



Report
on the Activities of UNESCO's
Regional Educational Building Institute
for Africa (REBIA)

by
L. Garcia del Solar
Joint Inspection Unit

Geneva
August 1971

Table of Contents

	<u>Paragraph</u>	<u>Page</u>
FOREWORD	1-3	1
I. <u>BACKGROUND</u>		
A. Origin and location	4-7	1
B. Initial activities	8-10	2
C. Geographical coverage	11	3
D. Contributions for the maintenance and operation of the Institute	12-14	3
II. <u>OPERATION</u>		
A. Organization of the Institute	15-29	5
B. Functions and programme	30-56	7
C. Views of the Member States of the region	57-62	14
D. Opinions from other sources	63	16
III. <u>APPRAISAL</u>		
A. Geographical coverage and location of the Institute	64-79	17
B. Support	80	21
C. Staff	81-85	21
D. Technical advice	86	23
E. Programme	87-114	23
IV. <u>CONCLUSIONS</u>	115-119	30
V. <u>THE FUTURE</u>		
A. Possible solution	120-124	33
B. Decentralization	125-136	33
C. Geographical coverage	137-158	38
D. Improvements in the programme	139-144	38
E. Tentative estimates for the decentralization of the programme	145-150	40
VI. <u>RECOMMENDATIONS</u>		42

FOREWORD

1. In a report (JIU/REP/71/5) on the activities of UNESCO's Asian Regional Institute for School Building Research (ARISBR), background information was given on the Director-General's request for an inspection of certain regional institutes and about the organization's policy with regard to centres in general (paras. 1 to 13).
2. Complying with the JIU's programme in response to this request, this Inspector undertook subsequently an inspection of the REGIONAL EDUCATIONAL BUILDING INSTITUTE FOR AFRICA (REBIA), located in Khartoum, Republic of Sudan.
3. Since this report deals, as the previous one on ARISBR, with UNESCO's regional programme on educational buildings, it will try to avoid, especially as far as technical explanations are concerned, repetition of details already given in document JIU/REP/71/5 insofar as they are applicable to the Khartoum institute. Special care will be taken, however, not to indulge in generalizations which would overlook the well-known differences in the problems which confront the African and the Asian regions.

I. BACKGROUND

A. Origin and location

4. The Institute was created as a result of UNESCO's Emergency Programme for Africa launched in 1961. Unlike the sister project in Asia, it was assigned a limited purpose: to design and assist in the construction of three school building projects.
5. An agreement between UNESCO and the Government of the Sudan was concluded in November 1961 for the establishment of an African School Planning Group which was later renamed the UNESCO School Construction Bureau for Africa. In the light of the Director's view that the Bureau should function as an architectural office to provide free professional services to African Member States, it was given the responsibility of designing and supervising the construction of teacher training colleges in the Sudan, Central African Republic and Nigeria; copies of the plans were to be communicated to all African Member States.
6. By 1964 UNESCO had acknowledged that the project was ill-conceived and a new agreement was signed in May 1965 with the Government of the Sudan converting the Bureau into a regional research and documentation centre. After the visit of the "Committee on the Evaluation of UNESCO-operated or aided Regional Offices", in 1967, a third agreement was negotiated and signed in October 1968, as a result of which the present name was adopted: Regional Educational Building Institute for Africa (REBIA).

7. The Sudan was chosen as the location for this Institute because: (a) it already had an experimental school building project under way, and (b) the country included nearly every African climate within its borders and this would consequently permit the evaluation of a variety of prototype buildings.

E. Initial activities

8. Of the above-mentioned projects for the construction of teacher training colleges in three African countries, only one was completed under the Bureau's supervision: the building of the Onduman Higher Teacher Training Institute in the Sudan; shortly afterwards severe cracks appeared in its walls as a result of foundation problems. The Central African Republic and Nigeria, in turn, were agreeable to receiving free architectural services, but it proved difficult for their governments to find funds for construction. It was probably for this reason that no construction was carried out.

9. The mistake made in creating almost simultaneously the equivalent of an architectural office both in the Asian and African projects is an indication of the lack of experience that UNESCO Headquarters had when the regional school building programmes were initiated. The policy had to be corrected in 1965 in order that the Institute's involvement in architectural activities should be restricted to "providing consultant services when requested by the Secretariat of UNESCO for the elaboration, appraisal, implementation and evaluation of school building programmes involving international assistance". But the difficulties encountered by the Institute in performing a useful task for African Member States were attributable not only to UNESCO's initial conception of its activities. great mistakes were also made in the selection of the Institute's staff. The team for the 1962-1964 period was assembled with perhaps undue haste, problems quickly arose and following a conflict with the staff, the Director was dismissed. Even after 1965, when changes in the methods of operation of the Institute were introduced, the old staff were replaced by persons ill-suited for the work and performance of the Institute continued to be disappointing.

10. It is no surprise to read, therefore, in the report of the Evaluation Commission (BMS/MD/2, May 1968, page 24, point 2) that "as regards the past activities of the Centre [the evaluation of the Committee] is that this institution has been a failure". (UNESCO's investment during the 1961-1968 period had amounted to about 1,000,000 dollars).

C. Geographical coverage

11. According to Article II of the agreement, Member States and Associate Members of UNESCO in Africa may participate in the activities of the Institute and use its service. This means that 37 countries should be the beneficiaries of REBIA's programme. This is by far the largest group of States served by any of the UNESCO-operated regional institutes for educational buildings.

D. Contributions for the maintenance and operation of the Institute

12. Three sources of aid are envisaged in the agreement:

(a) Through UNESCO

- (i) assistance under the UNESCO regular budget as authorized by the General Conference;
- (ii) assistance under the UNDP Regional Technical Assistance Programme in the form of services of experts and fellow-ships;

(b) By the host Government

- (i) the services of a full-time Director for the Institute;
- (ii) local staff, to meet the needs of the Institute;
- (iii) premises for office space;
- (iv) supply and maintenance of office equipment and furnishings;

(c) By third parties

- (i) voluntary contributions from Member States in the region;
- (ii) voluntary contributions from other interested Member States;
- (iii) voluntary contributions from international organizations other than UNESCO;
- (iv) compensation received for services rendered or material produced;
- (v) contributions, gifts, legacies and subventions from individual sources.

13. An examination of the contributions in US dollars to the Institute during the past six years gives the following picture:

	<u>1965-1966</u>	<u>1967-1968</u>	<u>1969-1970</u>
UNESCO Reg. Prog.	185,260	246,195	264,500
UNDP Regional Tech.Ass.	-	-	49,200
Host Government	18,000	28,000	43,000
Member States of region	-	-	-
Member State outside the region	-	-	54,000
Regional organizations	-	-	-
Other reg. institutions (African Dev. Bank)	-	-	1,500

14. Approved figures for 1971-1972 show a decrease in UNESCO's regular budget contribution ("224,500) and a substantial increase in the UNDP allocation ("63,200).

The above figures indicate that^{1/}:

- (i) unlike the other two regional educational building institutes which from the very beginning received contributions through TA, REBIA only started receiving funds from this source as from 1969;
- (ii) contributions by the host Government in relation to the funds mobilized by UNESCO are relatively modest (i.e. 13.7 per cent in 1969-1970), especially when compared to the Latin American centre where the government's allocation is double that of UNESCO;
- (iii) contributions from participating Member States of the region are non-existent;
- (iv) compensation for services rendered, gifts and legacies have also been non-existent. As far as subvention from individual sources are concerned, the Institute has been in contact with the German Foundation for Developing Countries which might result in some kind of assistance. There has also been some collaboration from the American Institute of Architects, which financed the visit of an architect to African countries. A report is expected;
- (v) the only regional institution furnishing a modest contribution is the African Regional Bank. In the case of the Latin American centre, appreciable aid is supplied by the Organization of American States ("180,000 in 1969-1970);
- (vi) the Institute is now receiving some valuable assistance from a Government outside the region: the Netherlands supplies the services of an associate expert (architect).

^{1/} For comparisons with figures of contributions from similar sources in the case of the Asian and Latin American educational building institutes, see document JIU/REP/71/5 para.24 (report on the Asian institute).

II. OPERATION

4. Organization of the Institute

15. The Institute's premises, which have been provided by the Government of the Sudan, are sufficiently large for its needs and well situated for its operations. The building has a solid structure and is equipped with air conditioning facilities in some offices. The Institute's administration is governed by the terms of the agreement which provide for.

- (1) a Governing Board
- (2) a Technical Advisory Committee and
- (3) the Staff

16. (1) The Governing Board, which corresponds to ARISBR's Steering Committee should, according to the agreement, be composed of (i) a representative of the Government who acts as Chairman ex officio; (ii) a representative of the Director-General of UNESCO; (iii) representatives of inter-governmental organizations of Member States making substantial contributions to the running of the Institute; and (iv) the Chairman of the Technical Advisory Committee. The Director of the Institute acts as the Secretary of the Governing Board.

17. In fact, only those mentioned under (1) and (ii) above have been represented on the Governing Board, since no Member State, nor regional, nor international organization have made any contributions to the Institute and aid granted by the African Development Bank is not substantial enough to meet the requirement stipulated in Article IV (d) of the agreement; the Technical Advisory Committee, on the other hand, has never been constituted.

18. Thus, the Governing Board has functioned with two persons plus the Secretary (who has no vote). The Chairman, nominated by the Ministry of Education, is currently the Deputy Under-Secretary on Engineering Affairs of the Ministry of Local Government. He has attended all meetings of the Governing Board and is in frequent contact with the Institute.

19. UNESCO's Director-General is represented at the meetings by the Headquarters' head project officer, which represents an improvement in respect of ARISBR's Steering Committee.

20. The Board meets once a year for two or three days to discuss and approve the programme and budget of the Institute; the UNESCO experts attend the meetings as

advisers. This body has performed its duties efficiently and seems to be a suitable mechanism for controlling the Institute's activities.

21. (2) Technical Advisory Committee: The agreement provided for the establishment of such a group in order to advise the Governing Board on the programme of the Institute and to help in promoting its activities in the region. It was to be composed of nine members of different African Member States, eminent in the educational building field. It was to meet once every two years.

22. This Committee has never been constituted because sufficient funds were not available. During the last meeting of the Governing Board the question was raised, but it was decided to take no action due to the fact that the agreement between the Government and UNESCO expires on 31 December 1972.

23. (3) The Staff: The Secretariat is composed of two categories of personnel:

(a) International professional staff

	<u>Financed by</u>	<u>Nationality</u>
1 Director	UNESCOPAS	Sudan
1 Development Group Adviser (Architect)	UNDP-TA	U.S.A.
1 Research Architect	UNESCO's Reg.	Colombia
1 Documentalist and Publications Officer	" "	Italy
1 Administrative Officer	" "	Rep. of Vietnam
1 Associate Expert (Architect)	Netherlands Government	Netherlands

(b) Local support staff

2 Draftsmen
1 Assistant Documentalist
1 Chief Clerk
1 Secretary of Director
1 Secretary
2 Typists
1 Machine operator
2 Drivers
2 Messengers
2 Workers

24. (a) International professional staff: at the time the inspection took place in May 1971, it included six experts; an additional associate expert (documentalist) was expected, and three associate expert posts (1 graphic designer and 2 architects) were under recruitment.

25. The Institute is headed by a Director appointed by the Chairman of the Governing Board in agreement with the Director-General of UNESCO. The present Director, appointed in 1966, is a Sudanese architect who studied educational methods in the UK. He is full-time and his salary is paid by the Sudanese Government (Ministry of Education) in conjunction with the UNESCOPAS arrangement.

26. Under his direction, three architects (one of whom is an associate expert incorporated in 1969) team up with him for the execution of the programme. The other two replace two very able architects who requested transfers in 1968 and 1970, after staying in Khartoum only 10 months and 24 months respectively. One of the two new arrivals has been engaged under a TA contract with a firm commitment to complete his mission in one year.

27. The international professional staff includes an Administrative Officer whose contract expires in December 1972. Finally there is a documentalist who replaced the extremely competent officer now working in ARISBR and who left in 1969 due to poor health after four years in Khartoum. Her present substitute looks forward to the termination of his contract next October.

28. This lack of stability in the international professional staff is one of the greatest problems of the Institute and severely jeopardizes its performance, a problem which cannot be solved by recruiting local professionals since the Sudan, a young Republic, is unable at this stage to supply the highly experienced senior experts needed for REBIA's specialized activities.

29. (b) Local support staff: the Institute has 15 people locally recruited by the Director. They are paid by the Government and receive an additional allowance from UNESCO funds. The Institute has total freedom to appoint and terminate these staff members, who are not subject to any restrictive governmental regulations.

B. Functions and Programme

30. The programme is drawn up, on a yearly basis, by the Director of the Institute in consultation with the experts and is presented to the Governing Board which discusses and approves it. It includes activities which are more the result of the experts' conception of priorities in their work, after years of trial and error, than an implementation of the functions as set forth in Art. III of the agreement. The text of this article, which is not as clear-cut nor as articulate as the corresponding one for the Asian Centre, includes activities in which the Institute is actually

engaged and others where little or nothing can realistically be done. The accent in the text of the report is put primarily on documentation and liaison activities and only then on development work; separate from the latter, certain other activities are stipulated which actually belong to development work. Research activities and the holding of courses and seminars - two main items in the ARISBR agreement - are given but marginal importance in Art. III.

31. As regards the levels of education with which the Institute concerns itself, emphasis has been placed on primary and secondary school buildings. This is logical since if there is a region where an enormous amount of work has still to be done at the lower levels it is in Africa. Nevertheless, REBIA has taken up studies on certain more developed areas of the second level such as the application of audio-visual techniques to teaching, the design of complexes for teaching science, arts and crafts, the development of mobile teaching packages and a series of other imaginative lay-outs in order to overcome problems created by the lack of teachers, waste in the utilization of the meagre resources available, etc.

32. At the third level of education, REBIA is giving advice on a project for the Building and Road Research Institute in Ghana and is taking up a study on criteria for design of teacher training colleges with a view to building a prototype training college using local materials developed by the Institute. In practice, the programme has developed on the following main lines:

(a) Development Work

33. The early approach, based upon purely architectural assistance for a handful of countries and the subsequent static period, when UNESCO attempted to recast the operational staff into research and documentation roles, failed to solve to any appreciable extent the educational building problems in Africa.

34. As a result, the Evaluation Commission was of the opinion that "UNESCO should give the Centre more leadership in evolving its objectives, and better facilities for their implementation with a view to making it more operational and more useful to the Member States of the region." To implement this course of action it specifically recommended the technique of dispatching task forces.

35. The idea of task forces owes its inception, therefore, to UNESCO's African project on educational building and was later adopted by the Asian Institute, where they are called "mobile teams". It consists of applying a dynamic and flexible approach to the

so-called "development work activities" (described in paras. 46 to 52 of the ARISBR report JIU/REP/71/5). The task forces, as originally conceived by the Evaluation Commission, were to include a leader, with educational and architectural experience, an educationalist and several junior architects, if possible African. After specific projects on educational buildings were identified by the Institute, these task forces would visit the respective Member States for a reasonable period of time and assist in planning and implementing the projects. A country's needs were to be assessed and studies were to be carried out not only of the construction of the school buildings, but of everything which was related to their type, size and location in the light of the educational and environmental requirements, the local materials that could be utilized, the growth and movement of population, the financial, human and physical resources of the Member States, the time and administration required for the planning, designing and construction of the school buildings, etc.

36. According to the degree of involvement of the Institute in each specific project, two categories of action can be identified:

(i) issuance of reports leading to full participation of REBIA in the actual construction of prototypes which, properly followed up, should influence school building programmes of the given country and could eventually be applicable to other Member States;

(ii) partial involvement of REBIA through the supply of advice or consultant services in connexion with specific projects financed by governments or by other organizations or institutions. Visits of REBIA's experts to Member States should also contribute to

(iii) the setting up of national "development groups" (described in para. 47 of JIU/REP/71/5) and to the creation of

(iv) school building units where these do not exist.

(i) Full involvement of REBIA through task force missions:

37. The task force approach on the basis of teams of experts visiting Member States has been applied in the case of three main projects: design of norms for secondary schools in the Ivory Coast, preparation of school building standards and of budgeting for maintenance and renovation of existing buildings in Somalia, and design of a low cost primary school with a centre for community activities in Mali. These two last missions resulted in reports, the latter of which should lead to the construction of

prototypes under the supervision of the Institute. This year, task forces are to be sent to Kenya and Cameroon for the preparation of inventories of space standards and design guidelines for secondary school buildings. On a more limited scale, an expert is to visit Togo this year to assist in the construction of a primary school prototype and then Ghana to develop a training college prototype.

(ii) Partial involvement through the supply of advisory services:

38. These activities are carried out either through the dispatch of a REBIA expert to specific countries or through visits to Khartoum of Member States' representatives responsible for school building projects.

39. In Libya a REBIA expert joined a consultant mission and two reports were prepared on the establishment of a national school unit and development of a programme of research and design projects. No action has so far been taken by the Government on the reports. In Algeria the Institute sent an expert to provide technical back-stopping to a UNDP/TA consultant mission for a project on design norms for secondary schools. Four pilot projects are to be built in 1971-72 following these norms. Uganda was visited to study the plans of six teacher training colleges which were to be built with funds provided by a bilateral loan, as well as to appraise the extension of three secondary schools built with UNHCR funds. In Chad, as in the above-mentioned countries, REBIA has given advice on the formulation of a request to UNDP for technical assistance for educational building projects. In the Sudan advice is being given on the design of primary schools to be built in conjunction with UNHCR resettlement schemes. The Democratic Republic of Congo received the visit of an expert together with advice on the reorganization of a national school building centre, in connexion with a UNDP/SF project for educational planning and buildings. Technical advice was furnished for a teacher training college in Sierra Leone and a secondary school in Tanzania, both financed with funds-in-trust from Sweden. Finally, advice is being given on the establishment of a primary school research unit in Zambia.

(iii) Setting up of national development groups:

40. Article III (1.(b)) of the agreement stipulates that in order to assist in the planning and execution of educational building programmes, the Institute should promote the establishment of national Development Groups; further, it specifies that REBIA should assist such groups to select development projects, plan with them the

documentation of work on significant projects and circulate the results through the region, hold workshops at which a number of groups can discuss and develop their techniques.

41. This objective of setting up in Member States interdisciplinary teams composed of local architects, educationalists, cost experts and administrators was inspired by a technique successfully developed in the United Kingdom. The report on the Asian Institute proved that due to the absence of architects and cost experts in the developing countries, it has been possible to establish such groups only in a handful of Member States. The situation in Africa is even more critical. Practically no country has experienced cost experts, very few have architects (of the 37 Member States, only the following eight have faculties of architecture: Algeria, Democratic Republic of Congo, Ethiopia, Ghana, Kenya, Nigeria, Sudan and United Arab Republic); even in the field of educationalists, it is hard to find in some countries professionals having the kind of modern expertise needed in development groups for educational building programmes.

42. Consequently, no development groups as such have been formed in the African region.

(iv) Creation of school building units within the administrations of Member States

43. If Member States were to include in their administrations a unit specifically in charge of educational building problems, such a unit would constitute the natural basis for the establishment of some kind of development groups and the executive arm to carry out, once the prototype buildings designed by REBIA will have proved successful, the follow-up and completion of the programme. Further, the formation of such a unit within the government departments would not only help to establish school building standards and prototype schools but would also serve as a nucleus for the future development of a research unit which would deal with all problems related to educational facilities, as well as of a planning unit which would promote the national programmes.

44. Unfortunately very few Member States have such a unit; in some cases they have, for instance, a building unit in the Ministry of Public Works and a school building planning office in the Ministry of Education. In most of these cases, co-ordination between these units is poor and their activities are not geared, as they should be,

to meet overall national planning. So far, the Institute has found no opportunity to actively promote the creation of such units in Member States or to improve co-ordination among the existing offices.

(b) Research

45. Unlike the Asian Institute, REBIA has given in its programme only a subsidiary role to research. The Evaluation Commission, anxious to inject operational impulse into the Institute's activities, strongly advised against any direct involvement in research and experimentation but recommended that it should stimulate these in the national institutes. The Commission considered, inter alia, that such activities were not geared to the Institute's resources.

46. Consequently, as against 53 studies performed by the Asian Institute, REBIA produced so far only 18, among which were space utilization surveys on Madagascar, Morocco, Ghana, Tanzania and Sudan.

47. The Institute has a staff of only four experts (architects), including the Director, all of them highly operationally minded: even the expert identified as "Research architect" strongly believes that what African countries need are studies on their specific requirements resulting from visits to the field.

48. The vastness of the territory to cover with such a small team allows the dispatch of task forces for development work to no more than three or four countries every year. Very little time is left for weeks-long laboratory-type research in Khartoum. There is no other alternative but to devote a limited amount of time to this activity and to approach research with strictly operational criteria. This does not prevent the Institute, however, from applying in Africa the findings of research performed elsewhere. In this regard, studies carried out by the Asian Institute have proved to be, in certain instances, very useful. This does not mean that research is totally neglected: some valuable studies were performed, specifically by the previous research architect who left the Institute, but some of his work remains unfinished. To sum up REBIA's present approach to research, it could be said that it is based on pragmatic criteria: whenever a study is carried out, it corresponds to a specific need detected during the task forces' missions.

49. As to the stimulation of research in national institutes, REBIA, rather than promoting it, has co-operated with existing organizations such as the National Building Research Station (Sudan), the Building and Road Research Institute (Ghana), the

Cacavelli Centre (Togo) and the College of Technology (Ethiopia). Further, a representative of REBIA attended recently the meeting of the Ad Hoc Expert Group on Co-ordination of Building and Planning. Recommendations were approved which, once implemented, will co-ordinate information on research activities carried out by all research organizations in Africa, the Economic Commission of Africa acting as the clearing house.

(c) Courses

50. The agreement deliberately does not contemplate, as in the case of the Asian Institute, the holding of seminars and training courses for representatives of Member States responsible for educational building programmes. It merely recommends the holding of workshops for development groups (which as was said earlier, have not been set up) and calls for collaboration "with the appropriate authorities in supporting courses in educational building for members of Development Groups and other African architects, engineers and administrators."

51. In a region in which architects and engineers are very scarce, whom do you train to be a specialist in educational facilities? It appears that the most important people to contact are educational administrators in key positions, i.e. directors of educational planning, chief education officers, etc. but on the other hand it is difficult for such persons to attend specialized seminars. But after attracting only six persons to a seminar in 1966, the Institute's activities in this field have been restricted to participation of REBIA's experts in training courses given for educational planners and administrators by the UNESCO centres in Beirut and Dakar; there attendance by African Member States is high.

52. The Institute has organized only two national courses (of two weeks each) in connexion with specific projects in Mali and the Democratic Republic of Congo and is planning another two in Somalia and Kenya.

(d) Documentation

53. The Publications programme has been qualitatively excellent since 1966. REBIA's documents are produced in English and French, translation into the latter language being very adequately done by the documentalist. The contents of the reports are very much oriented to African problems and the quality of reproduction is good; recent reports are conceived according to practical criteria and are well illustrated.

54. From the quantitative point of view, the output has been relatively small: 5 technical publications (23 in ARISBR), 26 working documents and restricted reports (40 in ARISBR). The modest research programme may be one of the reasons, to which must be added the fact that until 1968 REBIA's activities generally were very limited. The Institute issues every three months a Newsletter which is distributed to Member States, as are all technical documents with the exception of country reports.

(e) Consultant Services

55. Point 1. (f) of Art. III of the agreement stipulates as one of the main functions of the Institute the provision of consultant services (at UNESCO's request), for the elaboration, appraisal, implementation and evaluation of educational building programmes involving international assistance.

56. So far consultant services were limited to the preparation of a plan for a school building project requested by UNESCO, reporting on the performance of national set-ups with a view to procuring international aid for these, and participation in organizing the evaluation of projects already carried out.

C. Views of the Member States of the region

57. Before going to Khartoum, this Inspector took advantage of the presence of representatives of Member States of the African region at the Sixteenth General Conference of UNESCO to talk with National Commission members and/or Ministry of Education officials of the following countries: Algeria, Cameroon, Central African Republic, Chad, Democratic Republic of Congo, People's Republic of the Congo, Dahomey, Ethiopia, Gabon, Ghana, Guinea, Ivory Coast, Kenya, Liberia, Libyan Arab Republic, Madagascar, Malawi, Mali, Morocco, Niger, Nigeria, Rwanda, Senegal, Sierra Leone, Somalia, Tanzania, Tunisia, United Arab Republic, Uganda, Upper Volta and Zambia. The Sudanese government was contacted in Khartoum.

58. The following general conclusions may be drawn from the talks held:

- (a) except for one Member State in northern Africa with relatively well developed educational facilities, all others admitted that there is a great need in the region for UNESCO's programme on educational building, promoted through institutes like REBIA;
- (b) most feel that the present approach based on visits to Member States by the Institute's representatives to make known its objectives, identify projects and discuss during several days methods of operation, constitutes the only realistic way of performing a useful task. They also find that the dispatch of task forces as the most effective operational technique. Many Member States are of the opinion that the holding of seminars where officials responsible for educational buildings could exchange views with UNESCO's experts on the objectives of the Institute its experiences and methods of operation, would help to make better use of the programme on educational building;

- (c) however, a very high proportion of western African Member States have had very little, if any, contact with REBIA. They all feel that it is too far away. Even in the case of some Member States of East and Central Africa it is admitted that communications with Khartoum are not easy;
- (d) a great number of Member States feel that it is unrealistic to have a single Institute to cover Africa's enormous needs in the field of educational buildings; some of them felt that the programme would be better implemented if one office would cover East Africa and another West Africa;
- (e) French-speaking Member States feel that REBIA's location in an Arab-speaking country, with personnel mainly using English as a working language, affects communication with them adversely;
- (f) aid for school building programmes in French-speaking countries predominantly flows from bilateral sources, based on somewhat outdated architectural concepts and utilizing expensive imported materials. These Member States also receive assistance from international financial institutions, such as IBRD. They, therefore, feel that if conditions were improved to make possible frequent contacts with an Institute like REBIA, great benefits would accrue on account of its knowledge of local problems, its tendency to utilize local materials and thus reduce construction costs and the possibilities it has to furnish consultant services to financing institutions;
- (g) most Member States feel that UNESCO's educational building programme should include, as one of its main activities, the granting of scholarships to train young African professionals in this sphere of activity;
- (h) those Member States having educational building units in their Ministries clearly are more familiar with the Institute's objectives and activities than those which do not. The latter, for their part, admit that such units would increase possibilities of co-operation with REBIA;
- (i) most Member States receive REBIA's documentation, but very few seem to make fruitful use of it. In the developing countries with no school building units or architects the documents simply pile up and remain unread.

59. An interesting source of authorized opinions is found in the report of the Third Sub-Regional meeting of East and Central African National Commissions for UNESCO, held in Addis Ababa in August 1970, attended by representatives of Ethiopia, Kenya, Somalia, Tanzania, Uganda and Zambia.

60. With reference to the various UNESCO centres in Africa, the following observations by the meeting are quoted below :

"National Commissions represented by the Sub-Region were not adequately informed about the activities and work of the centres ... The Meeting further noted that Member States tended to obtain service and assistance if they were near a centre or when they were sites of centres.. States remotely located tended to benefit inadequately ... The idea of Regional Centres and Offices serving the whole vast Region of Africa with all its diversity was considered as unrealistic and not the best way of rendering efficient service. The Meeting felt this problem was compounded by the shortage of staff and resources in the offices and centres ... It was observed that the activities of the Regional Centres and Offices suffered due to lack of sufficient planning by Member States themselves ..."

61. Among the recommendations, it is worth-while quoting the following which illustrates how difficult it is to serve all of Africa over distances of thousands of kilometres and including areas using different languages:

"... 3. The specific aims and purposes of the various UNESCO offices were felt to be little known even to the national commissions represented. The Bureau of Education at Dakar was cited as an example of a case in which none of the national commissions represented have obtained to date information on the specific tasks assigned to this Bureau".

62. It is no surprise therefore to read the final recommendation:

"5. The Meeting recommends that the whole concept of regional bureaux, offices etc. be re-examined and other venues of service be explored. The possibility of sub-regional rather than regional centres may be considered as an alternative "

D. Opinions from other sources

63. The UNDP Resident Representative in Khartoum acknowledges the importance of UNESCO's programme on educational building and commends the efforts being carried out by REBIA's experts. On the other hand, he states categorically that with the resources now available to it, the Institute cannot cover all of Africa. If a country in West Africa requests a task force it takes a long time for the force to arrive and for the duration of the mission the very few experts the Institute has, and who are badly needed at its headquarters to study and prepare work for other parts of the region, are fully mobilized. The present arrangement is, therefore, highly inadequate to face Africa's pressing needs in educational building. In conclusion, he feels that either the Institute should be strongly reinforced, or it should be decentralized to cover different sub-regions. If neither of these solutions is adopted he considers that the Institute should be closed.

III. APPRAISAL

1. Geographical coverage and location of the Institute

64. (a) With financial resources 2.5 per cent and 193 per cent lower, respectively, than those assigned between 1965 and 1970 to the Asian and Latin American Institutes, REBLA has to serve a number of African Member States (37) that is nearly double that of each other region.

65. At present, the programme includes the following countries: Algeria, Burundi, Cameroon, Chad, Central African Republic, Democratic Republic of Congo, People's Republic of the Congo, Dahomey, Ethiopia, Gabon, Ghana, Guinea, Ivory Coast, Kenya, Lesotho, Liberia, Libyan Arab Republic, Madagascar, Malawi, Mali, Mauritania, Mauritius, Morocco, Niger, Nigeria, Rwanda, Senegal, Sierra Leone, Somalia, Sudan, Tanzania, Togo, Tunisia, Uganda, United Arab Republic, Upper Volta and Zambia. It does not include, however, such non-member States as Botswana, Gambia, Equatorial Guinea and Swaziland though school building needs there are pressing.

66. (b) Khartoum is located in an area where climatic and living conditions deeply influence the stability of the international staff. As described in paras. 26-28; 67-73 there is a continuous turnover of experts on whose adaptation to the methods of work of the Institute valuable time is periodically lost.

67. What is the reason for such a chronic turnover? It definitely has nothing to do with the experts' interest in their work: all of them, those who are in Khartoum and some who left, were interviewed by this Inspector, and they were unanimous in considering that working on UNESCO's regional educational building programme for Africa is a fascinating challenge. But all of them also agree that conditions in Khartoum are often difficult since the staff is very isolated from professional contacts and advice in its specific field of activities. Besides, living conditions create problems for their families. The feeling of isolation is, therefore, two-fold - professional and geographical - something that has to be mentioned in all frankness since this problem will influence this Inspector's conclusions on the continuity of the project as now carried out. May I however state, in a sincere homage to the Sudanese Government, that all parties concerned - officials at UNESCO Headquarters and REBLA's former and present personnel - have nothing but praise for the tireless efforts that the authorities have always made to support the Institute's activities,

and to try to solve whatever professional or personal problems the staff may have. Moreover, this has been done with the very particular charm and high degree of hospitality which is in the nature of the Sudanese people.

68. But Khartoum is a city located in Central Africa, completely surrounded by the desert. This factor influences the weather greatly: it is relatively cool at night and in the early morning, but from 9.00 a.m. on, the temperature rises abruptly under a burning sun. The following tables illustrate these climatic characteristics:

Mean MINIMUM temperature (°F) at night and early morning hours with indication, between brackets, of lowest point reached every month (1968)

Jan.	Feb.	Mar.	Apr.	May	June	Jul.	Aug.	Sep.	Oct.	Nov.	Dec.
60	62	67	73	79	80	78	77	78	77	70	63
(44)	(46)	(53)	(57)	(66)	(68)	(67)	(65)	(66)	(66)	(55)	(43)

Mean MAXIMUM temperature (°F) at day time hours with indication, between brackets, of highest point reached every month (1968)

Jan.	Feb.	Mar.	Apr.	May	June	Jul.	Aug.	Sep.	Oct.	Nov.	Dec.
90	93	99	105	107	107	100	97	101	103	97	91
(104)	(110)	(113)	(117)	(117)	(118)	(115)	(110)	(113)	(113)	(108)	(104)

69. The average minimum temperature for the whole year round is, therefore, 72 degrees F. and the average maximum 99 degrees F.

70. Except for the months of July, August and September (1.89, 1.83 and 1 inches respectively, in 1968) there is little rain in Khartoum. The climate is, therefore, dry, something which mitigates the effect of the high temperature during working hours. If we add the fact that REBELA's building is partially air conditioned, it could be said that for those members of the staff who are not obliged to move around in Khartoum, conditions are reasonably bearable. This is not the case, however, for the families of the experts, particularly the wives, who very rarely adapt themselves to the almost unvarying very hot all year round temperatures.

71. To this it must be added that experts and their families needing a break on weekends have practically nowhere to go near Khartoum and cannot afford expensive long-distance plane trips. The Sudan is the largest country in Africa and communications from Khartoum are poor; there is one railway leading to the sea, but its nearest point, Port Sudan, is 700 kms. away. Personal effects of newly appointed experts take as much as three months to get to their final destination.

72. The rise in the cost of living and the non-availability of certain indispensable articles also create problems. Until December 1969, UN experts received a monthly allowance for housing. This allowance was discontinued from 1 January 1970, and experts have now to pay the full rent which rises constantly (10% in 1969 and 30% in 1970). In 1971, the rent of a comfortable house of 3-4 bedrooms costs from 350 to 430 dollars, plus electricity, water, gas and telephone. As for supplies, many articles are impossible to find on the market due to the rise in import taxes. Items like butter, cheese, toilet soap, toilet articles, clothing, mineral water, etc. have to be ordered from Kenya. Thus, a family of 3 or 4 persons have great difficulties in financing their personal needs with the emoluments at present paid to experts.

73. If to the above-mentioned climatic conditions and feeling of geographical and professional isolation are added the handicaps of everyday life, it is understandable that qualified international experts do not remain long in Khartoum.

74. Of course, climatic conditions do not affect the local personnel; the only problem for them is transportation between their homes and the Institute which in some cases takes at least one hour. Some clerks have to change buses as much as three times, with long waits at rush hours.

75. (c) Air communications within the African region are significantly less developed than in other continents; flights are infrequent and due to the enormous distances, and to the necessity of making detours because connecting points are in cities which are not centrally located (Cairo, Nairobi, Dakar, Lagos, Accra), fares are very high, and experts lose much time travelling to and from their destinations.

76. The following examples may give an idea of the travel situation from Khartoum:

	<u>Frequency</u>	<u>Cost in US\$</u>
<u>Northbound and Southbound</u>		
Khartoum - Cairo	Daily	195.00
" - Dar-es-Salam	4 times/week	428.00
" - Entebbe	2 times/week	255.00
" - Nairobi (via Addis Ababa)	2 times/week	312.00
<u>To other East African countries</u>		
Khartoum - Mogadiscio	Once a week	382.00
" - Lusaka (via Nairobi)	Once a week	503.00
" - Tannanarive (via Nairobi)	Once a week	514.00

	<u>Frequency</u>	<u>Cost in US\$</u>
<u>To other neighbouring countries</u>		
Khartoum - Fort Lamy	Once a week	258.00
" - Tripoli	Once a week	370.00
" - Bangui	Once a week	420.00
" - Kinshasa (via Entebbe)	Once a week	468.00
<u>To West African countries</u>		
Khartoum - Dakar	Once a week	560.00
" - Accra	Once a week	448.00
" - Lagos	Once a week	420.00
" - Brazzaville	Once a week	468.00

77. Connexions with flights to other West African cities like Monrovia, Lomé, Freetown, Abidjan, Douala, Niamey, Conakry, Libreville and Nouakchott, are made mainly in Dakar, Lagos or Accra, but the scarcity of flights sometimes obliges travellers to spend many idle days before reaching their destination. For instance an expert who has to travel on mission from the Sudan to Douala (Cameroon), has but two alternatives: either to leave Khartoum on a Saturday to Lagos and wait until Tuesday to continue on to Douala or to go through Accra with a stop-over of two more days. To Conakry, he would leave on a Saturday to Accra, on Tuesday on to Freetown and wait until Friday to continue to his destination. To go to Libreville, he would leave on a Saturday from Khartoum for Lagos and arrive on a Tuesday at his destination after another stop-over in Douala. Niamey can only be reached through Accra and Abidjan after a three-day trip.

78. To sum up, these examples show that:

- (i) only northbound communications between Khartoum and Cairo are good; those southbound to some East African countries are fair;
- (ii) communications with Sudan's neighbouring countries with the exception of the UAR are very poor;
- (iii) east-west communications are also difficult, this being aggravated by the inadequacy of air networks within the latter area.

79. This situation greatly influences the output and the expenses of the Institute. When an expert must travel to the west coast to participate in a course or a project, he may lose as much as one week travelling, adding per diem expenses to the cost of the operation. The 1971 budget shows that 55 per cent of the cost of a five-day mission of one expert to a National Course in Gabon is attributable to travel fares and per diem; only 45 per cent corresponds to the cost of the expert himself, materials, printing and distribution.

B. Support

80. (a) Member States of the region have failed to make the voluntary contributions envisaged in the agreement. No support has come from international or regional organizations, with the exception of a very modest contribution by the African Regional Bank;

(b) some collaboration is envisaged with non-governmental institutions outside the region, which could be enhanced should UNESCO promote more actively this type of support and should the Institute be located in a geographically more favourable situation as regards outside sources of finance;

(c) one government outside the region is giving valuable support by furnishing associate experts, a resource that should be more actively promoted by UNESCO;

(d) UNDP's contribution to REBIA through the Technical Assistance Regional component between 1965-1970 (\$49,200) amounted to 6 per cent of all funds allocated to the Institute by UNESCO (\$745,155), whilst in the case of the Asian Centre, it represented 17 per cent. For 1971-1972, UNDP's participation is increased to 22 per cent (REBIA) and 28 per cent (ARISBR). This is a sound trend, especially in the case of the African Institute since fellowships are badly needed to train young professionals of the region;

(e) the host government has fulfilled its obligations under the agreement in providing suitable premises for the Institute, contributing to the Director's salary, financing the provision of supporting staff, and defraying a substantial part of the administrative and supply costs.

C. Staff

81. (a) Professional staff (6): The Director's long dedication to problems in the field of educational buildings, his vigorous personality and his knowledge of African problems, have given the Institute a dynamic and competent leadership. He is not a research man but he seems to be the ideal person to promote action on the programme in the English- and Arab-speaking countries of the region. As for the team of three architects working under his direction, two came to the Institute this year and display great enthusiasm in their job; the third, an associate expert, has proven to be most valuable.

82. Unlike the Asian Institute, REBIA does not include on its staff an educator or a cost accounting expert. There is no clear justification for the absence of the former

in an educational building set-up: the whole concept of using task forces for development work is based on the combined efforts of multidisciplinary teams, in which educators play a decisive role. The task has been carried out by the Director who, besides being an architect, is a specialist in technical education. But his position prevents him from full-time dedication to any particular activity. As for the cost accounting expert, since the budget limitations of the Institute do not allow the inclusion of such a specialist, the architects must carry out, for each specific project, their own cost-reduction calculations.

83. The international professional staff includes a very conscientious Administrative Officer and a documentalist who had to be trained on the job because of difficulties in recruiting an expert willing to go to Khartoum. He has never adapted himself to local conditions and his attendance at the Institute has been irregular.

84. The following conclusions may be drawn from this situation:

- (i) the quality of the professional personnel has improved greatly during the past three or four years;
- (ii) however, the number of experts is quite insufficient to cope with a programme that claims to embrace the whole of Africa. To serve a number of Member States that is nearly double that of each other region, REBIA had, when this inspection took place, a staff of six professionals, as compared with eleven in the Asian and sixteen in the Latin American Institutes. In addition, it lacks certain specialists indispensable for educational building development work;
- (iii) unlike the other Institutes, REBIA cannot find local professionals with the necessary technical experience in regional educational building problems to team up with the international experts. The Director of the Institute is an exception;
- (iv) climatic conditions and the geographical isolation of Khartoum described in paragraphs 66 to 73 create a chronic lack of continuity of the experts. This provokes a loss of many months of work until the replacing technicians adapt themselves to their tasks, it also disrupts the continuity of operations.

85. (b) Local supporting staff (15): According to the opinion of the Director of the Institute and the experts, the supporting staff is excellent: the two draughtsmen are outstandingly competent and the stenographers have no problem with their work, which is done in English. The rest of the personnel includes decent, honest people who perform their duties satisfactorily.

D. Technical advice

86. The creation of the Technical Advisory Committee provided for in the agreement, has never been implemented for financial reasons. This is regrettable because such a group would be a valuable source of advice to the Governing Board in formulating the programme; the Board would benefit from the African experts' direct knowledge of the regional problems, and the interest in the Institute's work of Member States whose experts are represented on the Committee would be enhanced.

E. Programme

87. (a) Formulation and control: These functions are adequately carried out by the Governing Board; the latter has performed its duties efficiently and seems to be a suitable mechanism for controlling the Institute's activities. This success is due partly to its present small membership which replaces the earlier arrangement whereby it included representatives of all countries of the region. Such a complex Board proved to be unrealistic; it met once, in 1965, and was attended by only five Member States. However, the present very restricted membership (a Government and a UNESCO representative, plus the Director of the Institute as Secretary, who has no vote) seems, in our opinion, to lack regional representativity; this could be partly overcome if the Technical Advisory Committee were created and its Chairman were to participate in the meetings of the Board. In addition, the Asian Institute's arrangement, whereby the Director of the Regional Office for Education is a member of the Steering Committee, should have been incorporated in the REBIA agreement when the Dakar office was established. I feel that the experience of the head of any UNESCO regional office dealing with African general educational problems would be valuable in the formulation of the Institute's programme.

88. (b) Criteria for the Institute's programme: One of the reasons the Sudan was chosen as the site for the Institute is the fact that its vast territory includes nearly every African climate which should have permitted the evaluation of a variety of prototype buildings. Actually this advantage was not put to use, partly because of difficulties of communications with the southern part of the territory. But in any case a classification of African countries according to climatic differences was never envisaged as a method to guide the Institute's work; neither was a division of Member States in relation to their degree of development, as is the case in the Asian

Institute; projects are chosen on an ad hoc basis, where a need has been identified and an agreement with the relevant government has been reached to request RLBIA's intervention, regardless of the climate, degree of development, etc. of the Member State concerned.

89. (c) Levels of education. emphasis has been put on the first and secondary levels of education with some recent incursions into the third level.

90. Priorities in African Member States will rest for a long time on elementary and secondary education. The Institute's policy should be harmonious with that of UNESCO's bureau in Dakar which directs its main activities to improve conditions of education at the first two levels. Within the second level, facilities for technical and scientific education are included in the Institute's work.

91. Main activities: priority is given in the agreement to two activities (1) development work and (2) dissemination of documentation. To these other activities should be added the holding of (3) courses and the furnishing of (4) consultant services.

92. (1) Development work: in the Institute, research activities are integrated with development work and are triggered by problems found in specific projects; each case is different, has to be examined "in situ" and the suggested solutions have to take into consideration local conditions, making the best use of local materials - like straw, for instance. The latter have proved, in many cases, not only to be highly functional, but their utilization encouraged respect to the region's cultural background. This approach is in radical contrast with the traditional criteria of bilateral aid as furnished to African countries by the former colonial powers and which was, and in many cases continues to be, based on imported architectural concepts and highly expensive materials which often fail to meet local requirements.

93. Of course, such factors as the operational-minded approach of the present Director and experts, plus their small number, also contribute to exclude from UNRISBR's programme of work the carrying out of voluminous theoretical studies which would immobilize the authors in their offices for weeks on end.

94. The greatest achievement in development work is the operational, project-oriented, highly mobile approach based on the dispatch to Member States of a task force. This method (described in paras. 34 and 35) has resulted in studies which, if properly followed up in each case by the Member States involved, should greatly improve national school building programmes.

95. But again, the limited financial and human resources of the Institute in relation to the number of Member States and the immensity of the area it has to serve, create undeniable handicaps:

- (i) the Evaluation Commission recommended that task forces should include an educator. Because of the lack of funds, REEBIA was forced to obtain the educational component locally (UNESCO experts or national educators). Further, the Commission recommended that African junior architects should be included in the task force, since they would have an opportunity of gaining useful experience under the supervision of UNESCO experts and at the same time alleviate the latter's work. This has never been done not only because of the lack of funds, but also due to the fact that many countries do not have any architects;
- (ii) involvement of a task force in the Somali project represented work by 4 experts during 55 man-weeks. The Kenya project which is being executed in 1971 is programmed at a 27 man-week ratio. Thus, REEBIA can undertake no more than three projects of this kind per year; additional requests from Member States have to await their turn. At the present rate, it might take more than ten years before some African countries benefit from the visit of a task force;
- (iii) studies carried out by a task force should result in the construction of a prototype which normally should be supervised by the Institute's experts. But there is no time for them to perform such work since they are immediately engaged in other projects. Much less do they have time to follow-up the execution of the educational building national programme that puts into practice the recommendations of REEBIA's study. The Institute's policy seems to be that once the prototype has been proposed, it is up to the local authorities to take over, either with their own human and financial resources or with the assistance of other organizations such as UNICEF, UNDP, etc. It is clear to this Inspector that in the less developed countries, there just are no technicians available to carry out such follow-up tasks adequately.

96. Action to promote the establishment of development groups has failed due to the fact that very few African Member States have the professionals to join them or special units in their administrations specifically in charge of educational building programmes. Beyond the task forces' intervention in executing projects, no national machinery has been created in order to follow up REEBIA's development work. At best, through contacts established by the task forces' experts with local authorities responsible for school building programmes, REEBIA's approaches and techniques are made known and some useful influence is exerted.

97. The complexity and variety of the African region precludes therefore a rigid application of orthodox criteria on development groups in the sense explained in

para. 41. A more flexible approach with a view to merely creating a framework within which a country can continue to work adequately with local personnel seems to be, for the time being, the best way of applying the "development group" technique.

Sometimes, the architect (if he exists) can serve as the cost expert. Elsewhere the educator, when properly trained, can give this information; the composition of a development group might easily change with each new country or problem. Consequently, REBIA has no alternative but to act with great flexibility, applying the full range of its creative efforts to each specific problem.

98. The supply of advisory services by single experts visiting Member States to advise how to request assistance from UNDP and how to relate REBIA's expertise to projects financed by UNHCR and UNDP/TA has been useful.

99. Finally, REBIA's personnel has little time and means to efficiently promote the creation of school building units in local administrations although these would play a fundamental role in the establishment of some version or other of the development groups and in the proper follow-up of the Institute's ideas.

100. (2) Documentation: The results of the activities under this item are not in proportion to the importance it receives in the text of the agreement.

101. Dissemination of the Institute's documents is fundamental to making known its objectives, so that Member States can benefit from its advice and assistance, and apply to their educational building programmes the results of REBIA's own experience. This function is specifically stressed in Article III, point 1 (b), (c) and (d) of the agreement which insists on the circulation within the region of the results of the Institute's work.

102. True, the Institute has produced some very valuable reports but their impact in Member States is limited by the following factors:

(i) The officer in charge of this activity is not a professional documentalist. He is a journalist who has never been able to really adapt to Khartoum's living conditions and this has affected his work. Great delays took place in the issuance of the Newsletter on account of his irregular attendance at the office.

(ii) On account of the size and shape of the African region, it is out of the question to distribute documents by sea (as is done in many cases in Asia and Latin America) since it would take ages to reach most Member States. Therefore, the

Institute is obliged to send them by air and due to the high expense involved, the number of copies distributed remains pitifully small and the volume of publications has to be reduced to a minimum.

103. Data given hereunder illustrate the high cost and the slowness of communications, even by air:

Cost of postage stamps and time for sending 100 copies of Newsletter (weighing about 11 kilos each) from Khartoum to Dakar.

By second class air Mail	15 days - \$ 79.00
By air freight	15 days - \$ 30.00
By pouch through Paris	10/12 days - \$ 35.00

Cables to and from Paris take two to three days.

104. Printing supplies have to be imported at high prices:

1,000 stencils	\$ 214.00
48 air tubes	\$ 143.00
200,000 sheets of duplicating paper	\$ 373.00
5,000 sheets of Bristol paper	\$ 459.00

105. Delivery times are extremely long six months by surface freight from order to reception. clearance at Port Sudan is very slow, materials take as much as three months to reach Khartoum. The Institute has to order occasionally small amounts by air freight to bridge gaps, at very high cost.

106. Thus efficient dissemination of documents describing the Institute's activities is not possible, in great part due to the fact that its resources are out of proportion to the immense territory it is obliged to cover. But even if the technical documentation reaches all Member States, another problem arises: what can countries that have no educational building units in their administrations, no development groups or other technical bodies competent in school buildings, do with this highly specialized literature? And what about Member States which so far have had no contact whatsoever with REBIA? Documents from the Institute, even the Newsletter, pile up in some corner of a governmental office, and are not even looked at.

107. The Institute is making a commendable effort to alleviate this problem. The documentalist visited countries to advise on the establishment of documentation units within the planning sectors of Ministries of Education, for which purpose a guide was prepared. As a result, units were established in Ethiopia, Tanzania and Zambia, hopefully others will be established in Somalia, Kenya and Libya.

108. The REBIA Library has not the size or comprehensiveness of those of its sister Institutes in Mexico and Colombo. Due to the absence of a strong research programme and to the higher priority given to preparing and distributing specialized publications, it has not been possible to devote adequate financial and human resources to the development of a complete library. Nonetheless, the experts feel that the quality of the collection is good and that they have all the major publications necessary for their work.

109. Courses: The limited human and financial resources of REBIA justify its reticence in developing a practice which has been a success in Asia. Seminars are uniquely useful to make known in the Region the objectives of an Institute such as REBIA, and national training courses are complementary to development work and could contribute to the formation of development groups, to the follow-up of specific projects, etc. But in the case of Africa, there are too many Member States to serve. It has already been shown that communications are difficult and expensive and that the four experts lack the time to give courses without seriously affecting their operational activities. Even the time now devoted to the very useful Dakar and Beirut courses somewhat jeopardizes the work of the Institute's experts concerned. Finally, the Institute does not have sufficient personnel or administrative facilities to organize seminars.

110. Consultant services: It is this Inspector's impression that, properly promoted, this function could result in one of the most useful activities performed by REBIA which would make available its great experience in African educational building problems and in turn, would help collect fees so necessary to improve its financial picture. (I do not see why such emphasis is put in the agreement on the consultant services being requested by the Secretariat; although in some cases UNESCO might instruct the Institute to assume a consultant task, it should be for either UNESCO's or REBIA's contacts to decide that, subject to UNESCO's mere authorization, the Institute should participate in projects financed by international, regional or national organizations or institutions.)

111. As for the resources available for these contacts, it is clear that REBIA's somewhat remote location makes it difficult for the Institute to negotiate with those organizations or institutes whose representatives visit Khartoum only very rarely. In any event, little seems to have been done to-date by UNESCO to vigorously promote such contacts.

112. It is regrettable, for instance, that collaboration with IBRD has not been more actively pursued, both the Institute and the Bank could greatly benefit from the consultant services that REBIA is able to provide. A good example of what can come out of such collaboration is the tripartite effort being carried out in the Ivory Coast between UNLSCO, REBIA and the Bank, where the two former jointly prepared school building standards which were then to a large extent applied by IBRD in a project there.

113. Otherwise, the Bank's project preparation missions have never made direct use of REBIA's experience, normally IBRD entrusts private consultants with school building surveys for a remuneration which could go a long way to bolster the very meagre financial resources of REBIA had the latter been entrusted with this work. IBRD thus seems to pass over an opportunity to make better use of the funds it provides for its projects, since REBIA's rational planning approach and its wise use of local materials would result in important economies for Member States whose scant resources are very often wasted first in the construction and maintenance of monumental and uneconomical buildings.

114. In short, UNLSCO should urge the IBRD to make use of the educational building programme when identifying, preparing and evaluating new projects, when supervising and evaluating projects entrusted to private firms, and when assessing projects already executed by the Bank, thus ensuring a more efficient utilization of available funds.

IV. CONCLUSIONS

115. From the description of the Institute's operations (Chapter II) and from the Appraisal above, the following conclusions can be drawn:

116. Between 1962 and 1971 seven countries have benefited from major co-operative activities by the Institute: Nigeria, Central African Republic, Ivory Coast, Mali, Somalia, Sudan and Libya. Limited activities have been carried out in the following ten countries: the Democratic Republic of Congo, Algeria, Uganda, Tanzania, Madagascar, Morocco, Ghana, Sierra Leone, Chad and Rwanda. (This includes cases where the Institute's co-operation was admittedly modest, yet valuable, i.e. assisting in requesting country technical assistance.) This means that at the time this inspection took place, twenty Member States of the Region (54 per cent) had not benefited from REBIA's activities, although an important project for Kenya is under way. Why, after nearly a decade of UNESCO's school building activities in Africa, has the impact of the work of the Institute not spread out more broadly over the region?

117. To begin with, between 1961 and 1966 the Institute was a total failure. In 1967, as a result of UNESCO's Evaluation Commission's recommendations and of the new policies adopted by Headquarters, a fresh look was taken at REBIA's activities which paved the way for the valuable work performed in the past three years. Dynamic techniques were introduced, based on project-oriented highly mobile operations which, as is the wish of the African Member States, are planned and executed during visits of the experts to the countries concerned. Among the many novel features of the Institute's present approach to its work, we will mention its insistence in respecting in its designs the cultural traditions of each Member State and in making the best use of local materials.

118. Nevertheless, there is no doubt that the Institute is still in the experimental phase; as mentioned above, despite the tireless and selfless action of its competent staff, very few Member States have had the benefit of substantial projects. Moreover, practically no feed-back or follow-up action on the studies carried out for the above-mentioned seven major projects has as yet been taken by Member States, with the exception of the Sudan. Lastly, very little can be done by REBIA to accelerate and expand the impact of its work. The reasons are many:

- (a) creating a single Institute to serve the whole African Region, which is the largest and has the greatest number of Member States of the three covered by UNESCO's programme on educational buildings, was in itself totally unrealistic;
- (b) the Institute receives funds (\$196,000 a year for the 1969-70 biennium) which for the period between 1965 and 1970 were 2.5 per cent and 193 per cent inferior, respectively, to those allocated to the Asian and Latin American Institutes. Member States of the area and regional organizations make no contributions to REBIA at all;
- (c) the inadequacy of the funds allocated to the Institute severely affects its technical structure; high costs for travelling over the enormous distances and for disseminating its documentation reduce its financial possibilities further at the expense of the posting of experts fundamental for development work (such as an educator and a cost expert). This is partly overcome by the recruitment of associate experts, financed under short-term contracts by Member States outside the Region;
- (d) the amount of work that the Institute can do is thus limited by the total lack of congruity between the number of experts it can afford and the immensity of the territory and number of Member States it has to cover. This is the main reason why very little research can be done, no seminars and very few national courses can be organized, and no intense promotion and supervision of follow-up action can be carried out. The time factor acquires, in REBIA, dramatic proportions;
- (e) the described isolation of Khartoum, with its poor communications and air network, its climate and the difficulties in obtaining many basic supplies, affect the morale of many experts and, more particularly, of their families. This provokes continuous turnover of experts which entails an additional loss of valuable time and jeopardizes the efficiency of the work. Besides, living conditions in Khartoum do not facilitate the recruitment of new experts;
- (f) from the professional point of view, REBIA's experts in Khartoum are cut off from the high-level technical advice they need in their work. Further, the Institute itself cannot benefit from contacts with the regional offices of international organizations and institutions which could collaborate in the programme. It is also far from UNESCO's educational offices.
- (g) the possibilities of forming in Member States development groups or of even training local professionals to follow up the Institute's work are slight indeed, firstly because of the lack of school building experts in most African countries and secondly because very few of these countries have educational building units within their administrations;

- (h) owing to the different cultural backgrounds of the African countries the Arabic, French and English languages predominate in one or other area. The Institute, which is located in an Arab country and uses English as a working language can service the distant French-speaking countries no more easily than Dakar's Educational Bureau can afford to extend its activities to the East African Member States;
- (i) dissemination of the Institute's documentation is handicapped by difficulties in recruiting specialists in this field and by the cost of air mail freight.

119. Although all these financial, structural and geographical handicaps do not seem to basically affect the quality of the Institute's work, there is no doubt that they greatly limit its operational capacity. In spite of all this, I feel that UNESCO's programme on educational building for Africa, as such, has finally found a positive direction and that the experiments carried out during the last three years have produced an impressive fund of knowledge which in the long run will allow Member States to greatly improve their standards as far as educational building facilities are concerned. However, if the programme is to proceed from its present experimental phase to really satisfying the crying needs of the Member States a number of measures will have to be taken, which are suggested in Chapter V.

V. THE FUTURE

Possible solution

120. The agreement between the Government of Sudan and UNESCO entered into on 31 December 1972 (Article XI). This is consistent with the decision taken by the General Conference at its Twelfth Session, which approved a time-limit of 10 years for the financial aid granted by UNESCO to the centres then in operation.

121. In Chapter IV of this report (Conclusions) this Inspector expressed the view that UNESCO's programme on educational buildings for Africa, after a long period of experimentation, has overcome its initial ill-directed gropings and has developed fruitful operational methods which, in the long run, will result in substantial improvement in the planning and execution of the Member States' school programmes.

122. However, as a result of the analysis of REBIA's operations (Chapter II) and of the Conclusions (Chapter IV) drawn from the appraisal (Chapter III), the Inspector believes that the present arrangement, whereby the responsibility for the execution of the programme rests with a small Institute with only meagre financial and human resources and whose geographical location has proved to be not as functional as was at first expected, should be radically changed.

123. Khartoum has during a long period of experimentation accomplished a lot. Thanks to the unfailing financial support of the Government of Sudan, whose hospitality and generous co-operation I must again most warmly commend, the Institute, within its modest capabilities, has done everything humanly possible to serve Africa's pressing needs in the field of educational buildings.

124. The wealth of experience this enterprise has gained can now be taken advantage of only if it is hereinafter geared to a new imaginative programme.

B. Decentralization

125. The first and paramount requirement is to decentralize UNESCO's programme on educational buildings in Africa into certain specifically-defined areas, since it has been clearly proven that it is altogether impracticable to serve 37 Member States from a single base of operations. In this sense, I wholeheartedly agree with the recommendations of the Third Sub-regional Meeting of East and Central African National Commissions of UNESCO (see paras. 59 to 62). In my opinion, three sub-regions correspond to the geographical and cultural realities of the African continent:

(1) West Africa; (2) East Africa; and (3) North Africa, with its predominantly Arab States, extending down to Sudan. The two first sub-regions could, in their turn, serve groups of Central African States, according to conveniences that can be worked out.

126. To put such decentralization into practice, the following considerations must be borne in mind:

- (a) Mobile Units in charge of the educational buildings programme should not be isolated from UNESCO's regional educational bases, and, in particular, of the offices competent for educational planning;
- (b) for the formulation of the programme, the Mobile Units must be based in focal geographical points where conditions of life are attractive enough to international experts and their families, where local bilingual technical and support staff can be easily recruited, where contacts with international and regional sources of finance, teacher training schools, architecture faculties, scientific institutions and travelling international experts on missions, are adequate;
- (c) for the execution of the programme, it is of paramount importance that communications between the base of operations and the Member States of the sub-region can be maintained with the least possible loss of time and at a reasonable cost;
- (d) last but not least, the financial implications of the proposed decentralization should be weighed with a view to reducing to a minimum the overhead cost in the budget which UNESCO currently allocates to the programme on educational buildings. To this end, UNESCO's existing office facilities in the regions should receive priority when considering the location of the bases of the programme.

127. (1) West African sub-region: In the opinion of this Inspector, a unit to serve West Africa and some of the francophone States of Central Africa should be based at the Regional Office for Education in Dakar (Senegal). This is an important set-up with adequate offices and all the administrative facilities that an educational building team needs: an excellent library with a good collection of educational texts, adequate personnel in charge of documentation, translation and typing, etc. In addition, the unit's experts would be in the closest contact with the office's expertise in all problems related to Education in the sub-region, thus obviating the need for adding an educator to the team. Communications with the Member States of this sub-region, which, as has been explained in paras. 76-78, are in many cases difficult, would be greatly eased and would be less costly than from

Khartoum. The possibilities of finding local young educators and architects to train in educational building development work would be increased. The physical and administrative facilities of the Bureau are adequate for the organizing of seminars. The costs of inviting representatives of Member States to attend seminars and of organizing national courses would likewise be lowered.

128. (2) East African sub-region: Nairobi (Kenya) seems to have the basic facilities required to establish the base of operations of a unit serving the educational building programme in this sub-region. Not only because its geographical location, conditions of life and of recruitment of skilled personnel, and the possibilities of contacts in the many fields mentioned in the case of Dakar, seem to meet requirements, but because UNESCO already has a set-up there, the Field Science Office for Africa.

129. True, there is no connexion between the activities of this office and those of a unit on educational buildings. The advantages of the Dakar office in supplying the architect's team with educational expertise would in this case not exist, and the unit would have to recruit an educator and build up a technical library. But the existing premises and the administrative facilities (which include a staff of 15) are there; any other choice would require considerable expense. However, if the Director-General's idea of opening in 1965 an Educational Planning Office for the East African sub-region is put into practice (16C/1, para. 186) its eventual location should be borne in mind for the above purposes.

130. (3) Arab sub-region: It includes only six countries. This would make it the area with the lowest coverage as far as the number of Member States is concerned.

131. However, a special situation arises there when considering UNESCO's programme on educational buildings; as was pointed out in paras. 20 and 73 of the report on the Asian Institute (JIU/RTP/71/5), Middle East Member States have been so far excluded from benefiting from this programme: ARISBA's activities stretch westward as far as Iran but not beyond, and REBEL's scope does not extend beyond the United Arab Republic.

132. This is an unfair situation that should be corrected by having all Arab States - African and Middle Eastern - served by a single educational buildings unit, based in some Arab capital that responds to the strategic and functional requirements mentioned in the cases of the other African sub-regions.

133. If all Arab States could be covered by such a unit, the following two alternative locations might be envisaged:

134. (a) Khartoum (Sudan): When this Inspector discussed REBI with the Minister and Under-Secretary of Education of the Republic of Sudan, they admitted that the Institute could not continue with its regional activities alone if UNESCO's assistance ended in 1972, when the agreement expires, unless support were received or envisaged from African Member States. They felt, since REBI's performance had improved as compared to its early days, that UNESCO should renew its support for at least six more years. On the other hand, should UNESCO insist on ending its contribution, they felt that REBI could be converted into a national Institute; it is doubtful, however, that in working out priorities for UNDP's assistance, the educational building programme could qualify ahead of other more urgent projects. Besides, a national institute would seem to duplicate the work of the existing school building unit of the Ministry of Education. Therefore, if these two alternatives were not workable, a third one could be envisaged, that of granting REBI the status of a sub-regional office serving all Arab States. This seemed an attractive solution to the Sudanese authorities and in such a case the Government would be prepared to continue its financial support.

135. While this alternative would have the advantages of utilizing the existing physical, technical and administrative facilities, it would not, on the other hand, cancel out the handicaps which I have dealt with at length in this report, namely Khartoum's climatic and living conditions, its remoteness from sources of international finance, and from highly qualified educational and scientific advice, and the impossibility of finding local experts in the architectural field.

136. (b) Beirut (Lebanon): UNESCO operates in this city an important office, the Regional Centre for Educational Planning and Administration for the Arab States (ASCATEP). Its Headquarters are located in a new building with every modern facility. In the opinion of this Inspector, ASCATEP qualifies as the ideal potential host of the Arab sub-regional office for the following reasons:

- (i) it covers, for its specific activities, all Arab States, including those located in Africa; the experience it already has in dealing with them would be invaluable to the unit;
- (ii) ASCATEP specialization in Educational Planning justifies the incorporation in its activities of an item - educational buildings - which is a constitutive element of such planning. ASCATEP's educationalists would be a continuous source of consultation for the architects. Its library and documentation facilities would furnish ample bibliographical data of great value on the educational component of development work;

- (iii) the Centre already is engaged in an educational building programme for which purpose a former REBLA architect has been engaged;
- (iv) activities of this Centre have been highly successful and as a result of the wishes expressed by the Marrakesh Conference of the Ministers of Education of the Arab States (1970), the Director-General proposes that the assistance granted to ASCATEP be continued until 1978. In his report on the Centre's activities (JIU/REP/71/9), Inspector Sawe has reached, subject to certain conditions, the same conclusion;
- (v) Beirut's ideal climatic, geographical and living conditions meet the requirements we have repeatedly stressed, including easy contacts with international and regional sources of finance, with high level scientific and educational advice, with visiting international experts, etc.;
- (vi) ASCATEP has received voluntary funds for the construction of its building from at least seven Arab Member States, and others are in the process of granting additional aid. This is a commendable precedent, showing a disposition that in the future might benefit also the educational building programme;
- (vii) Communications between Beirut and the Arab capitals are more frequent and less expensive than from Khartoum, as can be seen in the following table:

	Frequency	Return cost \$
Beirut - Casablanca	Twice a week	497.00
Khartoum - Casablanca	Once a week	591.00
Beirut - Algiers	Twice a week	358.00
Khartoum - Algiers	Once a week	537.00
Beirut - Tripoli	Five flights a week	264.00
Khartoum - Tripoli	Once a week	370.00
Beirut - Cairo	4/5 daily flights	87.00
Khartoum - Cairo	Daily flights	195.00
Beirut - Amman	7 flights a week	45.00
Khartoum - Amman	3 flights a week	233.00
Beirut - Baghdad	7 flights a week	121.00
Khartoum - Baghdad	3 flights a week	362.00
Beirut - Kuwait	13 flights a week	161.00
Khartoum - Kuwait	4 flights a week	318.00
Beirut - Riyadh	5 flights a week	223.00
Khartoum - Riyadh	4 flights a week	209.00
Beirut - Jeddah	3 flights a week	391.00
Khartoum - Jeddah	Once a week	230.00

with overnight stay in Cairo.

C. Geographical coverage

137. As a result of the suggested decentralization and broadening of the programme to encompass all Arab Member States, including those of the Middle East, the Institute should cover the following countries:

- (a) East and West African Member States: Burundi, Cameroon, Central African Republic, Chad, Democratic Republic of Congo, People's Republic of the Congo, Dahomey, Ethiopia, Gabon, Ghana, Guinea, Ivory Coast, Kenya, Lesotho, Liberia, Madagascar, Malawi, Mali, Mauritania, Mauritius, Niger, Nigeria, Rwanda, Senegal, Sierra Leone, Somalia, Tanzania, Togo, Uganda, Upper Volta and Zambia.
- (b) Arab Member States: Algeria, Bahrain, Iraq, Jordan, Kuwait, Lebanon, Libyan Arab Republic, Morocco, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, Sudan, Syria, Tunisia, United Arab Republic, Yemen Arab Republic and the People's Democratic Republic of Yemen.

138. Further, the possibility of serving the following non-member states of both regions should be studied:

- (c) African non-member States: Botswana, Gambia, Equatorial Guinea and Swaziland.
- (d) Arab non-member States: Abu Dhabi, Dubai, Al Fujayrah, Umm al Qaywayn, Oman, Ras al Khaymah, Sharjah and Ajman.

D. Improvements in the programme

139. If this Inspector's suggestions on decentralization of the educational building activities in Africa are accepted, a number of problems which restricted the nature and scope of REBI's work might be overcome, resulting in some streamlining and diversification of the programme.

140. In the case of the suggested Dakar and Beirut units, the permanent contact that would be established between architects and UNESCO educationalists and planning experts will have catalytic effects, facilitating an effective adaptation of the educational building programmes to the present climate of change in Education. This should work two ways. members of the unit would benefit from the ideas of the educationalists and planning experts, and these in their turn would be briefed by the architects when on their way to their respective assignments to make sure that whenever architects or educational building specialists are lacking in a particular country, planning activities reflect as much as possible the problems of concern to

the unit. If a unit is established in Nairobi or any other East African capital where no UNESCO educational set-up exists, measures should be taken to add to the unit a planning specialist who would maintain close contact with the Dakar office.

141. The programme itself should be a balanced combination of research, publications, courses and consultant services, with the accent on concrete assistance and advice to Member States. Taking advantage of the fact that as a result of decentralization, the mobile units would have less territory to cover and the experts somewhat more time to spare, research activities and the holding of seminars and national courses could receive additional thrust without affecting the priority given to the despatch of task forces for specific projects.

142. As regards the levels of education to be tackled, priorities should be given to the first and second levels, especially in the case of the East and West African sub-regions; advice on the third level should be furnished only in exceptional cases, i.e. teacher training institutions, when a Member State has a specific project under way. The unit's ability to act on a consultative basis - a function that should be enhanced in the future - would be particularly pertinent in such cases.

143. An activity that deserves much greater attention in the educational building programme for Africa is the training of young professionals. Experience has shown that unless UNESCO provides for the training of African cadres of experts concurrently with a given project, there will be little follow-up. Further, with the ever-increasing need for school building experts as a result of the expansion of the organization's Educational Planning activities, there will come a time when it will be difficult to meet such demands due to the scarcity of international and local experts.

144. As far as documentation is concerned, the administrative and technical facilities already available in the Dakar and Beirut offices can help improve such an important function as the production and dissemination of the bulletins and studies so that Member States may be better acquainted with the educational building programme and make better use of acquired experience in their national development planning. The initiative taken by REBIA to furnish direct advice to Member States for setting up documentation units in their Ministries of Education should be further encouraged, as well as the possibility of making use of UNESCO's coupon system for the establishment of research libraries.

E. Tentative estimates for the decentralization of the programme

145. According to UNESCO calculations, the annual cost of each mobile unit incorporated in the respective regional offices would be:

	<u>Beirut</u>	<u>Dakar</u>	<u>Nairobi</u>
Senior architect (P.5)	20,100	23,700	21,500
Architect (P.4)	16,500	19,500	17,700
Educationalist (P.4)	-	-	17,700
Ass. Architect (P.2)	12,100	13,500	12,700
Ass. Documentalist (P.2)	12,100	13,500	12,700
1 Secretary	3,100	3,100	3,600
1 Draughtsman	<u>3,100</u>	<u>3,100</u>	<u>3,600</u>
	\$67,000	\$76,400	\$89,500

Cost of three units \$232,900

146. To this figure, twenty UNDP fellowships for each unit should be added

(two weeks a year), at the cost of \$14,300 \$ 42,900

147. Other costs:

Travel and per diem	10,000
Consultation fees	10,000
Equipment amortization	1,000
Library books	<u>1,000</u>
	\$22,000

Cost for three units \$ 66,000

TOTAL COST \$341,800

148. To which should be added the extra cost of transferring REBIA's experts, and the re-equipment expenses:

3 vehicles	9,000	
3 small technical libraries	6,000	
3 sets of drafting and photo equipment	6,000	
Lost time (2 months) on experts' transfers (1 P-5, 1 P-4 and 1 P-2)	<u>6,300</u>	\$ 27,300

AGGREGATE TOTAL COST \$369,100

149. These calculations show that should three mobile units be formed to take care of the programme on a sub-regional basis, as against the \$221,950 current (1971) annual cost of REBIA's operation, the annual costs would increase to \$341,800. This 54 per

cent increase is due to the fact that the number of architects is increased from three to six, an educator and assistant documentalists are added to the staff, forty fellowships are added to the current twenty and some extra support personnel is contemplated.

150. Taking into account the fact that the number of countries to be served would increase from thirty-seven to forty-seven (not counting the non-member states) and that the suggested programme includes new activities, these estimates seem reasonable.

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS

RECOMMENDATION 1: Termination of UNESCO's assistance to REBIA

In accordance with the resolution adopted by the General Conference at its Twelfth Session, with provisions of Article XI of the agreement between the Government of Sudan and UNESCO and with the conclusions reached in this report:

(a) UNESCO's assistance to the Regional Educational Building Institute for Africa (REBIA) should come to an end on 31 December 1972 (paras. 58(c), (d) (e); 64-120);

(b) the educational building programme for the African Region, however should be continued, but on a new basis (paras. 58 (a) (f); 63 120-124).

RECOMMENDATION 2: Geographical coverage and decentralization of the educational building programme for Africa

(a) All African and Arab Member States should be served by three units to be created on a sub-regional basis for the execution of the educational building programme, according to the following pattern (paras. 125-138):

(i) a unit should be established in the Regional Office for Education (BREDA, Dakar, Senegal) in order to serve West African Member States and those Central African Member States to be agreed upon (para. 127),

(ii) a unit should be established in some East African Member State in order to serve countries included in that sub-region plus those Central African countries to be agreed upon. the convenience of attaching it to the Field Science Office for Africa (Nairobi, Kenya) should be considered (paras. 59-62. 128-129);

(iii) a unit should be established in the Regional Centre for Educational Planning and Administration for the Arab States (ASCATEP, Beirut, Lebanon) in order to serve African and Middle Eastern Arab Member States (paras. 134-136).

(b) The possibility of serving non-member States of the African and Arab Middle Eastern regions should be considered (paras. 137-138).

RECOMMENDATION 3: Arrangements for the establishment of the units

(a) Administrative structure: a new section or unit should be established in the Dakar and Beirut UNESCO Offices (and eventually in the East African Office) to take charge of the educational building programme. In the former two cases, the units would be under the authority of the Directors of BREDA and ASCATEP, and would be administered as part of these Offices as are the other sections. But a significant measure of autonomy in terms of the mobility and operations of these units, and of flexibility regarding their communications with Headquarters and the Member States should be assured to them;

(b) Office space: the new units should be provided with offices that will allow for the best possible performance on the part of the staff dealing with educational buildings; in particular, care should be taken to ensure that working conditions allow the staff to give their specialized tasks, and especially their research activities, the degree of concentration these require;

(c) Equipment: in carrying out its tasks, the unit should have at least the same facilities as REEBIA with regard to equipment and independent means of transport (para.148);

(d) Staff:

(i) the present international technical staff of REEBIA, including its Director, should be transferred to the units' new bases (para.81)

(ii) in the immediate future, each unit should be led by a senior architect, the professional establishment being strengthened by an additional architect, an assistant architect and an assistant documentalist. An expert on educational planning would be needed for the East African Unit (paras. 129 and 145);

(iii) BRLDA, ASCATEP and, eventually, the Nairobi Office should allocate some of the time of its support staff to meet the requirements of the new sections (paras. 127 and 129).

RECOMMENDATION 4: Technical supervision and advice

(a) Substantive technical supervision of the units' work programme should be provided by the Division of Educational Planning and Administration at Headquarters which could also make proposals for specific operations through the Directors of the offices where the units are based.

(b) A Technical Advisory Committee of five African members should be established for each of the African sub-regional units and a similar arrangement should be made with Arab specialists, for the Middle East sub-region. The Members should be appointed by the Directors of the regional offices, they would advise on educational building programmes and should meet in Dakar, in Beirut and at the East African base, every two years. A formula should be found, however, to enable their advice to be sought whenever necessary (paras. 21-22; 86).

RECOMMENDATION 5. Programme

(a) the educational building programme for Africa and the Arab Member States should be regarded as an integral part of general educational planning;

(b) close links should be established between educational planning specialists of BREDA and ASCATEP and the members of the units (paras. 118(f); 126-127; 136; 140). In the case of the East African unit where the appointment of an educator is suggested, he should maintain close contact with BREDA (paras. 128-129; 140);

(c) the short, medium and long-term objectives of the programme and its operational methods should be clearly defined in the relevant UNESCO documents (para.88);

(d) the programme should concentrate on the first and second levels of education; only exceptionally, at the specific request of a Member State, should advice on projects at the third level be furnished. A classification chart based on the degree of development and the specific needs of the Member States should be included in the relevant UNESCO documents; it would be utilized in deciding in which countries or areas priority should continue to be given to plans for buildings for the first level of education and where action can be shifted to the second level (paras. 31-32, 88-90; 142);

(e) the programme should be formulated by each unit on an annual basis, with the advice of the Directors of the respective Offices and in the presence of the Chairmen of the Technical Advisory Committees, and the UNESCO project officer in charge (paras. 30; 87);

(f) the programme should comprise five main phases: (i) research; (ii) development work; (iii) seminars and training; (iv) consultant and advisory services; and (v) the compilation, production and distribution of books and publications (paras. 139-144);

(g) some additional impulse should be given to research activities (paras. 30; 45-49; 92-93, 118(d); 141);

(h) development work should have priority over the other phases of the programme, it should be carried out by highly mobile task forces which should include among their experts an educationalist. They would be responsible for identifying projects in Member States and planning and advising on their execution. Where Member States lack technicians for the follow-up of the execution of buildings, the experts of the unit should fill in the gaps (paras. 30, 34-37; 58(b); 94-95; 117);

(i) a flexible approach should be envisaged as regards the creation of development groups; the efforts of the units should, for the time being, be directed to creating a framework within which Member States could continue to work adequately with local personnel (paras. 40-42; 96-97; 118(f));

(j) in order to ensure that Member States derive the greatest possible benefit from development activities, UNESCO should step up its encouragement of the organization of sections or units within the national administrations to take charge of educational building programmes (paras. 43-44; 58(h); 99; 118(g));

(k) the practice of holding sub-regional and national seminars and courses should be intensified, following the patterns developed by the Asian Institute (paras. 30; 50-52; 109; 118(d); 141);

(l) training activities should be directed mainly to instructing young African and Arab architects, engineers and educators on school building development work so that they may be able to collaborate with the units' task forces, follow up the execution of the projects and, eventually participate in development groups. (paras. 35; 41; 51, 58(g); 84(iii); 95-96; 143). To this end:

(i) fellowships should be instituted by UNESCO/UNDP for the training of the graduate and under-graduate level of African architects and engineers and of technicians, representing the second level of experts in this field (para.146);

(ii) African and Middle Eastern Member States with adequate training facilities should provide scholarships for students from countries where these are lacking;

(iii) the employment of student architects and engineers during holiday periods should be considered, to facilitate practical training;

(m) the units' experts should occasionally give short courses on educational building at African and Middle Eastern universities, which would be duly briefed and supplied with technical literature.

(n) they should continue the practice of contributing to courses held under other regional programmes (para.51);

(o) the units, at the request of the Member States, should provide technical advice on and participate in projects financed by governments and/or by other international or regional organizations (paras. 38-39; 98);

(p) the provision of consultant services to institutions carrying out educational building programmes in the sub-regions, should be activated and duly publicized by UNESCO Headquarters and the units themselves. These with the authorization of Paris Headquarters, could negotiate and formalize the necessary arrangements. In addition, the units' headquarters should serve as briefing centres for international experts (paras. 55-56; 58(f); 110-114; 142);

(q) the identification, preparation and appraisal of projects related to emergency situations should be included in the programme of work of the units;

(r) the dissemination of technical and other relevant documentation should be greatly improved (paras. 30; 53-54; 58(i); 100-106; 118(i); 144);

(s) the policy of advising Member States as to how to set up documentation units and research libraries should be pursued in all the sub-regions. Arrangements should be made to use the UNESCO coupon system for the latter purpose (paras.107; 144);

(t) REBIA's technical books should be offered as a gift to the Government of the Sudan. Consequently, the existing libraries at the units' bases, will have to be provided with new books, mainly in the architectural field (paras. 147-148).

RECOMMENDATION 6: Voluntary contributions

(a) Voluntary contributions to the educational building programme from Member States of the regions and from regional organizations should continue to be encouraged, regardless of the eventual termination of the Institute as such (paras. 12-14; 80; 136 (vi));

(b) UNESCO should suggest such various forms of voluntary contributions as direct financial assistance, supply of know-how, materials or equipment, fellowships;

(c) in the latter case, Member States of the regions having teacher training schools and faculties of architecture could grant fellowships to train young local professionals in educational building development work (para.143);

(d) more use should be made of the associate expert system. In addition to Member States outside the African and Middle Eastern regions, countries in the area having a high degree of development should be urged to provide associate experts; in such cases, young local professionals previously trained under UNDP or Government fellowships could become associate experts (para.81).