerning that Territory and that the delimitation of the frontiers should be carried out, in so far as not already completed, in conformity with those treaties. It was in that sense that the Minister of Foreign Affairs had stressed the importance of an initial stage of discussions in order to determine first the necessary guiding principles and preconditions, in other words that agreement should be reached on the interpretation of the basic Convention of 1908.
- In order to advance the negotiations as rapidly as possible, so that the delimitation envisaged in General Assembly resolution 392 (V) could be applied to the extent that the frontier provided for in the 1908 Convention had not been completely delimited, the Ethiopian Minister of Foreign Affairs had informed the late Ambassador of Italy at Addis Ababa, in June 1955, of the precise interpretation of the 1908 Convention which the Ethiopian Government had then placed and still placed on the still not delimited portion of the frontier as traced in the Convention. In order to make it possible to settle any possible differences of interpretation by negotiation, the Minister had asked the Ambassador to indicate what interpretation the Italian Government placed on the 1908 Convention. On 28 June the Ambassador had undertaken to give a reply within several days. Unfortunately, the sudden death of the Ambassador had intervened and, although the Minister had pressed for the Italian Government's view on that fundamental matter by diplomatic notes and aide-mémoires on 22 and 27 July, 16 and 25 August, 5 October and 12 November, it had not yet been communicated to the Ethiopian Government. As soon as agreement was reached on the basic principle, the Ethiopian Government considered that rapid progress could be made to complete the delimitation of the remaining portions of the frontier.
- 6. In regard to the admission of Somali representatives to the negotiations, the Ethiopian Vice-Minister of Foreign Affairs and the Italian Counsellor of Embassy had already been designated as negotiators when, in September 1955, the Italian Government had proposed the inclusion of "member-experts" in the proposed commission, without indicating whether they were being added as experts or as additional negotiators. The first view of the Ethiopian Government had been that the new proposal introduced an element of uncertainty and confusion, particularly because of the failure of the Italian Government to give a

reply on the basic issue of the interpretation of the Convention of 1908. The Ethiopian Government, in its reply to the proposal to alter the composition of the commission, had not rejected the possibility of modifying the composition of previously established commission, nor had it challenged the Italian Government's right to consult with such experts as it might wish. The fact was that it had been quite impossible to proceed with any negotiations, whatever the composition of the commission, with or without Somalis, so long as the Italian Government refused to indicate whether its interpretation of the 1908 Convention differed from that of the Imperial Ethiopian Government. If there were no differences between the two Governments as to the interpretation, there was no reason why the procedure of delimitation should not be carried out immediately. It there was a difference, the Ethiopian Government was most anxious to settle the matter by negotiation. As article 1 of the Trusteeship Agreement called for implementation of the 1908 Convention, negotiations could be carried on only if the two parties concerned indicated how they interpreted the Convention.

- 7. Nevertheless, in its desire to advance the negotiations as rapidly as possible, the Ethiopian Government had communicated to the Italian Government on 12 November its agreement to the inclusion of Somali experts in the commission, as proposed by the Italian Government, on the understanding that they should assist as experts in reaching an agreed interpretation of the provisions of the 1908 Convention in so far as they related to that portion of the frontier which was still not delimited.
- 8. He hoped that the members of the Committee would realize how difficult and delicate it was for him in New York to try to supply information about the present position of the negotiations at Addis Ababa on a subject of the greatest possible importance to his Government. His Government was confident that the negotiations would be successful and noted with satisfaction the evidence of co-operation in the Italian Observer's remark at the 514th meeting to the effect that the Italian Government was ready to resume the negotiations immediately, provided that Somali experts were included in its delegation. The Ethiopian Government had welcomed the Italian Government's declaration that it intended to discharge its responsibility fully and to pursue and complete the negotiations for the delimitation of the frontier.
- 9. The Ethiopian Government had no reason to believe that either of the two Governments concerned would fail in its task or that either of them would so fail to discharge its task as to admit failure and request the consideration of procedures that would necessarily result in protracted delays and uncertainties.
- 10. Mr. JAIPAL (India) proposed that the Ethiopian representative's statement should be reproduced *in extenso* and circulated to the members of the Committee.

There being no objections, it was so decided.1

Hearing of the representative of the Somali Youth League (continued)

At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr. Abdilrazak Haji Hussen, representative of the Somali Youth League, took a scat at the Committee table.

- 11. Mr. SAAB (Lebanon) remarked that the Committee had heard different views on the question of the frontier between Ethiopia and the Trust Territory of Somaliland. He asked the petitioner whether he could say exactly what the Somali people's wishes were.
- 12. Mr. HUSSEN (Somali Youth League) said that, in the course of the last eighteen months, his party had requested on several occasions that the negotiations should pass to the second phase provided under General Assembly resolution 392 (V), namely, a procedure of mediation, as the negotiations had produced no results in five years. The Somali people were convinced that the views of the two Governments concerned were diametrically opposed. In view of the gravity of the situation in the area it seemed unwise to spend more time in direct negotiations. The Somali people hoped that the question would be satisfactorily settled as soon as possible, regardless of the methods used.
- 13. Mr. SAAB (Lebanon) asked the petitioner his opinion on the question of languages, particularly Arabic, referred to in the Trusteeship Council's report (A/2933) and other documents.
- 14. Mr. HUSSEN (Somali Youth League) said that in a referendum carried out in 1950 the Somali people had chosen Arabic as the national language. They had not changed their minds since then. The Administering Authority seemed to be hesitant to recognize Arabic as the official language of the Territory, and particularly as the language of instruction.
- 15. The Somalis had expressed their disappointment to the Trusteeship Council and the General Assembly on many occasions. At the Trusteeship Council's sixteenth session (529th and 530th meetings) the two petitioners from Somaliland who represented the Somali Youth League and the Hisbia Dighil Mirifle, the two largest parties in the Territory, had stated that the Somali people felt that Arabic should be regarded as their official language and that it should be taught more extensively in the schools. He did not know what had been done since then.

Mr. Hussen, representative of the Somali Youth League, withdrew.

GENERAL DEBATE (continued)

- 16. Mr. ASHA (Syria) said that the aspirations of the people in most of the Trust Territories had obliged the Administering Authorities to grant them a greater voice in the administration of their country. He was convinced that of all the aspects of the colonial problem the most important was political advancement, which went hand in hand with economic, social and cultural development. To be sure, the Territories had made some progress, but even the most backward of them could not wait indefinitely to attain self-government. However, several Administering Authorities had not yet taken energetic steps to teach the peoples for whom they were responsible to govern themselves democratically.
- 17. With regard to the Trusteeship Council's report, his delegation had already, in the Council, dealt with the problems facing the Territories. He noted that administrative unions were not always in the best interests of the people concerned, who were deprived of a separate administration and made dependent on a Non-Self-Governing Territory. The Trust Territory which depended on an administrative union would

¹ Subsequently circulated as document A/C.4/321.

be in a very precarious position when it achieved its independence if it had no administrative and legislative system of its own. He also feared that administrative unions might be converted into political unions. He agreed with the Indian representative that the Standing Committee on Administrative Unions should without delay study the possible effects of administrative unions on the development of Trust Territories. He also shared the Indian representative's disappointment with regard to the Committee on Rural Economic Development of the Trust Territories, which had been unable to submit a definite report to the Council because it lacked sufficient information. That Committee dealt with questions vital to the economy of the Territories and he therefore earnestly hoped that the Administering Authorities would provide it with all relevant data.

- 18. With regard to the question of the participation of indigenous inhabitants in the Council's work, General Assembly resolution 853 (IX) on that subject had not been fully implemented. He would submit a draft resolution designed to overcome that shortcoming.
- He noted that in Tanganyika the organization of society was still based on racial stratification, but realized that the racial problem could be a source of troubles which Tanganyika had so far avoided. He hoped that the way in which the Administering Authority had governed the Territory had helped it to disprove the extremist theories of some immigrants. Tanganyika could serve as an example and show how the African majority could be accorded its rightful place in the development of the country. Regardless of the Administering Authority's policy, it should be realized that at the present time, most influence in Tanganyika was exercised by Europeans, less by Asians and least of all by Africans, despite the fact that there were 8 million Africans in the Territory, as against only 80,000 Asians and 18,000 Europeans. The Europeans did not even agree that the three groups should have equal representation. The levels of living of Africans were low, while those of Europeans seemed to be relatively high and vast economic differences existed between the two groups. Europeans also enjoyed a privileged position in the matter of education. With respect to the restrictions placed on the political activities of civil servants, he hoped, like the United Nations Visiting Mission to Trust Territories in East Africa, 1954, that the Administration would be more liberal in its treatment of junior civil servants.
- 20. With respect to the question of the Territory's association with Kenya and Uganda, he thought a periodic study should be made of the advantages of the East Africa High Commission to Tanganyika.
- 21. He noted that in Ruanda-Urundi administration was completely in the hands of Europeans. Although the decree of 14 July 1952 had improved the Territory's political structure, the representative basis of the indigenous councils should be broadened.
- 22. Somaliland under Italian administration was to achieve its independence in 1960. If the Italian Administration succeeded in its mission, it would have proved to the world that a colony could be turned into a modern democracy in a much shorter time than was generally admitted. In that connexion, he noted with satisfaction that Italy had never questioned the date on which Somaliland should become independent.
- 23. He noted that relations between Somali political parties had improved considerably and it was gratifying

- that the legislative power would be granted to the Territorial Council. However, he noted with some concern that the Administration would have the right of veto, although article 4 of the Declaration of Constitutional Principles annexed to the Trusteeship Agreement made no such provision.
- 24. The question of the frontier between the Trust Territory of Somaliland and Ethiopia was delicate, but it was vitally necessary to find a solution to it at the present session. The question had been on the agenda for more than four years, but had still not been settled by the parties concerned. That was why his delegation had proposed in the Trusteeship Council that, should the parties concerned fail to reach agreement by direct negotiations, they should have recourse to mediation (Trusteeship Council resolution 1257 (XVI)). However, in view of the statement the Ethiopian representative had just made, he wished to reserve the right to speak on the question later.
- Mr. SAAB (Lebanon) said that the underlying principle of the Trusteeship System, as might be inferred from Chapters XII and XIII of the Charter, was that man, regardless of his continent, race, religion and class, was potentially self-governing. The Trusteeship System was merely a means of translating that political potentiality into a living reality in the few parts of the world which had not yet attained selfgovernment. Freedom, both inward and outward, was represented in the Koran as God's trust to Man and to Man alone. The ultimate objective of the Trusteeship System was to make that trust a working institution in all Non-Self-Governing Territories. The System was therefore a means towards a better end. Accordingly it was a self-cancelling human institution not only because of its functional nature, but because of the developments which were taking place in the continents in which it was being applied, particularly the African continent. The rate of those developments was more rapid than could have been expected. That was best illustrated by the case of the African sovereign, who, two years previously, had deserved nothing but exile, and who had recently recovered his dignity not only as a legitimate ruler but as a moderating influence upon his own people.
- In discussing the Trusteeship Council's report, the real question was not whether a Trust Territory should become completely self-governing, but when and how it should become self-governing. That fundamental question had been answered clearly and definitely in the case of Somaliland. The Trusteeship Council unanimously agreed that the Trusteeship System was working successfully in that case. Pages 107, 110, 114 and 116 of the report contained many compliments paid to the Administering Authority on the way it was carrying out the recommendations of all United Nations organs and gradually transferring its political and administrative powers to the Somali people. The statements of the French and United Kingdom representatives on page 110, as well as the opinion of the 1954 Visiting Mission, which was mentioned on page 114, were apposite. The Mission had noted that considerable progress had been made by Somalis in acquiring parliamentary experience and ability to discuss affairs affecting their country.
- 27. In order to initiate the Somalis in the democratic art of government and to prepare them for modern administration, the Administering Authority had estab-

lished new institutes for them in Somaliland and had sent graduates to Italy for higher education and training. The political, economic, educational and territorial difficulties which still remained to be overcome did not seem to be hampering the Territory's progress towards self-government. That was due to the cooperation of able Italians, open-minded Somalis, and dedicated United Nations representatives, but it was also due to the special type of trusteeship system which was being applied. That trusteeship was exceptional in character, but its recognized effectiveness made it an example to be followed by other Trust Territories. It illustrated the great benefit of setting a time limit for the attainment of full self-government and suggested that such a self-accepted limitation should be the general rule and not the exception.

28. In view of the different conditions prevailing in the Trust Territories and the variety of approaches among the Administering Authorities, it seemed at first sight that it would be a heresy to suggest a general rule. The situation in Somaliland, which was about to become independent, differed greatly from that in New Guinea, where Australian officials were still gallantly sacrificing their lives to achieve the peaceful penetration of the Territory. The approaches of the Administering Authorities ranged from Belgian paternalim and "economism" to New Zealand's genuinely democratic liberalism. Because of those differences, the rate of evolution towards self-government could not be the same. However, the human principles directing the evolution should be identical and should be democratic.

It happened that all the Administering Authorities had a Western democratic type of government, which, despite all its shortcomings, was the best form of government that man had been able to devise. In the words of the philosopher Jacques Maritain, a genuine democracy was aware of itself and of its principles and it must be capable of defending and promoting its own conception of social and political life; it must bear within itself a common creed, the creed of freedom. A genuine democracy had a universal value which should be extended not only to all Trust Territories but to all mankind. However, the democratic Powers seemed in many cases to be the least confident in the possibility of such an extension. That was illustrated by the passages in the Council's report which showed how plurality of citizenships, the system of parity in representation, duality of institutions and administrations, and primitive tribal institutions were defended by the representatives of some Administering Authorities. Fortunately, others were successfully introducing democratic practices. The Council and the representatives of some Administering Authorities had expressed gratification with the progress achieved. In that connexion he read a passage from the United States representative's statement which appeared on page 148 of the report, as well as the Council's congratulations to New Zealand on its successful policy of encouraging the people of Western Samoa to work out an enduring system of democratic self-government, given on page 193 of the report.

30. His delegation hoped that those examples would be followed in other Trust Territories and that political, economic and educational democratization would soon be speeded up in all Trust Territories. No people, no State and no culture could in the long run be

democratic in one continent and non-democratic in another.

31. Mr. BOZOVIC (Yugoslavia) said that he had certain comments to make regarding the action taken by the Trusteeship Council on General Assembly resolutions. At the 513th meeting, the Indian representative had made certain suggestions on the point which he considered rather appropriate.

The Trusteeship Council had objected to the resolutions on the participation of the indigenous inhabitants of the Trust Territories in the work of the Trusteeship Council (resolution 554 (VI) and 653 (VII) on legal and technical grounds, but for the sake of compromise the Assembly had decided to pursue a long-term policy and had, in resolution 853 (IX), recommended provisional measures which would take the Council's difficulties into account. In particular it had recommended that visiting missions should no longer play a passive, but an active, role. The Council had noted the resolution, but despite Article 87 of the Charter, which placed it under the Assembly's authority, it had not accepted the Salvadorian proposals under which it would have instructed the Visiting Missions of 1955 accordingly.² It therefore remained for the General Assembly to express the hope that the Council would give proof of a more co-operative spirit and apply the resolution in question.

With regard to the attainment of self-government and independence by the Trust Territories, he recalled that the Assembly had invited the Council in future to devote a section of its annual report to measures taken or contemplated which were intended to lead the Territories to the attainment of self-government or independence and also to state their conclusions and recommendations on that point (resolutions 558 (VI) and 752 (VIII)). The Council had in fact devoted part III of its report for 1954 (A/2680) to a summary of information provided by the Administering Authorities on the implementation of the above resolutions, but it had decided to submit its own conclusions and recommendations in subsequent reports. The General Assembly, still anxious to compromise, had expressed the hope that it would receive those conclusions (resolution 858 (IX)); but the Council had referred the question to a committee and had not included in its present report a part corresponding to part III of its previous report. To allay the apprehensions raised by its methods the Council, it seemed to him, might at least have drafted a part III and explained once more that it had not been able to include draft recommendations for lack of time. The General Assembly, as the supreme authority of the Organization, was entitled to supervise the implementation of Chapters XII and XIII of the Charter; it also had duties to the subsidiary organs and it could create special organs to aid them in the discharge of additional duties it had imposed. That stage would perhaps be reached at a subsequent session, but for the moment the Assembly might confine itself to expressing again the hope that the Council would include a part III in its report containing recommendations and conclusions on the points at issue.

34. With regard to the dissemination of information on the United Nations and the International Trusteeship System in the Trust Territories, he agreed with

² See Official Records of the Trustceship Council, Sixteenth Session, 633rd and 634th meetings.

the Indian representative that it would be very useful to send a Trusteeship Council representative to the Territories to consider the most suitable means of promoting such dissemination jointly with the Administering Authority, the local authorities and representatives of the people.

In the matter of the time limits to be set for the attainment of self-government and independence by the Trust Territories, it was in certain cases possible, and even inevitable, that a date should be set. But in cases where circumstances did not permit such a course at present, General Assembly resolution 558 (VI) would have to be applied and an attempt would have to be made to set at least a time limit for the creation of "pre-conditions" for the attainment of self-government or independence. "Pre-conditions" would have to include free and compulsory education, both primary and secondary, universal suffrage, the creation of legislative and executive organs, measures of economic and social development and the training of indigenous civil servants. There was no danger in following such a course; it was not unrealistic and it did not imply prejudging the General Assembly's decision on the rapidity of development and the date when the Territories concerned would attain self-government or independence.

36. There were some problems common to all the Trust Territories, such as the role of non-indigenous elements and the land question. The number and influence of Europeans, particularly in Africa, was proving to be more and more a decisive factor in the determination of the Territories' future. Some of the countries were preparing to become African states; they would have to undergo, it seemed, a progressive development which would depend on the flexibility of the present Administration and the strength of the indigenous political movement. Others were taking the road towards a multi-racial state: in that case foundations would have to be laid for a new relationship between a dominant minority and a dominated majority. He asked what was to become of the privileges of the European minority, which for the present was the most powerful factor from the economic point of view. It had been said that the presence of Europeans was a sine qua non of the economic and political development of the Territories. Without wishing to minimize the European contribution, he asked how it could be explained that West Africa, where the Europeans were fewer, was politically more advanced. The facts showed that the idea of European supremacy could not ensure collaboration between the indigenous majority and the immigrant minority. The Africans said they were ready to accept Europeans and Asians in the new states as citizens enjoying the same rights as the others, or as members of minorities whose rights would be guaranteed as they were in some countries in Europe or America. It was to be hoped, in the interests of all and for the sake of world peace that Europeans and Asians would accept that idea in time.

37. The policy of consolidation of European interests was frequently supplemented by racial discrimination, whose manifestations were numerous, despite the misleading statements of Administering Authorities. Such manifestations were dangerous for relations between Africans and Europeans. His delegation had already

suggested useful ways of dissociating the Administering Authorities from the elements which encouraged prejudice; they would provide a legal basis on which the indigenous inhabitants could ask the Administering Authorities for protection.

With regard to the land question, the Administering Authorities sometimes alienated as much as 50 per cent of the land and yet maintained that they were keeping the Africans' present and future interests in mind. That claim was not convincing. They ought to take steps either to buy the land back from the Europeans and give it to the indigenous inhabitants or otherwise to assure the indigenous inhabitants a decent life. By transferring responsibilities to the indigenous inhabitants and by speeding up economic development and satisfying the aspirations of the inhabitants, the Administering Authorities would not be showing weakness; they would be proving that they respected the Charter and intended to eliminate all causes of conflict, present and future. By neglecting the evolution of the modern world, by tackling problems from a negative angle and obstinately maintaining inequality among the peoples, peaceful relations among the nations would be jeopardized.

39. Mr. JAHANBANI (Iran) considered that, compared with the provisions of the League of Nations Mandates System, those of Chapters XII and XIII of the Charter represented an undeniable step forward in the march of the peoples of the Trust Territories towards self-government. It was unfortunate, however, that after ten years of the Trusteeship System the Administering Authorities still retained almost exclusive legislative, executive and judicial powers. Indigenous inhabitants ought to play a great part in the Administration and in the legislative organs of their countries. The only advances recorded in the Council's report concerned communications, housing, medical and health services.

40. The Administering Authorities had almost ignored the Press. If those peoples were to attain independence one day, they would have to be helped to create their own media of information. The Trusteeship Council had rightly noted the absence of such media and it had done well to invite the Administering Authorities to contemplate the establishment of broadcasting stations.

The number of petitioners was increasing, which did not speak well for the Administering Authorities. The Trusteeship Council's report showed that the indigenous peoples had advanced, but their progress was still far too limited. Without underestimating the difficulties facing the Administering Authorities, he thought that a date or time limit should be set for the attainment of independence by the Trust Territories and that the United Nations and the Administering Authority concerned should seek agreement on that point. The more advanced countries should not use their superior knowledge to enslave the populations of Trust Territories or to exploit the resources of the Territories in the interests of their settlers. He would like to see the rights of the peoples of all the Trust Territories as nations recognized, and he would like to see them free and able one day soon to take their place in the United Nations.

The meeting rose at 1 p.m.