



Economic and Social Council

Provisional

14 July 2005

Original: English

Substantive session of 2005

Coordination segment

Provisional summary record of the 18th meeting

Held at Headquarters, New York, on Thursday, 7 July 2005, at 10 a.m.

President: Mr. Hachani (Vice-President) (Tunisia)

Contents

Towards achieving internationally agreed development goals, including those contained in the Millennium Declaration

Corrections to this record should be submitted in one of the working languages. They should be set forth in a memorandum and also incorporated in a copy of the record. They should be sent *within one week of the date of this document* to the Chief, Official Records Editing Section, room DC2-750, 2 United Nations Plaza.

05-41159 (E)

*** 0541159 ***

In the absence of the President, Mr. Hachani (Tunisia), Vice-President, took the Chair.

The meeting was called to order at 10.15 a.m.

Towards achieving internationally agreed development goals, including those contained in the Millennium Declaration (E/2005/56)

Panel discussion on implementing the internationally agreed development goals, including those contained in the Millennium Declaration: perspectives and strategies

1. **The President** said that the panel discussion would focus on the work of the United Nations system organizations in Tanzania, thereby giving the delegates the opportunity to hear the perspectives of various national stakeholders, the United Nations country team, government officials and civil society. Delegates would be able to review the United Nations strengths and weaknesses in assisting the Tanzanian Government in its efforts to achieve the international development goals.

2. **Mr. Hendra** (United Nations Resident Coordinator for the United Republic of Tanzania), Moderator, said that national ownership in the United Republic of Tanzania was strong. The discussions would focus on the implementation and monitoring of the international and national development goals in terms of the national policy framework. The presentations would also touch on the role of the United Nations, particularly with regard to establishing a stronger alignment with the national processes.

3. **Ms. Mapunjo** (Commissioner for External Finance, Ministry of Finance, United Republic of Tanzania) said that her Government had started to work on the Millennium Development Goals in 2000. The main priority was to eradicate poverty by 2010, but that could not be accomplished unless foreign resources were extended. Other Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS) priorities included universal primary education, improved health and gender equality. New development approaches had been institutionalized under the Tanzania Assistance Strategy (TAS) 2002. Some TAS best practices included government leadership in developing policies and strategies, involvement of other stakeholders in the development management process and the integration of external resources into the strategic expenditure framework.

4. There had been several positive outcomes of PRS1. Significant improvements had been made in priority sectors, particularly those of health and education. The final PRS I report emphasized that sustainable economic growth was the key to poverty reduction. The report also laid down the foundation for the national development agenda, the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (NSGRP/MKUKUTA). MKUKUTA integrated the Millennium Development Goals and other international development commitments at the country level, and coordinated all forms of implementation of the policies, strategies and initiatives aimed at growth and the reduction of poverty.

5. A Joint Assistance Strategy (JAS) aligning external resources with national development priorities under the MKUKUTA had also been formulated. The JAS principles included national ownership and government leadership of the development process, division of labour based on comparative advantages and a greater role for non-State actors in the development management process.

6. The United Nations played a fundamental role in providing policy and technical support under the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) and helping to coordinate the division of labour and cooperation under the JAS process.

7. **Mr. Mkai** (Director-General, National Bureau of Statistics, United Republic of Tanzania) said that a database had been set up to monitor poverty and the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals. The Tanzania Socio-Economic Database (TSED) was an indicator and database system which facilitated the systematization, storage and analysis of performance indicators and allowed user-friendly access to data and presentations in maps, graphs, tables and reports. TSED was running on a stand-alone basis and on the Web. A few sample compact discs were available for those delegates who wished to study the database.

8. A common database had been set up because data were not easily accessible. Two focal persons in more than 20 TSED collaborating ministries and institutions were being trained to use and update the database. Target users included local government planners and policymakers, non-governmental organizations and donors. As a tool for the storage and dissemination of all quantitative information, TSED was at the very heart of Tanzanian poverty monitoring systems.

9. The majority of the Millennium Development Goals and targets had been incorporated in order to highlight priorities using empirical data; to inform the public and policymakers on progress in poverty reduction and goal achievement; and to trigger action to meet time-bound targets. Graphs pertaining to different goals and targets were provided as examples of available data.

10. Finally, TSED encouraged South-South cooperation, in that officials from several other countries had come to the United Republic of Tanzania to study the database.

11. **Mr. Kajege** (Coordinator, Coalition on Debt and Development, United Republic of Tanzania) said that civil society organizations had played a significant role in the formulation and monitoring of the first Poverty Reduction Strategy (PRS I) in 2000. In 2004, they participated in the formulation of the National Strategy for Growth and Reduction of Poverty (NSGRP), commonly referred to as MKUKUTA. Both programmes complemented the Millennium Development Goal targets.

12. With respect to goal achievement, it had been observed that: (a) the macroeconomic gains had not trickled down to the poorer segments of the population; (b) a net school enrolment of 95 per cent was feasible but drop outs remained a problem; (c) gender parity in primary and secondary schools had improved, but, the rising trend might not be maintained unless better sanitation facilities were provided; (d) slight improvements in infant mortality had been registered, but maternal mortality was actually rising; (e) with regard to health, it had been recommended that the Government should abolish taxes and tariffs on mosquito bed nets and that the bed nets should be subsidized in order to prevent the spread of malaria; as for HIV/AIDS, there had been no significant improvement; and (f) access to safe drinking water had increased over the last decades, although it was unlikely that the target would be reached because water access in urban areas had actually worsened.

13. The Government was still facing several challenges: most civil society organizations had very little understanding and knowledge of the Millennium Development Goals; little had been done to raise public awareness of the goals; and greater financial resources were required from both the Tanzanian Government and the donor community.

14. Nevertheless, the Government remained committed to poverty eradication and improved social well-being. The move to mainstream the goals into MKUKUTA augured well for their eventual implementation and, given the recent move in favour of debt cancellation, it could be expected that grants would be increased.

15. The United Nations could play a role by financing civil society organizations and assisting in their capacity-building; monitoring the implementation of MKUKUTA; and acting as a bridge between the civil society organizations, the Government and the development partners.

16. **Mr. Hendra** (United Nations Resident Coordinator for the United Republic of Tanzania) said that the country was an emerging model of reform because of its strong sense of national ownership. It had experienced five years of strong economic growth, macroeconomic stability, enhanced governance and improving socio-economic indicators, and had demonstrated a strong commitment to the Millennium Development Goals. In fact, it was on track to achieve Goals 2, 3, 4 and 7 on time. The Goals were fully integrated into the policy framework and subject to public debate, rather than being a parallel process. In fact in the new MKUKUTA 2005-2010, many of the targets were more ambitious than the Goals, for instance, aiming to halve extreme poverty by 2010, making Tanzania an "MDG-Plus" country. Tanzania had been the first country to adopt an innovative approach. Rather than addressing priority sectors, it focused on three key outcomes: growth and reduction of poverty; quality of life and social well-being; and governance and accountability. The strategy was truly national; not just the Government but civil society, the private sector, Parliament and development partners were involved in it, as had been demonstrated recently by the extensive public debate over budget priorities.

17. The United Nations system was promoting the Goals through advocacy, support of their full integration into key policy frameworks, support of the model Poverty Monitoring System, support of initial costing within the MKUKUTA framework and advocacy for mobilization of increased external resources. The challenges faced in supporting full integration of the Goals included moving to an outcome-oriented approach through planning, budgeting, implementation and monitoring; costing the

Goals; capacity development, and providing truly joint United Nations support as one, not by agency.

18. Factors in the evolution of development partnerships in the United Republic of Tanzania included a very strong sense of national ownership and leadership regarding the Rome and Paris Declarations. The Tanzania Assistance Strategy (TAS) provided an overall framework of coherent partnership principles. Several best practices in the areas of harmonization and alignment had been developed, including the Independent Monitoring Group and “quiet times” from May to August each year when no external visits from partners were received in order to allow time to prepare the budget. Those practices had produced very good results: there was greater use of national systems, enhanced predictability and a large increase in external assistance and direct budget support. The objectives of the Joint Assistance Strategy (JAS) were to strengthen national ownership and leadership, improve aid effectiveness and bring the targets into line with the Rome and Paris Declarations on aid harmonization and alignment.

19. The United Nations had repositioned itself in Tanzania’s dynamic development environment through joint analytical work on poverty and human development reports. The Resident Coordinator provided overall leadership in aid coordination and alignment by co-chairing the Development Partners Group (DPG) and housing the DPG secretariat. It had also provided support to the review of the PRS I paper and the Zanzibar Poverty Reduction Plan. The United Nations maintained a very tight focus on just three UNDAF outcomes aligned to the new MKUKUTA, and was working with such new instruments as direct budget support, sector-wide approaches (SWAPs) and baskets of aid to specific sectors.

20. A number of key challenges remained, however, and the United Nations system must ask itself if it was ready to move from an implementation role to a more exclusive policy advisory and capacity development role and to move away from many small project interventions to participation in new instruments aligned around national processes. The country team must decide whether it could sign up together to the new JAS, or just on an agency-by-agency basis. In order to maximize the new technical assistance policy, staff capacity, skills mix and incentive structure must be demand-driven and provided on a flexible basis. It must address the implications of the new policy on the

role of United Nations expertise as outsourced through internal structures. Finally, the communications strategy must be unified to allow the United Nations to speak with one voice.

21. **Ms. Betson** (Ireland) said that the statistics and databases referred to in the presentations were mainly national, and she would like to know their relationship to international databases. She would also like to hear the views of the panel on the approach to eradication of malaria proposed by the Director of the Campaign for the Millennium Development Goals. Finally, she asked if the resident coordinator/country director system had been beneficial in the United Republic of Tanzania.

22. **Mr. Sow** (Guinea) asked for concrete examples of how coordination between the United Nations and the Government took place, and what mechanisms had been established for mobilization of international resources and exchange of best practices. In the context of South-South cooperation, he would like to hear more about the impact of the Tanzanian model on other African countries, and whether the Millennium Project report had also had an impact. Finally, he would like to know the extent to which civil society had participated in the implementation of the plan and whether the model could be applied to countries emerging from conflict.

23. **Mr. Schultz** (United Kingdom) said it was encouraging to hear that improved coordination had actually had an impact in improved performance. With regard to statistics, he wondered if there were still any other data collection systems besides the ones in use by the Government. He would also like to know if the United Nations country team felt that it was ready to move into the new areas outlined by the Resident Coordinator.

24. **Ms. Nemroff** (United States of America) said that she would like to hear more about the evolution of the role of the private sector and what kind of feedback had been received from small and medium enterprises. She would also like to know if the benchmarks and targets had been established at the country level or if they came from the United Nations or another source.

25. **Mr. Mkai** (Director-General, National Bureau of Statistics, the United Republic of Tanzania) said that it was not easy to eliminate parallel data systems, but in the PRS I, an agreement had been reached on an internal institutional framework to coordinate data collection, composed of a technical working group in

the Ministry of Finance to harmonize administrative data and a working group for the census and surveys in the National Statistical Office, which had helped to minimize parallel systems.

26. **Ms. Mapunjo** (Commissioner for External Finance, Ministry of Finance, the United Republic of Tanzania) said that her country had itself learned through South-South cooperation: in 1996-1997 it had sent missions to Latin America and had followed the model of Bolivia. It was sharing information with its neighbours in the region and with donor countries as well, through the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD). A clear coordination structure had been established for working with partners through high-level consultations with all non-State actors, including the private sector, academia and political parties. All partners believed it was best to work together, since all wanted to achieve the Millennium Development Goals.

27. **Mr. Kajege** (Coordinator, Coalition on Debt and Development, United Republic of Tanzania) noted that there were regular consultations between civil society and the Government on issues of common interest and that efforts were made at grassroots level to develop capacity for policy dialogue in the interests of government accountability. On the question of malaria, he said that it was still a problem but that the use of bed nets had substantially reduced its incidence. The challenge was to ensure that nets produced in conformity with World Health Organization (WHO) standards could be introduced into the United Republic of Tanzania in sufficient quantity. Government subsidies were being provided to that end.

28. **Ms. Mapunjo** (Commissioner for External Finance, Ministry of Finance, the United Republic of Tanzania), in response to the question from the United States delegate regarding indicators, said that the country's PRS indicators were fully in keeping with international standards.

29. **Mr. Hedra** (United Nations Resident Coordinator for the United Republic of Tanzania), Moderator, reverting to the question of bed nets, said that over a period of five years the number of children protected by that means had risen significantly and that pregnant women received vouchers to purchase such nets, financed by the private sector.

30. He referred to the first PRS assessment which had revealed a need for greater engagement on the part of

civil society, reflected in the setting up of the Tanzania Business Council. That had made for closer coordination with Government and the creation of a strong inclusive environment in the country. The United Nations vision for the country carried the hope of the country team signing up to JAS and helping to maximize it.

31. Alluding in turn to the Millennium Project report — the Sachs report — he said that some of its aspects had been particularly discussed in the United Republic of Tanzania, where substantial progress had been achieved in primary school enrolments, which were so important for Goal 2. On the question of the costing of MKUKUTA, joint efforts were being made with civil society representatives to that end. In response to the question regarding a UNDP country director in the country, he observed that while, as yet, there had been no such appointment, there were, however, two deputy directors in place.

32. **Ms. Hollifield** (World Bank) said that it was a privilege to work in the United Republic of Tanzania, which was in the front line for good stewardship and leadership in coordinating the efforts of the donor community in support of the Goals, embodied in MKUKUTA. Tanzania took its international commitments very seriously, as reflected in the fact that the Government's goals were harmonized with them. In addition to using country-level systems for financial management and procurement, it had established a very robust strategy framework within which efforts were being made to weigh comparative advantages in order to find ways of better delivering aid. The World Bank stood ready to support the multi-donor approach thus being developed.

33. **Mr. Ndjoukou** (International Labour Organization), pointing out that employment was not among the Goals, said that the United Republic of Tanzania had a 20 per cent urban unemployment rate and a large working poor population, earning under \$1 a day. He asked what could be done to bring employment into the debate around the Goals.

34. **Ms. Taylor Roberts** (Jamaica), referring to the representative of Guinea's question seeking guidance on how to build on the best practices of the United Republic of Tanzania and transfer them to other African countries, wondered whether an answer could be provided.

35. **Ms. Nemroff** (United States of America) asked what impact, if any, were the many infrastructure projects sponsored by the Japanese Government in the region having on capacity-building in adjacent countries.

36. **Mr. Mertens** (World Health Organization), after noting the joint responsibility of all the actors for technical progress under Goals 4, 5 and 6, emphasized the importance of the sustainability and quality control of interventions in order to ensure their effectiveness into the long term.

37. **Ms. Mapunjo** (Commissioner for External Finance, Ministry of Finance, the United Republic of Tanzania), endorsed the point made by the World Bank concerning the importance of using country systems and procedures for procurement. On the question regarding employment, she said that MKUKUTA contained very clear indicators of what was being achieved under the current PRS, while on the question of coordination and monitoring the development agenda, the United Republic of Tanzania relied on an independent body.

38. She stressed that a great deal had been able to be achieved through the projects funded from Japanese assistance, which were well within the Government's priorities, and that the collective nature of the endeavour was of the highest importance.

39. **Mr. Hendra** (United Nations Resident Coordinator for the United Republic of Tanzania), Moderator, said that MKUKUTA offered a rolling framework for integrating the Goals with the PRS and that employment figured significantly in the results-based matrix developed for the country.

40. Addressing the key question of how to scale up best practices, he noted that the Tanzanian Government had established a central website for documentation on poverty reduction and codification for the purposes of benchmarking. Joint missions, rather than missions from individual countries, also offered a promising way forward.

41. **Mr. Mkai** (Director-General, National Bureau of Statistics, United Republic of Tanzania) pointed out that poverty was monitored by a body set up in the Office of the Vice-President.

42. **Mr. Kajege** (Coordinator, Coalition on Debt and Development, United Republic of Tanzania) said that the poverty monitoring system included all

stakeholders and that its output was established in a user-friendly language, either Swahili or English, for effective dissemination.

43. **Ms. Hollifield** (World Bank), referring in turn to the sharing of best practices, noted that OECD had set up a working party on aid harmonization and that the development gateway of the World Bank's website gave access to a relevant database.

44. **Mr. Hendra** (United Nations Resident Coordinator for the United Republic of Tanzania), Moderator, said that knowledge networks were linked through the Web and that the United Nations country team focused on sharing.

45. **Ms. Betson** (Ireland), noting that the results achieved in reducing child mortality (Goal 4) had not been impressive, wondered if members of the panel wished to comment thereon.

46. **Mr. Mkai** (Director-General, National Bureau of Statistics, the United Republic of Tanzania) said that the 2004 population and health survey had revealed a reasonable reduction in child mortality, but had given no evidence of any change in maternal mortality since the mid-1990s.

47. **Mr. Hendra** (United Nations Resident Coordinator for the United Republic of Tanzania), Moderator, stressed that Tanzania needed to redouble its efforts in that respect. That was one focus of the United Nations country team's advocacy and dialogue, considering that investment in health issues could have a huge impact on achievement of the Goals.

48. **The President** said that Tanzania could count on the full support of the entire United Nations system in meeting the challenges before it and expressed his conviction that the country's positive experience would be of great value to other African countries.

The meeting rose at 12.35 p.m.