



UNITED NATIONS
TRUSTEESHIP
COUNCIL



LIMITED

T/PV.228

17 February 1950

ENGLISH

Dual Distribution

23 MAR 1950
TRUSTEESHIP COUNCIL

Sixth Session

VERBATIM RECORD OF THE TWENTY-SIXTH MEETING

Palais des Nations, Geneva,

Friday, 17 February, 1950, at 2.30 p.m.

PRESIDENT:

Mr. Roger GARREAU France.

Note: The Official Record of this meeting, i.e., the summary record, will appear in provisional mimeographed form under the symbol T/SR.228 and will be subject to representatives' corrections. It will appear in final form in a printed volume.

The PRESIDENT (Interpretation from French): I declare open the two hundred and twenty-eighth meeting of the Trusteeship Council.

EXAMINATION OF THE ANNUAL REPORT OF THE ADMINISTRATION OF THE TRUST TERRITORY OF RUANDA-URUNDI FOR THE YEAR 1949 (T/217, T/361, T/361/Add.1, T/439, T/L.19, T/L.19/Corr.1) (Continued)

The PRESIDENT (Interpretation from French): The Council will resume its examination of the Report of the Administering Authority on the Trust Territory of Ruanda-Urundi.

I call upon the representative of the United States.

Mr. SMITH (United States of America): May I express my appreciation to Governor Pétillon for his opening statement, which brought home to us in a precise way the magnitude of the problems confronting the Administering Authority in Ruanda-Urundi. I would also renew the thanks of my delegation to the special representative, Mr. Pierre Leroy, for his patience in answering our questions.

My delegation was impressed to learn from Governor Pétillon's opening remarks that the efforts of the Belgian Administration on behalf of the indigenous inhabitants of Ruanda-Urundi are causing a deficit in the Territory's budget and that Belgium has therefore decided to spend 150 million francs to cover the deficit in the ordinary and extraordinary budgets for 1950. It appears, moreover, that this budgetary deficit is likely to increase, for Governor Pétillon informed us that a comprehensive ten-year plan for the economic and social development of Ruanda-Urundi is to be worked out along the lines of the plan published last year for the Belgian Congo. We shall look forward with interest to the publication of such a systematic and detailed plan as he described to us.

The increasing deficits resulting from this economic and social development programme present a serious problem. All of us hope that these expenditures will have the effect of stimulating effectively new economic activity in the Territory, so that eventually Ruanda-Urundi will be able to stand on its own feet.

As to political advancement, my delegation notes with considerable gratification two promising developments. The first of these is the appointment of the Mwami of Ruanda and the Mwami of Urundi to the Council of the Vice-Government General. We were informed also that the local administration is hoping to seat additional Africans on this Council in the fairly near future. This is a significant step forward in the development of African participation in the political institutions of the country, a step which I think the Council will wish to commend.

The second development is the very important reform in local government which is now being worked out by the Administering Authority. My delegation notes that the hope that this reform would become effective during 1949 failed of realization because the studies took longer than was expected. As we understand it, however, the studies have now been completed by the local authorities and have been transmitted to the central authorities in Brussels, where they are being intensively studied.

As I stated during the questioning of the special representative, my delegation is happy to learn that the Belgian Government, with determination, is pushing forward with this plan. May I express the hope that, when we next examine the administration of the Trust Territory of Ruanda-Urundi, we may have the full details of the plan before us.

In the economic field, all of us were happy to learn that the Territory enjoyed so prosperous a year in 1948. Harvests were so satisfactory that, as we have learned, the regulations covering the purchase of food products were suspended from 1 July 1948 in order to facilitate the export of surplus food.

We note with concern, however, that the long threatened danger of famine remains as a major problem of this densely-populated territory. The country is poor and the irregularity of rainfall and the damage from soilerosion are constant threats. The commendable efforts of the Administering Authority to meet this danger have therefore been of particular interest to us. We note that the Administering Authority has now provided protection from soil erosion for some 200,000 hectares and that the draining of marshes has brought an additional 78,000 hectares under cultivation. In addition, as a further attack upon the

continuing and ever-present danger of famine, the Administering Authority has spent 50 million francs for equipment with which to provide for the storage of some 12,000 tons of food. It is also interesting, in this connection, that in December 1948 the Administering Authority decided to make a land survey of regions of limited population, with a view to determining the reasons for the existing limited occupation and to study means, if desirable, for moving people into such areas.

I know that the members of the Council will be greatly interested in these efforts and, while commending the Administering Authority for such efforts, will wish to urge that continuous and continuing attention be given to additional ways and means of meeting the famine danger.

Coffee cultivation is the main source of revenue for the peasantry of Ruanda-Urundi, and we are happy that the inhabitants are showing increasing interest in government efforts to aid them in extending their cultivation of this remunerative crop. The Administering Authority is giving special aid in this field and hopes that it will prove possible to increase coffee production in the Territory by 50 per cent in three years' time. My delegation shares this hope and believes the Administering Authority's efforts to increase coffee cultivation should be noted with approval.

We have some concern, however, over the concentration on this one export crop - coffee. The production and export statistics reveal that, out of a total indigenous production of industrial crops valued at 155,700,000 francs, a total of 121,700,000 francs came from coffee. We hope that the Administering Authority will continue its efforts to diversify the Territory's economy to the fullest extent practicable, in order to reduce the Territory's dependence upon a single cash crop.

The Council will also, I feel sure, wish to commend the Administering Authority for its important decision, effective on 1 January 1949, to suppress prestations, that is, obligatory payments in kind or in labour. It is our understanding that these traditional obligations will hereafter be paid in money.

In the social field, we have but three brief comments to make.

In the first place, my delegation believes the Council should commend the Administering Authority^{for} its efforts to enable workers who leave their villages for long periods to take their wives with them to their places of work. As we understand it, the Government of Ruanda-Urundi requires that at least 90 per cent of the workers engaged by recruiting agencies be married men and that those men must be accompanied by their wives to their places of work, unless their wives do not wish to go. We understand that these regulations are not included in the laws of the Territory but rather in the permits which are issued for the recruiting of workers. We would like to express the hope that other Administering Authorities may consider the possibility of adopting a similar practice.

Secondly, my delegation notes with satisfaction that the medical corps in Ruanda-Urundi increased nearly 50 per cent in 1948 and that medical expenditures rose from 24 million francs in 1947 to about 42 million francs in 1948. This is noteworthy.

In the third place, we have been gratified by the programme for building houses for Africans throughout Ruanda-Urundi in 1948. We note that, at the time the report was written, 365 houses in Ruanda and 339 houses in Urundi had been completed or were in the final stages of construction. This, again, seems to us an encouraging development.

In the educational field, my delegation notes with satisfaction that important progress was achieved in 1948. We note that the budget for education rose from an estimated total of 13 million francs in 1947 to an estimated total of 25 million francs in 1948 - almost double. The report also tells that the number of school-children rose from 326,000 to 420,000, that the number of ^{subsidized primary} schools rose from 1297 to 1589 and that the number of non-subsidized primary schools rose from 3181 to 4953. We further note that several normal and trade schools were opened in 1948 and that students from Ruanda-Urundi were admitted to a secondary school at Costermansville in the Belgian Congo.

We have, on a number of occasions, called the attention of the Council to the importance which the United States delegation attaches to progress in the field of education. We feel that the Council will wish to express its satisfaction at the progress made by the Administering Authority in the educational field, particularly during the past year, and the hope that improvements in this field will continue to be pushed with vigour.

In conclusion, may I express my delegation's appreciation also for the way in which the Administering Authority has responded to the requests and recommendations of the Trusteeship Council with respect to the preparation of the 1948 Annual Report.

Mr. HENRIQUEZ URENA (Dominican Republic) (Interpretation from Spanish):

After examining the report of the Government of Belgium on the Administration of Ruanda-Urundi, and after reading the comments of the Visiting Mission sent to that territory by the Trusteeship Council, the picture that one has in mind is, in its general lines, satisfactory. There; in Ruanda-Urundi, work has been carried out, a constructive effort has been made, and a civilizing action has been carried through. That territory, mountainous and at the same time arid in various sectors on account of its ill-distributed rainfall, needed communications, and these have been provided in abundance. It was necessary to organize its local production and today it surprises us with the variety and wealth of its crops. That territory, burned by the sun, scourged by tropical diseases and exposed to epidemics, needed a health system which would protect it, and it has been provided with hospitals and dispensaries which combat physical misery. But moral and intellectual poverty of a dense population has also been combated amongst this backward people. Until recently almost isolated from the world at the top of its plateau, this population has now been provided with centres of instruction, and the bases of a culture have been laid.

For all these, the Belgian Administration deserves gratitude and I would even say that we ought not to be scanty in our praises, because we have been shown the efficiency which has been exercised in reaching these results. It would not be difficult, with this in view, to fill in the few gaps that still remain in the work, and I am sure that this will be done.

The Visiting Mission pointed to the fact that the great material successes obtained by the Belgian Administration have been, in a certain sense, at the cost of individual liberty and the freedom of the population. The visiting mission also observed that the form of customary organization on a tribal and feudal basis has been conserved but its substance has been changed progressively and continues to evolve.

The political evolution of the Africans has been conceived as a process which must be very slow. The visiting mission therefore recognized that the rhythm of political progress must be accelerated and for this purpose four lines of directives which might be followed are laid down.

In the first place, general education for the masses should be intensified, both for the masses and for the elite. At the same time there should be greater participation by the indigenous authorities in the direction of the affairs of the Territory. As far as possible and as rapidly as circumstances permit, the political structure should be made more democratic.

Finally, as an additional measure to accelerate the political evolution of the country, the Mission believes that the general attitude of paternalism of the European Administration with regard to the indigenous authorities might be revised, since the indigenous authorities should feel, in a higher degree, the possibility that they have of participating with the Administration on a footing of equality in the direction of political affairs.

I am not going to follow, step by step, the interesting observations of the Visiting Mission on the political progress of the Territory. I simply wish to formulate, in the light of these views, one or two observations which I think should be stated.

The peoples of Western civilization tend to suffer from a superiority complex which prevents them from seeing clearly into matters related to the capacities of other peoples. And this complex is intensified one hundred percent with regard to the Tribes of Africa, which is the Continent where Western culture itself has yielded its scantiest fruit in contact with primitive peoples.

Let me offer an example. Some Europeans and a few administrative officials have told the Visiting Mission that the worker of Ruanda-Urundi is the worst in the world. This extravagant language comes, naturally and spontaneously, from a superiority complex, so that the indigenous people of these zones tend to be despised.

This is a dangerous trend which might lead to the most serious atrocities, as seems to occur even in Ruanda-Urundi, when a people like the Germans proceed in an arbitrary and delirious fashion -- although with a philosophical background -- to try to impose the idea of Western superiority. In such circumstances, we should not be surprised that the natives of Ruanda-Urundi were treated as things rather than as human beings, because even some animals receive better treatment from their masters.

The Belgian Administration has wiped out the memory of that situation, ominous for the natives. But even so, it seems to me that many ideas which determine official action in the Territory are the shameful product of that same superiority complex, although this complex has now been reduced to a minimum.

I still have my faith, but it will be necessary to lose our faith in the indefinite persistence of education, if one did not consider that with the cultural work which has been carried on in Ruanda-Urundi during the last thirty years, the indigenous inhabitants were unable to take a more active part in the administration. We should democratize, not gradually but rapidly, the political system which exists there. In short, it is already time to abandon tribal feudalism and to begin to make use of elections and of the vote; namely, to train the indigenous inhabitants in the exercise of suffrage, although all that need only be done, at the outset, in small municipalities. After all, nations have risen from municipalities, and although you cannot throw down, in a single stroke, the traditional authority of the Mwami, we could set up, beside them, a parallel system of authority and municipal democracy which might subsist together and at the same time as the absolute monarchs.

Of course, we would have to face up to whatever difficulties and frictions might arise from such steps. No political evolution is possible without some effort. But what we cannot do is to leave a people, indefinitely, in a position of inability to exercise their rights in a democratic political system. With the present slow system, we would have to wait for many generations to pass — perhaps centuries — before Ruanda-Urundi could obtain its own government. How long, for example, should we have to defer even the modest participation which should be given to the local population in the exercise of legislative authority? I think that although the first steps might be halting, one generation might be enough, through higher education, to enable this people to learn to exercise, through a small elite of ^{trained and} capable men, the process of governing ^{the} country. It is time to give to the population of Ruanda-Urundi a citizenship, since at the present time these people do not have a citizenship.

I know that when these things are said, there are some who smile sceptically and who profess and declare that it is dangerous to permit people to govern themselves without long political training, because that imperils institutions and will probably imperil human rights. Is this not the argumentation of one of the latest exponents of the superiority complex which I referred to? Nations which regard themselves as the centre of civilization and which fight for human

rights, can hardly justify timidity here by referring to the need for experience, or, at any rate, over-stressing this need. There are many civilized countries which have had as little respect for human liberties as may be expected from these tribes of Africa. There are many which have gone backwards to a lower level than that of these primitive tribes.

Why should we consider it premature to concede wider political rights and greater liberties to peoples like those who are at present under the trusteeship of the United Nations in Africa? If the purpose of the present trusteeship system is to prepare these peoples to govern themselves, just as preparation in the matter of political rights should concern us, in respect to a people which must become a nation, so should the economic conditions which enable this people to subsist also concern us, because no people can prosper without an economic equilibrium. No people can correct its own defects and evolve politically, if it is not provided with a sound economic system. If I refer to the peoples under United Nations trusteeship in Africa, I do so because these observations do not all apply to Ruanda-Urundi, and I do not wish to have to repeat what I have to say here, with reference to other territories. What is important is that in all administrative actions taken in Africa, the idea of the absolute inferiority of the native should be set aside. In other words discrimination should be set aside.

Let us concentrate now upon Ruanda-Urundi. Here we see this discrimination at every step. The Administering Authority always has some explication for this, but I do not think that it has a justification. We see in the report, of the Administering Authority, at every step, a ^{differentiation} with respect to measures applied to the indigenous population and the non-indigenous population. It is comprehensible that with a view to keeping up constitutional traditional rights there should be some ^{differentiation} in judicial organisation, but it is not essential that there should be a double system of administration of justice, and fortunately, the Visiting Mission seems to have the impression that it is not intended to maintain this discrimination between Europeans and indigenous persons indefinitely.

If we examine the existing penal system, we find flagrant cases of discrimination, however; for instance, that of whipping, which is reserved for the indigenous population. With regard to one of the cases in which this penalty was applied -- as a corrective measure for penitentiary discipline -- I put a question in writing, and this was not answered satisfactorily by the Special Representative of the Administering Authority. I pointed out in my question that the Administration itself, on page 166 of its report, in connection with question 216, referred to one system of corrective measure for whites and another for persons of colour. That is exactly the language which is used in the report. And in this reply the Special Representative began by saying something which seemed to be a sort of warning to the author of the question, but which warning should rather be directed to the Administering Authority.

The reply of the Special Representative was to the effect that it is necessary, first and foremost, to point out that in reality the distinction does not exist between white and coloured persons, but exists between indigenous and non-indigenous persons.

I regret that the Special Representative answered in this way a question which was correctly put and which deserved his careful attention. But what is important to note is that in this case the Administering Authority expressed itself incorrectly in its report; and all I did was to repeat the words used in the report literally. But even if the Administering Authority rectified this, the discrimination will remain. Why should disciplinary penalties involving whips and chains be applied to the natives and not applied to the whites? This nomenclature of "white" has not been rectified by the Special Representative, although I note that in discussing this matter the Special Representative tried to justify the measures by saying that as regards this chain business, he is not speaking of a chain fixed to the wall, but of a light chain which is attached to the neck of the prisoner, tying one prisoner to the other. Thus the prisoner is unable to escape without taking his companion with him. The chain does not cause pain.

And the Special Representative continued to say that the reason for discrimination as regards the chaining of prisoners is that the Administration is trying to occupy these prisoners according to their abilities, and that the indigenous prisoners, when they work outside the prisons, escape whenever they like, but that the "white", on the other hand, is never employed outside the prison. There is therefore no need to fear his escape.

We should like to note here another discrimination which is the most serious of all. The white man is never called upon to work outside the prison, and we know that this work outside the prison is the hardest. The real reason why the chain is used is that it is reserved for prisoners working outside the prison. But since the white prisoner never has to work outside the prison, and the indigenous person does, the discrimination is clear. For a white man there is protection. What I wish to point out ^{is} that there is discrimination here. I am not going to give an opinion on the nature of the chain itself. The chain can, of course, be considered in relation to this or that case, but the discrimination remains. As regards whipping, the only reason given by the Special Representative for using this penalty against the indigenous inhabitants is that for the white man this kind of punishment is not customary, whereas it is for the coloured man.

In the first place, it is not true that the white man does not have whipping in his country of origin. This penalty does exist in certain European countries. What is important, however, is to note that this punishment is being more and more discarded. In the second place, if this punishment is not fit for the white man it should not be fit for the indigenous person. If we respect one, we should respect the other. It is not a good way of preparing the native for the more civilized life; it is not a good way to hold him to his less commendable traditions.

However, leaving aside the question of discrimination, we might proceed now to the substance of the matter, the very essence of the penalty which, as I said, is a residuum of the Middle Ages. This penalty violates the best doctrine of juridical principles and what is, in the light of prevailing opinion, the object of punishment. The essence of punishment is not ~~retribution~~ but social defence. Society defends itself against those who violate the law and menace the lives and welfare of those who are law abiding. It is not necessary,

in order to assure this social defence, to whip and mutilate violators of the law. Whipping does not involve mutilation necessarily, but there are wounds, bruises, scratches, and so forth. The penalty of whipping is, furthermore, a morbid residuum of former ages and, as I have already said, is being discarded by Western civilization, although some legislation still permits it. This morbid residuum belongs to the category of punishment which may be described as penal sadism and it should be struck out of all penal systems, as recommended by the General Assembly in a recent resolution.

There is another disciplinary punishment in prisons, which punishment is applied indiscriminately to white and coloured. This punishment is confinement in the dark for a maximum of one month. There is no discrimination here. But to live in the dark for a month may upset the mental faculties of the most vigorous mind, quite apart from the implications in the field of physical hygiene, apart from mental hygiene. The Visiting Mission advises that ^{this} punishment should be reserved, at the most, for the most extreme cases, and, further, proposes that the maximum should be reduced.

With regard to the questions which I put to the Administering Authority in connection with labour contracts, why are penal sanctions imposed, such as imprisonment, in order to apply it to an employee who infringes on his employment contract, and why is this penalty reserved for indigenous employees? The Special Representative declared that seventy-four percent of these violations have been punished, according to the statistics of 1948, by means of imprisonment, and he alleges that the reason for this discrimination -- since this sanction is only for indigenous persons -- arises from the fact that civil sanctions and pecuniary fines are sufficient to ensure respect for contracts in the case of non-indigenous employees, and that these do not operate for the indigenous persons who have few needs and can thus escape and evade the law without fear.

But this reason does not convince me either. There are many countries in which a civil sanction might be regarded as such to guarantee the civil contract, and yet the penal sanctions have not been sought.

There are countries in Latin America, about which I know best, in which workers are imported from other countries or islands for the purposes of sugar production. They are employed on contract, but in these countries there are no penal sanctions whatever for the worker who does not conform to his contract. It is just an additional risk undertaken by the employer, who may be able to cover himself by some form of insurance. To impose a penal sanction and imprisonment for failure to fulfil a civil obligation may be a means of putting the worker into a position of slavery. The Visiting Mission trusts that in the near future this exceedingly rigorous system may be abolished in Ruanda Urundi, and I wish to support that very fully.

Similar reasoning may be used, as it was used by the Visiting Mission, against corporal punishment for non-payment of taxes, because there are other means, such as the retention of part of the wage. In the case of inability to pay, imprisonment does not provide a solution. In that case, the State applies a very hard sanction, but still does not secure the tax.

Wages, on the other hand, are too low to cover the most urgent needs of subsistence, and there is no legislation setting up minimum wages in Ruanda Urundi. There can be no doubt that these problems might be resolved by means of rapid economic prosperity, and that the Administration will have serious difficulties in implementing further measures to this end. There are serious difficulties due to the nature of the soil and the special conditions of the country. The question of cattle is an interesting one. The animals are of poor quality and, owing to a social tradition and the position of cattle as a symbol of prestige for the family owning them, it is difficult to use them as a source of food or means of commerce. However, the Administering Authority has done something in this field towards overcoming the popular resistance based on this tradition, and perhaps this improvement may be expected to continue.

With regard to the economic problems, which are very complex and peculiar to this Territory, many interesting observations have been made, but I do not wish to take up the time of the Council by repeating or amplifying them. In conclusion, allow me to make one or two remarks regarding the plan for education. The proportion of children of school age who are at school is quite considerable,

300,000 out of a population which does not exceed 3,700,000; that is to say, although there is a shortage of statistics, it may be said that about two thirds of the children are going to school. To this I would add that an effort is being made in the field of adult education, and the work of the Administering Authority in this regard has to be highly appreciated, supported as it is by various religious organisations. It is clear that, even so, there are gaps. The Visiting Mission has noted this. Elementary education still remains at a level which is low. Secondary education is confined to a very small minority, and the intervention of the Administration is almost exclusively indirect, since there are few official schools. Higher education cannot exist except by means of bursaries, and this last question will have to be taken up later.

In the debates that have taken place during this session of the Council, reference has been made several times to the language in which elementary education is given. The Administration decided that primary education should be given in a language which is familiar to the pupil, that is to say, in the language of his locality.-- Kirundi in Urundi and Kinyarwanda in Ruanda. Kiswahili is the vehicle used in the Islamic schools. All the school text books are written in these languages and are found in all the schools. We can only applaud this measure, inspired as it is by the best experience and the best doctrine of the pedagogues. The idea of giving education in the vernacular certainly is the best. It would be a double and excessive burden to teach another language at the same time as elementary education is being imparted in the vernacular. Once, however, the child knows his own language well enough and has acquired a sufficient knowledge of its grammatical elements, he can more easily learn another language and train himself so as to be able to pursue his studies further in that language. In Latin America, we have an example of the excellence of this system. I will confine myself to mentioning Paraguay, where, although the language of the people is Kurami, elementary education in the last century was given in Spanish, at any rate, as a general rule, with the result that it was of limited scope. Had Kurami been used, and had there been more Kurami textbooks, not only would education in general have been better, but the learning of Spanish, when it began, also would have been

better. The Belgian Administration in Ruanda Urundi has pursued a wise policy in this field. We hope, therefore, that day by day the conditions in Ruanda Urundi will improve in all fields, thanks to the firm will of the Administering Authority. With this, I shall conclude these remarks, since I do not wish to draw further upon the patience of my colleagues.

Mr. RYCKMANS (Belgium) (Interpretation from French): I should like very briefly to try to dispel certain misunderstandings which seem to have arisen from the observations which have been made. In general, I thank my colleagues for the remarks they have made and the criticisms they have put forward, of which the Administering Authority certainly will take account.

To reply to a remark made by the representative of the Philippines, I should like to return to the reproach which appears to have been addressed to the special representative for not having given complete information on the projects which are at present being submitted to the higher authority. I am somewhat surprised at this reproach, because, in the first place, we are examining at the present time the 1948 Report. The special representative attempted every time it was possible to give information on the implementation of the plans mentioned in the Report which were to be carried out during the following budgetary year. When it is a question of the proposals made by the local authorities to the Ministry of Colonies, we must recall that the Governor of Ruanda Urundi and the special representative, who is a member of the staff in Ruanda Urundi, are, vis a vis the Minister of Colonies, in a position of hierarchical subordination. To give an idea of the functioning of legislative power, I should explain that legislative power belongs in the first place and for all subjects to the Belgian Parliament. But the Belgian Parliament does not normally exercise legislative power over the Trust Territory. Legislative power is normally exercised by the King in the form of decrees which are counter-signed by the Minister of Colonies and which are first submitted to the consideration of a Colonial Council sitting in Europe. When the initiative for projects comes from the Department of Colonies, the Governor of Ruanda Urundi has to be consulted on these projects before they are submitted to the Colonial Council. In other cases, when these projects come from the local

administration, they are transmitted through the hierarchical channel to the Ministry of Colonies, which is the chief office, and submitted by the Ministry of Colonies to the Colonial Council. When the Colonial Council gives its opinion, legislation takes the form of a decree signed by the King or, at the present time, by the Prince Regent and countersigned by the Minister of Colonies. The members of the Council know that in a constitutional country it is a tradition that within an administration no member of this administration will go beyond the orders of his chief or of the communications of his subordinate. When the decree has been signed by the Chief of State and countersigned by the Minister of Colonies, the text belongs to the legislature and nobody should know from whom the original proposal came. If the original proposals of the local authorities went further than those of the Minister of Colonies, or if the Minister of Colonies went further than the proposals of the local authorities, this should not be known. It is, therefore absolutely impossible for the special representative to give details on projects which are at the present time being discussed within the Administration. The necessary information will be given in the report for the following year.

The representative of China, without condemning the support given by the Government to missionary education, nevertheless expressed the wish that the Administering Authority should open a certain number of schools. In this respect, I should like to give one figure. At the present time in Ruanda Urundi there are 146 Christian missionaries who devote their whole time to teaching. The amount we should have to pay for European officials would represent an expenditure simply in salaries, if these missionaries were teachers or school directors on the staff of the Administration, of 20 million francs. This would not take account of the expenditure on their travel, housing and so forth. That amount is half as much again as the total budget for education in 1947 and three quarters of the educational budget for 1948.

The representative of Iraq put a question which is extremely interesting for a great number of trust territories. He pointed out that it was important that there should not be a difference between the degree of instruction of the

traditional chiefs and the degree of instruction of the indigenous elite. We know that it is very painful for people who have young men or women who have carried out their studies to integrate themselves in the tribal life where the chiefs have had a firm traditional upbringing and no education. In Ruanda Urundi the situation is somewhat different. On page 29 of the Report there are certain figures. It is stated that in Ruanda the Mwami and 49 chiefs out of 52 are literate and 558 sub-chiefs out of 633 are literate. In Urundi, the Mwami and 32 chiefs out of 36 are literate and 344 sub-chiefs out of 516 are literate. The degree of instruction of the chiefs and sub-chiefs is certainly higher than the average degree of education of the population.

In the same way, the representative of Iraq, approving the Administering Authority for having organised in middle education a theoretical and scientific education of the vernacular, nevertheless pointed out that this education should not begin at the fourth or fifth year of study. The systematic teaching of the vernacular begins as early as the first year of study. All the little children in Urundi have in their hands the Kirundi grammar books; in Ruanda they have the Kinyarwanda grammar books. The innovation is that formerly, once French was adopted as the vehicle for education, teaching in the vernacular ceased, whereas now, even in the middle schools, where French is the vehicle for education, the systematic teaching of the vernacular is maintained.

As regards the representative of the Philippines, he quoted a report of a 1947 Senatorial Commission on Salaries. He quoted certain texts from the report voted by the Senatorial Commission, and he quoted others which did not come from the report voted by the Senatorial Commission but which were made by individual members of the Commission. In this respect, I would simply draw the attention of the Council that here there is an obvious proof that the Belgian Parliament is just as much concerned with the well-being of the natives as the Trusteeship Council, and that Belgium does not hesitate to publish reports of a parliamentary commission, including even the individual remarks of the members of this Commission. This clearly shows the concern which the Belgian Parliament has for the way in which the natives are treated.

Mention has also been made of the press, and in this respect the reproach was made of the Administering Authority that it prescribed a prior authorisation for the publication of a newspaper or periodical. In this respect I would point out that in the Belgian legislation there are certain limitations imposed by law. ^{After the war} those who have been condemned for collaboration with the enemy cannot take part in the publication of a newspaper. This limitation exists in the Trust Territory as well. In addition, we are compelled by certain international conventions which we have signed to forbid the circulation in the country of certain obscene publications, and this requires the seizure of such publications by the Government.

The representative of the United States of America asked about the ten year plan, which will be published probably at the end of this year. In this respect, I can tell him that the financial implications of the plan are being very carefully studied and that in any case the financial implications are not liable to damage the finances of the Territory in an excessive manner, because we contemplate a considerable participation by the Metropolitan Power without any interest to be paid by the Treasury of Ruanda Urundi for the financing of this ten year plan.

The representative of the Dominican Republic asked whether the Administering Authorities, in this case the Administering Authority for Ruanda Urundi, did not have some kind of superiority complex with regard to the natives, a superiority complex they could not get rid of. He asked if we did not doubt the capacity of the African population to administer themselves, and he saw in the difference of treatment between the natives and the European or non-indigenous inhabitants a proof of this superiority complex and of an idea we had of the ^{fundamental} inferiority of the natives. I insist on saying here that we have no idea of any inferiority of the natives. Rather on the contrary, we are convinced that the natives can be perfected and can be led to a degree civilization and of development which is as high as our own. It is not a question of a superiority complex. It is knowing that the natives, unfortunately, at the present time are in a backward state of civilization, and the whole action of the Administering Authority is guided by the fact of its faith in the perfectability of the indigenous inhabitants, which they wish to bring

out of their backwardness. When reference is made to the capacity for self-government of these populations and it is said we doubt their political qualifications, I must say we have absolutely no doubt in this respect. We are convinced that they can be given this. We have seen numerous examples of indigenous populations with self-administration, and both Ruanda and Urundi had their own administration before the arrival of the Europeans. They had a political organisation that was extremely solid. There were the great tyrants such as Chekka and Linga and the Zulus, who were conquerors and massacred hundreds of thousands of people. Sumari administered his own country. We must recognise that the European invasion and occupation was real liberation for most of these tribes of Dark Africa, which, for the last century before European occupation, had known nothing but invasion massacres and slavery of entire populations.

What we doubt is not the natives' capacity for self government, it is their capacity for self-government today, according to civilised norms. If we went away tomorrow, the natives would administer themselves, but how would they do it? When it is said that we are not sufficiently concerned, as the representative of the Philippines said, with the natives' preparation for self-government or independence, for my part I consider that when we provide medical assistance, agriculturalists and agricultural engineers, educate the children by setting up schools among the people, when we improve the health of these populations and we improve their feeding and so forth, we are providing them with just as important elements as political progress in leading them progressively to self government and independence.

Naturally, I do not challenge the possibility of increasing the rhythm of this development, but I simply wish to point out that all the aspects of this development, economic, social, health and education, are all means by which we may prepare the indigenous inhabitants for self government.

One word with regard to penal sanctions, the representative of the Dominican Republic recalled to us that in countries of the West Indies workers were imported to work in the sugar industry and other seasonal industries, and that these workers who came a long way at a great cost to their employers were not kept at their work by penal sanctions. I do not wish to defend

penal sanctions in themselves, we have dealt with this in the Report and at other times. I would simply point out that the comparison is not valid because a worker who is imported from a foreign island and who finds himself without means of returning to his own country is, unfortunately for himself, tied by that iron law. If he does not get his salary, he dies of hunger. He cannot leave his work because he cannot swim home, and in this way the worker is bound, just as the European worker, by the law that he either has to earn his living or die of hunger. In primitive territories like Ruanda Urundi, where the worker considers his salary simply as extra money, if a man does not want to work he simply goes home. He disappears and he cannot be found. Therefore, civil sanctions would be inoperative, and we should either agree to renounce any sanctions, even civil sanctions, or else resort to the only possible sanction, which is penal sanction. I admit that it might be said we have to give up even civil sanctions, but let us not be told we have^{to} replace penal sanctions with civil sanctions, because the civil sanction does not exist and would be impossible of application.

To conclude, I will call on the special representative, who has a few remarks of clarification to make. I should like to thank the Trusteeship Council for the conscientious and objective manner in which, on the whole, it has studied the Report of the Administering Authority. I can assure the Council that the remarks which it has deemed necessary to formulate will be taken into account by the Administering Authority, as it has taken them into account in the past in considering the remarks and suggestions of the Trusteeship Council.

Mr. LEROY (Special Representative from Ruanda Urundi): I should like to make a few additional clarifications. In the political field, the representative of the Philippines was concerned with the dissemination in the Territory of Ruanda Urundi of the purposes of the United Nations and the International Trusteeship System. To my previous replies, I should like to add for the information of the Council that in January of this year I published a book on legislation in Ruanda Urundi. This volume, which many natives have purchased, reproduces in pages 10 to 14 the provisions of international law of special concern to the Territory, that is to say, Articles 75 to 91 of the Charter and the Trusteeship Agreement for Ruanda Urundi in full.

In the economic field, as was recalled by the representative of the United States of America, among the measures contemplated by the Administration and encouraged by the Council in the struggle against famines is the construction of thirty sections and six sheds, where 12,000 tons of food can be stored. The six sheds have been sent, and two are being erected and the others are ready for erection.

With regard to the indigenous workers, it has been said that his work is the worst in the world, but I think this was a hyperbolic form of expression. In any case, the Belgian Government does not make such a clear condemnation. We admit that the actual yield is somewhat low. The Mwami of Urundi visited Belgium from 20 April to 17 May 1949, ^{and} he was very much concerned by the economic and social conditions of Belgium. When he returned to Urundi he convened a meeting of the students of the school group at Astradi. This contains more than 1,000 students, and I shall quote what I took from the speech delivered at that time: In

"In Urundi we do not know what work means. I have seen a Belgian with 25 cows and 200 hectares of land. He had 12 workers and he had agricultural machinery, it is true. Nevertheless, here for the same work I should have needed 2,000 Urundi and they would have started by complaining and saying they were not properly treated. I have seen Belgian miners in the mines. Each takes out 11 cubic metres a day."

Then I asked what one miner in Urundi would get, he said they were pleased with their workers if they got one and a half cubic metres out a day.

In the field of education, the representative of China seemed concerned as to the possibility of students not following religious courses. I would point out that in the school of the religious sisters at Usukuma, where the European children go, 15 students out of 100 do not receive religious instruction. They receive instruction in ethics instead. That simply shows the Council how the religious groups understand their educational mission.

Now I should like to say a few words along more general lines. The task which has been given to Belgium in Ruanda-Urundi is a considerable one. In his initial speech, Governor Petillon told the Council about the economic and social aspects. He spoke of the Ten Year Plan which will be both an inventory of the resources of the territory and an indication of our purposes and means in the territory. He alluded to the political growth of the population as a problem of the greatest importance. In fact, economic conditions affect political conditions. We must ensure their daily bread to the population of Ruanda-Urundi. We have to set aside the threat of famine. We hope that we have now accomplished that. We have to give the natives this minimum of comfort without which there is no possibility of virtue. The Visiting Mission which went through the territory in 1948 wrote:

"The Mission considered that an overwhelming majority of the Africans of Tanganyika are still not capable, and, in the present situation will not be capable for a long time, of assuming complete political responsibility".

They might have said the same of Ruanda-Urundi. Apart from the still small elite, the mass of the population lives from day to day. They have no political concerns. To them, the United Nations, the Trusteeship Council, the Belgian Government, the Government of Ruanda-Urundi are only very distant abstractions. The native knows his Chief and the Administrator of his territory. We have to waken his political conscience. At the same time, we must ensure his evolution from the purely family conception of existence toward a more general social concept. It is not sufficient to modify institutions or to put an end to barbarous customs. It is not sufficient to proclaim the fundamental rights of the human person. That is the easiest

part of the task. It is not sufficient to do anything for the material prosperity of the country. It is up to us, and it is a real task, to modify men and orient their minds, to fashion their souls. That is a very thankless and lengthy task when dealing with men who have only daily concerns and who are more easily resigned to an always uncertain future than to fatiguing daily work. We have to teach them to envisage the future. These men see a kind of magic in any obstacle, and we have to show them that effort will dispel those illusions. We must induce the breath of professional conscience into their minds. Politically speaking, the question is not a simple one.

We often speak of the natives of Ruanda-Urundi. Let us not lose sight of the fact that these natives are actually divided into three distinct groups, the Batwa, the Batutsi and the Bahutu. We have to protect the Batwa and the Bahutu against themselves; we have to consider that the Batutsi have at present gained a preponderance which was held by the Bahutu and the Batwa at first. It is a whole scale of values that we have to overthrow.

I simply wished to point out this problem in passing. However, I do not wish to take further time. Belgium has the honour to assume the responsibility of orienting the territory of Ruanda-Urundi toward its future. We will carry out this mission with all the means in our power. All our activities and all our efforts.

The PRESIDENT (Interpretation from French): If there are no further comments, I shall take it that the discussion on the Report on Ruanda-Urundi is closed. It will now be for the body entrusted with the preparation of the report to draft that report. This is a question which will be decided by the Committee of the Whole when it meets again.

The discussion of the Report on Ruanda-Urundi was closed.

REPRESENTATIVES OF ISRAEL

The PRESIDENT (Interpretation from French): I shall now read a telegram from Moshe Sharett, Minister of Foreign Affairs for the State of Israel. It reads:

"IN REPLY TO YOUR CABLE 11 FEBRUARY HAVE HONOUR INFORM YOU
AUBREY S. DEAN ISRAEL'S PERMANENT REPRESENTATIVE TO UNITED
NATIONS HAS BEEN INSTRUCTED PRESENT TO TRUSTEESHIP COUNCIL
VIEWS OF GOVERNMENT OF ISRAEL ON QUESTION OF JERUSALEM".

Therefore, we have received affirmative replies from both the Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan and the State of Israel. I believe that the representatives of these two States will appear at the meeting on Monday, the day on which we agreed to again take up the question of the statute for Jerusalem.

The meeting of the Council will now adjourn, and the Committee of the Whole will meet immediately to continue its discussion of the Report on Tanganyika.

The meeting rose at 4.10 p.m.