



**Economic and Social
Council**

Distr.
GENERAL

E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/SR.17
24 October 2003

Original: ENGLISH

COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS
SUB-COMMISSION ON THE PROMOTION AND PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS
Fifty-fifth session

SUMMARY RECORD OF THE 17th MEETING

Held at the Palais des Nations, Geneva,
on Monday, 11 August 2003 at 10 a.m.

Chairperson: Mrs. WARZAZI

CONTENTS

ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS (continued)

PREVENTION OF DISCRIMINATION

- (a) RACISM, RACIAL DISCRIMINATION AND XENOPHOBIA
- (b) PREVENTION OF DISCRIMINATION AND PROTECTION OF
INDIGENOUS PEOPLES
- (c) PREVENTION OF DISCRIMINATION AND PROTECTION OF
MINORITIES

This record is subject to correction.

Corrections should be submitted in one of the working languages. They should be set forth in a memorandum and also incorporated in a copy of the record. They should be sent within one week of the date of this document to the Official Records Editing Section, room E.4108, Palais des Nations, Geneva.

Any corrections to the records of the public meetings of the Sub-Commission at this session will be consolidated in a single corrigendum, to be issued shortly after the end of the session.

GE.03-15809 (EXT)

The meeting was called to order at 10.10 a.m.

ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS (agenda item 4) (continued)
(E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/8 9, 11, 12, 14-18, 38, 41 and 42; E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/NGO/3, 8, 13, 14, 21, 22, 29, 35-39, 42, 44 and 48; E/CN.4/2003/7)

1. Ms.DUSSOLLIET-GOND (World Federation of Trade Unions) said that no mention was made in the draft norms on the responsibilities of transnational corporations (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/12/Rev.1) of the need to moralize shareholders' money by combating the laundering of money from various sources that were strongly to be condemned. The transnational corporations had various means of satisfying the insatiable desire for profits of their shareholders. They included the injunctions by the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and the Maastricht Treaty to privatize public companies and services and precipitate the fall in social standards; restructuring, regrouping and delocalization, leading to redundancies and unemployment and variation in the prices of primary commodities designed to destabilize recalcitrant producing countries. If they did not achieve their economic or strategic objectives, they orchestrated embargoes such as those against Cuba or Iraq, where 187,000 persons had died as a result of lack of medicines. They also incited wars to sell their armaments by fanning religious fundamentalism, ethnic hatred, terrorism or direct military aggression, in violation of human rights, the right of peoples and international law.

2. Her organization would not compromise with the transnational corporations and demanded the independent exercise of the right of association, under Conventions 98 and 87 of the International Labour Organization (ILO). The following standards should be absolute: a 35-hour working week; two rest days per week out of seven; annual leave of 1/10 of working time; one month's redundancy notice and redundancy payments. In addition, corporations should contribute a percentage of the employee's wages to accident or sickness insurance and also contribute to insurance for the unemployment they created. Remuneration should be based on a retirement age of 60.

3. Transnational corporations should invest their profits in the countries in which they operated, rather than channel funds to tax havens. In countries where the State was weak, they should teach literacy skills and train their employees in the language of the country. National and international labour courts with elected trade union representatives should monitor the standards.

4. Mr. MADELIN (International Federation of Human Rights Leagues) said that the adoption of the draft norms on the responsibilities of transnational corporations (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/12/Rev.1) and the commentary thereon, (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/38/Rev.1), by the Sub-Commission would be a significant first step towards making all the actors in the economic globalization process accountable with regard to human rights.

5. His organization had acquired some basic experience in that area by working with a French corporation to establish a contractual charter with its subcontractors, and an independent audit mechanism to ensure compliance with the charter. The evaluation of that collaboration had highlighted the urgency of elaborating and implementing international norms on the subject, as well as the need to establish an independent and impartial monitoring mechanism to deal with individual or collective complaints, and to assess not only the application of the norms but also the implementation of its own recommendations.

6. His organization recommended that the Sub-Commission should: adopt the norms and commentary, transmit the norms to the Commission on Human Rights for consideration and adoption as a legally binding instrument, and recommend to the Commission consideration of measures to ensure the effective, binding implementation of the norms.

7. In the run up to the Fifth Ministerial Conference of the World Trade Organization (WTO), in Cancun, his organization was concerned about the consequences of trade liberalization on human rights, particularly economic, social and cultural rights. It thus recommended that the Sub-Commission should evaluate the impact on human rights of trade liberalization policies and should adopt a resolution calling on Governments to include respect and protection of human rights expressly among the objectives of the WTO trade agreements.

8. Mr. BALUCH (Interfaith International) said that gross violations of economic, social and cultural rights were being committed in the province of Baluchistan in Pakistan. Baluchistan was a neglected region where the literacy rate was a bare 3 per cent and per capita income was the lowest in Pakistan. Growing unemployment in the region forced the youth to migrate to the city of Karachi in order to find work, which resulted in major ecological and demographic imbalances and encouraged the growth of slums.

9. The spread of religious fanaticism in the region was evident from the recent election results. Although Baluchistan had formerly been a secular nation, the Federal Government, and the Punjabi elite which controlled it, had fomented religious extremism.

10. Pakistan required a new Constitution that would embody the true spirit of the Pakistan Resolution of 1940. The art of carrying a religious, ethnic, linguistic or cultural minority along with the majority population, without resorting to the concept of majoritarianism, was learnt and practiced only in a democratic regime, and such a regime had never existed in Pakistan.

11. Mr. AAJAKIA (International Committee for the Respect and Application of the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights) (ICRAC) said that, in Pakistan, the residents of Sindh province were subject to violations of their economic, social and cultural rights. The most basic right of all was access to water, yet in the Sindh province, rural and urban populations faced an artificial water shortage. The money spent by the Federal Government on projects such as the Greater Thal Canal, which would chiefly benefit the Punjab, would be better employed in modernizing Pakistan's irrigation network and lining all watercourses, minors and canals passing through Sindh and southern Punjab.

12. ICRAC recommended that the Sub-Commission should urge the Government of Pakistan to stop construction of the Thal Canal and also to take steps to replace the current Constitution with one that reflected the true spirit of the Pakistan Resolution of 1940.

13. Mr. GUISSÉ, speaking on a point of order, said he wondered why an organization supposedly representing human rights in Africa was speaking on Pakistani issues. The mandate of that organization should be checked to see whether it was allowed to examine non-African issues.

14. Mr. MIR (Himalayan Research and Cultural Foundation) said that the economic dimension of the right to development had been given priority in the discussions, while the effects of socio-economic and political measures to ensure the upholding of that right or its

impact on social and cultural rights had been largely ignored. In that connection, he drew attention to the continued violation of the economic, social and cultural rights of over 1.7 million indigenous people in Gilgit-Baltistan in Pakistan. Huge numbers of Pashtoons and Punjabis were being settled there in an organized manner to exploit the province's natural resources and fill their own pockets. As a result, the local population had been reduced to a minority. The immigrant Pashtoons and Punjabis were given preference in employment, business opportunities and acquisition of land, in violation of the Jammu and Kashmir State Subject Act of 1927. His organization recommended that the Sub-Commission conduct a study on the deteriorating situation of social, cultural and economic rights of the people of Gilgit-Baltistan and take immediate steps to restore the people's rights.

15. Ms. SANTIEMMA (International League for the Rights and Liberation of Peoples - LIDLIP) said that her organization welcomed Ms. Mbonu's working paper on corruption and human rights (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/6) and strongly supported the recommendation that an in-depth study on corruption should be carried out by the Sub-Commission, with a view to drafting guidelines and disciplinary measures and sanctions. That was, however, a process that would take several years, and, in the meantime, corruption could have devastating effects in many developing countries. She also recommended, therefore, measures which would have an immediate deterrent effect, such as the creation of an international observatory on corruption, to study and establish cases of corruption on the basis of concrete verifiable evidence, and bring them to the attention of the media. Her organization also recommended that a corruption awareness programme be introduced into schools in developing countries under the mandate of the United National Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), but financed from the cultural budget of the transnational corporations.

16. Mr. BERRY (International Commission of Jurists) said that the elaboration of an optional protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights should adopt a comprehensive approach to all the rights embodied therein, following the example of the first Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. As a complaint mechanism, an optional protocol would provide individuals and groups with an international adjudicative procedure that would include remedies; as an inquiry procedure, it would empower the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights to initiate an investigation into serious violations of the Covenant.

17. The parties able to lodge a complaint under the optional protocol should include both individual and group victims of violations by the State party of the Covenant and interested individuals and groups (including non-governmental organizations (NGOs)) initiating complaints on behalf of victims who might risk retaliation if they engaged in the process directly. It would be appropriate to preclude the possibility of reservations to the optional protocol since, as a procedural instrument, it would not impose additional obligations on States parties but would merely serve as a means of implementing their existing obligations.

18. His organization therefore requested the Sub-Commission to convey its support for the drafting of an optional protocol to the Covenant to the Commission on Human Rights at the latter's sixtieth session.

19. Mr. AHMAD (World Muslim Congress) said that the deteriorating economic and social conditions in poor countries were, in many cases, the result of advice given by the Bretton

Woods institutions; policies that imposed financial liberalization, free capital movement, exaggeratedly market-friendly measures, unregulated foreign investment, drastically reduced customs tariffs, privatization of public enterprises such as water distribution, unrestricted competition and a minimal role for Governments. All those measures supported global capitalism while playing havoc with the economies of the developing countries.

20. Multinational corporations had immense political and financial clout and were immune to accountability in poor countries, where they introduced corruption through bribery and kickbacks. Tariff barriers denied poor countries access to rich markets while ensuring free access of manufactured goods and services to their own markets; the United States of America, the European Union and Japan doled out nearly \$1 billion a day in agricultural subsidies, while developing-countries farmers were driven out of business because the Bretton Woods institutions had forced the countries to open their agricultural markets to free imports. The poor countries were unable to repay the monumental debt they had incurred by providing easy markets for free trade imports and were obliged to incur additional debt to cover the costs of debt servicing. The only hope of recovery was for those debts to be written off and for free labour mobility to be facilitated.

21. Ms. BOONRIDRERTHAIKUL (Pax Romana) called on the Sub-Commission to remain seized of the issue of globalization and its impact on the full enjoyment of human rights and to pursue its dialogue with WTO, IMF, the World Bank and other multilateral organizations (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/14, para. 48) during the World Water Forum. It was to be hoped that Mr. Guissé would include in his next report on the realization of the right to drinking water, a more substantial review of the Johannesburg Declaration on Sustainable Development and its Plan of Implementation, give consideration to the issue of the privatization of water in the context of the International Year of Fresh Water, 2003, and work with the Commission on Sustainable Development.

22. In Kerala, India, the Coca-Cola Company had dug giant wells, extracted the local community's entire water supply and dumped its waste nearby; the people had lost control of their natural resources and their lives had become a misery without water for drinking and agriculture. The company had since moved on to an area in another state, where it was continuing the same practices.

23. Privatization deprived the poor, especially women and children, of the right to water, to life, to health and, consequently, to development. Her organization therefore urged Governments to reconsider the privatization of water and other essential services, ensure public participation in decision-making, require the private sector to respect human rights and regulate it through appropriate laws and carry out a critical review of accountability and governance issues relating to WTO, IMF and the World Bank.

24. Mr. CHAPMAN (Minority Rights Group) said that indigenous knowledge of crops and medicinal plants was being pirated and patented by multinational companies. His organization had recently issued a report on the intellectual and cultural property rights of indigenous and tribal peoples in Asia, which examined the effectiveness of United Nations instruments such as the Convention on Biological Diversity, the draft declaration on the rights of indigenous peoples and the Convention concerning Indigenous and Tribal Peoples in Independent Countries (International Labour Organization (ILO) Convention 169).

25. A related issue of concern was the Human Genome Diversity Project, one aim of which was to collect, analyse and preserve genetic samples from indigenous peoples who, because of their relative isolation, had characteristics absent from the mainstream population. The Sub-Commission had an important role to play in ensuring that the rights of such peoples were respected in all areas relating to the human genome, pursuant to Commission on Human Rights resolution 2003/69 and article 10 of the Universal Declaration on the Human Genome and Human Rights and in the context of its recommendations on Ms. Motoc's expanded working paper on human rights and bioethics (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/36).

26. Minorities and indigenous peoples were among the poorest of the poor, yet poverty reduction strategies often failed to address key issues such as discrimination. He thus welcomed the inclusion of the issue of discrimination in the preliminary working paper on the implementation of existing human rights norms and standards in the context of the fight against extreme poverty (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/17) and suggested that the Sub-Commission should elaborate specific recommendations on ways of ensuring that the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) were achieved in full compliance with standards for the protection and promotion of the rights of minorities and indigenous peoples, beginning with the critical factor of ensuring their recognition.

27. Lastly, his organization had recently carried out a legal analysis of rights and obligations within the right to development, including the intersection between the rights of minorities and indigenous peoples and the right to development, which might be useful to the Sub-Commission in its work with the independent expert on the right to development.

28. Mr. MALEZER (Foundation for Aboriginal and Islander Research Action) said that paragraph 1 of the draft norms on the responsibilities of transnational corporations and other business enterprises with regard to human rights (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/12) mentioned "indigenous peoples and other vulnerable groups"; the word "other" should be deleted since some indigenous peoples owned and controlled their lands and resources and could not be regarded as vulnerable. The title of section E, "Respect for national sovereignty and human rights", should be changed to read "...States, sovereignty and human rights" so as not to contradict the argument that indigenous peoples could hold sovereignty over natural resources. With respect to paragraph 10, it was not enough to require corporations to comply with domestic legislation when dealing directly with indigenous peoples since many States' laws were discriminatory in that regard. Lastly, the expression "indigenous peoples and communities" should be deleted from paragraph 22 and paragraph 16 should be amended since the term "stakeholder" was often used by States to diminish indigenous peoples' ownership rights.

29. The draft norms should be approved at the Sub-Commission's current session and the framework for their implementation should be established as soon as possible; the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights and fundamental freedoms of indigenous people should be regarded as the mechanism of implementation for indigenous peoples' interests until that framework was fully in place.

30. Mr. HUSSAIN-QADRI (International Human Rights Association of American Minorities) said that although the right to development was enshrined in many United Nations

instruments, the gap between rich and poor continued to widen. South Asia's tremendous potential could not be realized until India ceased to mass troops along its borders and removed its unreasonable reservations on trade and economic issues. The South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC) was being held hostage by Indian efforts to sabotage it; too many capital resources were being wasted on military defence. He urged the Sub-Commission to make a clear reference to that issue in the concept paper on the right to development which the Commission on Human Rights had asked it to prepare.

31. Mr. PARKER (Human Rights Advocates, Inc.) gave two examples of the type of incident which the draft norms on the responsibilities of transnational corporations and other business enterprises with regard to human rights were designed to address. Unocal, an American corporation, was appealing its conviction for human rights violations committed on its behalf by the Myanmar military, which had provided security for Unocal's oil pipeline. One villager had testified that her husband had been shot by soldiers while attempting to escape from forced labour and that in retaliation, the soldiers had thrown her and her baby into a fire, killing the infant. The Coca-Cola Company was also appealing a decision to revoke its licence to operate a bottling plant in India as a result of violations which had been described by a previous speaker.

32. Workers harmed by the activities of transnational corporations were often unable to seek remedies from their Governments and voluntary codes of conduct did not include implementation and enforcement mechanisms; binding international regulations were needed. He urged the Sub-Commission to adopt the draft norms and the commentary thereon (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/38/Rev.1).

33. Ms. EIDE (United Nations Standing Committee on Nutrition) said that the Sub-Commission's work on the right to food had been an inspiration to the efforts of the United Nations Standing Committee on Nutrition, one of the largest inter-agency arrangements at the technical level, to build bridges between human rights norms and mechanisms on the right to food and more conventional approaches to food security. In October 2002, the Council of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) had decided to establish an intergovernmental working group to elaborate voluntary guidelines on the progressive realization of the right to food in the context of national food security; it was open to all stakeholders and was expected to conclude its work within two years. For the first time, a specific economic, social or cultural right was the subject of joint intergovernmental efforts to develop guidelines leading to the enactment of legal and political norms for its implementation at the country level.

34. Since diplomats might not be familiar with the rights-based approach to development, the Sub-Commission should monitor that process and ensure that the proposed guidelines were not merely reiterations of conventional development principles and jargon by repeating the appeal contained in its resolution 2002/10 on the right to food, and international guidelines for its implementation, adding a specific reference to the proposed guidelines.

35. Furthermore, the fourth consultation on the right to food, recommended by the Commission on Human Rights in 2001 and by the Sub-Commission in 2002, had yet to be held; the Sub-Commission should repeat its recommendation on the matter and urge the Office of the

High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) to seek, on a priority basis, funds for it to be held in early 2004, while the guideline process was under way.

36. Ms. PENFOLD (International Labour Organization, (ILO)) said that the views of the ILO secretariat did not prejudice any position that might be adopted by the ILO Governing Body. The draft norms on the responsibilities of transnational corporations and other business enterprises with regard to human rights had addressed all the concerns expressed by the ILO secretariat to the working group over the previous four years. Those concerns had been based on a desire for consistency with ILO conventions, recommendations and other instruments. Interpretation of the elements of the norms and commentary that referred to ILO conventions and recommendations should be guided by the comments of the ILO supervisory bodies.

37. Mr. EL-SEDDIG (Observer for Sudan) said that war economies were synonymous with poverty, underdevelopment and human rights violations. Most of the armed conflicts, civil wars and military coups that had had such devastating consequences on the third world, especially in Africa, had been manipulated or sustained by the transnational corporations. Throughout the cold war, when the third world had become a battlefield between East and West, the selfish role played by the transnational corporations had had a damaging impact on the stability and development of many third-world countries. Besides the systematic plundering of natural resources, they interfered in internal political affairs, always putting profits before the interests of the local people. Consequently, many countries in Africa and Latin America had been left in chaos and disarray, and their people denied the enjoyment of basic human rights.

38. The draft norms on the responsibilities of transnational corporations and other business enterprises with regard to human rights should provide for sanctions against corporations that continued to ignore the principle of non-interference in the internal affairs of sovereign States. Given that armed conflicts were a major source of human rights violations, he called for the more active involvement of the United Nations in conflict resolution.

39. Mr. MOSCOSO BLANCO (Observer for Bolivia), referring to the working paper on corruption and its impact on the full enjoyment of human rights, in particular economic, social and cultural rights (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/18), said that his country had been one of those worst affected by corruption. In spite of the efforts made over the past 30 years to carry out structural economic reforms and to consolidate democracy and the rule of law, corruption remained as destructive a force as ever. The embezzlement of State finances had continued to deprive his Government of the scarce resources it needed to improve public services, build schools and hospitals, and strengthen the judicial system.

40. In April 2003, his Government had established a national anti-corruption ministry, with responsibility for receiving and responding to complaints; ensuring implementation of the various anti-corruption measures assigned to specialized State agencies; coordinating the work of State and other agencies in the fight against corruption, and promoting the values of responsible citizenship. It was designed to protect the economic, social and cultural rights of the people of Bolivia from the threat of corruption. He called upon the United Nations to provide suitable technical assistance, and to develop anti-corruption programmes and initiatives.

41. Mr. DE LAURENTIS (Observer for the United States of America) said that chapter II, entitled "Globalization in the aftermath of 11 September 2001: what place for human rights?"

of the report on globalization and its impact on the full enjoyment of human rights (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/14) contained irrelevant, as well as inaccurate, information pertaining to the tragedy of 11 September 2001, and to the relationship between human rights and globalization. His delegation failed to understand the link between globalization, on one hand, and the barbaric attacks on the people of the United States that had taken place on 11 September 2001, leaving 3,000 persons dead or missing.

42. His delegation strongly protested the assertion that the attention paid to security since that date had been premised on the curtailment of civil liberties. Security and respect for human rights were not mutually exclusive, in fact they were mutually reinforcing. Many of the root causes of terrorism, such as a sense of hopelessness and injustice, were found among downtrodden peoples living under oppressive regimes. It was important to escape the vicious cycle of repression and terrorism that could only cause further destruction. Since the attacks of 11 September 2001, the United States and the international community had taken decisive action to protect the rights of all persons to live in a world free from terror.

43. The various phenomena grouped under the term “globalization” had neither led to an increase in poverty nor had had a broad negative impact on the enjoyment of human rights. The increased information flows facilitated by globalization had made it more difficult for regimes that violated human rights to escape the spotlight of the international community. More people had risen out of absolute poverty over the past three decades than in any comparable period of the world’s history. Governments had been most successful in combating poverty by embracing freer markets, freer trade and technological change. Globalization presented many challenges, and it was vital for Governments to provide safety nets with a view to protecting those who found it difficult to adapt. He urged the Sub-Commission to focus more on the provision of social safety nets and the challenge of combating poverty in the context of globalization.

44. Mr. VIGNY (Observer for Switzerland), also speaking on behalf of the observer for Liechtenstein, said that the working paper on corruption and its impact on the full enjoyment of human rights, in particular economic, social and cultural rights (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/18) contained some misleading references to banking secrecy in Switzerland and Liechtenstein. Their Governments cooperated effectively with those of other countries in the fight against organized crime, and had the power to lift banking secrecy in order to assist criminal investigations, for instance with regard to corruption, money laundering or tax fraud. Switzerland had assisted the Nigerian authorities in their investigation into the embezzlement of public funds under the regime of Sani Abacha. Funds of criminal origin or misappropriated public funds were not welcome in either Switzerland or Liechtenstein.

45. Mr. KEBE (Observer for Côte d’Ivoire), speaking in exercise of the right of reply, said that the Afro-Asian Peoples’ Solidarity Organization (AAPSO) had made some false allegations concerning the use of child slaves, under the influence of transnational corporations, on cocoa plantations in his country. Transnational corporations had no say in the running of those plantations, most of which were either family or local village businesses. Furthermore, those corporations had no policy towards the Côte d’Ivoire in particular, but subjected all producing States to the same rules.

46. His country had ratified the Convention on the Rights of the Child, the ILO Minimum Age Convention, 1973 (No. 138), and the ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention

(No. 182), and had made the appropriate modifications to its domestic legislation. It had intercepted approximately 200 child victims of trafficking, thanks to a bilateral agreement signed with the Government of Mali.

PREVENTION OF DISCRIMINATION:

- (a) RACISM, RACIAL DISCRIMINATION AND XENOPHOBIA
- (b) PREVENTION OF DISCRIMINATION AND PROTECTION OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLES
- (c) PREVENTION OF DISCRIMINATION AND PROTECTION OF MINORITIES

(agenda item 5) (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/19, 20, 21, 23 and Add.1, 2, 3 and 4, 24 and 42; E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/NGO/4, 7, 20, 24, 28, 29, 33, 35 and 42; E/CN.4/Sub.2/AC.5/2003/2: E/CN.4/Sub.2/AC.5/2003/WP.1, WP.2, WP.3 and WP.14; E/CN.4/Sub.2/1993/34 and Add.4)

47. Mr. WEISSBRODT, introducing his final report on the rights of non-citizens (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/23), said that international human rights law was grounded upon the premise that all persons had fundamental rights, whether or not they were citizens of the country in which they lived. In its General Comment No.15, the Human Rights Committee had stated that each right protected by the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights must be guaranteed without discrimination between citizens and non-citizens. The only exceptions to that premise were political rights explicitly guaranteed to citizens.

48. The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights established that States should, in general, protect the rights of all individuals, regardless of citizenship, to work, just and favourable living conditions, and other rights. The children of non-citizens should have the right to a name and the right to acquire a nationality. In general, children should have the right to acquire citizenship of the country in which they were born, particularly if they would otherwise be stateless. Children of non-citizens – even those without legal status – should not be excluded from the schools.

49. Despite the existence of an extensive framework of non-citizens' rights, many institutional and endemic barriers existed to the enjoyment of those rights. The situation had worsened since 11 September 2001, as several countries had detained non-citizens in response to fears of terrorism. All individuals must be protected from arbitrary detention, and States were under an obligation to respect the human rights of detainees, including legal protection. Non-citizens suspected of terrorism should not be deported without a legal opportunity to challenge their expulsion.

50. His report had concluded that clear, comprehensive standards should be developed for governing the rights of non-citizens and their implementation by States. Since problems relating to the treatment of non-citizens arose under each of the seven principal human rights treaties, the treaty monitoring bodies should jointly prepare general comments and recommendations to establish a consistent approach to the protection of rights of non-citizens. The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination was using his report to prepare an improved General

Recommendation on the rights of non-citizens, and he strongly suggested that the Sub-Commission should continue work in that area.

51. Mr. EIDE introduced his progress report on the update to the study on peaceful and constructive approaches to situations involving minorities (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/21). After reviewing briefly the matters covered in the report, he drew attention to the issues to be dealt with in the final report, which were contained in paragraphs 90-93.

52. Speaking as Chairperson-Rapporteur of the Working Group on Minorities, he introduced the report of the Working Group on its ninth session (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/19). Having drawn attention to his comments on the Working Group's mandate contained in paragraph 2, he reviewed its decisions and recommendations, which were set out in paragraph 86. He emphasized in particular recommendation 19, addressed to international, regional and national development agencies, because development projects often had a considerable impact on the lives of minorities.

53. Ms. SEIGEL (International Council of Jewish Women), speaking also on behalf of Socialist International Women, International Council of Women, World Federation of Methodist and Uniting Church Women, United Towns Agency for North-South Cooperation, Indian Movement "Tupaj Amaru", International Alliance of Women, All India Women's Conference, International Federation of Social Workers, International League for the Rights and Liberation of Peoples, and Zonta International, said that to help Governments make known the contents of the United Nations system for the protection of women and children, the Sub-Commission should request the General Assembly to commission the production of short broadsheets on the topic written in simple language for distribution in countries of emigration and immigration. The persons involved often did not know that the United Nations had set certain standards. Governments themselves would profit from such broadsheets and they might want to have their own national versions; the information would help NGOs and even United Nations agencies. Such information would not prevent criminals from exploiting people but it might give pause to a few of them, and that would make the effort worthwhile.

54. Mr. PRAKASH (World Peace Council) said that many minority groups dissatisfied with their Governments resorted to building platforms abroad in order to mobilize international support. In India, however, a politics of dialogue with minorities had won them back to the national fold. The Government had ended the Khalistan movement in the Punjab organized by expatriate Sikhs, who had given up their ill-conceived mission. The same process was taking place in Jammu and Kashmir, reducing the little support for minority separatist politics, which survived mainly through Pakistan-sponsored cross-border terrorism.

55. In Pakistan itself, the minorities were not involved in politics, and the raw treatment handed out to them was detailed in the first Human Development Report produced in Pakistan. Pakistan's failure to develop its minority areas showed how authoritarian systems produced internal strife rather than balanced social and economic development.

56. Mr. SY (International Movement Against All Forms of Discrimination and Racism) said that his organization fully endorsed the recommendations contained in the expanded working paper on discrimination based on work and descent (E/CN.4/Sub.2/2003/24). In Senegal, each of the many ethnic groups was subject to the same form of social stratification ranging from

nobles to occupation-based castes and down to slaves. The same situation was to be found in Mali, Mauritania, Sudan and Niger. The caste system was governed by a powerful principle of social immobility. The problem was not merely one of the division of labour but of an interiorization of the system by the members of the castes themselves. It could not be resolved merely by economic improvements or by requesting States to include prohibitions in their constitutions or legislation. What was needed was the creation of appropriate conditions for education in development, democracy and, above all, human rights.

The meeting rose at 1.05 p.m.