



**Economic and Social
Council**

Distr.
GENERAL

E/CN.4/1990/33
21 November 1989

ENGLISH
Original: ENGLISH/FRENCH
SPANISH

COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS

Forty-sixth session
Agenda item 9 of the provisional agenda

QUESTION OF THE REALIZATION OF THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT

Analytical compilation of comments and views on
the implementation and further enhancement of the
Declaration on the Right to Development prepared
by the Secretary-General

CONTENTS

| | <u>Page</u> |
|---|-------------|
| INTRODUCTION | 3 |
| I. SIGNIFICANCE OF THE DECLARATION AND ITS RELATION TO OTHER INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS | 5 |
| A. Governments | 5 |
| B. Non-governmental organizations | 6 |
| II. FACTORS AFFECTING THE REALIZATION OF THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT ... | 7 |
| A. Respect for human rights, including self-determination | 7 |
| 1. Governments | 7 |
| 2. United Nations organ | 7 |
| 3. Specialized agency | 8 |
| 4. Non-governmental organizations | 8 |

CONTENTS (continued)

| | <u>Page</u> |
|--|-------------|
| B. International peace, security and disarmament | 10 |
| 1. Government | 10 |
| 2. Non-governmental organizations | 11 |
| C. New international economic order | 11 |
| 1. Governments | 11 |
| 2. Non-governmental organizations | 12 |
| III. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE DECLARATION AT THE NATIONAL LEVEL | 14 |
| A. Governments | 14 |
| B. United Nations organ | 15 |
| C. Non-governmental organizations | 15 |
| IV. IMPLEMENTATION AT THE INTERNATIONAL LEVEL | 16 |
| A. Governments | 16 |
| B. Specialized agency | 17 |
| C. Non-governmental organizations | 17 |
| V. THE ROLE OF WOMEN IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT | 20 |
| A. United Nations organ | 20 |
| B. Non-governmental organizations | 21 |
| VI. EVALUATION SYSTEM ON THE IMPLEMENTATION AND FURTHER ENHANCEMENT OF THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT | 21 |
| A. Governments | 21 |
| B. United Nations organs | 22 |
| C. Specialized agencies | 23 |
| D. Regional commission | 24 |
| E. Non-governmental organization | 24 |

Annex

Illustrative list of points to be included in a questionnaire on the realization of the Declaration on the Right to Development

INTRODUCTION

1. The Declaration on the Right to Development was proclaimed by the General Assembly at its forty-first session in resolution 41/128 of 4 December 1986. The Working Group of Governmental Experts on the Right to Development, which had been established by the Commission on Human Rights in 1981, held nine sessions in the period preceding the adoption of the Declaration to the content of which it had contributed. Subsequent to the proclamation of the Declaration, the Working Group held two sessions in January 1987 and January 1988 prior to the sessions of the Commission on Human Rights.
2. The Commission on Human Rights at its forty-fifth session in 1989 had before it the report of the Working Group of Governmental Experts on the Right to Development on its 1989 session (E/CN.4/1989/10).
3. At that session the following representatives made statements under item 8 of the agenda on the right to development: */

Governments: Afghanistan (19th), Algeria (22nd), Argentina (19th), Austria (20th), Bangladesh (21st), Belgium (21st), Bulgaria (20th), Byelorussian Soviet Socialist Republic (21st), Canada (19th), China (19th), Colombia (21st), Cuba (20th and 21st), Ecuador (19th), Ethiopia (20th), Egypt (21st), France (19th), German Democratic Republic (20th), India (20th), Iraq (20th), Ireland (22nd), Lebanon (22nd), Libyan Arab Jamahiriya (20th), Mexico (20th), Netherlands (21st), Pakistan (20th), Peru (21st), Philippines (21st), Portugal (20th), Romania (21st), Syrian Arab Republic (20th), Ukrainian Soviet Socialist Republic (19th), Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (19th), Venezuela (20th), Yugoslavia (20th).

Specialized agency: International Labour Organisation (22nd).

Non-governmental organizations: Christian Democratic International (20th), Commission of the Churches on International Affairs of the World Council of Churches (22nd), Four Directions Council (22nd), Grand Council of the Crees (of Quebec) (20th), Indian Council of South America (20th), Inter-American Press Association (20th), International Association Against Torture (22nd), International Bar Association (22nd), International Commission of Jurists (20th), International Council of Jewish Women (20th), International Federation of Human Rights (22nd), International Indian Treaty Council (22nd), International League for the Rights and Liberation of Peoples (20th), International Movement ATD Fourth World (20th), International Union of Students (22nd), Latin American Federation of Associations of Relatives of Disappeared Detainees (22nd), World Confederation of Labour (22nd), World Student Christian Federation (20th).

*/ The figures in brackets indicate the number of the meeting during which the representative spoke.

4. The Commission, in its resolution 1989/45 of 6 March 1989, took note with appreciation of the report of the Working Group of Governmental Experts on the Right to Development (E/CN.4/1989/10) and requested the Secretary-General to circulate it to all Governments, United Nations organs and specialized agencies and other governmental and non-governmental organizations, drawing their attention to the analytical compilation of replies (E/CN.4/AC.39/1989/1). The Commission also requested the Secretary-General to transmit a questionnaire to Governments, United Nations organs and specialized agencies, as well as to other governmental and non-governmental organizations, including those active in development and human rights, in order to elicit from them additional updated and more specific views on the subject of the implementation and further enhancement of the Declaration on the Right to Development.

5. In the same resolution, the Commission invited the Secretary-General to organize, in 1989, within existing resources, a global consultation on the realization of the right to development involving experts with relevant experience gained at the national level and representatives of the United Nations system, including its specialized agencies, regional intergovernmental organizations and interested non-governmental organizations, including those active in development and human rights, to focus on the fundamental problems posed by the implementation of the Declaration, the criteria which might be used to identify progress, and mechanisms for evaluating and stimulating such progress. It further requested the Secretary-General to submit the report on the global consultation to the Commission on Human Rights at its forty-sixth session.

6. The Commission also decided to consider the question of the right to development at its forty-sixth session, as a matter of high priority and continuing interest, under a separate item of the agenda, to be entitled "Question of the realization of the right to development".

7. The Economic and Social Council, by its decision 1989/141 of 24 May 1989 took note of Commission on Human Rights resolution 1989/45 of 6 March 1989 and approved the Commission's invitation to the Secretary-General to organize, in 1989, within existing resources, a global consultation on the realization of the right to development, involving experts with relevant experience gained at the national level and representatives of the United Nations system, including its specialized agencies, regional intergovernmental organizations and interested non-governmental organizations, including those active in development and human rights.

8. The present report is based on information received in reply to the questionnaire transmitted by the Secretary-General in accordance with the request of the Commission on Human Rights in its resolution 1989/45. The report is based on the following replies:

Governments: China (21 July 1989), Dominican Republic (7 September 1989), Netherlands (24 July 1989) and Qatar (14 June 1989).

United Nations organs: United Nations Centre for Human Settlements (19 June 1989), United Nations Development Programme (5 October 1989) and World Food Programme (25 September 1989).

Specialized agencies: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (19 June 1989 and 7 November 1989), International Civil Aviation Organization (22 June 1989), International Labour Office (29 September 1989), United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (7 September 1989) and World Intellectual Property Organization (20 September 1989).

Regional commission: Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (26 September 1989).

Intergovernmental organization: Council for Mutual Economic Assistance (19 June 1989).

Non-governmental organizations: Four Directions Council (10 October 1989), International Association of Lions Clubs (30 August 1989), International Confederation of Free Trade Unions (18 October 1989), International Juridical Organization (13 July and 13 September 1989), International Law Association (14 June 1989) International League for the Rights and Liberation of Peoples (7 November 1989), Inter-Parliamentary Union (3 October 1989), Latin American Council of Catholic Women (27 June 1989), Service, Justice and Peace in Latin America (15 August 1989), United Schools International (21 August 1989), World Education Fellowship (5 October 1989) and World Movement of Mothers (20 July 1989).

9. The following replies indicated that the relevant source had no comment to make:

Government: Netherlands.

United Nations organ: United Nations Development Programme.

Specialized agencies: International Civil Aviation Organization, United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization and World Intellectual Property Organization.

Intergovernmental organization: Council for Mutual Economic Assistance.

Non-governmental organizations: International Association of Lions Clubs, International Law Association and United Schools International.

I. SIGNIFICANCE OF THE DECLARATION AND ITS RELATION
TO OTHER INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS

A. Governments

China

The Chinese Government considers the right to development to be one of the inalienable human rights. Only with the realization of the right to development can the other human rights be fully enjoyed by the people. Thus, to promote a clearer understanding, the interdependence between this right and the other human rights should be widely publicized. The right to development does not simply imply the development of the national economy and the

improvement of the material living standards of the people. It also involves the overall development of all aspects of the economy, society, culture, education, health and social welfare as well as the achievement of social justice.

Dominican Republic

The Government of the Dominican Republic supports the Declaration on the Right to Development and welcomes the fact that the question of the right to development continues to be examined as a matter of high priority and ongoing interest under the item "Question of the realization of the right to development". In view of the current world economic and social situation, there is a need for the Declaration on the Right to Development, which can help to stabilize peoples and hence contribute to world peace.

Qatar

The Government of the State of Qatar supports and welcomes the Declaration on the Right to Development, which was adopted by the General Assembly in 1986 as a result of concerted endeavours by the international community in previous years. The State of Qatar believes that the Declaration, in its present form, achieves one of the basic objectives, namely the establishment of a formula that combines individual and collective rights. Another advantage of the text is that it clearly establishes a link between development and human rights. Moreover, the Declaration places the individual, as a subject rather than an object, at the heart of the development process, thereby implying that individuals should participate in the development process on a voluntary basis.

B. Non-governmental organizations

Service, Justice and Peace in Latin America

The human rights situation in Latin America as regards the realization of the right to development under current circumstances is considerably different from the situation in the region when the United Nations, at the initiative of the Latin American countries themselves, began to deal with this problem.

Current living conditions and economic, social and cultural conditions have deteriorated greatly. Poverty has spread to broad sectors of the population, and there is widespread frustration at the drop in standards of living. This situation has produced acute social tensions and conflicts of various kinds that might jeopardize the States under the rule of law, which today are in the majority. These difficulties are apparent in the external sector which is the sector that imposes restrictions on the development of the countries of the region. It follows that the external debt problem is the main obstacle to the realization of the right to development.

Since the Declaration (General Assembly resolution 41/128) does not establish any strategy for attaining this objective - not being the appropriate place for so doing - the right to development remains an ideal goal towards which efforts by the international community and States in particular should be directed.

The World Education Fellowship

The right to development was felt to be an enormously complicated matter since the interpretation of development can be very wide and relate to the personal intellectual, moral and emotional development of the individual, and also to the economic and social development of a group or a whole nation. The two aspects are not insulated from one another since greater economic development can favour personal development, though not necessarily so. The right to personal development can be supported unequivocally from the standpoint of WEF since its objectives are clearly in the same direction. On the right to economic development, WEF does not necessarily have a view. The only caveat it would raise is that the right to unrestricted economical development is probably not ecologically sound.

II. FACTORS AFFECTING THE REALIZATION OF THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT

A. Respect for human rights, including self-determination

1. Governments

China

The Government is responsible for the promotion of democracy and the rule of law inside the country. It must act to safeguard social stability and order and to ensure for its people the full enjoyment of generally acknowledged human rights, thereby facilitating domestic economic and social development. The Government should also take legislative, judicial, administrative and other measures to ensure that its people can all participate in the development process and have equal rights and opportunities to enjoy its fruits.

Qatar

The State of Qatar acknowledges that the continuation of colonialism, aggression and threats against national sovereignty, national unity and regional peace, as well as foreign occupation, apartheid, all forms of discrimination and domination, and the refusal to recognize the fundamental right of every nation to exercise full sovereignty over its natural resources constitute basic obstacles that impede implementation of the Declaration on the Right to Development and full realization of economic, social and cultural rights.

2. United Nations organ

World Food Programme

Since the "right to development" ultimately devolves around the enhancement of individual participation in and benefit from development in order to achieve individual well-being, human resources development needs to be seen as the core idea behind efforts to promote the right to development. Human resources refer to the entire stock of human attributes - physical, mental and social - which contribute to, and determine, the economic and social well-being of a nation. Seen in this context, the most effective way

to combat the poverty, and related hunger cycle in most of the developing world is not only to invest in the development of human resources but also to create and secure the structures and systems necessary for the productive employment of people and their sustained well-being.

The World Food Programme (WFP) for its part has placed particular emphasis on human resources development. Apart from the World Bank Group, WFP is the largest source of funding for human resources development in the United Nations system. Of the \$US 10 billion in total food aid committed by WFP since the inception of its operations in 1963, 25 per cent has been allocated in direct support of vulnerable group feeding and school feeding projects, the remainder having been devoted largely to support for agricultural and rural development (mostly through labour-intensive works) and to refugee and emergency assistance. This form of assistance is also viewed by WFP as contributing ultimately to human development especially since the family rations provided under these projects, which are always directed to the poor, alleviate the serious effect of under-nourishment on human development. Increasing efforts are being made to incorporate, in food aided projects, the training and other activities for human resources development that are financed by Governments, with assistance from other United Nations agencies, bilateral donors and non-governmental organizations. Food aid should therefore be seen as a most valuable part of the resources of the United Nations system directed at human resources development.

3. Specialized agency

Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

In order to realize the right to development, it is essential that all partners concerned and particularly the beneficiaries participate in the development process. The role of NGOs, particularly those active in the field of human rights and development, should be strengthened so that they can play a greater role in the implementation of the resolution. As pointed out by the World Conference on Agrarian Reform and Rural Development (WCARRD) in 1979, special attention should be given to vulnerable groups, such as women, youth, landless labourers, shifting cultivators and nomadic populations. Another basic pre-condition for the realization of the right to development is the need to ensure equitable access to land, water and other natural resources.

4. Non-governmental organizations

International Confederation of Free Trade Unions

Development and democracy are inextricably linked. This is true in all areas of life including industrial democracy, and trade unionists need to have the necessary guarantees of their rights to represent their members' interests effectively. Experiences of economic development have shown that its benefits must be shared fairly, and that progress in the social sphere must accompany that in the economic, for otherwise the prevalence of extremes of wealth and poverty will sow the seeds for political and social unrest. More freedom for trade unions would enable a more equitable distribution of the gains of development and help to create flexible social structures that can support economic change.

International League for the Rights and Liberation of Peoples

Taking the Declaration on the Right to Development (General Assembly resolution 41/128 of 4 December 1986) as our basis, we must continue to develop our thinking on the concept of development, bearing in mind in particular:

(a) that it is a comprehensive process whose main subject is the human being and whose purpose is the full realization of human beings in all respects (physical, intellectual, moral and cultural) within the community;

(b) that this process requires the active and conscious participation of individuals and communities in decision-making at all stages, from determination of objectives and means of achieving them through their implementation and assessment of results;

(c) that the right to development encompasses the right to enjoy civil and political rights and freedoms and the absence of any type of discrimination;

(d) that there is no single or pre-established model for development, which is why genuine development requires the self-determination of peoples, recognition of their sovereignty over their natural resources and wealth and full respect for their cultural identity;

(e) that development is not a problem which concerns solely the "developing" countries, but an objective of interest to the entire international community, because of the interdependence of all nations and also the fact that the developed countries have pockets of underdevelopment in the classic sense and problems that warrant attention because of their bearing on the development process: the relationship between economic growth and the well-being of the individual; problems of alienation, over-consumption, non-participation in decision-making; and environmentally unsound policies" (E/CN.4/1334, para. 25).

International Juridical Organization

The IJO is of the opinion that the right to development consists of each individual's right to a dignified life and freedom from poverty; the right for the populace to follow, after political independence, economic self-determination; the right for the States to be able to guarantee the fundamental needs of its own population without interference in its sovereign rights by other States. The realization of the right to development requires not only economic intervention but, above all, political and legal intervention.

An important element of the right to development is the relationship between the different legal subjects: States, peoples and individuals.

Peoples and individuals have a particular role versus the States in two specific areas: the involvement of the population in the development policy and the exploitation of imported resources to their advantage. The first aspect is a valid objective for both the developing countries and the

industrialized countries as is shown, for example, by the development aid policy of Italy (law No. 49 of 1987), where the involvement of the local population and local groups is encouraged at the different stages with positive results.

Bilateral agreements between Italy and developing countries show the same tendency of involvement and active participation by the population being regarded as one of the most important elements.

The problem of the effective use of the resources offered by international development co-operation in order to improve the standard of living is of crucial importance and is connected with the issue of linking the development policy of the industrialized countries to respect for human rights in the beneficiary States.

The problems are however diverse: the main problem being that there is not yet full agreement on the meaning of the concept "human rights" since this concept is much related to the social situation, history and legal and political traditions in the different continents and countries. There exists also the risk that the link between development co-operation - human rights is used for other than pure humanitarian aims. It should, however, be confirmed that a link of this kind with the necessary guarantees is a key element for putting into practice the right to development.

Latin American Council of Catholic Women

The Council referred to the spiritual dimension of man and indicated that respect for the human rights related to this was crucial to the achievement of development by all men.

World Movement of Mothers

The World Movement of Mothers remarked that the current tendency to proclaim new rights, while the old ones are still so flagrantly flouted in so many parts of the world and by so many member States, seems dangerous.

The temptation is great to indulge in what the French call "la fuite en avant", instead of concentrating on solving already recognized problems. WMA is in full agreement with the right to development but would not like it to serve as an excuse for ignoring or denying other basic human rights. In particular, governments should not deny the basic human rights of minorities, of women, of children, of the handicapped, of the elderly, etc. on the pretext that these rights run counter to the right to development of the majority. No healthy or durable development can be achieved under such circumstances. There are many examples of this in recent and current history.

B. International peace, security and disarmament

1. Government

China

In the domain of international politics, it is imperative that racism, colonialism and hegemonism be eradicated, that foreign invasions and occupations be stopped, that international peace and stability be maintained

and that the right to self-determination of the peoples of all countries be assured. Only then can we hope to induce an international environment favourable to the realization of the right to development.

2. Non-governmental organizations

Inter-Parliamentary Union

The 82nd Inter-Parliamentary Conference held in London (United Kingdom) from 4 to 9 September 1989 examined the problems of peaceful uses of outer space for the benefit of mankind. It called, *inter alia*, on States "to envisage introducing, as necessary, procedures, mechanisms and bodies for international co-operation so as to contribute to the advancement of space science and technology, to the strengthening of international security and confidence, economic and social development, and the prevention and handling of disasters and major threats".

Service, Justice and Peace in Latin America

The current international situation appears to be favourable for fostering international co-operation concerning the right to development. The achievements in the field of disarmament and the settlement of various regional armed conflicts that were negatively affecting international peace and security have eliminated a series of impediments that had previously been hampering the development of measures of co-operation.

C. New international economic order

1. Governments

China

In the domain of international economics, all countries, especially developed countries, should actively strive to redress the injustice and imbalance in the world economic structure. To begin with, they could endeavour to raise the prices of primary commodities, stabilize exchange rates, lower interest rates, improve the terms for transfer of technology, alleviate the debt burden of third world countries, overcome trade protectionism and increase their own official development assistance. They could set practical goals and adopt feasible policies and measures to improve the international economic environment. This would moderate and gradually eliminate the constraints suffered by the developing countries.

Qatar

The State of Qatar believes that there is a need to place international economic relations on a more equitable footing and therefore supports the Declaration on the Right to Development, as well as the Declaration on the Establishment of a New International Economic Order, the Charter of Economic Rights and Duties of States, the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, whose implementation would

promote international economic co-operation on a basis of equality of rights, justice, respect for sovereignty, non-interference in the internal affairs of States, non-aggression, the furtherance of mutual and equitable interests, elimination of the injustices suffered as a result of the use of force, and the promotion of social justice.

The economic factor lies in the establishment of a new international economic order based on equal sovereignty, interdependence, mutual interest and co-operation among all States. Accordingly, as a prerequisite for the realization of every people's right to development, international economic relations should be restructured on an equitable and democratic basis and a new international economic order should be established with a view to ensuring equal economic security for all States. Furthermore, exercise of the right to development implies the prevalence of peace and the establishment of a new international economic order based on respect for human rights. Consequently, States Members of the United Nations have a joint and separate obligation to create the conditions required for realization of the right to development, paying special attention to the obstacles that are impeding the endeavours of the developing countries to guarantee the enjoyment of this right.

2. Non-governmental organizations

International League for the Rights and Liberation of Peoples

Among the factors in the international sphere that prevent many countries from implementing the right to development, mention should be made of the following: (a) the external debt; (b) the imbalance in the terms of trade; (c) the crisis in the international financial system; (d) South-North capital flows; and (e) the adjustment policies advocated by the IMF and the World Bank.

To overcome these impediments, the following steps should be taken:

- (a) Calling of a moratorium on the external debt;
- (b) Full or partial cancelling, as necessary, of the developing countries' external debt. In case of partial remission, the capital repayment period should be extended and the interest rate on the remaining debt lowered;
- (c) Setting of stable, remunerative and equitable commodity prices and elimination of certain restrictions on the developed countries' imports of manufactured and semi-manufactured products from the developing countries;
- (d) Reform of the international monetary system, in particular, so as to stabilize exchange rates and discourage international financial speculation;
- (e) Application of existing economic, legal, fiscal and financial mechanisms and establishment of new methods to reverse the capital flow (and particularly the capital drain) from South to North.

It is vital to reverse this trend, for the economic development of the developing countries requires help from the developed countries in the form of capital, technology, etc. At the very least, the target of 0.7 per cent

of GNP set by the United Nations should be attained. This would be one way, easily available to the developed countries and mutually advantageous, of paying back the substantial contribution - involuntary and at the cost of enormous suffering - made by the countries of the third world, when they were colonies, to the industrial development of the then-metropolises (E/CN.4/1334, paras. 52 and 53);

"The NGOs recognize that financial institutions such as the IMF and the World Bank are not simply 'above' or 'outside of' the current crisis in development, but that they themselves are in crisis, and the NGOs have begun seriously to wonder whether these institutions' prescriptions are helpful or even feasible ... As a point of departure, the NGOs believe that if the IMF and the World Bank are really trying to aid the development of the third world, they should: become genuinely democratic and multilateral, concerned with responding to the needs of the South and not only the interests and ideological concerns of the North; find a way to make the development of the poor masses the basis of their policies and programmes ..." (from the final declaration of the NGO-United Nations seminar, held at Oxford, United Kingdom, from 19 to 22 September 1987).

International Juridical Organization

The fundamental objective of the right to development is that the industrialized countries commit not only a portion of their resources to development aid but, should also consist of the progressive reforms of the laws that regulate the international "economic system", to enable the realization of the "égalité des chances" proclaimed in the Declaration of 1986.

In this sequence of ideas, the right to development and the new international economic order go hand in hand: in fact, the objective of the new international economic order is to replace the current international economy by a more democratic and efficient one, and, the right to development is a legal instrument which can support such an evolution. Quite clearly, within this context, the position of the countries takes on a different aspect according to their economic situation, but always with a common goal.

The obligations of the industrialized countries should not be limited to an obligation to assist, they should in fact contribute to the formulation of new economic rules which would allow a more democratic economic international situation.

In addition, there exists a particular obligation for the developing countries. Firstly, they have to guarantee their own people the benefits of the results of international co-operation, and parallel to that, they have to let the people participate in the politics of development.

A concrete example of how a new approach at legal, political and economic level can be reached is the change from the "most favoured nation clause" to a system of "general trade preferences" which has been used in the Lomé agreement between the European Community and the ACP States.

Inter-Parliamentary Union

The 82nd Inter-Parliamentary Conference held in London (United Kingdom) from 4 to 9 September 1989 took up the subject entitled "Population and food equation and the search for rational and efficient solutions to the problem of the third world debt to ensure that the world can eat". Parliamentarians outlined a series of specific measures to bring about more harmonious economic development of the world.

III. IMPLEMENTATION OF THE DECLARATION AT THE NATIONAL LEVEL

A. Governments

China

The Chinese Government is consciously formulating a development strategy which takes into account the realities of China along the following lines: to allow for the parallel existence of State, collective and private ownership; to set up economic zones; to start developing the coastal areas which will have a locomotive effect, pulling the interior forward; and to decentralize decision-making so that regions can set their own development goals according to local conditions.

The people are encouraged to participate in the development process so that they can release their creative energies. Women receive pay equal to that of men. The handicapped are provided with employment, working to the extent of their abilities. In this way, all the favourable factors can come into play to animate and develop a dynamic economy, eventually raising the living standard of the people.

A policy of reform is being instituted that looks outward towards management know-how, advanced technology and investment to further China's development.

In the process of developing its economy, China is also building up its democratic and legal systems with which to protect the civil and political rights of its people.

China makes use of its taxation and welfare facilities to prevent and eliminate disparities between wealth and poverty so that every Chinese citizen can justly claim the fruits of development.

Qatar

With regard to the internal conditions required for the implementation of the right to development, the State of Qatar supports the provisions of the Declaration, which stipulate that States have a right and an obligation to formulate an appropriate national development policy aimed at achieving continual improvements in the well-being of the population as a whole and of all its individual members on a basis of active, free and purposeful participation in development and in the equitable distribution of the benefits resulting therefrom. At the same time, there should be an inseparable link between the realization of the individual's rights and his obligations towards society since, if an individual attempts to exercise his rights at the expense of society, he is actually violating those rights.

B. United Nations organ

United Nations Centre for Human Settlements

The concerns of UNCHS (Habitat) with development are primarily focused on strengthening the local and domestic capacities for production, operation, maintenance and management of human settlements activities. The global mandate of the Centre covers the multidimensional nature of problems and solutions shared by many countries as relate to the scarcity of resources, inadequate institutional capacities and the lack of a legal and financial framework for alleviating the problems. However, the thrust of UNCHS (Habitat) activities is in assisting capacity-building efforts at the national level. These activities which relate to the concept of right to development had three main features:

(a) Provision of basic human needs, including adequate housing which was recognized by the Commission on Human Rights as a basic human right;

(b) Adoption of strategies and policies for development of human settlements including shelter and related services for all, and their integration in the framework of national development plans; and

(c) Integration of the poor and disadvantaged which make up a large segment of population, in the low-income countries, in the mainstream of economic activities, by stimulating activities which require unskilled labour input and other locally available factors or production.

C. Non-governmental organizations

International Confederation of Free Trade Unions

Consultation of all the socio-economic interest groups is essential if development policies are to enjoy widespread support, and trade unions must be considered partners in development. When sacrifice is required during a period of economic adjustment, a perception that all are contributing to the effort for economic recovery is imperative. Consultative procedures must be used to decide on the priorities for adjustment and on measures to reduce the impact of austerity on the poorer workers. Measures to wipe out corruption and inefficiency - at all levels - are paramount if the government is to establish popular confidence in its policies.

Inter-Parliamentary Union

In their resolve to contribute to the development of effective international economic co-operation, parliamentarians took up the problem of tourism whose tremendous economic impact on the modern world has perhaps not been sufficiently recognized to date. The Inter-Parliamentary Conference on Tourism organized by IPU and the World Tourism Organization in April 1989 in The Hague (Netherlands) recommended, among other things, that Parliaments should ensure that the tourism components be taken into account when other issues of national importance (e.g. economic, regional development and security questions) are studied so that tourism becomes part of comprehensive national policies and priorities for development. The conclusions of this Conference were also issued as an official document of the Economic and Social Council (E/1989/77).

Service, Justice and Peace in Latin America

It is also of fundamental importance to disseminate the contents of the right to development and include it in educational and research activities, to familiarize all countries with the provisions of the Declaration, as recommended by the Working Group.

World Movement of Mothers

The World Movement of Mothers suggested that national governments should be asked primarily to consider domestic problems and obstacles. It is notoriously easy for them to place the entire responsibility for certain shortcomings on international reasons, overlooking the often equally responsible domestic failings such as poor planning, graft, corruption, favouritism, negligence or persecution of minorities, et al. They should, therefore, be asked to concentrate on the domestic aspect of these problems and should, moreover, be requested to spend less time extolling their own virtues (not always visible in results) and more time in lucid analysis of their problems and the means with which to solve them. Therefore, questions 2, 3, 6 and 9 seem to be particularly valid for questionnaires addressed to governments.

IV. IMPLEMENTATION AT THE INTERNATIONAL LEVEL

A. Governments

China

The foreign policy being pursued by China is based on the principles of independence, autonomy and peace. China opposes all forms of racism, colonialism and hegemonism. It actively seeks to improve its relations with neighbouring and other countries. To maintain international peace and security, China favours the use of non-violent means to resolve conflicts between nations and to create a climate which will favour the fulfilment of the right to development. At the same time, China takes it upon itself to develop economic exchanges with other countries and, in so far as it is able, to extend assistance to the third world and contribute to the removal of unjust and unbalanced conditions in the world economy.

Dominican Republic

1. The Dominican Republic, as a signatory of the Charter of the United Nations, believes that the concept of the right to development should be refined. Problems should be identified and measures adopted to implement the right to development.
2. International co-operation is needed for the development of the underdeveloped countries especially. We believe that the developing countries should be adequately represented in the working groups so that they can have the opportunity to express their opinions and defend their positions in the search for ways to implement this right. The industrialized countries should fulfil their commitments to provide unconditional aid to the developing countries.

Qatar

1. The State of Qatar feels that there is an urgent need to implement the right to development as a human right. Qatar is convinced that the international community is fully determined to promote the human element of the right to development, since development that does not take individual well-being into account cannot be regarded as development in the true sense of the term.
2. The interdependence of the international community implies the need for concerted international endeavours to achieve the successful implementation of the right to development, and States have an international as well as national obligation to take the necessary measures in order to promote development.
3. The international development agencies and financial institutions should play a fundamental role in ensuring that their programmes and agreements cater for the needs of the developing countries.

B. Specialized agency

International Labour Organisation

During the consideration of the report of the Director-General (Part I) entitled "Recovery and Employment" at the 76th session (1989) of the International Labour Conference, emphasis was put in particular on the role that the ILO could play through its capacity and experience concerning labour market problems and its tripartite approach involving the actual participation of the social partners, as well as on the importance and necessity of strengthening international co-operation, in a situation where the problem of external debt continues to dominate the international scene and North-South relations. In the context of preparing the International Development Strategy for the next decade, the international community and the ILO in particular must contribute to the emergence of a new perception - which was already apparent - of development and world solidarity, and above all to encourage the growing movement aimed at placing man at the centre of development.

C. Non-governmental organizations

Four Directions Council

1. Implementation of the Declaration should begin within the United Nations system itself. It should involve measures for assuring that United Nations resources are (1) prioritized for projects which are designed to strengthen the enjoyment of human rights (economic and social as well as civil and political), and (2) not contributed to any project which is incompatible with the human rights of the people affected. Effective administrative and procedural measures to achieve this could include the following:

Administrative

2. All United Nations programmes that provide technical or financial assistance for development should review their operations manuals and project-appraisal guidelines, to ensure that compliance with human rights standards is a requirement for United Nations participation in development

activities. Manuals and guidelines should be revised where necessary, and public information materials should also be revised to explain clearly the way in which human rights factors will be considered as part of the project review process. Every programme should be required to report to the Commission on Human Rights within two years on the administrative measures taken.

3. Advisory services in the field of human rights are needed within the United Nations administrative system. Human rights officers should be assigned to each operational programme, on a full-time basis, co-ordinated by the Centre for Human Rights. Their functions would include technical assistance to programme staff, providing information on the human rights aspects of the programme to both NGOs and governments, and reporting any relevant information on the human rights performance of the programme to the Commission on Human Rights. Grassroots NGOs should be able to communicate concerns directly to a programme's human rights officer, without regard to consultative status.

Procedural

4. Every application for technical or financial assistance from any United Nations system programme should be required to include the following information:

(a) A statement indicating clearly how the project will affect the rights contained in the International Bill of Human Rights. The goals of the project should be related explicitly to specific human rights standards wherever possible;

(b) A statement explaining what consultations were undertaken at the grassroots level to evaluate the human rights impacts of the project, and summarizing the views expressed by grassroots NGOs. The NGOs consulted should be identified, with contact addresses;

(c) A statement explaining in detail what arrangements have been made to include the people and communities directly affected by the project in the further planning, implementation, and review of the project.

5. Programme guidelines, and letters of commitment to governments, should routinely include a statement that information submitted by the applicant with regard to human rights impact assessments and community-level participation in project implementation, are in the nature of assurances, and that continued United Nations involvement in the project will depend on the accuracy and full observance of these assurances. Projects should ordinarily be subjected to an annual, or mid-term review of compliance with these human rights assurances, at which the government will be invited to respond to any concerns communicated by NGOs to the programme's human rights officer.

International Confederation of Free Trade Unions

1. Greater solidarity at continental level is required if the voice of Africa is to make itself heard in international fora. Faster economic growth requires increased intra-African co-operation, to develop complementary industries, set up regional and continental trading arrangements and to take

trans-frontier measures to protect the environment. African trade union solidarity can provide support for trade union rights and can establish a regular input into debates at the continental level.

2. International solidarity must fight for action to promote African development. Trade unions will put pressure on their governments to adopt concrete measures to increase the resource flows going to Africa. The ILO is an important channel for raising the concerns of workers at international level and putting pressure on countries to respect trade union rights. Finally, trade union solidarity will continue to make its direct contribution to the creation of strong trade unions through providing international support to the work of trade unions in Africa.

International League for the Rights and the Liberation of Peoples

The need should be stressed for placing information campaigns on the right to development on an equal footing with information campaigns on other human rights and the possibility should be considered of including the right to development in the programme of activities of the Advisory Services Section (report of the Working Group, document E/CN.4/1989/10, paras. 29 and 30).

Inter-Parliamentary Union

1. The 80th Inter-Parliamentary Conference, held in Sofia (Bulgaria) from 19 to 24 September 1988, undertook an in-depth examination of action by Parliaments in developing international co-operation in the humanitarian field and in bringing national legislation into line with international human rights norms, principles and instruments. The Conference reaffirmed, inter alia, "that the right to development is an inviolable right, the enjoyment of which would further the exercise of civil, political, economic, social and cultural rights". In full accord with the United Nations Declaration on the Right to Development the Conference called on Parliaments "to undertake constructive efforts jointly at the international level to promote human rights, seek agreement and mutual understanding, improve readiness to co-operate and seek solutions to world problems such as hunger, disease, poverty, homelessness and environmental destruction, and to establish a just and democratic international economic system".

2. The 81st Inter-Parliamentary Conference held in Budapest (Hungary) from 13 to 18 March 1989 examined a whole range of issues concerning the protection of the rights of children, including those relating to development.

3. In conformity with Articles 7 and 8 of the Declaration on the Right to Development, the 81st Conference stressed that "the rights of children can best be advanced and guaranteed through concerted efforts by the whole international community to establish a just international economic order and to settle conflicts and remove hotbeds of tension by means of dialogue and negotiations, so that the precarious situation of children in developing countries may be redressed".

Service, Justice and Peace in Latin America

1. It is essential to make a greater effort towards more effective co-ordination among all United Nations development activities. This requires bringing the various programmes of the United Nations and the specialized

agencies into line with each other so that all efforts focus on consideration of the right to development as a fundamental right. The realization of this right can be evaluated by analysing compliance with economic, social and cultural rights. In this respect it is crucial for the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights to consider the right to development when it studies the reports submitted by the States parties to the International Covenant on this subject.

2. We concur with the Working Group's other recommendation to the effect that the right to development should be fully integrated with other human rights in the World Public Information Campaign for Human Rights to be held this year.

3. First world countries have been able to release enormous financial and economic resources that might be devoted to development purposes. In this way, the next few years will be a test for international co-operation and universal solidarity, for the purpose of fully realizing the terms of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, to the effect that "the peoples of the United Nations have in the Charter reaffirmed their faith in fundamental human rights, in the dignity and worth of the human person and in the equal rights of men and women and have determined to promote social progress and better standards of life in larger freedom ...".

4. In this new social and political context, the international community must have a high-level forum in which to debate these issues. We agree on the need to hold a World Conference for the realization of the right to development with the participation of representatives of the United Nations system, its specialized agencies, the regional intergovernmental organizations and non-governmental organizations working in the field.

V. THE ROLE OF WOMEN IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT

A. United Nations organ

World Food Programme

1. In discussing the role of food aid in support of the right to food and the right to development, mention must be made of the key importance of integrating the women's dimension - especially in Africa where women play a crucial role as food producers. WFP has made deliberate efforts in this field which is considered as an important sub-set of the human resources field. There is an urgent need for greater recognition and appreciation of women's productive and reproductive roles, and the implications of the continuum of those roles for the design of programmes directed at improving living standards not only for women and children but for society at large.

2. There is no dichotomy between women's productive and maternal-related tasks. Both tasks are performed within a matrix of labour time allocations, which, naturally, implies a physical limit. A major failing, both of domestic policies and programmes of international assistance, is that in addressing women's reproductive roles in the social sectors and their productive roles in the economic field separately, they tend to dichotomize in development programming what is harmonized in everyday life. The Programme has recently

prepared a policy paper for its governing body (the Committee on Food Aid Policies and Programmes) which incorporates detailed guidelines tailored specifically to the conscious incorporation of the women's dimension - in terms of gender responsiveness - into all aspects of the design, implementation and evaluation of WFP-assisted projects. This is an approach which, with due consideration for diversities in mandates and emphases, other agencies within the United Nations system as well as outside want to pursue.

B. Non-governmental organizations

Inter-Parliamentary Union

1. In line with article 8 of the Declaration which stipulates that "effective measures should be undertaken to ensure that women have an active role in the development process", the Inter-Parliamentary Union has been pursuing an extensive programme of studies of the status of women, basically in the political decision-making process. The results of the latest studies can be found in ECOSOC document E/CN.4/1989/NGO/24.

2. A world-wide Inter-Parliamentary Symposium held in Geneva from 20 to 24 November 1989 undertook a detailed examination of the whole range of issues linked to the participation of women in the political and parliamentary decision-making process.

World Movement of Mothers

1. As a Movement representing women and, in particular, mothers, WMM wishes to stress the extreme importance of education as the basis for all development. If the young are to be properly educated, special efforts must be made for their mothers' education. Literate and educated mothers provide invaluable support in raising literate and educated children. Special attention must therefore be given to the problem of the education of women.

2. To this purpose, those programmes that have proved most successful are the grassroots programmes, concrete in their implementation and in their objectives and circumscribed in scope. Far more support should be given to such programmes, which, moreover, are less costly, than to huge, ambitious programmes that are discovered years later to have been enriching experiences for their developers and organizers but not necessarily for those whom they were designed to help.

VI. EVALUATION SYSTEM ON THE IMPLEMENTATION AND FURTHER
ENHANCEMENT OF THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT

A. Governments

China

1. The realization of the right to development is necessarily a long and arduous task. It cannot be entrusted solely to human rights agencies but must involve the co-ordinated efforts of all States Members of the United Nations, intergovernmental organizations, special agencies and interested parties. Co-ordination and co-operation between human rights and development agencies

within the United Nations system and between the United Nations system and other special agencies, intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations must be strengthened. It is suggested that the Secretary-General of the United Nations redouble his efforts in this regard.

2. In order to propagate as widely as possible the substance and meaning of the Declaration on the Right to Development, both internationally and within each country, the United Nations could hold seminars and workshops for the general dissemination and understanding of the Declaration.

3. The human rights agencies of the United Nations should give as much emphasis to the Declaration on the Right to Development as to the other international human rights instruments. The Commission on Human Rights should request the Secretary-General of the United Nations to make a detailed study of ways and means, methods, measures, obstacles and prospects for the realization of the right to development and to submit proposals thereon for consideration by the Commission on Human Rights and the General Assembly.

4. A mechanism should be set up to evaluate the implementation of the Declaration on the Right to Development and to propose actions to be taken in the future. It is also possible to consider appointing a Special Rapporteur to study the above question.

5. The Secretary-General should provide sufficient financial support to activities on the right to development.

6. The Commission on Human Rights could authorize the United Nations Centre for Human Rights to make a compilation of international instruments and national legislation on the right to development for general distribution.

Qatar

1. The implementation of the Declaration on the Right to Development should include national and international measures, together with a definition of the fields of development that require urgent attention. The countries and groups of individuals requiring urgent development assistance should also be defined with a view to the formulation of appropriate mechanisms to provide those target groups with such assistance.

2. The State of Qatar believes that the present working methods of the Commission on Human Rights should be improved through the introduction of new methods to enable it to deal effectively with the problems relating to the implementation of the right to development in the Commission's future work.

B. United Nations organs

United Nations Centre for Human Settlements

The questionnaire on the realization of the Declaration on the Right to Development, would benefit from developing specific questions, on a sectoral basis, as relate to the degree of participation of people in the process as well as their shares of the benefits of development.

World Food Programme

Any constructive measures aimed at promoting the right to development should take into account the following essential points:

(a) The right to development should be pursued from the point of view of the human person as the central subject of development. In this connection, increasing attention should be paid to promoting human resources development as the bedrock of true self-reliance.

(b) Governments should play the lead role in these efforts with the United Nations and other donor countries and organizations playing a facilitating or catalytic role.

(c) The right to development and the right to food are inextricably linked and therefore efforts to remove obstacles in the way of the latter should be consciously integrated into broader programmes and activities to promote the former.

(d) Efforts to promote effective implementation of both the procedural and substantive aspects of the General Assembly resolution (41/128) must go beyond the dissemination of information and education and research activities. These have been recommended by the Working Group of Governmental Experts in their report of 27 January 1987 and are no doubt important. But they must be coupled with institutional structures and mechanisms for monitoring implementation on a stage-by-stage basis. As a first step, a simple and practical reporting system will need to be developed for the United Nations agencies which could be completed at the country level under the auspices of the UNDP. This would be a way of enhancing co-ordination within the United Nations system as well or with Governments.

C. Specialized agencies

Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

1. FAO considers that Commission on Human Rights resolution 1989/45 on the Right to Development is a logical follow-up to resolution 41/128 entitled "Declaration on the Right to Development" adopted by the General Assembly in 1986. As this Declaration was not adopted by consensus and as little information is as yet available at national levels as to how the development process protects human rights and vice versa, we consider it essential that governments, NGOs and the secretariats of the United Nations agencies continue to emphasize the urgency for its enhancement and implementation.

2. FAO shares the view of the Working Group of Experts on the Right to Development that a periodic evaluation should take place on the progress achieved in implementing the Declaration. The discussions of such progress reports at the United Nations would contribute towards improving the international and national political situation with regard to the right to development. The 11 points suggested in the draft questionnaire on the realization of the Declaration on the Right to Development are very comprehensive. We consider them a suitable tool for the evaluation of progress achieved. We also support the proposal to hold a global consultation in 1989, if possible.

International Labour Organisation

As regards the reports that might be requested of States on the implementation of the Declaration, it would appear that the proposed questionnaire (E/CN.4/1989/10/Annex I) includes a number of points, in particular points 3, 4, 5 and 6, which would cover in substance the type of information requested of Governments under various international instruments, including the International Covenants, the ILO Conventions and Recommendations on employment and human resources development policies and the many ILO and other international instruments dealing with specific civil and political as well as economic, social and cultural rights. Appropriate co-ordination in this respect should be considered in any reporting scheme to be proposed on the implementation of the right to development.

D. Regional commission

Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean

The Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean is of the view that the "Illustrative List of Points" contained in Annex I of the Report of the Working Group (E/CN.4/1989/10/Annex I) still requires some careful elaboration to transform it into a questionnaire that is capable of eliciting responses from a large proportion of governments and relevant organizations. For this purpose, it is suggested that the questions be as specific as possible and require only short or multiple choice responses, since often the respondents are too short of time or are unwilling to draft lengthy explicative answers.

E. Non-governmental organization

Four Directions Council

1. Two aspects of the implementation of the Declaration will require further research: (1) measurement of the progressive achievement of economic, social and cultural rights, and (2) interdependence of human rights. These issues need to be addressed rigorously - that is to say, quantitatively, based on concrete observational research - but not necessarily "objectively", since the enjoyment of human rights is a subjective experience for the individual, rather than a physical status that can be measured mechanically. Until more reliable and widely-accepted methods of measurement have been developed, human rights impact assessment will tend to be relatively imprecise, and therefore unnecessarily political.

2. With the co-operation of the Centre for Human Rights, the Centre for Social Development, and relevant specialized agencies, the Secretary-General could initiate a series of technical seminars on measurement, and on the quantitative study of interdependence of rights. These seminars could be conducted in tandem with the work of the Special Rapporteur on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.

Annex

ILLUSTRATIVE LIST OF POINTS TO BE INCLUDED IN A QUESTIONNAIRE ON THE
REALIZATION OF THE DECLARATION ON THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT

Should the Commission on Human Rights decide to propose to the Economic and Social Council that States should periodically (triennially or quinquennially) report on the implementation of the Declaration on the Right to Development it might take into account the following types of questions:

1. Which are the essential elements of the content of the right to development in the context of the domestic socio-political and legal system (art. 1).
2. Which are the essential features and objectives of the domestic development model and which are the main difficulties (domestic and international) encountered in the process of its realization (arts. 1 and 2).
3. How is the duty of States to formulate appropriate development policies (art. 2, para. 3) being carried out and which are the main difficulties (domestic and international) in this process.
4. What are the main instruments guaranteeing equality of opportunity for all individuals in their access to basic resources and services (art. 8) and to the benefits resulting from development.
5. What steps are being taken to eliminate obstacles to the realization of the right to development, resulting from failure to observe civil and political rights as well as economic, social and cultural rights (art. 6, para 3, as well as arts. 2, 3 and 5).
6. What steps are being taken to encourage popular participation in all spheres (art. 8, para. 2).
7. What steps should be taken to give effect to the provisions of article 4 of the Declaration relating to the duty of States to formulate international development policies with a view to facilitating the full realization of the right to development.
8. What steps are being taken to contribute to the strengthening of international peace and security and particularly to the reduction of military spending (art. 7).
9. What steps are being taken domestically to secure the full exercise and progressive enhancement of the right to development (art. 10).
10. What steps should be taken at the international level to ensure the full exercise and progressive enhancement of the right to development (art. 10).
11. What steps have been taken or are proposed in respect of recommendations made in the reports of the Working Group of Experts on the Right to Development.
