UNITED NATIONS

1968 International Year for HUMAN RIGHTS

INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON HUMAN RIGHTS

GUIDELINES FOR A STUDY OF THE EFFECTIVENESS OF POLICIES AND MEASURES AGAINST RACIAL DISCRIMINATION

Paper prepared by UNITAR

The Secretary-General has the honour to submit to the Conference the attached paper prepared by the United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITAR) in pursuance of the invitation of the Preparatory Committee for the Conference noted in resolution 2217 C (XXI), adopted by the General Assembly on 19 December 1966.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION

1.   UNITAR has prepared this paper for the Teheran International Conference on Human Rights in the hope that it will encourage and assist further research and studies by individuals and institutions on the effectiveness of measures against racial discrimination.   There is an urgent need to undertake more studies in this area.   The harmful and tragic effects of apartheid and other forms of racial discrimination have been realized and acknowledged by the international community and measures have been taken in many countries to combat racial discrimination. Declarations and discussions by the United Nations and other international organizations have promoted concern and remedial action.   Even though this has resulted in many descriptive and analytic studies of aspects and manifestations of racial oppression and prejudice, in reviewing the whole field of investigation, one is made keenly aware of the need for comparative research concerning the effectiveness of measures against racial discrimination.

2.   UNITAR has, therefore, undertaken a research project whose basic purpose is to ascertain and compare the effectiveness of measures and policies against racial discrimination in a number of countries.   By analysing the racial and ethnic conflicts in typical societies with varying economic and social conditions, and by assessing the effectiveness of different types of measures and policies adopted and implemented by governmental units and private organizations, it will be possible to obtain important insights into the interplay of factors which determine the existence and character of racial problems.   It could furthermore provide much needed information about those mechanisms by which anti-discriminatory measures make their impact on society.

3.   This is a cross-national research project, involving a number of country studies. The first country study has just begun in the United Kingdom, in co-operation with the Institute of Race Relations, and arrangements are being made for other country studies.   The different country studies will provide the basis for the comparative evaluation.

4.   The research methodology which UNITAR is following and which is now presented to the Conference may be considered a substantive contribution to this field.   Its significance is twofold: first, it is a pioneering research project in the area of

comparative studies, especially for evaluation of the effectiveness of measures against racial discrimination; second, it will serve as a stimulant and a partial methodological model for other country studies. It should be possible to approach a variety of similar multi-national studies on human rights in much the same way. We feel that the methodology of the UNITAR study is no less important than its results.

5. UNITAR considers that many other studies with similar objectives are urgently required in order to understand and evaluate measures against racial discrimination and other curtailment of fundamental human rights leading to the adoption of more effective action. It is for this purpose that UNITAR presents in the following pages a description and detailed design of the comparative study of effectiveness of measures and policies against racial discrimination. The International Conference on Human Rights may wish to recommend to scholars in all countries the need for further studies in this area. UNITAR, for its part, would be prepared to provide information and assistance in the formulation of research methodology appropriate to each country and situation.

I. UNITAR RESEARCH

A. Description of the project

6. The study will analyse and compare policies and measures to combat racial discrimination and the results obtained in national societies. It will study the racial situation in national societies in order to evaluate the effectiveness of such policies and measures, and compare them with spontaneous factors in the dynamics of the whole structural situation as sources of change in the patterns of race relations It will not, however, endeavour to describe the whole area of race relations in the country studied.

7. The study will cover situations involving various ethnic categories, and will look at the problem in different economic, political and social contexts, degrees of national development and geographical areas. The collection of data and the field work of the teams to be established for the purpose in various countries, may follow common guidelines detailed in the present paper. This will assure basic comparability of various national reports.

8. It is necessary that each national society to be studied must have: (a) a multiracial population; (b) a significant degree of tension between the ethnic groups, and (c) some accumulated experience in concerted action against discrimination. The societies should be located in different geographical areas, present a diversified set of ethnic constellations, and should be at different stages of social, political and economic development.

9. In the contemporary world the problem of racial discrimination has new and extremely complex dimensions. It is no longer restricted to the level of inter-personal relations - the small group, the neighbourhood, the local community - but is developing in a broad national and international context, affecting relations between sovereign States. Furthermore, the most important issues today with regard to racial problems, at the national as well as at the international level, are the product of intentional and deliberate actions by organized groups. Thus, the proper study of the problem of racial discrimination nowadays requires a study of the sociology of majorities, and the methodology reflects the fact that today racial discrimination is occurring in some sociological and political contexts without historical precedent.

/...

10. In other words, what we would like to analyse and to comprehend with regard
to each national society under study, are the respective importance and weight of
(a) the policies and methods deliberately used, and (b) the dynamics of the
structural change itself, in determining the intensity and direction of the
trends prevailing in the patterns of racial relations from World War II until
today. The present situation will be approached as the historically accumulated
result of the effectiveness or lack of effectiveness, of the policies applied
and the methods used during the last quarter of a century to build desirable
patterns of racial relations in the society under study.

11. An attempt should be made to extract, from the analysis and comparison,
possible guidelines for better performance in the future. To a great extent, it
will be a study of the social structure of multi-racial societies, of the social
values, and of the different types of social action that are causing
multi-directional change in prevailing models of inter-ethnic relations.

B. Objectives of the study

12. In the structure of any national society, there is a system of roles and
functions to be played by individuals and groups of individuals, in different
spheres of life. The criteria and the actual distribution of groups in different
social positions, and the attribution to them of different social roles, are, at
any given moment, the accumulated result of historical processes of social
conflict and accommodation. In multi-racial societies, ethnic traits frequently
become the support and justification for imposing and maintaining criteria of
social differentiation. To understand how and why, in the societies under study,
social differences are expressed in racial terms, what is the role played by
intentionally applied measures in changing these patterns, and what are the other
influential factors that arise spontaneously from the dynamics of the situation
itself - these are basic goals of the projected study. The research procedures
recommended in this paper are designed in the light of these goals.

13. "Race", "ethnic group", and such terms will, for the purposes of the study,
be taken with the meaning they have in the everyday life of the society concerned,
independently of qualifications scholars have made regarding the scientific
meaning of these terms. In every society these words express the perceptions of

/...

the groups involved concerning their similarities and differences; and the
patterns of actions and reactions we propose to study are based on such
perceptions and definitions.

II. RESEARCH AT THE NATIONAL LEVEL

A. National studies

14. The national study to be prepared will result from extensive fieldwork – six months, at the minimum. The national studies could be used as the basis for a comparative study for a region, continent or the whole world.

15. Any national study should make:

   (i) an objective characterization of the situation existing at the end of World War II;

  (ii) an analysis of the factors and trends that, up to the present, have acted to change that situation;

 (iii) the identification and evaluation of the role played by the deliberate application of policies and measures to combat racial discrimination, compared to other influential factors.

B. Data required

16. The collection of basic data in each society under study will be along the following lines:

    1. Structural characteristics of the multi-racial society: demographic data; position of the groups in the stratification system.

    2. Main traits and trends: historical background and analysis of the origins and orientations of the patterns of values, assumptions and goals connected with the prevailing racial policies.

    3. Policies and measures: analysis of the policies and measures applied to combat racial discrimination.

    4. Successes and failures: assessment of the effects and evaluation of the results of the policies applied, compared with other factors connected with the dynamics of the racial situation itself.

17. It should not be inferred from the detail with which the working hypothesis is outlined below that it involves a number of in-depth studies of racial relations. Although it will deal with the background and setting of the problem, the comparison and evaluation will be centred on the effectiveness of measures against racial discrimination.

1. Structural characteristics of the multi-racial society

    (i) Demographic data

18. When the racial situation in country A is contrasted with the racial situation in country B, it is important to know that in A the minority group is represented by some thousands of people while in B the minority constitutes 10 million or so. Furthermore, the social role of a "minority" may, in fact, be performed by a majority of a given population. The demographic background of the social structure in which the patterns of inter-ethnic relations are established must therefore be analysed as the starting point for any further approach to the problem. The basic sources of this information are the national censuses and equivalent demographic registers. The last national census made before World War II and the most recent national census will be compared to characterize the main trends of the structural changes that have occurred.

19. Statistics on migratory movements will be analysed to identify the influence of migrations upon the ethnic profile of a national population. Emigration will be also considered as an attempt, forced or spontaneous, to reduce tensions. For these purposes, the points of origin and destination, and the ethnic, social, national and other characteristics of migrants must be taken into account. Internal migrations connected with racial tensions, with changes in the political status of the country, or fostered by changing economic patterns, deserve special consideration with regard to their present implications as well as for the future.

20. The same applies to vital statistics: birth rate, mortality rate, infant mortality rate. Data on ethnic differentials in causa mortis obtained from reliable sources (even if only sample studies and/or covering only some periods of scme groups) as well as other equivalent data concerning population structure and dynamics, may when duly analysed illuminate many aspects of the social organization within which the interplay of racial relations occurs.

21. Partial populations represent "samples" selected by the very functioning of a given social structure, and their analysis may be extremely pertinent for the study. For instance, the ethnic composition of the penitentiary population, the military, the teaching profession, the highest bureaucratic layers, and so forth, represents a set of relatively accessible information because it is usually

collected for other purposes. When subjected to systematic analysis and interpretation, such information may throw light on many aspects of the structure of a multi-racial society.

22. Special consideration must be given to the analysis of data relating to mixed groups: origins, definition, composition, social status. The same applies to data concerning "passing" through the racial line.

(ii) Position of the groups in the stratification system

23. In any multi-racial society, ethnic differences are not the only social differences between the groups. From this starting point, many essential clues may be explored, all leading to the very core of the subject of the study. The basic problem here is to discover the non-ethnic cleavages among the ethnic groups using different social indicators.

24. In many instances, the sources of information are the same as for the demographic data, but in other cases the number and quality of the sources are more diversified. The following points should be mentioned with regard to the indicators to be used in the study:

(a) Income

The goal here is to obtain a breakdown of national levels of income on an ethnic basis, in order to learn the relative location of the groups on the economic side of the social pyramid.

The sources of this information may vary from country to country: internal revenue data, insurance companies' figures, statistics of wages and earnings, labour statistics, etc. The breakdown will be made into five levels of income, so that in a group of 100 individuals at each level, it will be dnown how many are of ethnic group A, B, C, etc.

(b) Occupation

Here, aside from giving an indication of the types of activity, information easy to find in printed sources, the goal is to obtain specific information concerning the usual way each of the various ethnic groups make their living. Such information, even when existing in official sources, often is released only

on request. In some countries information is collected concerning the position in the occupation (i.e., employer, employee, autonomous, etc.). On the other hand, in some countries, for various reasons, no break-down is made or available according to ethnic origin. In certain cases, the solution may be to obtain special processing from the original sources. The purpose is to identify in objective terms the trends and the amount of ethnic concentration in various clusters of the occupational structure of each society.

(c) Education

This data is, perhaps, easier to obtain. The tables to be drawn up will present, by ethnic origin, indices of literacy and the termination of study at the primary, secondary and college levels. Whenever possible, a table will be added concerning the ethnic origin of the student population and the holders of diplomas of higher study. Here again the intention is to identify some clusters in the prevailing educational pattern and to learn the reasons for their configuration as well as to try to understand the factors causing change.

(d) Power

Under this heading we need information concerning the ethnic composition of the bodies performing decision-making functions: (i) Parliament, house of representative or governing collegiate bodies (national and local, when pertinent); (ii) collective governing bodies (council of ministers, cabinet, etc.); (iii) higher civil servants, senior military personnel, governing bodies of political parties; (iv) heads of more important banks, corporations, universities, newspapers, broadcasting stations; (v) the judiciary and the religious hierarchy; (vi) other pertinent information concerning the social differences between the various ethnic groups in relation to power and the sources of power. The patterns of relations of the political parties and groups with the main racial issues in the societies concerned will be analysed here.

Common sources of this information, aside from official statistical publications and registers, are "Who's Who" books, social registers, chambers of commerce, clubs and associations, etc. In the presentation of information and data concerning this item, it is particularly important to indicate, in each case, the

criteria of the selection of people for these functions, and the implications,
actual or potential, of these systems of social position over the processes of
ethnic relations.

(e) Patterns of mobility and segregation

In the structure of any multi-racial society, two aspects deserve special
attention: status – meaning the position in social space; and situs – meaning
the position in physical space. In interpreting the data concerning demographic
aspects, status scales, etc., particular attention must be given to the prevailing
patterns and trends of social mobility with regard to the various ethnic groups
as well as to changes during the period under review. As far as the geographical
distribution of ethnic groups is concerned, we will define segregation as a
pattern of relative isolation within a social structure, in which the spatial
distribution of ethnic groups reflects social distances between them.

An index of segregation may be applied, of course, not to the national
territory as a whole, but to the smaller areas in which "minority groups" are
more concentrated, especially in urban areas. Knowing the percentage
representation of each ethnic group in the total population a scale for each
district (or ecological area) can be prepared. At one end of the scale the
proportion of each group in each district would be the same as their proportion
in the total population of the area, random distribution; while at the other end
of the scale the pattern would be one in which the total population of each group
is concentrated in one and the same district (or ecological area). Variations
along the scale will indicate variations in the index of segregation. This is
only one method. Other suitable indexes may be adopted.

25. The final goal of the collection and interpretation of data concerning the
multi-racial social structure of each society under study is to have a clear idea
of the profile and dynamics of the position and role of the various ethnic
groups. For this purpose, other information and data may be added to the
above-mentioned, according to its availability in each society. As a rule,
all sources for the figures and tables included in national reports must be
fully and explicitly indicated.

2. Main traits and trends

26. Any social tension has its "natural history"; and the understanding of this history is an essential prerequisite for the analysis of the tension itself. A part of each national study should be devoted to the historical background of the existing racial tensions in the society under review. To a great extent, the figures collected for the first part will make sense only if and when projected on the screen of the historical background.

27. We are not, of course, interested in an exhaustive and full account of all the small factual details. On the contrary, we must be selective concentrating our attention more on an intelligent interpretation of significant relations between facts and trends than on detailed description per se. This is the only way to obtain an illuminating background for understanding the objective data and to obtain an insight into the dynamics of the whole situation.

28. The following set of questions may be taken as a general guideline to the historical survey:

   (a) How old are these problems in the society under study?

   (b) What have been the main stages of their evolution?

   (c) Earlier patterns of racial relations contrasted with prevailing patterns;

   (d) Main trends appearing between World War II and the present day.

29. Special emphasis must be given, in the historical survey, to the analysis of: (i) the changes occurring at different institutional levels of the national society; (ii) the changes of the status of the nation in the structure of international society; (iii) the nation's relation to, or reciprocal influence on, changing patterns of racial tension, discriminatory practices and the application of policies to combat them. It goes without saying that this applies equally to changes for better as well as to changes for worse, the important thing being to learn the how and the why of whatever trends are observed.

30. A basic and guiding hypothesis here, which would be tested in the historical survey, is that: In any society in which social positions are ethnically marked, prejudice and discrimination are fostered when qualitative changes occurring in the social structure threaten established patterns, and the groups having a dominating position in the prevailing social system react, expressing in racial terms their social resistance to change.

31. On the other hand, this hypothesis alone could not help us in the study of some contemporary manifestations of racial tensions as for example where and when racism, or racialism, or any form of race consciousness appear not as a factor of resistance to change but as one of the basic ingredients of an emergent nationalism and as a strong emotional motivation to promote change and to stimulate economic, social, cultural and political achievements.

32. "Sociological imagination" must be fully exercised here to develop the procedures for this part of the investigation: Content analysis of documents, statements, newspapers, humour; formal and informal interviews with people; participant observation in the daily life of professional, recreational, educational, political and other kinds of associations; "life-cycle" or biographies of representative individuals strategically located in the framework of the racial patterns under study. These will provide the necessary insights.

33. The aim of this part of the study is not necessarily to discover new facts, but to analyse, for the period under review, the interplay of the racial problems and the racial policies and ideologies at different levels and in different environments, and their patterns of mutual conditioning.

34. It would be appropriate to attach to the study essential documents such as biographical sketches, photographs, newspaper reports, and statements to illustrate and support the interpretations offered in the text.

35. The policies and measures adopted to combat racial discrimination in any society are based on certain assumptions, resulting from an implicit or explicit definition of the situation, and they also imply a set of goals to be reached. It is in relation to these values, assumptions and goals that an evaluation of the effectiveness of these policies should be made rather than in relation to any ideal model superimposed by the observer on the situation under study.

36. What are the targets of the existing "racial policies"? Complete assimilation, aiming at an ethnically homogeneous society in the future? Non-conflicting co-existence in a mosaic pattern? Complete separation and domination by one group over the other? Other models could be offered as examples.

37. How are these policies and measures perceived by the groups that practice discrimination as well as by the groups discriminated against? How are these perceptions manifested in actions and reactions on the part of the groups involved?

38. It is a common pattern in these situations of inter-group tension that, aside from the main groups confronting each other, there is almost always a "third party", the "others", whose perception or definition of the situation frequently does not coincide with that of the main conflicting groups. It is important to know who they are and how they function, bearing in mind that in such situations the "third party" position is a social role.

39. The attitudes and reactions of the groups discriminated against, their opinions concerning the usefulness of the measures, the alternatives they offer, their position as spectators or their active participation in the promotion of the policies, must be observed as counter-points to the discriminatory ideologies and must be studied in depth.

40. The patterns of internal solidarity of a group against which discrimination is practiced is another important aspect to be studied. These depend upon many factors such as the numerical strength of the group, the fact of having or not having the same nationality as those practising discrimination, the location of the group in the stratification system, etc. The internal segmentation or stratification of the group discriminated against according, for instance, to lines of elites and masses, rich and poor, older and younger generations, lighter or darker colour, etc., seems to have definite importance in the formation of different value-orientations and perceptions inside the same ethnic group. Special consideration should be given to this problem in order to identify sub-groups inside each confronting group - e.g., "black bourgeoisie", "poor whites" - and to analyse how the internal social stratification of each group and the specific role of each segment impinges on the development of the situation as a whole.

41. In this context, special attention must be given to the elite sectors of the groups discriminated against: their typology, roles, idealogies, behaviour and relations with the rank and file of the groups concerned.

3. Policies and measures

42. The aim, in this part of the study, will be, after having acquired an objective understanding of the structure of the multi-racial society, its functioning and basic trends, to analyse, on that basis, the role played by the policies to combat racial discrimination.

/...

(1) Legislative and other prescriptive measures (conventions, regulations, decrees, etc.)

43. This part of each national study, should include a detailed and careful analytical description of the lines along which the policies and measures have developed in the society; the causes and motivations of the actions taken; the personnel, machinery, sponsorship, organization, functioning and other institutional aspects of the apparatus; its sporadic or continuous character; and the events, pressures and groups involved in the decisions to apply the policies and measures.

44. For the purpose of the analysis, a complete survey will be made, aiming at a systematic presentation of the anti-discriminatory measures taken in each society.

45. For each prescriptive measure, we must know:

(a) nature and source – for instance, law of Parliament, decree, court decision, agreement between parties, etc., date (year and month);

(b) stated objective and brief background of reasons for measure;

(c) basic norms prescribed – general rules and requirements prescribed;

(d) sanctions – kinds of sanctions and conditions of application;

(e) when, how and who may invoke – for example, the victims themselves, public authorities, attorneys, other parties, etc., being a detailed description of the actual functioning of the machinery established;

(f) application and enforcement – application of the prescriptive measures in typical concrete situations, including whether and how the application of the norms and jurisprudence has changed, been adapted or altered from its original purposes;

(g) appraisal – who assesses and reviews the results of the policies applied; if such an appraisal exists, its functioning must be described;

(h) other comments – other pertinent observations not made explicit in the above list.

46. A careful analysis must be made of the role of the government as a whole, as well as of its various branches – especially the police machinery, the law and the courts – in the patterns of racial relations and in their changing trends.

47. It is important to make clear that this will not be repetition of what is said in the laws and documents, but clarfication and explanation of any

/...

discrepancy that may exist between the law on the books and its enforcement.
Court decisions and/or other significant encounters between principles and
practices must be carefully examined. It will be appropriate to attach to each
study documentation concerning the basic legislation and jurisprudence on the
matter.

48. Another aspect deserving special attention is that of the policies of forced
assimilation that not infrequently provoke contra-assimilation reactions from the
groups involved. The same applies to the policies enforcing - or prohibiting -
discrimination in taxation, housing, schools, "job reservation", quota systems,
etc. These must be analysed from the point of view of the ideal models they offer,
the implementation they receive, and the real targets they reach.

49. Preventive legislation, in terms for instance, of making unlawful the
propagation of racist values and ideas, must be considered in all aspects,
especially in its application to concrete situations.

50. In some countries, especially the newly independent ones, the process of
acquiring, changing or losing citizenship and nationality, as well as the rules
concerning the right of some groups to preserve traditions, customs, folkways,
religion, education, language and symbols, express philosophy concerning the
problems of assimilation and/or segregation, and must be the subject of special
consideration in the study. Legislation concerning "job reservation", right of
association, marriage and education are some examples of special fields to be
considered.

51. With regard to the effectiveness of the role of law as a tool against
discrimination, there may be evidence that other social processes must occur in
order to provide the prerequisites of law enforcement. It has already been
suggested, for example, that legal measures against discrimination increase in
effectiveness when other factors in a society multiply the number of individuals
ready to adjust their overt behaviour to the prevailing legal rules, independent of
any evaluation of content according to the principle dura lex sed lex. In other
words, various social factors may increase the number of individuals whose basic
orientation will be to obey the law - whether discriminatory or anti-discriminatory.
There may be an increase in the number of "prejudiced-but-non-discriminators",
whose characteristics fit the profile of the so-called "authoritarian personality"

/...

(Adorno), this being apparent in societies in which there is a trend toward centralization of power. Using this as a working hypothesis, and applying it to the society under study, new aspects of the problem may be discovered.

52. Considering that some social groups have a strategic role in dealing with members of other ethnic groups and in spreading their own attitudes, it is important to analyse the measures from the point of view of the special groups they have as targets: youth, teachers, workers, military, civil servants, clergymen, physicians, lawyers.

(ii) Measures of persuasion and promotion

53. For our research purposes, they could be provisionally classified as follows:

(a) Exhortation - appeals, speeches, statements, recommendations, etc. Who makes them? Why? For what specific purposes? When? Case studies of the most typical cases will be made and whenever possible, original documentation will be attached to the reports.

(b) Education - meaning the formal and systematic use of the educational apparatus as a tool against racial conflict, prejudice and discrimination. Content analysis of syllabi, textbooks; interviews with students, teachers, parents, are recommended approaches to obtain insight into this aspect of the problem. The analysis must pay special attention to the secondary or high school level, because of its strategic importance in conditioning racial attitudes.

(c) Information - as circulated to the general public through mass media of communication. Its role in the formation and/or transformation of racial feelings will be analysed here, emphasizing not only the effects of the intentional use of these media for the purpose but also the patterns on awareness revealed, remembering that it is easier to create than to eliminate racial attitudes.

(d) Participation - in multi-racial associations and/or activities, guided by the idea that keeping in touch, and acting together, leads to increasing reduction of racial tensions. Case studies of most typical attempts made together with the effects will be undertaken.

(e) Negotiation - as a pattern of solving open conflicts between ethnic groups - established by law, tradition, or by agreement between interested parties. This approach has been experimented with in different fields (trade

unions, employment, urban settlements, schools, etc.), especially when the groups concerned have reached a high level or organization along racial lines.

(f) <u>Treatment</u> - meaning a clinical approach with explicit therapeutical goals. After the Second World War, this approach came into vogue in many countries, and its use, abuse and real effects will be analysed in the society under study.

54. These categories are not intended to be exhaustive, and others may be added according to the particular experience of each society concerned.

(iii) Actions and reactions of the groups

55. The actions and reactions of the groups involved, their ideologies and degrees of organization, patterns of leadership and of active participation in the combat against racial discrimination will be another aspect of the problem deserving special consideration. Such consideration will be given systematically, carefully taking into account the characteristics of each society under study.

4. Successes and failures

56. In the final part of each study, the interpretation and evaluation of the existing trends, as revealed by the study as a whole, will be made explicit. This interpretation and evaluation of the policies and measures taken since World War II to combat racial discrimination, as well as of their effectiveness, may provide answers to the three basic questions: (a) In what direction are the patterns of racial relations changing? (b) What has been the role played by the measures taken and the policies applied? (c) What has been the role played by spontaneous, non-deliberate factors, connected with the dynamics of the racial situation itself, as factors of change?

57. Where necessary, a clear indication should be given, stating whether or not the opinions expressed coincide with the points of view prevailing in (a) local "public opinion"; (b) the governing circles of the society under study; and/or (c) the different groups involved.

58. The assessment of the successes and failures of the policies applied, to be done intelligently, must recognize that nobody expects any "measure" taken in isolation to solve any racial problem of any society. Also, from this point of view, no measure could be completely "effective" in the sense that its absence or lack of

application would be the main factor responsible for the existence, or for the continuation, of the racial problem.

59. Racial discrimination is an extremely complex problem; its typology is manifold. Easy formulas or specific "measures" to solve other social problems - war, prostitution, poverty, neurosis, drug addiction, delinquency, illiteracy - do not exist, and the same applies to racial discrimination.

60. We must, therefore, approach the "measures" and "remedies" attempted as a whole, as forming a pattern of prevailing and developing racial policy in the society concerned. The analysis of each "measure" per se is conceived of as a step leading to the understanding of the racial policy in the total breadth and complexity of its meaning.

61. In evaluating the successes and failures of the policies applied as well as of their effects, some strategic questions must be raised, and used as basic working hypotheses to be checked by direct observation of the situation under study and by the systematic analysis and interpretation of the documentation collected in the fieldwork.

62. Some examples of those strategic questions to which the study must offer scholarly and well-documented answers, are given below. It must, however, be made clear that criteria for measuring the effectiveness of the measures and policies should be refined in the light of further study and discussion with those who will paricipate in the study.

  - In many cases, the techniques most frequently used are not the most pertinent - being preferred more for their latent functions than for the manifest one (i.e., imitation, less costly, discharge of guilt complexes, etc.). From this point of view, what is the case with the situations under study?

  - There commonly exists a gap between scientific knowledge regarding the processes of racial relations and the underlying philosphy of the anti-discriminatory practices and measures. What is the situation in the societies under study? At which stage, or level, does theoretical knowledge form the basis of practical measures?

  - Failure of measures applied tends to increase frustration and unrest. Sometimes, the mere announcement of a "measure" to be taken is considered as a satisfactory step against discrimination, thus relying on the efficacy of a "moral

warning". It is also assumed by some that the mere passage of the law probably decreased the incidence of discrimination. What, from this point of view, is the situation in the society under study?

- One of the most typical heritages of some domination patterns of the past - for instance, the colonial system - is the fact that the subordinate groups continue for a long time to look at themselves through the eyes of the dominating groups, accepting the negative image about themselves. Is the eradication of these self-depreciating views one of the goals of the anti-discriminatory policies? To what extent is this made explicit? What are the measures and techniques specifically used for this purpose? What are the results obtained?

- "Discretion is the best policy" - "It is not wise to publicize racial tensions". How far is this found in the societies under study? With what results? If changes have occurred, what were the reasons and under what pressures?

- An intensification of inter-group tensions and discriminatory practices may, in many cases, be the result of the fact that some basic problems are being solved, that the groups are moving in social space, that a process of structural change is going on, stimulating the rise in discrimination as a compensatory and stabilizing factor. How far, and why, does this model fit, or not fit, each society under study? To what extent do the policies applied take this into consideration?

- Some policies put the emphasis on changing the status of those discriminated against in order to improve their situation and image; other policies emphasize changing the attitudes of the discriminators. From this point of view, what is the prevailing pattern in the society under study? Why was it preferred?

- Social and economic policies, applied for other purposes, not explicitly to combat racial discrimination, may have an impact on the racial problem. What have these measures been and what has been their impact? Here, special consideration must be given to policies of agrarian reform, anti-poverty programmes, popular education, technical training, community development, etc.

- The "prejudiced outlook" and its institutional framework forms a relatively integrated unit. How far and in what ways do the policies applied take this into account? In practice, what is the corresponding integration of policies applied to combat various discriminations: religious, national, linguistic, against women, against foreigners, against handicapped people, etc.?

/...

- Policies aiming to remove the structural factors of racial discrimination
usually raise resistance on the part of those with vested interests in these
social cleavages. In each society concerned - Who are those with vested interests?
Why do they oppose changes? How is this expressed in practice? To what extent,
and how, do the policies applied take this into account?

63. Special consideration is also to be given to international aspects. In the
modern world international implications of national racial problems are of the
utmost importance. Two main directions are: (a) the national "race" problem
becoming an international issue; (b) trends in world politics deeply influencing,
for better or for worse, the evolution of the national racial situation. These
international implications must be approached from different points of view as for
instance: Migration to other countries of groups discriminated against; solidarity
or support for resistance movements received from abroad; existing "spreading
factors" in other countries that could be affected by developments in the
situation of the nation considered; connexions of the racial problem with tribal,
national or other patterns of solidarity or conflict involving more than one nation,
etc. Last, but not least, the presence and influence of the efforts of the United
Nations in combating racial discrimination and in defending human rights will be
considered, with special emphasis on the identification of weak points and
suggestions for better performance in the future.

64. Comparing the policies applied, as factors of change, with the spontaneous
factors connected with the dynamics of the racial situation itself - as has already
been indicated - is another basic aim of the evaluation to be undertaken. The
explicit aim here is to understand what is happening in the various relevant sectors
of the social, economic and political structure that are changing (indicating in
what direction and with what intensity) the institutional framework within which
the groups enter into relations with each other, the systems of social roles they
perform and the orientations and effectiveness of the policies applied. Thus,
what seems to be important is the notion that anti-discriminatory policies operate
in a context in which everything else does not remain equal and that other factors
are present and influential in the changing configuration of the racial situation.
This analysis would also be based on the fact that the effectiveness of measures
against racial discrimination is largely dependent upon the patterns and degrees
of correlation between "racial" and "non-racial" processes, "deliberate" and
"non-deliberate" factors, and "ethnic" and "non-ethnic" trends.

III. DIFFICULTIES AND OBSTACLES FOR THE STUDY

65. In proposing such studies and providing a research design for information, UNITAR is aware of the many difficulties and obstacles. First of all, there is always a certain amount of sensitivity on the part of authorities to admit the existence of problems of race relations. This results in resistance to any study in depth on the situation prevailing in a particular society. This has also prevented the adoption of concrete anti-discriminatory measures and where adopted, the implementing machinery is often subsumed in other forms of social welfare activities and where the law is ambiguous the problems of enforcement are considerable. Proportionately the task of evaluation is made more difficult. In many societies most people who suffer the humiliation of being discriminated against prefer to forget it or suffer the affront in silence. They are also afraid of creating a situation in which their complaints would lead to more organized discrimination. This being the case it will be exceedingly difficult for individuals or institutions to collect evidence more or less accurately as to the extent of discrimination and forms which it takes. While sample surveys are useful methods of discovering the extent of racial discrimination, through interviews, situation testing etc., one should not underestimate the problems involved in it. First of all, these are expensive undertakings. An important requisite for the reliability and relevance of the sample surveys is the confidence created by the investigators in both the discriminators and the discriminated and the co-operation received from different sections of the community as well as the administrative units at local, regional and national levels.

66. The second hurdle to be faced is in relation to statistical data of every kind. Although basic demographic data are being gradually compiled on a systematic basis in a number of countries, there is a reluctance to keep statistics that distinguish by race or ethnic group. In fact, the attempts at removing racial distinctions as a part of anti-discriminatory measures have obliterated the statistical data necessary for the study. This difficulty in the collection of figures will be more compounded when we move into the area of education, housing, employment and financial sectors involving mortgages, insurance and credit facilities. But since the main purpose is evaluation of the effectiveness of

measures against racial discrimination, the difficulties encountered in data collection should not deter the prosecution of the study.

67. The enumeration of some of these difficulties is made not to discourage the undertaking of these studies. On the contrary, the challenges involved should spur greater efforts and the beneficial results would be, not only in the field of racial discrimination, but also in other sectors of public life, associated with this problem.