United Nations A/HRC/WG.6/23/RWA/2



Distr.: General 10 August 2015

Original: English

Human Rights Council Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review Twenty-third session 2–13 November 2015

> Compilation prepared by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights in accordance with paragraph 15 (b) of the annex to Human Rights Council resolution 5/1 and paragraph 5 of the annex to Council resolution 16/21

Rwanda

The present report is a compilation of the information contained in reports of the treaty bodies and special procedures — including observations and comments by the State concerned —, in reports of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, and in other relevant official United Nations documents. It is presented in a summarized manner owing to word-limit constraints. For the full texts, please refer to the documents referenced. The report does not contain any opinions, views or suggestions on the part of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights other than those contained in public reports and statements issued by the Office. It follows the general guidelines adopted by the Human Rights Council in its decision 17/119. Information included herein has been systematically referenced in endnotes. The report has been prepared taking into consideration the periodicity of the review, and developments during that period.





I. Background and framework

A. Scope of international obligations¹

International human rights treaties²

	Status during previous cycle	Action after review	Not ratified/not accepted
Ratification, accession or succession	ICERD (1975)	OP-CAT (2015)	ICPPED
	ICESCR (1975)		ICERD, art. 14
	ICCPR (1975)		OP-ICESCR
	ICCPR-OP 2 (2008)		ICCPR, art. 41
	CEDAW (1981)		ICCPR-OP 1
	CAT (2008)		CAT, arts. 21 and 22
	CRC (1991)		OP-CRC-IC
	OP-CRC-AC (2002)		ICRMW, arts. 76 and 77
	OP-CRC-SC (2002)		
	ICRMW (2008)		
	CRPD (2008)		
Reservations and/or declarations	OP-CRC-AC (Declaration, art 3(2), age of recruitment at 18 years, 2002)		
Complaints procedures, inquiries and urgent action ³	OP-CEDAW, art. 8 (2008)		
	CAT, art. 20 (2008)		
	OP-CRPD, art. 6 (2008)		

- 1. The United Nations country team (UNCT) stated that Rwanda was yet to ratify ICPPED even though in its universal periodic review on 24 January 2011 (2011 review),⁴ Rwanda had accepted recommendations to ratify this Convention.⁵ Rwanda had also accepted recommendations to ratify OP-CAT.⁶ Pursuant to the Depository Notification of 1 July 2015, OP-CAT will enter into force on 30 July 2015.⁷
- 2. In 2013, the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR) encouraged Rwanda to ratify OP-ICESCR⁸ and ICPPED⁹. In 2013, the Committee on the Rights of the Child (CRC) encouraged Rwanda to ratify OP-CRC-IC.¹⁰
- 3. In 2012, the Committee against Torture (CAT) recommended that Rwanda makes the declarations pursuant to articles 21 and 22 of the Convention. In 2012, the Committee on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (CMW) invited Rwanda to make the declarations pursuant to articles 76 and 77 of the Convention.
- 4. In 2011, the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (CERD) urged Rwanda to ratify ILO Convention No. 169 concerning Indigenous and Tribal Peoples in Independent Countries. ¹³ CESCR encouraged the ratification of ILO Convention No. 189

concerning Decent Work for Domestic Workers.¹⁴ CMW invited Rwanda to ratify ILO Conventions Nos. 97, 143 and 181.¹⁵

Other main relevant international instruments

	Status during previous cycle	Action after review	Not ratified
Ratification, accession or	Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide		
succession	Palermo Protocol ¹⁶		
	Conventions on refugees and stateless persons ¹⁷		Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court
	Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949 and Additional Protocols I and II ¹⁸		Additional Protocol III to the 1949 Geneva Conventions ²⁰
	ILO fundamental conventions ¹⁹		ILO Conventions Nos. 169 and 189 ²¹
	UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education		

B. Constitutional and legislative framework

- 5. UNCT stated that defamation had not been decriminalised, in accordance with the recommendation received at the 2011 review.²² UNESCO recommended that Rwanda decriminalize defamation, with provision for defamation in the civil code.²³
- 6. CRC welcomed and CAT noted the adoption of Organic Law N° 01/2012/OL, instituting the Penal Code. ²⁴ CRC recommended bringing the Penal Code in full compliance with OP-CRC-SC. ²⁵ CERD recommended the inclusion of provisions in the Penal Code to give full effect to article 4 of the Convention. ²⁶
- 7. CRC welcomed the adoption of Law N°54/2011 relating to the Rights and Protection of the Child.²⁷ It recommended that Rwanda implements child-related laws;²⁸ enforces legislation for the protection of children from all forms of offences covered by OP-CRC-SC;²⁹ and explicitly criminalize the recruitment, and use in hostilities, of children under 18 years.³⁰
- 8. CMW noted the adoption of Law No. 04/2011 on immigration to and emigration from Rwanda,³¹ and recommended that Rwanda brings that Law in conformity with the Convention with a view to decriminalizing immigration offences committed by migrant workers or members of their families.³²
- 9. CERD expressed concern that the definition of "the ideology of genocide" under article 2 of Law No. 18/2008 was too broad, and recommended revising the Law by providing for a more specific definition and to include intention as an element of this crime.³³
- 10. The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) stated that the Refugee Law of 2014 lacked key provisions, such as non-penalization upon entry and UNHCR's supervisory responsibility and observer status in the National Refugee Status Determination Committee (NRSDC).³⁴ It recommended amending the Law to include those provisions,³⁵ as well as provisions obliging the Directorate General of Immigration and Emigration to submit all asylum claims to the NRSDC within 15 days.³⁶

C. Institutional and human rights infrastructure and policy measures

Status of national human rights institutions³⁷

National human rights institution	Status during previous cycle	Status during present cycle ³⁸
NCHR	A (2007)	A (2013)

- 11. The Special Rapporteur on the rights to freedom of peaceful assembly and of association called on the National Human Rights Commission of Rwanda (NCHR) to become a more robust, highly visible and well-respected institution by engaging more with the Government on its responses to legitimate dissent; enquiring proactively, and taking public critical stands, on violations of the rights to freedom of peaceful assembly and of association and publicly articulating and disseminating international human rights norms and standards governing the rights to freedom of peaceful assembly and of association.³⁹
- 12. In 2012, CAT was concerned about the lack of effective independence of the NCHR, and its insufficient financial and human resources. 40 CESCR recommended that Rwanda effectively implements Law No. 19/2013 to ensure the independence of the NCHR in practice, particularly on the selection process of its members and its financial autonomy, as set out in the Paris Principles. 41

II. Cooperation with human rights mechanisms

A. Cooperation with treaty bodies⁴²

1. Reporting status

Treaty body	Concluding observations included in previous review	Latest report submitted since previous review	Latest concluding observations	Reporting status
CERD	March 2000	2010/2014	March 2011	Eighteenth to twentieth reports pending consideration
CESCR	February 1989	2010	May 2013	Fifth report due in 2018
HR Committee	March 2009	2014		Fourth report pending consideration.
CEDAW	February 2009			Seventh to ninth reports overdue since 2014
CAT		2011	May 2012	Second report due in 2016.
CRC	June 2004	2010 (to OP- CRC-AC and OP-CRC-SC) / 2011 (to CRC)	June 2013	Fifth and sixth reports due in 2018.
CMW		2011	September 2012	Second report due in 2017
CRPD		2015		Initial report pending consideration

2. Responses to specific follow-up requests by treaty bodies

Concluding observations			
Treaty body	Due in	Subject matter	Submitted in
CERD	2012	National reconciliation and social cohesion; Batwa community; article 4 of the Convention; and access of the Batwa to justice. ⁴³	
HR Committee	2010	Enforced disappearances and summary or arbitrary executions; investigation of the 1994 killings; solitary confinement; and right to a fair trial. ⁴⁴	2010. ⁴⁵ Complementary information requested. ⁴⁶
CEDAW	2011	Violence against women; and women's access to health care. ⁴⁷	2011. ⁴⁸ Further information requested. ⁴⁹
CAT	2013	Allegations of torture and ill-treatment; fundamental legal safeguards; enforced disappearances; secret detention centres and overcrowding in prisons. ⁵⁰	Reminder sent in 2013. ⁵¹

B. Cooperation with special procedures⁵²

	Status during previous cycle	Current status
Standing invitation	No	Yes
Visits undertaken		Minorities
		Housing
		Peaceful assembly and association
Visits agreed to in principle	Minorities	
Responses to letters of allegation and urgent appeals	During the period under review, three communications were sent. The Government replied to one communication.	

13. UNCT stated that in 2011, Rwanda issued a standing invitation to Special Procedures, in line with supported recommendations received at the 2011 review.⁵³

III. Implementation of international human rights obligations, taking into account applicable international humanitarian law

A. Equality and non-discrimination

14. CERD noted that while article 11 of the Rwandan Constitution prohibited racial discrimination, this provision was not fully consistent with article 1 of the Convention, given the absence of any wording related to descent or national origin.⁵⁴

- 15. The Independent Expert on minorities stated that Rwanda needed to adopt comprehensive anti-discrimination legislation, which should include measures to prohibit discrimination and establish effective civil penalties for discriminatory acts by both state and private actors.⁵⁵
- 16. UNCT stated that at the 2011 review, Rwanda accepted recommendations on gender equality. ⁵⁶ While noting initiatives such as the adoption of the Organic Law N° 10/2013/OL of 11/07/2013, ⁵⁷ UNCT stated that deep-rooted, traditional patriarchal stereotypes and unequal gender relations remained, which perpetuated the subordination of women. ⁵⁸
- 17. CESCR expressed concern at the patriarchal stereotypes regarding roles and responsibilities of men and women,⁵⁹ and recommended effective application of gender equality legislation and the implementation of policy measures to achieve equality between men and women.⁶⁰
- 18. CESCR expressed concern about persistent stereotypes and discrimination against the Batwa population,⁶¹ and recommended effective application of the anti-discrimination legislation.⁶² CERD also made recommendations in this regard.⁶³
- 19. CRC remained concerned at persistent discrimination of persons born as a result of rape during the genocide, children affected by HIV/AIDS, children with disabilities, especially girls, children living in poverty, children in street situations, child-headed households, children in residential care, orphans, and children from 'historically marginalized communities'. It requested Rwanda to protect those children in vulnerable situations.⁶⁴

B. Right to life, liberty and security of the person

- 20. Concerning the large number of persons, including women and children, reported to have been killed from 1994 onwards in the course of operations by the Rwandan Patriotic Army, 65 the Human Rights Committee (HR Committee) had requested Rwanda to provide more concrete follow up information on "la proportion des dossiers qui a donné lieu à des poursuites pénales, les mesures prises pour assurer la participation des victimes dans les procès et les motifs des décisions d'acquittement prises dans ces dossiers". 66
- 21. CAT expressed concern about reported cases of enforced disappearance. It recommended thorough investigation of all cases and prosecution of those allegedly responsible; and that Rwanda ensures access to information in relation to the whereabouts of disappeared persons.⁶⁷
- 22. CAT expressed concern about allegations of torture in some detention facilities, particularly about reports of 18 cases of torture and ill-treatment during interrogations by Rwandan military intelligence in the Kami and Kinyinga camps, and by other security personnel in "unlawful places," including the mistreatment of political prisoners. It recommended that Rwanda investigates cases of torture, and prosecutes those allegedly responsible.⁶⁸
- 23. CRC remained concerned about persistent early marriages, particularly in refugee communities. It urged Rwanda to enforce the Family Code in order to prevent and prohibit early marriage.⁶⁹
- 24. CRC was alarmed at high prevalence of sexual violence against children, including in schools and in the community. It urged Rwanda to bring to justice perpetrators of such crimes; and establish effective and child-friendly procedures and mechanisms to receive and investigate complaints.⁷⁰

- 25. CRC expressed concern about many cases of children being exploited in the commercial sex industry and trafficked for prostitution. The CMW expressed concern at reports that Rwandan children were sent to neighbouring countries where they were forced into prostitution, as well as reports of children from neighbouring countries being subjected to prostitution in Rwanda. The CMP is a subjected to prostitution in Rwanda.
- 26. CESCR was concerned at the high rate of child labour, particularly children working in agriculture, as domestic workers, in small companies and in light manufacturing, brickmaking and mining industries.⁷³ CMW was concerned at reports that children from neighbouring countries were subjected to forced labour in Rwanda.⁷⁴
- 27. CRC was concerned about lack of clarity in the definition of child labour; and that Law N° 54/2011 specified that children under 18 might work in underground mines; and that the Labour Code did not cover workers in the informal sector where children were mostly employed.⁷⁵
- 28. UNCT stated that at the 2011 review, Rwanda accepted a recommendation to prohibit corporal punishment of children. Law No. 54/2011 of 14/12/2011 did not explicitly abolish all forms of corporal punishment of children. Also, parents have the 'right of correction' under Article 347 of the Civil Code 1988.⁷⁶
- 29. In 2011, within the follow-up framework, Rwanda reported to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) that the centres to receive, host, care and treat survivors of gender-based violence were insufficient and that the country lacked sufficiently qualified health and medical personnel. The Ministry of Health was working on a National Scale-Up Strategy to expand these centres.⁷⁷
- 30. The Independent Expert on minorities recommended that the situation and needs of women who suffered rape and other sexual violence and who may be living with HIV/AIDS must be given high priority, including their access to life-saving medication. Ray and rehabilitation measures. Ray and a inter alia provide victims with assistance and rehabilitation measures.
- 31. UNCT stated that challenges remained in the prevention and response to gender-based violence such as the limited institutional capacity, persistence of gender-bias and the subordinated status of women.⁸⁰
- 32. UNCT stated that in compliance with a recommendation on prison overcrowding, received at the 2011 review, ⁸¹ new prisons have been constructed. Old prisons have either been renovated or demolished. In February 2014, the Nyagatare Rehabilitation Centre was opened, for those between the ages of 14 and 18 years. ⁸²
- 33. CAT expressed concern about reports of detainees held in "unofficial detention centres" without having been charged of a crime or brought before a court, and without having access to a lawyer and to a doctor. It recommended that Rwanda ensures that no person is detained in secret or in unofficial facilities and also recommended the closure of such facilities.⁸³
- 34. CRC was deeply concerned at the increase in child trafficking; particularly refugees;⁸⁴ the disappearance of adolescent girls from refugee camps without their family being aware of their whereabouts;⁸⁵ and the re-victimization of some child victims of sale and trafficking in the transit centres.⁸⁶ CRC recommended that Rwanda adopts a comprehensive policy to address the root causes of child trafficking; and investigates the reports of disappearances of adolescent girls from refugee camps.⁸⁷

C. Administration of justice, including impunity, and the rule of law

- 35. UNCT stated at the 2011 review, Rwanda had received recommendations to eliminate corruption in the Judiciary, which enjoyed its support. 88 In this context, initiatives have been taken, such as granting the Office of the Ombudsman the mandate to initiate prosecutions for corrupt practices. However, concerns about corruption within the Judiciary remain. 89
- 36. CAT was concerned about reports that individuals charged with threatening national security and detained at Kami or Mukamira military camps and in "safe houses" in Kigali, had made confessions following beatings and torture; and that judges had placed the burden of proof on the persons charged. It recommended that confessions, statements and evidence obtained as a result of torture or ill-treatment should not be entered as evidence in court proceedings. ⁹⁰
- 37. CERD was concerned at reports that the Batwa did not receive equal treatment in the courts and had difficulties obtaining access to justice. It recommended that Rwanda facilitate the access to justice for Batwa; and inform the Batwa of available legal remedies.⁹¹
- 38. UNCT stated that a National Legal Aid Policy had been adopted. The policy defined the eligibility criteria for legal aid. 92
- 39. UNHCR stated that there was no legal aid for asylum-seekers at different stages of the process. It recommended legal aid to asylum-seekers at all stages of the process and capacity building for the institutions providing such legal aid. 93
- 40. CRC regretted that Rwanda had not established independent children's courts and expressed concern that children in vulnerable situations were perceived to be offenders and detained without charge in an unofficial detention centre in Gikondo. 4 CAT was concerned that minors under 12 years of age, in conflict with the law, were detained for a maximum period of eight months, and were not always detained separately from adults. 5
- 41. UNCT stated that the Justice for Children Policy and Strategic Plan (2014 to 2019) has been developed to advance the best interests of the child and to foster the participation of children in all legal proceedings.⁹⁶
- 42. UNCT stated that the Gacaca process was brought to end in June 2012, in line with recommendations that had been received at the 2011 review, 97 and considered those recommendations to be implemented. 98
- 43. In 2011, the Independent Expert on Minorities stated that while bring the Gacaca process to a close, the Government should put in place a long-term strategy that recognized the continuing need for community-centred reconciliation mechanisms. 99

D. Right to family life

- 44. While noting that Organic Law No 01/2012/OL criminalized child abandonment, CRC expressed concern about the unintended consequences of some provisions of this law on economically and socially disadvantaged parents. It urged Rwanda not to prosecute parents unable to provide proper care to children due to poverty; and adequately support families in vulnerable situations. ¹⁰⁰
- 45. CRC noted that Rwanda had one of the highest proportions of child-headed households in the world and urged Rwanda to formulate appropriate policies to address their needs. ¹⁰¹ It also recommended providing appropriate care and assistance to all children deprived of a family environment and those living in vulnerable situations. ¹⁰²

E. Freedom of movement

46. UNCT stated that Rwanda has a reservation to Article 26 of the 1951 Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees. As a result, freedom of movement for refugees was not guaranteed and an encampment policy had been adopted.¹⁰³

F. Freedom of religion or belief, expression, association and peaceful assembly, and right to participate in public and political life

- 47. UNCT stated that at the 2011 review, Rwanda had accepted a number of recommendations on peaceful assembly, expression, association, belief, religion and participation in public and political life.¹⁰⁴ In this regard, media sector reforms were fast-tracked through the adoption of legislation. Also, the powers of the Media High Council were removed and self-regulation of the media was introduced.¹⁰⁵
- 48. UNESCO stated that the Rwanda Media Commission, the country's media self-regulatory body, was installed in 2013. Rwanda must ensure that journalists and media workers are able to work in a free and safe environment and all attacks against them must be investigated. To
- 49. UNCT stated that laws had been promulgated to give effect to the rights to peaceful assembly, association and participation in political and public life. However, there were challenges in reinforcing inclusive participation and strengthening political processes. 108
- 50. In 2014, the Special Rapporteur on the rights to freedom of peaceful assembly and of association recommended that administrative and law enforcement officials are adequately trained in international human rights norms governing the rights to freedom of peaceful assembly and of association. Officials who violated the rights to freedom of peaceful assembly and of association should be held accountable. ¹⁰⁹
- 51. The Special Rapporteur on freedom of peaceful assembly and of association recommended that Rwanda offers all citizens the right and opportunity to freely form and register political parties and operate in a pluralistic political sphere; and to ensure that all political opponents were free to participate in the political process, and were not labelled as enemies of the State.¹¹⁰
- 52. CAT was concerned about reports of intimidation and threats, which impeded the participation of NGOs in human rights activities; of arrest and detention of human rights defenders and journalists; and of obstacles regarding the NGOs registration and work.¹¹¹
- 53. CERD recommended that Rwanda promotes the participation of the Batwa in political and public life. 112

G. Right to work and to just and favourable conditions of work

- 54. CESCR was concerned about the high rate of unemployment, particularly among women, people living in rural areas, marginalized groups, including the Batwa, the youth, and persons with disabilities.¹¹³
- 55. CESCR was concerned at the large number of persons working in the informal economy. It recommended that Rwanda provides those people with formal employment opportunities.¹¹⁴
- 56. CESCR was concerned at reports that violations of working standards provided for by the Labour Code occurred mostly in the informal economy. It recommended reinforcing inspections on working conditions.¹¹⁵

- 57. CESCR recommended that Rwanda introduces a national minimum wage to ensure a decent standard of living to all workers and their families. 116
- 58. CESCR was concerned that many workers were excluded from social security and recommended the implementation of the national social security policy of 2009 to provide universal social security coverage.¹¹⁷
- 59. UNCT stated that maternity leave for female employees was inadequate and that the maternity fund was not operational. 118

H. Right to social security and to an adequate standard of living

- 60. CRC expressed concern that housing initiatives, such as the "Bye-Bye Nyakatsi" campaign, has rendered hundreds of families homeless. 119 CRC urged Rwanda to ensure the housing programmes were carried out in accordance with the right to decent housing. 120
- 61. CESCR expressed concern at reports that most of the people expropriated or forcibly evicted from their lands or whose lands had been expropriated in the context of the land consolidation policy or urban planning, had not received fair compensation. It recommended that Rwanda seek the consent of those to be expropriated or evicted, and provide them with compensation. ¹²¹
- 62. The Special Rapporteur on housing recommended that the *imidugudu* policy, ¹²² (which encourages the establishment of consolidated, planned, prebuilt housing in rural centres) ¹²³ should be implemented in full consultation with the populations concerned. Parties to land exchanges or victims of expropriation should be compensated before such transactions take place. Persons displaced to *imidugudu* villages should be afforded conditions in their new place of residence which were at the very least equal to those of their previous residence. An administrative or judicial review system should be introduced to allow for challenges to be made to transactions conducted in connection with this policy. ¹²⁴
- 63. CESCR expressed concern at the housing situation of disadvantaged and marginalized groups and persons.¹²⁵ It recommended that Rwanda improves access to adequate housing for all, in particular the Batwa community.¹²⁶
- 64. CESCR expressed concern at the high rate of poverty, particularly affecting women, child-headed households, and persons living in rural areas and working in agriculture; as well as the high rate of poverty among marginalized and disadvantaged persons and groups, such as the Batwa community, asylum seekers, refugees and domestic workers. It recommended that Rwanda implements and reinforces measures to combat poverty.¹²⁷
- 65. The Special Rapporteur on housing recommended that Rwanda encourage families to maintain a minimum level of subsistence agriculture so that they do not become completely vulnerable to market fluctuations. 128

I. Right to health

66. CESCR expressed concern that access to health-care services was not effectively ensured to all. ¹²⁹ CRC was concerned at regional disparities in health among urban and rural areas, and recommended that Rwanda ensures equitable access to health care services and accessibility to the health insurance scheme programme for children in vulnerable situations. ¹³⁰ CMW was concerned that in some sectors, migrant workers were not eligible to subscribe to a health insurance scheme. ¹³¹

- 67. CESCR expressed concern at the rate of child mortality and high rate of maternal mortality, which was partially due to unsafe abortions. According to CRC, the lack of pre-natal and neo-natal care resulted in a high rate of new-born mortality and recommended increasing the availability and accessibility to emergency obstetric care.
- 68. CESCR expressed concern at the criminalization of and the severe punishment for abortion, as well as difficulties faced by some women in accessing family planning services, particularly in rural areas. It recommended that Rwanda extends family planning services to all women and carries out educational programmes on sexual and reproductive health. It urged Rwanda to reduce the scope and severity of the punishment of abortion. ¹³⁴ In 2011, Rwanda reported to CEDAW that efforts to promote family planning and the use of contraceptives had been derailed by some religious convictions, as well as by the mentality of the rural population and the negative perception of contraceptive methods due to misconceptions and false information. ¹³⁵ CEDAW recommended reviewing the legislation on abortion with a view to removing punitive provisions imposed on women who undergo abortion. ¹³⁶
- 69. CRC was seriously concerned at high level of child malnutrition. 137

J. Right to education

- 70. CRC expressed concerned about the inadequate quality of education and hidden education fees. It recommended that Rwanda increases spending on quality education; eliminates all types of hidden educational costs in the school system; ¹³⁸ and improves the quality and coverage of its early childhood care and education. ¹³⁹ CESCR encouraged Rwanda to make secondary education fully free. ¹⁴⁰
- 71. CRC expressed concern about disparities in education between urban and rural areas; limited access to education for children with disabilities, Batwa children and girls; ¹⁴¹ and the lack of inclusive education for children with disabilities. ¹⁴² CESCR expressed concern at the high rate of dropouts among children belonging to disadvantaged and marginalized families, in particular to Batwa families. ¹⁴³ CRC recommended that Rwanda eradicates regional disparities; ¹⁴⁴ and urged Rwanda to achieve inclusive education for all children and eliminate barriers leading to educational disparities for children with disability. ¹⁴⁵ CMW recommended that children of migrant workers in an irregular situation have access to education on an equality basis with nationals. ¹⁴⁶
- 72. UNESCO stated that Rwanda continued to improve the quality of education and noted inter alia the adoption of the Strategic Plan of the Education Sector (2013-2018). However, Rwanda has not taken additional measures to integrate minority groups and indigenous peoples in the education system.¹⁴⁷
- 73. UNCT stated that Rwanda should implement effective strategies to strengthen the implementation of the education policy on girls which allows adolescent mothers to resume their education.¹⁴⁸
- 74. UNCT stated that refugee children faced practical impediments in accessing upper secondary education, due to a lack of resources. All possible efforts should be made to ensure that refugee children have access to upper secondary education. 149

K. Cultural rights

75. UNESCO noted that Rwanda was a State Party to the Convention concerning the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage (1972), the Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (2003) and the Convention on the

Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions (2005), and encouraged Rwanda to fully implement the relevant provisions that promote access to and participation in cultural heritage and creative expressions and, as such, were conducive to implementing the right to take part in cultural life.¹⁵⁰

L. Persons with disabilities

76. CRC expressed concern that children with disabilities lacked adequate health care and social protection, and was often discriminated against due to cultural stigma and superstition. It urged Rwanda to review the Special Needs Education Policy of 2007 to realize the rights of children with disabilities; include in the National Council of People with Disabilities (NCPD) established in 2011 a section on children; and repeal Article 42 of the Law N°54/2011 to ensure that the placement of children with disabilities in institutions is used only as a measure of last resort. ¹⁵¹

M. Minorities and indigenous peoples

- 77. CRC stated that it was troubled by Rwanda's non-recognition of the existence of minority and indigenous people, including the Batwa community. The Independent Expert on minorities stated that Rwanda should acknowledge the Batwa as a distinct population group and the Batwa should participate in all stages of policy formulation, programme design and implementation of decisions that affect them. The Independent Expert of the Indiana Indiana
- 78. CRC expressed concern that Batwa communities had been forcibly displaced from their ancestral forest lands without consent or compensation and deprived of their traditional livelihoods.¹⁵⁴ The Independent Expert on minorities stated the Government should compensate displaced Batwa communities and, pursuant to effective consultation with those communities, develops initiatives to reconnect them with their ancestral habitats and cultural practices, recognize their rights to the natural resources of the forests, and develop programmes that value and preserve the traditional practices of their forest livelihoods.¹⁵⁵

N. Migrants, refugees and asylum seekers

- 79. CMW was concerned at the lack of protection of migrant workers employed in the informal sector, particularly in domestic service. ¹⁵⁶ It recommended that Rwanda registers all migrant workers to avoid them being placed in an irregular situation. ¹⁵⁷ CESCR recommended the protection of domestic workers. ¹⁵⁸
- 80. CMW recommended that the Government amends Law No. 04/2011 on immigration to and emigration from Rwanda as well as Ministerial Order No. 02/01 of 2011 to give migrants subject to expulsion, the right to have their case reviewed by the competent authority.¹⁵⁹ CMW also recommended regulating and facilitating the return to Rwanda of Rwandan migrant workers who do not hold a valid travel document or other proof of Rwandan citizenship; and facilitating the voluntary return of Rwandans living abroad as well as their long-term reintegration in the country.¹⁶⁰
- 81. CRC expressed concern that the law on asylum (Law No. 29/2006) and its draft amendment of 2011-2012 contained provisions contrary to the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees. CESCR expressed concern that the law did not protect against refoulement; and recommended that Rwanda guarantee the principle of non-refoulement. CRC urged Rwanda to ensure the right to family reunification without distinctions based on legal status. CRC urged Rwanda to ensure the right to family reunification without distinctions based on legal status.

- 82. CRC was concerned about the absence of a comprehensive mechanism to identify refugee and asylum-seeking children or children in migrant situations who might have been or were at risk of being recruited or used in hostilities; and the lack of procedures to provide care and services to those children. ¹⁶⁵
- 83. CESCR was concerned that the birth registration of refugees, asylum seekers and stateless children was not fully guaranteed and recommended that Rwanda ensures the registration of all children born in its territory. 166 CRC also recommended the provision of adequate protection for unaccompanied asylum-seeking and refugee children, including by providing them with free birth registration and equitable access to free education, health and social services. 167
- 84. UNHCR stated that there was a large backlog in birth registration, and that there was a need for systematic birth registration in all camps within 30 days after birth, in accordance with the time-frame prescribed by national law. Court fees relating to late birth registration was an impediment to birth registration.¹⁶⁸
- 85. UNHCR stated that asylum process had become problematic in terms of access to asylum, length of the procedures and the quality of decision-making. There was also a lack of clarity regarding the role of the Directorate General of Immigration and Emigration in reviewing asylum claims. UNHCR recommended that Rwanda ensure the immediate functioning of the National Refugee Status Determination Committee and allow access to asylum procedures for all asylum-seekers, without discrimination. Union 170
- 86. UNHCR stated that additional living spaces for camp-based refugees as well as for transit centres that provided services to Rwandan returnees were urgently needed.¹⁷¹
- 87. UNHCR stated that although the 2008 Rwandan Nationality Law allowed for the naturalization of refugees and asylum-seekers married to Rwandan nationals and for all children born in Rwanda to refugees and asylum-seekers after they reach adulthood, the occurrence of naturalization was very rare.¹⁷²

O. Internally displaced persons

88. UNCT stated that Rwanda signed and ratified the 2009 Kampala Convention on Internally Displaced Persons in 2012. However, the provisions of the Convention needed to be incorporated into national legislation.¹⁷³

P. Right to development

89. UNCT stated that despite the high economic growth, the production base remained narrow with the economic structure dominated by agriculture. There was high income inequalities and poverty prevalent in rural areas, high youth unemployment, the need to strengthen the private sector, high reliance on foreign aid and vulnerability to external shocks, including changes in donor policies.¹⁷⁴

Notes

Unless indicated otherwise, the status of ratification of instruments listed in the table may be found on the official website of the United Nations Treaty Collection database, Office of Legal Affairs of the United Nations Secretariat, http://treaties.un.org/. Please also refer to the United Nations compilation on Rwanda from the previous cycle (A/HRC/WG.6/23/RWA/2).

² The following abbreviations are used in UPR documents:

ICERD International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial

Discrimination

ICESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

OP-ICESCR Optional Protocol to ICESCR

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights

ICCPR-OP 1 Optional Protocol to ICCPR

ICCPR-OP 2 Second Optional Protocol to ICCPR, aiming at the abolition of the death

penalty

CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against

Women

OP-CEDAW Optional Protocol to CEDAW

CAT Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading

Treatment or Punishment

OP-CAT Optional Protocol to CAT

CRC Convention on the Rights of the Child

OP-CRC-AC Optional Protocol to CRC on the involvement of children in armed conflict OP-CRC-SC Optional Protocol to CRC on the sale of children, child prostitution and child

pornography

OP-CRC-IC Optional Protocol to CRC on a communications procedure

ICRMW International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant

Workers and Members of Their Families

CRPD Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities

OP-CRPD Optional Protocol to CRPD

ICPPED International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced

Disappearance.

⁴ A/HRC/17/4.

³ Individual complaints: ICCPR-OP 1, art. 1; OP-CEDAW, art. 1; OP-CRPD, art. 1; OP-ICESCR, art. 1; OP-CRC-IC, art. 5; ICERD, art. 14; CAT, art. 22; ICRMW, art. 77; and ICPPED, art. 31. Inquiry procedure: OP-CEDAW, art. 8; CAT, art. 20; ICPPED, art. 33; OP-CRPD, art. 6; OP-ICESCR, art. 11; and OP-CRC-IC, art. 13. Inter-State complaints: ICCPR, art. 41; ICRMW, art. 76; ICPPED, art. 32; CAT, art. 21; OP-ICESCR, art. 10; and OP-CRC-IC, art. 12. Urgent action: ICPPED, art. 30.

⁵ UN Compilation Report for the second cycle of the Universal Periodic Review Mechanism – Rwanda (UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda), p. 5, para. 24.

⁶ UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 5, 25. See A/HRC/17/4, para. 79.1.

⁷ C.N.375.2015.TREATIES-IV.9.b (Depositary Notification).

⁸ E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 29.

⁹ E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 30.

¹⁰ CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 65.

¹¹ CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 26.

¹² CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 8.

¹³ CERD/C/RWA/CO/13-17, para. 22. See also CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 57.

E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 14. See also CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 10 and CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 61.

¹⁵ CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 10.

Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime.

^{17 1951} Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and its 1967 Protocol, 1954 Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons, and 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness.

- Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of the Wounded and Sick in Armed Forces in the Field (First Convention); Geneva Convention for the Amelioration of the Condition of Wounded, Sick and Shipwrecked Members of Armed Forces at Sea (Second Convention); Geneva Convention relative to the Treatment of Prisoners of War (Third Convention); Geneva Convention relative to the Protection of Civilian Persons in Time of War (Fourth Convention); Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (Protocol I); Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts (Protocol II). For the official status of ratifications, see International Committee of the Red Cross, www.icrc.org/IHL.
- International Labour Organization Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29); Abolition of Forced Labour Convention, 1957 (No. 105); Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise Convention, 1948 (No. 87); Right to Organise and Collective Bargaining Convention, 1949 (No. 98); Equal Remuneration Convention, 1951 (No. 100); Discrimination (Employment and Occupation Convention, 1958 (No. 111); Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138); Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182).
- Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Adoption of an Additional Distinctive Emblem (Protocol III). For the official status of ratifications, see International Committee of the Red Cross, www.icrc.org/IHL.
- International Labour Orgaization, Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention, 1989 (No. 169); and Domestic Workers Conventionn, 2011 (No. 189).
- UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 10, para. 57. See A/HRC/17/4, para. 80.3 for the recommendation.
- ²³ Contribution of UNESCO to Compilation of UN information Rwanda (UNESCO Submission for the UPR of Rwanda), p. 16, para. 43.
- ²⁴ CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 4, CRC/C/OPSC/RWA/CO/1, para. 4 and CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, paras. 5(b) and 7.
- ²⁵ CRC/C/OPSC/RWA/CO/1, para. 28.
- ²⁶ CERD/C/RWA/CO/13-17, para. 15.
- ²⁷ CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 4 and 62, CRC/C/OPAC/RWA/CO/1, para. 5 and CRC/C/OPSC/RWA/CO/1, para. 4. See also E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 4.
- ²⁸ CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 10.
- ²⁹ CRC/C/OPSC/RWA/CO/1, para. 30.
- ³⁰ CRC/C/OPAC/RWA/CO/1, para. 14.
- 31 CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. $\bar{4}.$ See also E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 4.
- ³² CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 22.
- ³³ CERD/C/RWA/CO/13-17, para. 14.
- Submission by the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees for the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights' Compilation Report; Universal Periodic Review:2nd Cycle, 23rd Session; The Republic of Rwanda (UNHCR Submission for the UPR of Rwanda), p. 5.
- 35 UNHCR Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 6.
- ³⁶ UNHCR Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 7.
- According to article 5 of the rules of procedure of the International Coordinating Committee of National Institutions for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights (ICC) Sub-Committee on Accreditation, the classifications for accreditation used by the Sub-Committee are: A: Voting Member (fully in compliance with each of the Paris Principles), B: Non-Voting Member (not fully in compliance with each of the Paris Principles or insufficient information provided to make a determination), C: No Status (not in compliance with the Paris Principles).
- ³⁸ For the list of national human rights institutions with accreditation status granted by the International Coordinating Committee of National Institutions for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights (ICC), see A/HRC/27/40, annex. [Symbol correct for UPR Sessions 2x-2x]
- ³⁹ A/HRC/26/29/Add.2, para 91.
- 40 CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 24. See also E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 7, CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 11 and UNCT Submission, p. 2, para. 7.
- ⁴¹ E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 7. See also CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 12, CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 24.
- ⁴² The following abbreviations are used in UPR documents:

CERD Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CESCR Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

HR Committee Human Rights Committee

CEDAW Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women

CAT Committee against Torture

CRC Committee on the Rights of the Child

CMW Committee on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and

Members of Their Families

CRPD Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities

CED Committee on Enforced Disappearances SPT Subcommittee on Prevention of Torture.

- 44 CCPR/C/RWA/CO/3, para. 24.
- 45 CCPR/C/RWA/CO/3/Add.1.
- Letters from HR Committee to the Permanent Mission of Rwanda to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva, dated 9 May 2011, 2 August 2011, 19 September 2011 and 30 April 2012, available from

http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CCPR/Shared%20Documents/RWA/INT_CCPR_FUL_RWA_122 39_F.pdf;

http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CAT/Shared%20Documents/RWA/INT_CAT_FUL_RWA_12910 _E.pdf;

 $http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CCPR/Shared \% 20 Documents/RWA/INT_CCPR_NGS_RWA_12 237_E.pdf;$

http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CCPR/Shared%20Documents/RWA/INT_CCPR_FUL_RWA_122 41_F.pdf (accessed on 6 January 2015).

- ⁴⁷ CEDAW/C/RWA/CO/6, para. 48.
- 48 CEDAW/C/RWA/CO/6/ADD.1.
- ⁴⁹ Letter from CEDAW to the Permanent Mission of Rwanda to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva, dated 19 September 2012, available from http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CEDAW/Shared%20Documents/RWA/INT_CEDAW_FUL_RW A_13616_E.pdf (accessed on 7 January 2015).
- ⁵⁰ CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 29.
- Letter from CAT to the Permanent Mission of Rwanda to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva, dated 3 June 2013, available from http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CCPR/Shared%20Documents/RWA/INT_CCPR_FUL_RWA_122 38_F.pdf (accessed on 6 January 2015).
- For the titles of special procedures, see www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/SP/Pages/Themes.aspx and www.ohchr.org/EN/HRBodies/SP/Pages/Countries.aspx.
- UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 3, para. 13, referring to A/HRC/17/4, p. 13, para. 77.8.
- ⁵⁴ CERD/C/RWA/CO/13-17, para. 13.
- ⁵⁵ A/HRC/19/56/Add.1, para 90.
- ⁵⁶ See A/HRC/17/4, p. 13, para. 77.11.
- ⁵⁷ UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 4, para. 19.
- ⁵⁸ UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 4, para. 21.
- ⁵⁹ E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 9.
- ⁶⁰ E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 9.
- ⁶¹ E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 8. See also CERD/C/RWA/CO/13-17, para. 16 and CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 21 and 56.
- ⁶² E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 8.
- 63 CERD/C/RWA/CO/13-17, para. 16. See also E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 8 and CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 57.
- 64 CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 21-22.
- 65 CCPR/C/RWA/CO/3, para. 13.
- Letter from HR Committee to the Permanent Mission of Rwanda to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva, dated 9 May 2011, p. 2, available from http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CCPR/Shared%20Documents/RWA/INT_CCPR_FUL_RWA_122

⁴³ CERD/C/RWA/CO/13-17, para. 29.

 $39_F.pdf$ (accessed on 6 January 2015). See also Letters from HR Committee to the Permanent

Mission of Rwanda to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva,

dated 2 August 2011, 19 September 2011 and 30 April 2012, available from

 $http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CAT/Shared \% 20 Documents/RWA/INT_CAT_FUL_RWA_12910_E.pdf;$

 $http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CCPR/Shared \% 20 Documents/RWA/INT_CCPR_NGS_RWA_12 \\ 237_E.pdf;$

http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CCPR/Shared%20Documents/RWA/INT_CCPR_FUL_RWA_122 41_F.pdf (accessed on 6 January 2015).

- 67 CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 14.
- ⁶⁸ CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 10. See also CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, paras. 7 and 23. CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 31-32.
- ⁷⁰ CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 29-30.
- 71 CRC/C/OPSC/RWA/CO/1, para. 25. See also E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 20.
- ⁷² CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 45.
- ⁷³ E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 19. See also CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 60.
- ⁷⁴ CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, paras. 19 and 45.
- ⁷⁵ CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 60-61.
- VINCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 5, para. 27. See A/HRC/17/4, p. 16, para. 79.1 for the recommendation.
- ⁷⁷ CEDAW/C/RWA/CO/6/ADD.1, para. 23. See also Letter from CEDAW to the Permanent Mission of Rwanda to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva, dated 19 September 2012, p. 2, available from
 - http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CEDAW/Shared%20Documents/RWA/INT_CEDAW_FUL_RW A_13616_E.pdf (accessed on 7 January 2015).
- ⁷⁸ A/HRC/19/56/Add.1, para 88.
- ⁷⁹ CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 16. See also E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 10.
- ⁸⁰ UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 6, para. 30.
- 81 See A/HRC/17/4, p. 15, para. 78.10.
- ⁸² UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 7, para. 40.
- 83 CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 11.
- ⁸⁴ CRC/C/OPSC/RWA/CO/1, para. 22. See also CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 45.
- 85 CRC/C/OPSC/RWA/CO/1, para. 23.
- 86 CRC/C/OPSC/RWA/CO/1, para. 33.
- 87 CRC/C/OPSC/RWA/CO/1, para. 24.
- ⁸⁸ See A/HRC/17/4, para. 79.7.
- ⁸⁹ UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 6, para. 35.
- 90 CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 23.
- 91 CERD/C/RWA/CO/13-17, para. 19.
- 92 UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 7, para. 38.
- ⁹³ UNHCR Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 6.
- 94 CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 62-63.
- 95 CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 20. See also CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 19.
- ⁹⁶ UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 7, para. 40.
- ⁹⁷ See A/HRC/17/4, para. 79.8.
- $^{98}\,$ UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 7, para. 43.
- ⁹⁹ A/HRC/19/56/Add.1, para 87.
- ¹⁰⁰ CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 35 and 37.
- ¹⁰¹ CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 36-37.
- ¹⁰² CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 40.
- ¹⁰³ UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 9, para. 53.
- ¹⁰⁴ See A/HRC/17/4, paras. 79.4, 79.10, 79.11 and 79.13.
- ¹⁰⁵ UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, pp. 9-10, paras. 54-57.
- Contribution of UNESCO to Compilation of UN information, Rwanda (UNESCO Submission for the UPR of Rwanda), p. 14, para. 34.
- ¹⁰⁷ UNESCO Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, para. 42.

```
<sup>108</sup> UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 10, para. 61.
<sup>109</sup> A/HRC/26/29/Add.2, para 86.
<sup>110</sup> A/HRC/26/29/Add.2, para 89.
111 CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 17. See also CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 19.
<sup>112</sup> CERD/C/RWA/CO/13-17, para. 18.
<sup>113</sup> E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 12. See also CERD/C/RWA/CO/13-17, para. 16.
<sup>114</sup> E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 13.
<sup>115</sup> E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 16.
^{116} E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 15.
<sup>117</sup> E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 17.
<sup>118</sup> UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 9, para. 52.
^{119} CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 50. See also E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 23.
<sup>120</sup> CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 51.
<sup>121</sup> E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 24.
<sup>122</sup> Also referred to as the "policy of villagization" (A/HRC/22/46/Add.2, para. 14).
<sup>123</sup> A/HRC/22/46/Add. 2, para. 14.
<sup>124</sup> A/HRC/22/46/Add.2, para 51.
<sup>125</sup> E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 23.
<sup>126</sup> E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 23. See also CERD/C/RWA/CO/13-17, para. 16.
<sup>127</sup> E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 22. See also CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 48-49.
<sup>128</sup> A/HRC/22/46/Add.2, para 53.
<sup>129</sup> E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 25.
<sup>130</sup> CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 45 and 47.
^{131} CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 31.
<sup>132</sup> E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 26. See also CEDAW/C/RWA/CO/6/ADD.1 paras. 43-47 and Letter
    from CEDAW to the Permanent Mission of Rwanda to the United Nations Office and other
    international organizations in Geneva, dated 19 September 2012, pp. 3-4, available from
    http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CEDAW/Shared%20Documents/RWA/INT_CEDAW_FUL_RW
    A_13616_E.pdf (accessed on 7 January 2015).
<sup>133</sup> CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 46-47.
<sup>134</sup> E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 26. See also CEDAW/C/RWA/CO/6/ADD.1 paras. 48-51; Letter from
    CEDAW to the Permanent Mission of Rwanda to the United Nations Office and other international
    organizations in Geneva, dated 19 September 2012, pp. 3-4, available from
    http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CEDAW/Shared%20Documents/RWA/INT_CEDAW_FUL_RW
    A_13616_E.pdf (accessed on 7 January 2015); and CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 47.
135 CEDAW/C/RWA/CO/6/ADD.1 paras. 49-50. See also Letter from CEDAW to the Permanent
    Mission of Rwanda to the United Nations Office and other international organizations in Geneva,
    dated 19 September 2012, p. 4, available from
    http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CEDAW/Shared%20Documents/RWA/INT_CEDAW_FUL_RW
    A_13616_E.pdf (accessed on 7 January 2015).
Letter from CEDAW to the Permanent Mission of Rwanda to the United Nations Office and other
    international organizations in Geneva, dated 19 September 2012, p. 4, available from
   http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/Treaties/CEDAW/Shared%20Documents/RWA/INT CEDAW FUL RW
    A_13616_E.pdf (accessed on 7 January 2015). See also CEDAW/C/RWA/CO/6/ADD.1 para. 51.
<sup>137</sup> CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 46.
<sup>138</sup> CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 52-53.
<sup>139</sup> CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 55.
<sup>140</sup> E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 27.
<sup>141</sup> CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 52. See also CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 56.
<sup>142</sup> CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 43.
<sup>143</sup> E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 27. See also CERD/C/RWA/CO/13-17, para. 16 and
    CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 53.
<sup>144</sup> CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 53.
<sup>145</sup> CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 44.
```

146 CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 34.

¹⁴⁷ UNESCO Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, para. 40.

- $^{148}\,$ NCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 14, para. 83.
- ¹⁴⁹ UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 14, para. 80.
- UNESCO Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 16, para. 45.
- ¹⁵¹ CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, paras. 43-44.
- 152 CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 56. See also E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 28 and CERD/C/RWA/CO/13-17, para. 11.
- ¹⁵³ A/HRC/19/56/Add.1, paras 94-95.
- ¹⁵⁴ CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 56.
- ¹⁵⁵ A/HRC/19/56/Add.1, paras 94-95.
- ¹⁵⁶ CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 29.
- ¹⁵⁷ CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 48.
- ¹⁵⁸ E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 14. See also CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 30.
- 159 CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 26.
- 160 CMW/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 44.
- ¹⁶¹ CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 58.
- ¹⁶² E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 11. See also CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 18.
- ¹⁶³ E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 11. See also CAT/C/RWA/CO/1, para. 18.
- ¹⁶⁴ CRC/C/RWA/CO/3-4, para. 59. See also E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 11.
- ¹⁶⁵ CRC/C/OPAC/RWA/CO/1, paras. 19-20.
- ¹⁶⁶ E/C.12/RWA/CO/2-4, para. 11. See also CRC/C/OPSC/RWA/CO/1, paras. 20-21.
- 167 CRC/C/OPSC/RWA/CO/1, para. 21.
- UNHCR Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 10. UNHCR made recommendations (p. 10). See also UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, para. 47.
- $^{169}\,$ UNHCR Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 7.
- ¹⁷⁰ UNCHR Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 7.
- UNHCR Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 9. UNCHR made recommendations (p. 9).
- UNHCR Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 9. UNHCR made recommendations (p. 9).
- ¹⁷³ UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 16, para. 92.
- UNCT Submission for the UPR of Rwanda, p. 16, para. 94.