

# **STANDARDS AND TECHNIQUES OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

**with special reference to  
Technical Assistance for  
Under-developed Countries**

**Report by the  
Special Committee on Public Administration Problems**



**UNITED NATIONS  
Technical Assistance Administration  
New York, 1951**

ST/TAA/M/1

20 November 1951

UNITED NATIONS PUBLICATIONS

Sales No.: 1951.II.B.7

Price: 50 cents (U.S.)

(or equivalent in other currencies)

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Page</i>
Introduction: Terms of reference and scope of report .....	1
<b>PART I. PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE</b>	
<b>Chapter 1. <i>Significance of public administration</i></b>	
Section 1. Public administration in under-developed areas .....	4
Section 2. United Nations programme in public administration..	6
<b>Chapter 2. <i>Elements of public administration</i></b>	
Section 1. Fundamentals of public administration .....	9
Section 2. Governmental organization .....	12
Section 3. Public finance .....	16
Section 4. Public personnel .....	20
Section 5. Administrative management .....	24
Section 6. Planning and development .....	26
<b>Chapter 3. <i>Measures for improvement of public administration</i></b>	
Section 1. Determination of administrative priorities .....	32
Section 2. International services in public administration .....	36
Section 3. Summary of recommendations for technical assistance..	40
<b>PART II. OUTLINE FOR A SURVEY OF ADMINISTRATIVE CONDITIONS</b>	
Section 1. Environment and background .....	42
Section 2. Governmental organization .....	44
Section 3. Public finance .....	48
Section 4. Public personnel, .....	52
Section 5. Administrative management .....	60
Section 6. Planning and development .....	62

## FOREWORD

This report on the standards and techniques of public administration was prepared with special reference to the problem of rendering technical assistance to under-developed countries. However, it concerns itself, also, with the general principles and procedures of public administration which are of more universal application.

Since administrative responsibility for the United Nations programme of training in public administration, initiated by General Assembly resolution 246 (III), was placed in the newly organized Technical Assistance Administration last year, the pervasive importance of public administration in connexion with effective economic and social development has been repeatedly illustrated and emphasized in the course of the Expanded Programme activities of the United Nations and the specialized agencies. The implications of this cumulative experience have been recognized in recent recommendations of the Economic and Social Council to the effect that the training programme should be placed on a continuing basis in the regular budget of the United Nations and that public administration should be placed on a par with economic development and social welfare as a field for assistance under the Expanded Programme.

In order to meet more effectively the various responsibilities imposed upon him in the field of public administration, the Director-General of the Technical Assistance Administration, Mr. H. L. Keenleyside, appointed a Special Committee on Public Administration Problems who have prepared the following report. The report, which is a unanimous one, reflects the broad experience of the members of the Committee who were acting in their personal capacities and whose recommendations are put forward as expert suggestions worthy of careful consideration. They do not constitute formal recommendations by the Secretariat.

This Special Committee was composed of the following members: Rowland Egger, Director, Bureau of Public Administration, University of Virginia, and Associate Director, Public Administration Clearing House, U.S.A.; Albert Lepawsky, Professor of Political Science and Public Administration, University of Alabama, U.S.A.; Carlos M. Moran, Director of the Law Department, City of Havana, Cuba, and Secretary, Pan-American Commission on Inter-Municipal Co-operation; Pedro Muñoz Amato, Dean of the College of Social Sciences, and Director, School of Public Administration, University of Puerto Rico, Puerto Rico, U.S.A.; Sir Jwala P. Srivastava, former Member of the Government of India, and Member of Parliament, India; Jean Trouvé, Deputy Director, Directorate

of the Civil Service, France; H. J. van Mook, former visiting Professor of Political Science at the University of California, and former acting Governor-General of Indonesia, Netherlands. Mr. van Mook acted as chairman of the Special Committee.

The Technical Assistance Administration is indebted to the members of the Special Committee for undertaking the difficult task of formulating the principles and evaluating the techniques of public administration. There has been a recurring interest on the part of the General Assembly, the Economic and Social Council and other organs of the United Nations and of the specialized agencies, in the science of administration and in the role which administrative principles and practices can play in assisting these international agencies to fulfil their functions and perform their services. It is hoped that the Committee's report will serve as a basis for further activity in this field.

## INTRODUCTION

### TERMS OF REFERENCE AND SCOPE OF REPORT

1. This report of the Special Committee on Public Administration Problems has been prepared at the request of the Director-General of the Technical Assistance Administration of the United Nations. The following were the terms of reference of the Committee:

“To prepare a document which can serve as a guide for surveying the status of the public administration of an under-developed country; for identifying the steps that can be taken by a newly organized country in establishing its administration; and for determining the measures which might be considered by an older and more established country in endeavouring to improve its administrative system. It is intended that the result of the Committee's work will be published for the information of the members of the Economic and Social Council and of the General Assembly of the United Nations, and for the use of public administration experts who may be called upon to aid requesting governments under the technical assistance programmes of the United Nations. Such publication would also be of value to governments and agencies that are seriously interested in examining and improving their current administrative practices and to experts in other fields of technical assistance who may find that their recommendations should include suggestions for the improvement of public administration in those fields.”

2. In drafting its report, the Committee continually bore in mind that technical assistance services looking toward improvement in public administration are rendered by the United Nations exclusively upon the invitation of Member States, and are in every case to be determined by careful discussion and agreement between the requesting government and the United Nations, through the agency of its Technical Assistance Administration. Such technical assistance may take a variety of forms: survey of the administrative situation within the area of the requesting government, analysis of major administrative problems and formulation of alternative solutions and recommendations, organization of training opportunities for the administrative officials of the requesting government, and assistance in carrying out or in installing the administrative changes recommended.

3. The Committee assumed that if such a task is undertaken with the assistance of the United Nations, the over-all review of the administrative situation in a given country will in most cases be the task of a technical assistance mission as a whole, consisting of experts in several fields, and

not merely that of individual member or investigator specialized in public administration. However, as the scope of such a technical survey, in the field of public administration as well as in other fields, depends upon the terms of agreement with the requesting government, the work will vary in extent and a selection may accordingly have to be made among the numerous points of inquiry outlined in Part II of this report. It is, of course, understood that the results of such surveys will retain their confidential character unless publication is authorized by both the government concerned and the United Nations, and that the action taken upon its recommendations will depend on the decision of such government.

4. It is further understood that the entire surveying, analysing and planning activity of a technical assistance mission has to be carried out in close and continuous co-operation and consultation with the host government, and that its technical nature must be carefully maintained. Although it will be essential for the members of a technical assistance mission to familiarize themselves thoroughly with the conditions and atmosphere of the country for which their assistance is asked, it is equally essential for them, particularly in the field of public administration, to avoid any action which might give the inquiry an inquisitorial aspect or lead the fact-finding beyond the limits of the agreed fields of investigation. Regard for the sentiments of the people among whom they are working should be combined with a scrupulous avoidance of any action that might cause embarrassment to the host country or touch upon domestic political controversies. While it is the responsibility of the United Nations and the specialized agencies to select competent personnel for the mission, the selection has to be made in agreement with the requesting government. Such competence implies for each individual the dual capacity of getting at all of the relevant facts and of inspiring in his host that confidence through which his work can achieve constructive and lasting results.

5. The report is a unanimous statement of the seven members of this Committee, all of whom have a considerable background of administrative experience in the Member States or in dependent areas. Despite differences in national background and administrative specialization the members of the Committee have been able to arrive at a consensus on the various problems and issues raised in this report. Such a consensus constitutes strong evidence that there exists a common body of principle and technique in the field of public administration which has some degree of world-wide and general validity, which may have special applicability to newer States and to the less developed areas of the world, as well as to the more developed areas seeking solutions for administrative problems raised by new or altered conditions, and which may be otherwise useful to any nation wishing to make a general evaluation of its system of public administration.

6. The Committee met at the United Nations Headquarters in New York for two working sessions, 18 June to 6 July, and 5 to 14 September

1951. It has been generously assisted by the staff of the Technical Assistance Administration during the course of these sessions and also in the interim period during which it carried on an extensive correspondence. The Committee has derived much benefit, moreover, from staff members from other departments of the United Nations and the specialized agencies. This experience also confirms the fact that there already exists in the international civil service, supplemented by experts called in for special consultation, a body of common knowledge in the realm of governmental administration and public management which constitutes one of the primary resources available in any evolving international programme of technical assistance looking forward toward social, economic, or administrative development.

7. The Committee has interpreted its terms of reference to require an emphasis upon principles, standards and norms of public administration. In its consideration of administrative techniques, procedures and methods it has of necessity limited itself to those of a more general character, without losing sight of the fact that great variety is to be expected in actual practice. Part I of the report, containing the general treatment of the subject, consists of three chapters, of which chapter 1 assesses the general significance of public administration with particular relation to technical assistance, chapter 2 analyses the major factors of public administration, and chapter 3 deals with measures for accomplishing administrative improvement, which may prove useful even for highly developed nations. Part II presents a reasoned outline which may be useful to government officials or to technical assistance personnel for the purpose of surveying or evaluating public administration.



**Part I**  
**PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND**  
**TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE**

*Chapter 1*

**SIGNIFICANCE OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION**

*Section 1. PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION IN UNDER-DEVELOPED AREAS*

8. In pursuing its assignment, the Committee proceeded on the general hypothesis that in every country, whether it is new or long-established, whether it is under-developed or highly developed, any programme of economic or fiscal development, of improvement in education, health, labour and social conditions, and of reform and reconstruction in any of the public services, can only succeed if it is supported by machinery and methods established under sound principles of public administration and adapted to the circumstances of the country concerned.

9. With particular reference to under-developed countries, the Committee feels that this assumption has attained more than a hypothetical stage. Technical assistance projects already undertaken by the United Nations continually demonstrate that in practically every attempt to solve technical and economic problems, there are a number of fundamental requirements of an administrative nature, requirements of organization, staff, budget, planning, and procedure. Moreover it has been discovered in one technical assistance project after another, in fields such as agriculture, industry, mining or power, that a prior need is to provide those basic communications and utilities which are usually considered to be governmental functions, those domestic administrative measures which are most likely to originate or stimulate economic development in individual fields, and those governmental programmes of social amelioration which will assist the people of the nation in undertaking the arduous tasks which lie ahead. By definition this is the role of public administration.

10. The Committee has been constantly aware, in the course of its work, of the danger of exaggerating the differences which exist between the more developed and the less developed nations with respect to the standards and practices of public administration or with respect to the relative existence of administrative inefficiency. It is true that one of the principal characteristics of under-developed areas is the imbalance between aspirations and needs on the one hand and material advancement and administrative maturity on the other. However, it is not the level of the

country's technical achievement that is the conclusive factor, so much as the relation which its technical — including its administrative — equipment bears to its expected and emerging level of development.

11. In this respect any attempt to apply the generally applicable principles of public administration must contend with those economic, social and governmental circumstances which seem to be peculiar to under-developed areas, which have been repeatedly revealed in the course of past technical assistance surveys, and which might be profitably kept in mind in future technical assistance projects. These circumstances arise out of the recent international changes of an economic and political character, the intrusion of international considerations into the internal life of partially autarchic areas, and the technological developments, particularly in the field of communication, which have given an international character to the demands and aspirations of peoples throughout the world. Even countries with a more developed administrative system, when faced with the introduction of wholesale programmes of economic or social betterment, may find their existing administrative machinery insufficient to cope with their requirements.

12. The problems of under-developed countries that may be related to public administration are primarily problems of transition: transition from semi-feudal and traditional to more responsible and rational forms of administration; from an agricultural and extractive economy to an economy of industry and trade; from a colonial régime conducted by foreigners to a national government. The pace and circumstances of such a transition may vary considerably from area to area. Some under-developed countries may in fact be able to skip a few of the intervening steps which more developed areas went through laboriously, and may thus demonstrate an unprecedented pace of development in limited fields. In certain cases revolutionary changes may create a climate conducive to wholesale reform, whereas in others a slower and more evolutionary process may be taking place.

13. In either case, certain characteristic conditions may be observed in under-developed countries. In the first place, the gap which exists between rich and poor is marked. It penetrates deeply into the entire range of economic, social and cultural relationships, and its impact is felt in the public administration as well. Frequently the duality expresses itself also in terms of the gulf which exists between an agrarian or barter culture and a commercial or money culture, existing side by side, but with little interpenetration. In some areas there is a related but deeper duality as between an original stock of ancient lineage and a recent immigrant leadership, or vice versa. At the same time too small a proportion from either group, or from their admixture, is available to furnish the technical knowledge or administrative experience required, for the proper economic and social development of the country. Meanwhile, too, there is a continuation of the associated social and economic ills, such as uncontrolled

inflation, widespread illiteracy, rampant disease, or political instability. All of these factors hamper the effective employment of the country's human and natural resources.

14. Improvement in the public administration seems to be one of the primary means through which the adverse conditions of the under-developed countries might be overcome. To the extent that more developed countries suffer from vestigial conditions of under-development or from periodic recurrences in that direction, they are likely to reveal similar social, economic and governmental ills. These too might be partially relieved by administrative measures of an international as well as a domestic character.

## *Section 2. UNITED NATIONS PROGRAMME IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION*

15. The crucial role of administrative machinery in the economic and social development of the less-developed areas of the world has increasingly modified the technical assistance rendered by international bodies in recent years. This development can be traced back to the post-First World War period, when, for example, the International Labour Office, one of the older specialized agencies of the United Nations, began to provide advice and consulting service on labour legislation, an important substantive phase of public administration. During the later stages of the Second World War, officials of the United Nations Relief and Rehabilitation Administration, recognizing the limited and temporary character of a programme consisting only of the distribution of emergency supplies, increasingly turned their attention toward the training of local administrative personnel and to other activities conducive to the establishment or improvement of permanent governmental services in the social welfare field.

16. United Nations technical assistance activities are based ultimately upon Article 55 of the Charter which pledges the organization to "promote higher standards of living, full employment, and conditions of economic and social progress and development". The earliest United Nations programme in this field was set in motion by the General Assembly at its very first session, in 1946, for the promotion of social welfare. Resolution 58 (I) authorized a programme of advisory social welfare services, to be rendered through the provision of expert advisers, fellowships and scholarships, demonstration projects, technical publications and films, and seminars, as might be requested by Member States. Two years later, the attention of the General Assembly having been drawn to the need for general training activities for countries desiring access to "the principles, procedure, and methods of modern administration", a resolution (246 III) was adopted authorizing the establishment within the Secretariat of an International Centre for Training in Public Administration.

17. The following year, in 1949, the General Assembly appropriated funds for a programme of fellowships and scholarships to be awarded to intermediate and senior civil servants of Member States for the

purpose of training them in specialized fields of public administration, for a programme of seminars on the problems of public administration, and for the development or improvement of national institutions offering training courses in public administration. In addition a sum was made available to the International Institute of Administrative Sciences in Brussels for the preparation of special studies, manuals and other materials in the field of public administration.

18. Meanwhile the General Assembly in 1948 had appropriated funds to enable the United Nations, in co-operation with the specialized agencies, to launch a general technical assistance programme for the economic development of less-developed areas (resolution 200 (III)). All of these programmes of the United Nations and the specialized agencies were brought into closer relationship and greatly enlarged by further resolutions of the Economic and Social Council (resolution 222 (IX)) and the General Assembly (resolution 304 (IV)) in the latter part of 1949, which authorized a special fund for financing an expanded programme of technical assistance activities and established the Technical Assistance Board to serve as a channel for requests from governments and otherwise to co-ordinate the technical assistance activities of the several organizations.

19. Even before the general United Nations aid programme for economic and social development got under way, technical assistance services were occasionally being rendered in the field of fiscal administration and even in public administration generally, touching on such subjects as governmental organization, civil service, budgetary procedures, governmental audit, and government purchasing. Meanwhile the specialized agencies of the United Nations, in accordance with their constitutions and with resolutions of their governing bodies, continued to contribute to the same general objectives by providing assistance to governments in their several special fields. In the course of their work they are frequently called upon to render advice and assistance in the organization or improvement of governmental services which deal with labour and employment, agriculture, education, air transport, public health, fiscal and foreign exchange problems, etc.

20. In order to administer the expanded programme of technical assistance, a Technical Assistance Administration was set up in the United Nations Secretariat in 1950. The early United Nations missions of technical assistance, especially those of a comprehensive nature covering the various fields of economic and social affairs, tended to emphasize the importance of improving the public administration as a necessary basis for, or as an essential preliminary to, the successful execution of the economic and social programmes. Indeed, the problem of developing or improving some part of the machinery of public administration has frequently appeared as a by-product of requests for international assistance in connexion with a specific economic or social project or some substantive problem of government. Under these circumstances, technical assistance,

looking originally toward economic and social development and improvement, has necessarily led to a growing number of requests for aid in achieving administrative improvement. For this reason, there was established, in 1951, a special branch to cope with these problems within the Technical Assistance Administration, known as the Public Administration Division. Toward the end of 1951, the Economic and Social Council recommended to the General Assembly that the existing public administration programme be placed on a continuing basis and that there should be a general extension of "technical assistance activities in the fields of economic development, public administration and social welfare", thus placing the administrative side by side with the economic and social features of the technical assistance programme.

## Chapter 2

### ELEMENTS OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

#### Section 1. FUNDAMENTALS OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

21. Permanent improvement in public administration can be realized only if based upon certain fundamental values and standards. Without the acceptance of some of these basic values, administrative reform in any given nation would be without direction; and internationally, public administration would be handicapped for lack of a common standard of evaluation and measurement. In searching for these basic characteristics of a competent system of public administration, and in evaluating particularly the extent to which technical assistance in the field of public administration may effectively contribute to economic and social development, the following conditions and norms are worthy of consideration.

22. A fundamental requirement for the improvement of any system of public administration is the attainment of governmental stability, public order, and the rule of law. Where civil disorder is endemic or where changes in political control are frequent, administrative improvement is severely handicapped. For areas where governments have been newly organized and where governmental institutions have not yet been thoroughly established, some degree of administrative instability may in the short run be considered as a part of the general political development. But where, over a long period of time, governments are not able to establish orderly political processes, administrative reforms are likely to lag, and the prospects of permanent administrative improvement are slight. Moreover, sound public administration can only flourish under a system for the administration of justice based on equal protection for all, impartial administration of government services, and adequate provision for social change. Governments which abuse their powers, or which habitually act arbitrarily with reference to persons and property, or which do not respect fundamental human rights, or which permit dishonesty in the public service, lack an adequate basis for a desirable and stable form of public administration.

23. An effective system of public administration must be founded on a policy which tends to broaden the range of personal freedom, economic and social opportunity, and political democracy. This norm may be regarded as a basic standard for good public administration, in spite of the fact that efficient techniques of administration have sometimes been installed by undemocratic political régimes or in highly stratified societies. Where caste, colour, race, creed, or party membership confer upon, or

deny to, whole sections of the population opportunities to share in the benefits bestowed by the State, or where a limited segment of society is able to maintain for itself the privilege of public service, the public administration will weaken in the long run. The best system of administration runs the risk of breaking down sooner or later if, in administering the power of the State, it is not genuinely responsible to the public, and if it does not subscribe to the elementary precepts of liberty and equality.

24. Effective public administration requires a favourable political leadership and public opinion. Within the newer areas or under-developed countries being assisted, there must be active and vigorous support for the improvement of public administration. On the part of these newer areas, more consideration will have to be given to the social and economic significance of public management and administrative technique. The political leaders and the public should recognize that economic and social development and administrative improvement are interdependent and that a successful programme of technical assistance is in large measure contingent upon the establishment of more mature administrative practices. The public must be willing to pay the price in order to achieve the essentials of governmental reorganization, fiscal reform, and civil service improvement.

25. On the other hand, the successful achievement of some degree of administrative improvement under adverse political circumstances may in itself contribute to an increase of public interest and establish the beginning of greater political stability and administrative impartiality. Partial improvement in some better conditioned section, particularly when it is rewarding in terms of economic and social advance, may be a useful starting point for a more general reform. Taken as a whole, however, public order, stability, and justice are not only indispensable to, but also fundamental objectives of, an effective system of public administration.

26. Sound administration seeks to share responsibility and to enlarge the area of participation as widely as feasible. Efficient management and national unity require an ordered structure of governmental powers and authority, but at the same time responsibility for administrative activity must be shared if it is to be effectively carried out. Such sharing may take the form of constant delegation of functions to subordinate administrative branches, to autonomous bodies or public corporations, to private or co-operative institutions, to local authorities, and to individuals at the various levels of the administrative structure. Central policies and plans emanating from the higher executive and legislative bodies are necessary, but the higher levels of the public administration can better carry out such responsibilities when they free themselves more and more from direct concern with administrative operations, and when they concentrate their activity upon supervision and direction. Administrative accomplishment, on the other hand, may be kept more in tune with plans and policies, as more agencies and more persons at all levels of the administrative structure

are given increasing responsibility for making decisions and for recommending programmes under these general policies and plans. Sharing of responsibility among civil servants and participation by citizens tend to bring out the highest loyalties and the best administrative abilities of a nation.

27. A sound system of public administration contributes as directly as possible to the economic and social development of the nation and to the raising of the level of economic security and social welfare of the population. Public administration which is not directed toward the improvement of the material and cultural achievements of an increasing number of groups and individuals in the country, like economic assistance which pays no attention to the internal distribution of a growing national product, merely freezes the existing economic inequalities and social disabilities. A system of public administration insensitive to these considerations is guilty of sins of omission which may be among the causes of the very ills which the under-developed country is suffering.

28. Effective administration adapts its particulars to the life of the nation concerned. The specific administrative devices which can be selected from the several alternatives offered by the growing body of modern administrative experience should be attuned to the cultural, economic, social and political characteristics of the under-developed countries. With reference to technical assistance for administrative improvement nothing should be borne in mind more constantly than the wide diversity of peoples and circumstances and the fact that no nation has as yet achieved perfection in this field. While, therefore, there need not be serious deviations from generally adopted standards of competent public management, there may have to be extensive variations in the means used to achieve such standards. Indeed questions of adaptation may be foremost in transplanting or refining administrative institutions. There exist not only different techniques of public administration, but different ways of installing administrative techniques to which those engaged in technical assistance programmes should be particularly sensitive.

29. A sound system of public administration is solicitous about its relations with the public. The way in which government agencies come into contact with the citizen will determine the awareness of the people concerning their rights and obligations, the possibilities of public criticism or support, and the opportunities for complaint or redress of grievances against oppressive administrative actions. The opportunities and procedures for registering such complaints or seeking such redress and the methods by which they are handled by or get lost in the hierarchy of public administration are matters of vital importance to the average citizen. Just as important may be the system of governmental public relations by which policies are explained and procedures are clarified. If these matters are neglected, the citizen will feel deprived of his just opportunities and will remain singularly uninterested in efficient adminis-



trative operations which are deficient in giving him an elementary degree of recognition as an individual.

30. In the final analysis, the principal support for an administrative system and for a system of administrative reform will derive from the most practical application of sound administrative principles — most practical in the sense of achieving results in support of the better life for more people. The devices and methods utilized in a sound administrative system are numerous. Few administrative institutions or practices stand alone without equally attractive alternative mechanisms designed to perform the same function. There is seldom a One-Best-Way in public administration. Yet there are certain broad categories of administrative problems and applicable principles that are common to most developed, and some under-developed, systems of administration. Perhaps the most important and generally relevant of these may be comprised under the following headings: (1) governmental organization, (2) public finance, (3) public personnel, (4) administrative management, and (5) planning. Each of these major aspects of administration is discussed in turn in the five immediately following sections of this report.

## *Section 2. GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATION*

31. The character of public administration will be influenced in the first place by the prevailing system of organization. In this respect it is important to observe whether the system has its roots in the past of the nation and to what extent its pattern has been derived from foreign sources. The traditional organizational problems revolve around the constitutional framework of the nation, raising such questions as: whether the constitution is written or unwritten, whether the form of government is unitary or federative, of the cabinet or the presidential pattern, what is the resulting distribution of powers between the central and the subordinate authorities, and whether there is a strict line of demarcation between, and what are the relations among, the various major branches of government, such as the legislative, executive and judicial authorities. These demarcations are of general importance because, if impartial justice helps guard the freedom of the individual, a proper balance between the executive authority and the legislature may, in the constitutions of some nations, help to preserve their liberty and stability.

32. In considering these demarcations, and particularly that between the legislative and executive power, it is necessary to segregate their essential character from the large variety of forms and relations that have developed in the course of history. The actual functioning of these two powers can never be wholly separated. In legislation and in the over-all determination of policy the political head of the executive and the legislature must be closely and continuously associated. On the other hand, it may be possible to draw a clearer line of demarcation between the political and the administrative function, and between the organization

of political and administrative authority. Political parties and periodical elections dominate in the political realm, whereas the administration forms a permanent and often a hierarchical structure, consisting of an appointed staff. Because of this difference in nature, intervention of one in the structure of the other may be harmful. The legislature, as a political arm of government, should abstain from using its controlling powers — either through the budget or otherwise — for the purpose of interfering with administrative and personnel management, while the administration should provide the necessary information to the legislature, should faithfully observe directives of general policy, and should maintain a complete impartiality towards the political parties.

33. The main problems of governmental organization, however, are not always of this formal kind, especially in the experience of the new or under-developed countries seeking immediate results in accomplishing a development programme without having perfected their constitutional structure. The crucial organizational issues involve instead the interplay of political, social and economic forces operating within — or without — the constitutional framework. They concern the dynamic questions of government organization, such as: where does the effective and decisive power reside within and outside the government; what is the position of hereditary groups or bureaucratic élites; what are the powers or practices of intervention, in case of civil emergency or domestic discord, of such agencies as the military; what is the real power position of the cabinet, the congress, the courts, the king, the president, the pressure groups, the political parties, the press and the public?

34. It is in the light mainly of these dynamic organizational issues that the more specific questions of administrative organization become significant. Administrative bureaux, branches, boards, departments, divisions and commissions are neither created, nor do they exist, primarily to fulfil standard principles of public administration. They are established in answer to certain needs. In under-developed areas, these needs will be expressed in relation to the most immediate problems of economic development and social amelioration and may tend to neglect longer-range considerations of administrative organization. On the other hand, a soundly organized administrative structure, following tested standards of organization, can do much to contribute to successful and steady economic and social development and to the stabilization of the constitutional framework and the political system generally. The factors which contribute to an effective administrative organization are, therefore, of prime importance.

35. The primary organization units — ministries or departments or commissariats — among which the executive functions of the government are distributed, is a major subject of interest in the field of administrative organization. Here there is some uniformity in principle but abundant diversity in practice. Sometimes ministries and departments are organized on the basis of functional purpose such as a Ministry of Defence; some-

times in accordance with a particular clientele served, such as a Department of Labour. Whichever basis for organization is employed, it is certain that alternative organizational bases will be applied by the same government in organizing other departments, or within the same department in organizing its bureaux. Identical questions of organization arise when the bureaux establish their divisions, when the divisions establish their branches, and when the branches establish their units. Increasing attention is being given to the possibility of developing standard organization practices based upon comparative experience in industry and business as well as in government. But national habit, historical accident or fortuitous circumstance continue to play their part in determining administrative organization at all levels of government. And it is likely that these will be among the influences that will affect the establishment of the newer agencies required to administer the development programmes in under-developed countries. In any case, co-ordination among the various departments should be a matter of special and continuous interest in those new or under-developed countries where a lack of a tradition of integrated functioning and a certain fear of incursions into each other's field of authority tend to emphasize vertical subdivisions at the expense of horizontal contacts within the governmental structure.

36. Experience points to two tested practices that might be advisably followed in the newer and less-developed areas. First, the number of departments and their subordinate agencies should be kept as low as possible in order to facilitate the executive's control in terms of a manageable number of sub-executives reporting directly to him. Secondly, each of the departments or subordinate agencies should comprehend as many interrelated activities as possible; interrelated in terms of both existing activities. The object should be greater interrelationship of activities or administrative experience and anticipated relationships with related functions and fewer individual departments and agencies.

37. If a multiplicity of departments cannot be avoided for political or other practical reasons, committees of the cabinet, or of senior public servants, might be established to deal with major fields of government policy or activity such as those involved in an economic development programme. Similarly other boards or commissions may be established to accomplish new or special measures and reforms. However, the committee or collegiate form of organization has generally been found to require the designation of a strong chairman or executive director or executive secretary or a secretariat of some kind upon which co-ordinating authority or operational responsibility can be conferred. At the least there might be an *ad hoc* designation of a single member of the committee or commission to deal with each individual activity or project. Otherwise administrative uncertainty may prevail as to where responsibility lies for carrying out the collegiate decision. This is a particular danger in under-developed areas where the haste to produce results in undertaking new

activities and where the shortage of skill and facilities leads to improvisation based on the existing structure rather than to more creative solutions of organizational questions.

38. Among the more promising organizational devices are two that might be especially relevant to the situation of those newer areas or under-developed countries which find themselves burdened with a shortage of administrative talent in the established departments and hampered by traditional routines and complex procedures. First a co-ordinating agency under the chief or central executive might be created for the purpose of achieving a more integrated form of administrative management and a greater degree of co-ordination of functions among the separate departments. Secondly, autonomous authorities or public corporations, independent of the existing departments and free from the normal rigid routines and formal procedures, might be established. The first of these is considered further in section 5 of this chapter, on administrative management, the second in section 6, on planning and development.

39. There remains the general question of provincial or other autonomous or semi-autonomous authorities. In some countries the states or provinces continue to exercise important functions of economic development or social welfare. It is at this point that local enterprise and initiative may be brought into play. The neglect of local government and provincial institutions, of municipal and rural affairs, may have a depressing effect upon the national development programmes, since the government may be compelled at least to collect information and data from the subordinate jurisdictions and possibly to seek their co-operation in the enforcement of measures. There is, moreover, in some of the most under-developed countries and depressed areas, a large degree of talent and initiative available among local agencies, a strength of community spirit and a will to profit or produce among their inhabitants which merely need direction in order to be a source of great stimulation to a development programme. Finally, some of the most pressing and vital problems facing a number of under-developed countries, such as population problems and problems of rural economy, cannot be solved without the active participation of local communities.

40. Meanwhile, more responsibility might be delegated to the various administrative subdivisions and to the subordinate ranks of the public service. It might be suggested, as a general principle, that normally all authority which can be adequately exercised at a lower level should be delegated. Whether or not a particular function can actually be delegated may depend upon such variables as the experience and loyalty of subordinate personnel, the maturity of the organization, the stability of the programme being administered, and the politically sensitive character of the activity concerned. Ordinarily, a new or controversial undertaking, such as those which may become part of a broad development programme in an under-developed country, may be tightly held in the hands of a high

executive. As pressing policy issues are determined, as precedents are established, and as personnel at lesser levels of authority are trained, more and more delegation can take place.

41. There are certain types of authority particularly susceptible to delegation by an executive. These include: the making of day-to-day decisions in accordance with policy guides or accumulated facts already in the possession of subordinate officials, the disposition of correspondence, the transmittal of documents and the approval of official statements dealing with items and issues already covered by established policies; routine actions concerning personnel, finance, supply, and other internal management matters.

42. The following are frequently considered non-delegable functions so far as the top executive of an agency is concerned: approval of requests for new legislation and for changes in higher policy; budgetary requests; general allocation of funds and manpower among the units of the organization; appointment of key personnel, at least those reporting directly to the executive; institution of major changes in administrative or management policies, including the authorization of major changes in organizational structure.

43. Once the organization is established there will always be occasion to consider the need for reorganization. Newer or under-developed countries may have to place their faith in a theory of reorganization that falls short of the ideal, as do indeed most developed countries in actual practice. Thus, the existing administrative framework may be accepted, and in lieu of any reorganization the emphasis may be placed upon a vigorous indoctrination and effective teamwork among the existing body of officials. Instead of reorganizing, it may be possible to accomplish more by installing revised procedures for the more effective correlation of the programmes and for the more efficient flow of work among the existing agencies and personnel.

44. There should, however, be no vested interest in either the existing or the emerging organization. Nor should reorganization become an end in itself, or be applied without integration with the existing pattern of development, whether of indigenous or foreign origin. Structure and hierarchy, organization and reorganization are institutional means. Too often they remain unrelated to the objectives being served or the results being sought. The objectives of economic and social development are fundamentally matters of human welfare. When an organization fails to contribute to, or when it detracts from, this important purpose, new and more responsive organizational devices will have to be developed.

### *Section 3. PUBLIC FINANCE*

45. Financial administration and fiscal management constitute one of the most essential arms of public administration. This is especially so in connexion with the management of development programmes since, sooner

or later, economic development, whether it takes the form of governmental or non-governmental activities, results in the collection and expenditure of money with all the implied effects which that might have on both the public budget and the private economy. Furthermore the quality of the financial administration in itself has a direct and important effect on the efficiency of expenditure in the public administration, on the effectiveness of revenue collection, and on the spread of the tax burden among the public. The subject is of particular importance in cases where governmental deficits are recurrent and serious. In under-developed countries, the related danger of chronic inflation to the economy and to the probity of the public administration justifies a high priority for the careful scrutiny of the financial administration.

46. In both developed and under-developed countries, the fiscal or financial agencies of government are likely to be always involved in the various channels of public administration and in the several projects of economic development. Their main task is to facilitate financially these administrative and economic operations, but at the same time they have to apply financial controls at key check-points in order to ensure that financial outlays in the public administration and fiscal commitments in the development programme are authorized or necessary. Similar controls must be sought in order to ensure adequate taxes to support the public administration. In combining operations and control it should be a gauge of efficiency to have a maximum of the first protected by a minimum of the second. The various devices by which the public finances are managed may be described under the heading of revenue administration, budgeting, accounting and auditing, and debt administration.

47. A system of revenue administration, in order to be fully effective, should produce enough taxes to help ensure fiscal solvency, should be adapted to the methods of transacting business and affairs in the country, should be as simple and manageable as possible and should bear a reasonably intimate relationship to the economic base of the country. Unless the revenue system fits fundamental economic facts, there is little possibility of securing significant results from any attempts to improve its administration. If, for example, a predominantly agrarian country in which barter exchange is prevalent, cash or money income is at a minimum, and the producer consumes much of his own production, chooses to rely heavily on a net income tax for an important part of its revenues, there is little point in trying to improve the administration of such a tax. Not only is it unsuited to such an economy, but the lack, under such conditions, of economic indicators by which enforcement might be evaluated would make it practically impossible to know definitely whether any administrative improvement had been achieved.

48. In many under-developed countries, however, the economic issues are not always so clear cut. With respect to the applicability of the income tax, for example, there may be in addition to the rural population living in an agrarian or barter economy, a small but wealthy group living within

the money economy for which an appropriate form of the income tax may be desirable. Consequently an effective revenue system may have to spread its net over a whole range of available tax sources. In most under-developed countries, the main sources of revenue are likely to be property taxes, customs, excise taxes, income and inheritance taxes. Income from government enterprises or monopolies also constitutes a significant proportion of the revenues of a number of the under-developed countries.

49. From an administrative point of view the basic tool for effective property tax assessment is an adequate set of property surveys. However, some under-developed areas lack the more elementary devices, such as an accurate system of property descriptions in the country, a detailed tax map and sufficient appropriations to keep it up to date, or possibly even a base map upon which to superimpose assessment information. With respect to income taxation, the administrative shortages may be even more serious. With respect to business or corporate income taxation, the necessary accounting skill may be lacking in the public service and the essential accounting data may not be made available by businesses, foreign or domestic. As far as salaries and wages are concerned, the advantages of enforcement at the source have been established. But excise, and especially sales, taxation sometimes suffers from more serious handicaps due to the greater dispersion of the objects of taxation and the sources of relevant information. Customs administration is made difficult by the fact that it is conducted in a setting in which officials and employees are subjected to more pressure than normally exists in other fields of revenue management. In few other fields of administration are service standards or morale more important. It may be advantageous for under-developed countries to reduce the number of separate ports of entry as a means of further facilitating customs collections and control.

50. In its international aspects, too, revenue administration might be made more effective. Customs administration is intimately related to international commercial practice and it would be desirable to employ standard titles and descriptions and internationally agreed-upon classifications. At the same time, the tendency of some under-developed countries to confuse their customs administration with the enforcement of their exchange rate regulations might have to be seriously reconsidered. International co-operation in income tax administration can be facilitated by the use of the reciprocal administrative assistance provided under international tax agreements. Although substantive adjustments of tax liability in favour of under-developed areas usually is the more important part of such agreements, this procedural device may nevertheless be of considerable importance to under-developed countries because many of their largest taxpayers are foreign corporations for which the necessary data may be available only in the country of origin. By using such international devices, the tax field might be used as the training ground for the corps of accounting or statistical specialists so urgently needed by under-developed countries in the field of international economics.

51. Budget administration is perhaps even more immediately related to economic development and planning than is tax administration. This is the case because the budget is the government's programme reduced to the common denominator of money. In its more comprehensive form the consolidated budget includes, besides a general indication of the expected revenues, the current budget of anticipated expenditure for the operation of all government agencies; the capital outlay or investment budget of the government; other public finance schedules and data such as the budgets of government-owned enterprises and public corporations, or at least their net contributions or net losses to the ordinary budget; debt retirement data; and summary data for special trust funds, including those of the public pension or the unemployment compensation systems. Some highly developed countries append or incorporate some data showing the financial plans or budgets of the private sector of the economy, a practice that is sometimes referred to as social accounting. It would seem that this practice, as well as the use of the budget as an instrument for programming, would be especially relevant to the needs of under-developed countries seriously concerned with planning for all forms of social and economic development, whether they are carried on by private or public enterprises.

52. While comprehensiveness in budgeting is an ultimate objective to be sought by under-developed areas seriously trying to secure a balanced development of their entire economy, it is a technical refinement which cannot be achieved quickly by countries still struggling with the more elementary problems of efficiently budgeting the limited funds of their own public household, while seeking ways and means to accomplish broader results in the economic and social field. As important as comprehensiveness at the early stage of budget improvement is the need to achieve a classification which will not only be useful for the purposes of administrative planning and expenditure control, but which will also clearly show what the economic and social development programme is actually to be. This may require further refinement of the budget technique by perfecting units of measure showing concrete performance in terms other than money, especially in such fields as health, employment, education and consumption. Although the theory and technique of performance budgeting are still being evolved in certain developed countries, it is possible that under-developed areas will be quick to grasp its possibilities in helping to carry out their development programme.

53. Moreover, budgetary specification must be in some form which facilitates, on the one hand, legislative adoption or formal approval of the budget by the competent constitutional authority, and on the other hand, administrative enforcement or budgetary accounting by the budgeting agency or authority. The drafting and adoption of the budget is only a first stage. Budget execution, together with all of its specialized techniques of allotting or encumbrancing the budgetary accounts, represents an equally important stage. By these means, budgeting becomes a sharp



tool of financial administration in the general system of public administration and management control. There is sometimes a tendency in under-developed countries to emphasize the mere preparation of a well-conceived budget, but the crucial need is to live within the terms of the budget and thus to accomplish both the administrative and the development plan. For this reason the organization and, especially, the personnel provided to conduct the budget processes are of the utmost importance. No less important will be the organization and personnel of the other central agencies responsible, like the budget agency, for influencing the broad allocation of the country's financial resources; the central banks, the statistical agencies which compile basic financial data or refine the key economic indicators, and any new development corporations or banks which may be created and authorized to make decisions as to fiscal priorities affecting the economic and social developmental programmes.

54. Important also are the accounting methods and auditing procedures whereby governments verify public expenditures, thereby helping to establish public faith in the public finances. Accounting and auditing are not only devices which test the probity of the public administration, but are also a source of protection to administrative officials, responsible for sizable public funds. Involved here are not only considerations of domestic public opinion, but also—what may be of even more importance to developing programmes—foreign reactions as to the under-developed area's fiscal management and its credit standing in the international investment market. It is in relation to this problem that accurate accounting of the public debt, or meaningful distinctions between current and capital accounts, may become fully as important as a budget which is merely balanced in a nominal sense. The particular tools here are also as varied as they are in other aspects of financial administration. There are pre-audits of individual expenditures which are carried on continually and internally; there are post-audits which are carried on annually by independent authorities, who may report directly to the legislature. It is likely, in any case, that many under-developed areas would find it advantageous to invite some international assistance at the auditing and accounting, as well as the budgeting and borrowing stages of the financial administration.

#### *Section 4. PUBLIC PERSONNEL*

55. The quality of public administration is in large measure determined by the devotion, ability and honesty of the public personnel. No administrative system can be better than the men and women who conduct, indeed it might be said, who personify it. The most serious defects in administration are frequently those arising from inferior personnel practices. Conversely, the raising of personnel standards is often the most substantial way to achieve lasting results for a sound public administration and a stable

development programme. Consequently, the criteria of good personnel administration which appear to have fairly universal validity are worthy of careful consideration.

56. An effective career service calls for selection on the basis of merit, reasonable assurance of tenure, an orderly classification of positions, an equitable salary plan, adequate opportunities for promotion based on meritorious service, and a proper system of retirement. A stable personnel system generally requires, in addition, a code or statute defining the rights and responsibilities of civil servants. A government service in which individual salaries are fixed arbitrarily or haphazardly, with little or no relation to qualifications, duties or responsibilities, is not conducive to good morale. It is true that the modern techniques of job classification, as well as individual decisions concerning salary adjustments, are subject to constant debate. However, there must be a personnel plan, including a pay plan broadly conceived, centrally controlled, and also thoroughly understood by the employees, if constant wrangling over public personnel matters is to be avoided. Personnel classification, if at all applicable to an under-developed country, may have to be simple and flexible, especially in its early stages. The basis for the classification should take into consideration, along with formal training or diplomas, practical and successful experience in administration. Under-developed, as well as developed countries may experience sooner than they expect some of the difficulties of personnel administration, unless they are ready to install some minimum of rational personnel practices *pari passu* with the intensification of their developmental programmes and the proliferation of their staff.

57. The merit principle should govern selection for as wide a range of public positions as feasible, the entire public service if possible. The strength of the public service will depend upon the widespread understanding that, in practice, the normal way to get a government job is to be the best man available. The techniques of merit selection, such as competitive examinations, are, it is true, far from being scientifically perfect, and it is clear here, as it is in other aspects of public administration, that procedures which will work in one culture or area may not be applicable in another. In under-developed countries particularly there may be so few candidates who deem themselves at all qualified to apply that a competitive system of selection would be completely inappropriate. Nevertheless, and the heart of the point is here, the recruitment system should strive toward the merit principle and must leave no room for personal favouritism, nepotism, or strictly partisan considerations. It may be advisable to introduce into the personnel system specific measures to counteract petty and political pressures.

58. While jobs which are to be filled on a non-competitive or political basis should be limited, certain appointments of a political or non-competitive nature may in some countries be necessary, particularly at the higher levels of responsibility, in order to guarantee the proper enforcement

of new policies, especially in under-developed countries where an adequate merit system has not yet been established. The number of such appointments should, however, be so limited as not to counter the essential trend toward the merit system.

59. Skilled and trained public servants are in increasing demand today by both developed and under-developed countries. One of the first matters of concern, in the personnel programmes of under-developed countries, may therefore have to be the facilities available for the technical preparation and the general education of the public service. Technical training without adequate primary education, and professional training without sufficient general or liberal education, will not be enough to provide the specialized or intellectual skills required to sustain a developmental programme over a long period of years. Whether the technical training programme should be conducted by existing educational institutions at home or abroad, whether the system of civil service examinations and appointments should be carefully integrated with the existing educational system, and whether there should be an organized programme of in-service training will depend on a variety of local factors. What seems to be essential, however, is some central direction which could encompass all of the necessary training efforts. It is worth keeping in mind that a training programme is necessarily a long-term project and that special training of various kinds needed for government service — for example, engineering, economics, finance — will also be valuable for service in non-governmental institutions.

60. It might be possible by means of such systematic training in public administration to lay the cornerstone for a professional corps of civil servants, skilled in general administration, who can man the top posts in a wide variety of substantive or functional fields, and who can particularly serve in the newer agencies as they appear in the course of the developmental programme. In the early stages it may be necessary to recruit administrators from outside the permanent service for specific programmes and projects, for which technical assistance may be secured from foreign or possibly United Nations sources. But the growth of an administrative corps for government-wide assignments will have the advantage of making available the necessary range of managerial competence required in the top branches of each important department, of stimulating the development of a sound administrative tradition, and of providing promotion incentives for the ablest of the career employees.

61. Systematic methods of recruitment and selection, possibly as an early phase of a general system of personnel management to be perfected later, should be installed as soon as possible under the direction of a competent personnel staff. Ultimately it would seem that some central personnel body would be necessary to perform the whole range of personnel functions. Meanwhile, it might prove advantageous to designate a board or commission of eminent, responsible and representative citizens

to inquire into the status of the existing system of public service and to make recommendations for the future.

62. It may turn out to be necessary, in order to obtain managers of sufficient experience in the developmental fields and to attract a sufficient number of technicians at the higher levels of professional competence, to offer much higher salaries and to provide entirely different conditions of service. The danger of undermining the morale and efficiency of the rest of the government service has of course to be taken into account. In any case, wider responsibilities might have to be assigned to public servants than would normally be the case. Senior officials may have to be given the added responsibility of quickly training understudies, assigned to them for this purpose from the junior ranks. Supplemental forms of compensation or public honours might have to be provided. It might even be necessary to tap regional and local authorities for able public servants and, indeed, to provide an organized system of alternation and mobility in the public service as between the centre and the provinces.

63. To build a career service with merit as its base, where none has existed before, is a most difficult task. It will require a transition period, in which the break from established and perhaps traditional practices may have to be gradual unless the entire reform is to be jeopardized. Those already in the service will probably have to be treated quite differently from those still to be recruited. Certain forms of additional training may have to be developed for that purpose. Experience in a number of countries seems to indicate that the large majority of incumbents will have to be granted "career" status. For a more rapid transition, on the other hand, an accelerated retirement plan may be feasible, and some kind of qualification examination, perhaps for the single purpose of eliminating those without a minimum of competence, may also be worth consideration. On the positive side a civil service efficiently organized, adequately trained, and recruited from all levels of society may become one of the most effective instruments of national integration and a means of awakening an active and intelligent interest in government among the citizens.

64. As a final point on the subject of public personnel, it seems desirable to call attention to the report produced by the United Nations Seminar on Public Personnel Management which met at Headquarters from November 1950 to January 1951. This report<sup>1</sup> which will be included in a more extensive compilation of materials from this Seminar to be published by the United Nations, was prepared by the experienced government officials of the twenty countries represented. The report outlines a set of fundamental principles and general practices that might be adopted by governments in the personnel field. Because of its comprehensive and rather technical nature, it may be most useful to those countries which have already made distinct progress in the personnel field and which are at

<sup>1</sup>The report was reproduced in the periodical *Personnel Administration*, vol. 14, no. 4, 1951.

present interested in enlarging and refining their programme. The report is worthy of the notice of any government that wishes to plan for long-range civil service improvement parallel with a continuing programme of economic and social development.

### *Section 5. ADMINISTRATIVE MANAGEMENT*

65. The degree to which a country marshals its governmental organization, its public finances, and its public personnel in order to achieve a purposeful management of its public affairs will depend on the prevailing theory and practice of administrative management at the higher levels of governmental control. The concrete problems that fall within the sphere of administrative management include: co-ordination of administrative programmes; co-ordination of the existing departments, ministries or services; establishment, when necessary, of new departments; reorganization of existing departments; installation of new administrative procedures and methods; studies of the work-load and the flow of work within operating units as a basis for decisions concerning reorganization, revised procedures, or modifications in the size of the personnel establishment. These are the questions that repeat themselves throughout the administrative structure, and therefore require central or co-ordinated decisions.

66. However, the instruments of administrative management are of value only if they contribute to the accomplishment of programmes and priorities of a substantive nature and are of little use if they merely add to the existing administrative overhead already overburdened with unnecessary routines and procedures. The ultimate objective of administrative management is to secure collective action among the various departments of the government directed towards the elimination of conflicts, the co-ordination of policies, and the integration of enforcement measures. In parliamentary forms of government, this is generally accomplished at the cabinet level; in presidential forms it may be carried out in the chief executive's office. Special machinery to accomplish this purpose might be established within the cabinet or within the chief executive's office. This might take the form of a cabinet secretariat or a council of state, or a closely knit group of personal assistants in the chief executive's office, or a council of senior statesmen, or of influential civil servants.

67. One of the most important functions which such central executive machinery might undertake is to provide a point at which all draft legislation emanating from individual ministries or departments is cleared. More difficult, but just as important, might be the carrying on, under the chief executive's direction, of liaison with the other major branches or centres of power in the State, including the legislature or legislative committees, diplomatic authorities, the higher judicial authorities, or military authorities having a special status, either normally or in times of emergency.

68. Perhaps the most continuing purpose of administrative management is to establish and maintain programme control by means of appropriate

procedural controls. This requires the enforcement of carefully selected routines and procedures at strategic points in the flow of administrative work. Since this phase of administrative management involves both organization and methods, some countries have been led to establish so-called Organization and Methods (O and M) offices, known in other countries as divisions of Administrative Management, or under similar titles.

69. O and M offices are designed to accomplish the following objectives: (1) promotion of organizational, administrative and procedural uniformity for the whole government service where it is advantageous to do so; (2) improvement of the quality of government operations by providing expert organizational, administrative and procedural services, which a large number of separate departments, each concerned with its primary responsibilities, cannot achieve; (3) relieving the established departments from the distraction of carrying out organizational, administrative, or routine functions necessary for, but not integral parts of, their own operations; and (4) the achievement of government-wide economies in material or personnel by rendering such service.

70. O and M agencies are frequently placed under the chief executive or in some ministry or department close to him. Some countries have tried to combine their various auxiliary administrative agencies, including their central personnel or budget agencies, with their O and M office, thus establishing an independent ministry or department responsible for government-wide administrative matters of this nature. Others have placed their services under one or more of the existing departments or ministries, frequently the treasury or finance department. A few have brought some of these agencies and functions into the executive office of the chief executive himself. Whatever the form, the object is to bring together the agencies engaged in, or working in direct relationship to, the field of administrative management.

71. With relation to under-developed countries, a revealing test of the adequacy of administrative management might be to inquire into the ways in which new departments or ministries are organized and assisted in the early stages of their existence. Is there any machinery for administrative management to provide central advice and assistance in the establishment of these newer agencies? This does not mean that an under-developed country need be seriously handicapped in establishing a new activity merely because there is no central office to assist it with O and M services. A vigorous department head of the new agency or an experienced civil servant in an established department might, by virtue of his wisdom or experience, designate some qualified person or persons to act as an O and M staff might act under the same circumstances. The existence of a pool for whatever talent is available in this field, however, whether it takes the form of an O and M office or not, might be invaluable to a country planning to engage in a series of development projects requiring new or reorganized agencies. Essentially, the O and M office is a service agency to help departments perform their own service functions with greater despatch.

72. Since the central auxiliary agencies dealing with individual subjects like budgeting or personnel were themselves created to co-ordinate formerly disparate activities, the establishment of central offices of administrative management suggests that the process is one of co-ordinating the co-ordinating agencies. Certainly this may appear so to under-developed countries, some of which have not yet taken the first step of establishing central personnel agencies, or, in some cases, even a central budget agency. There is a real danger that the attempt to impose O and M offices or higher agencies of administrative management upon administrative systems that have not yet established the most elementary central services or the simplest forms of administrative management will confuse rather than assist under-developed nations in making their administrative plans for their development programmes. In such cases, the possibilities of central executive agencies might be more readily appreciated when these areas devote their attention to the necessity for, and the possibility of, co-ordination on the substantive side of their development programmes. This brings us to the subject of planning and development as a final factor of public administration.

#### *Section 6. PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT*

73. For the effective administration of development projects, governments have found it convenient to give increasing attention to the general practice of planning. In fact, governmental planning may be the most determining influence in any programme of economic and social development or administrative reform. Broadly conceived, the elements of the planning function include: (1) inventory of natural resources, existing capacity to produce, manpower and human resources, and financial resources; (2) analysis of past, and forecasting of future, trends in the light of the data in (1); (3) selection of those projects that might hold the key to the quicker priming of the total development programme; (4) assignment of more precise priorities and actual time-scheduling of projects in relation to the considerations in (3); (5) co-ordination of the specific development projects with the rest of the governmental programme and with the social services; (6) creation or selection of proper administrative agencies for the efficient execution of plans within the total programme.

74. Although the various parts of a general development programme may be separable, there are intimate relationships between economic and social, governmental and non-governmental, fiscal and administrative plans. For example, a sound fiscal or revenue programme designed to support an economic development programme, may fail to accomplish its broad purpose unless there are simultaneous measures of social development. It is not merely that an economic project for expanding productivity is not politically feasible without giving attention to a social plan for genuinely increasing the standard of living. There are technical reasons why the two must go hand in hand. Unless a better educational and training programme is available to prepare skilled workers, unless a more usable highway or transportation system essential to the construction or operation of the

new project is planned, unless greater public health measures for the efficiency of the population are provided, the development project may break down. For similar reasons, there should be provided, parallel with the planned projects for social and economic development, plans for administrative improvement, governmental reorganization, public personnel training, and fiscal management, in order to enable the system of public administration to carry the additional load which is sure to be thrown upon it. Careful planning may be particularly desirable in order to ensure a policy of gradual and balanced execution which does not overload the existing machinery of government and provides for consolidation of each phase before the next one is started.

75. Between the formulation of ambitious plans and the actual realization of a simple programme or one development project, much — or little — can happen. Nothing will be more disheartening and, in the long run, more disastrous than the failure to execute a fine plan or the abandonment of half-finished projects. If the choice is apt to be between waiting for a complete and perfect plan on the one hand, and making a concrete start on the basis of an incomplete plan on the other, the latter may under certain circumstances be preferable. The demonstration that certain phases of an over-all programme can progress rapidly toward concrete results may be well worth the risk that minor difficulties might have been avoided by long delays. It is no contradiction to say that sufficient flexibility must be maintained in the developmental programme to permit constant modifications and improvements as things progress.

76. Perhaps one of the most concrete opportunities for planning resides in the government's own construction plan or public works programme. Where capital investment is lacking generally, the government's programme may constitute the bulk of the engineering and construction work in the country. From the fiscal point of view, an important question is whether public works planning takes the form of capital budgeting over a sufficiently long period of time. In this respect, attention may have to be given to: (1) the need to constantly maintain up-to-date construction plans, spanning a five-year period, more or less; (2) due separation of current costs for repair and maintenance from the capital costs of the original construction; (3) long-term provision of the capital funds for replacement after the project has continued through its expected period of existence.

77. Such public works programmes raise the general question of how the planning process and the budgeting process are to be linked. Certainly any planning programme to be administratively effective must be closely co-ordinated with the government's budgetary programme. The financial aspects of national planning — particularly the relative shares of public funds that can be allocated to various projects, the extent to which public borrowing is necessary or feasible, the net effect of projects which themselves will produce some income — cannot be ignored if specific plans, programmes or projects are to be properly financed. It is at the budgeting stage that priorities among the various projects in a general plan will have



to be assigned. Such a process of selection also implies co-ordination in timing among the component parts of the general programme.

78. Little can be done without at least a reasonable minimum of basic data and reliable statistics. In a sense, the effective marshalling of data, in which the statistical method plays an important role, is the primary and basic tool of governmental planning. Basic statistics will have to be made available in the following fields: (1) agriculture, industry, employment, prices, foreign trade, balance of payments, banking, credit, transportation, government revenue, expenditures and debt; (2) distributive shares of the national income showing figures for wages, interest, investment; (3) demographic and social statistics showing births, death, morbidity, migration, literacy, level of education, general and technical; (4) internal governmental statistics on cost of the public service and public personnel statistics, including salaries, age in relation to grade in the personnel establishment, employment turnover, rates of recruitment, and training.

79. Further, the degree of success of whatever development programmes are undertaken — the extent to which there has been a more fruitful employment of the nation's basic resources, natural and human — must be judged on evidence which is primarily statistical in nature. The subjects of importance here are: (1) the effectiveness of the land-use programme, as measured by the increased yield per unit of such main crops as foods, fibres and other agricultural raw materials or forest products; (2) the improved use and conservation of water and mineral resources; and (3) a more effective employment of manpower, including the accretion of administrative and technical training, experience and skill.

80. The most pointed statistics which might help to weigh the extent to which progress has been made are the following: (1) infant mortality and average life span; (2) literacy and average number of years of schooling; (3) *per capita* income, family incomes, and percentage of national income ploughed back into investment; (4) balance of payments and rate of retirement of the foreign debt; and (5) average calorie consumption and the amount of horsepower being added to manpower.

81. In this connexion, the relation between the statistical services available in a given country and the work of United Nations in the field of economic, social and governmental statistics might be explored by underdeveloped areas. Moreover, the organization of the statistical services, especially in these countries, may have much to do with the quality of the statistics. The tendency in some countries is to concentrate much of the statistical work in a single unit placed as close as possible to the central planning or development agency.

82. In examining the existing machinery for the central planning function itself, it may be helpful to review the various patterns which have developed. Because of the relationship between planning and the urgent search for rapid economic development, there is a tendency to place the planning function in the highest reaches of the administrative hierarchy. In some cases it is located in the office of the chief executive (or prime minister)

himself. In other cases it is established as a separate ministry. Sometimes it is located within or adjacent to a major agency of fiscal control such as a finance ministry or a budget office. As another alternative, it is in a ministry of economics. Finally, there is the collegiate type of central planning agency, sometimes taking the form of a council of ministers.

83. There are a number of advantages to thus centralizing the preparation of broad plans in one agency or service. But this is not to say that other departments of government do not have an important planning role within their respective spheres. On the contrary, it is essential that they be brought into the planning process. A national plan which is overly centralized has little to commend it. On the other hand a national plan which is broadly co-ordinated but which leaves to the separate agencies and subordinate levels much of the detailed planning responsibilities may well succeed. Most departments which are competently run, quite naturally tend to believe the activities in which they are engaged are the most important of the government and deserving of the highest share of the government's funds. But if the broad lines of national planning are fixed, the legitimate requests of the various agencies can be more readily assessed. Balancing this process with the necessity of having the primary administrative departments participate in and come to the support of the over-all plan is a delicate but essential task. One of the best devices for accomplishing it is to delegate responsibility for planning the details to individual departments which would be responsible for refining specific sections of the co-ordinated plan.

84. Effective planning requires even wider participation than this. If the legislature is not kept fully informed or satisfied with regard to central planning, it may make decisions or appropriations concerning programmes or projects which might seriously interfere with the over-all plans. Local authorities, too, though they might have a tendency to overemphasize their own needs, are essential partners in the national plan. There is, moreover, the possibility of regional plans to accomplish programmes which might help to give to the national plan a multi-purpose resource-use character. There are, finally, the non-governmental plans of private enterprises which are related. Countries seeking to effectuate development programmes may thus find it necessary to deconcentrate rather than to centralize some phases of planning, while retaining at the centre the power to make the essential minimum of decisions. One way to develop an adequate body of planning as well as administrative skill is not to centralize but to share responsibility and authority with provincial or municipal authorities, private or co-operative agencies, and mixed or public corporations.

85. The public corporation is one of the more recent devices designed to facilitate development activities. Both developed and under-developed countries have found that a new programme can sometimes be facilitated by this type of autonomous or semi-autonomous agency, or by mixed public-private corporations, or simply by means of a concession or a management contract to an independent corporation, firm or individual. While the

public corporation or the autonomous agency may satisfy the objective of achieving swifter administration freed from the formal regulations or routines imposed upon the regularly established agencies, careful consideration must be given to the composition of the autonomous board of directors, the necessity of assuring a proper degree of conformance to higher executive or legislative directives, and the need to substitute an effective system of governmental controls for those from which the autonomous body is exempted — budgeting, accounting, auditing, staffing, purchasing. The object is to ensure governmental control but to clothe the public corporation with the more independent and flexible operating characteristics of the private corporation. Another attraction of the public corporation — intangible but important — is the value of giving dramatic and symbolic expression in this manner to the single development project or to the broad development programme for which it might be made responsible.

86. In fact one of the main needs of planning and development of this kind is widespread support among the public. Consideration might be given to the publication of explanatory material about the development plan at the appropriate stage in order to obtain public understanding and public support. A carefully devised public relations programme of this kind might also help to encourage the planning specialists who may lose faith in the planning technique unless their work is understood beyond their own specialized circles.

87. Broad development plans in which there is wide understanding mean that citizens and authorities learn to look ahead, to weigh alternatives, to assess priorities, in short, to plan. Engineers, technicians and administrators within the government and outside get a more comprehensive view of their jobs, and their sense of responsibility and initiative for further planning grows. Private individuals and groups become informed about the government's intentions, and they begin to plan too, within the broader plan. In under-developed countries there is frequently an air of expectation about planning and development, and if the plans are well conceived and widely appreciated there is little reason why citizens should be let down.

88. Realization of plans will depend in large measure upon the grade of the planning personnel and especially upon their ability to help translate and transmit the plans to those responsible for execution and operations. Planning for economic and social development under the stimulation of a deliberate programme to convert an under-developed country into a more productive one and a better place to live is significant and dramatic enough to command the best brains and the hardest workers in the country. The established agencies and ministries may not only be tapped for able personnel but may actually be assigned to carry out some of the newer and more dramatic development activities; otherwise the talent and facilities of the existing personnel will continue to be spent in carrying on the old functions in existing ways with little addition to the totality of public services and public administration. What is certain is that plans drawn up

in a detached agency, without the participation and support of the officials most responsible for carrying them out, will be hard to realize. For many countries outside assistance in planning will be essential and desirable. Every technical assistance mission of the United Nations will, in a sense, have the opportunity of contributing to, and bringing outside expertise to bear upon, national planning in the economic, social and administrative spheres.

### *Chapter 3*

## MEASURES FOR IMPROVEMENT OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

### *Section 1. DETERMINATION OF ADMINISTRATIVE PRIORITIES*

89. As was said before there are some standards and guides in the field of public administration which would help countries seeking administrative assistance to select the most workable administrative devices for the solution of economic and social problems. When it comes, however, to the question of choosing, from among the various mechanisms and techniques, those most likely to provide the maximum results in the shortest time, the problem becomes more difficult. Obviously the situation of each country, whether developed or under-developed, differs with respect to its administrative needs and practices, and administrative priorities will be affected accordingly.

90. It is not possible to say that the installation of administrative changes can be strictly tied in with the sequence of economic and social developments. The art and science of public administration tends to be a general one and consequently it is not feasible to proceed as though the technical programme for agriculture, for example, could be accompanied by an administrative plan for reorganization only of the agricultural agencies, for the recruiting solely of agricultural administrators, for the budgeting only of the agricultural services, and for the revision solely of procedures relating to the administrative management of agricultural functions. Similarly, the timing of technical developments and reforms in these factors of public administration cannot be tied primarily to the particular programmes for resource development, water-power, industrial production or public health.

91. In many instances, the administrative and managerial phases may have to precede and lay the ground for the economic and social developments. In other cases, administrative priorities may be given the barest consideration. It is quite conceivable that in certain countries and circumstances, one or a few subject-matter programmes — a health programme, a water-power project, a welfare programme, a petroleum project — should be given thorough emphasis and furnished with the minimum of administrative requirements, leaving the government-wide problems of public administration for future solution. Dramatic achievement in a single economic or social field, where the public demand and pressure for some accomplishment is great, may do more to give an impetus to the whole development

programme than slower progress of more general coverage, including government-wide administrative improvements.

92. It might therefore be more feasible to approach the problem of administrative priorities and timing by choosing between the broad alternatives of either a comprehensive reconstruction of public administration, or selective changes in particular factors of public administration, just as it might be equally feasible to consider whether the public administration phase of the development programme should be long-range or short-range, or whether it should restrict itself to changes that might be brought about merely by executive decision instead of requiring extensive constitutional or legislative revision. It would be highly desirable to prefer the comprehensive and the long-range approach, but the pressure on time and resources and the political and psychological urge for concrete accomplishments in the economic and social field as against administrative projects which are seemingly of less immediate import, makes it impossible to disregard the necessity for a high degree of selection of administrative projects for the purpose of serving short-run needs, with the hope that the individual decisions will contribute to a well-conceived long-range and comprehensive reform of the public administration.

93. By applying this approach to each of the five main factors of public administration, we may possibly arrive at some determination of administrative priorities. Clearly, factor number one is the over-all planning and development phase which has just been discussed in its broadest administrative outlines. Meanwhile, planning in the separate subject-matter fields might be encouraged to proceed as continuously as possible. This should not be too difficult, in view of the readiness on the part of a few isolated subject-matter specialists working in public works, public health, and in other specialized lines in the under-developed countries, to engage, sometimes enthusiastically, in the concrete formulation of projects, once they are encouraged to do so under the impetus of general development plans.

94. Because of the characteristic shortage of skilled human resources in under-developed areas, the public personnel factor within the context of the general plan should be given the highest priority. Among the particular needs here are: (1) a list of the top administrators in all of the government agencies; (2) an inventory of available administrative talent at the intermediate as well as higher levels in technical as well as in executive positions; (3) a national register of technical, scientific, administrative and possibly clerical personnel; and (4) an estimate of all personnel needs required to accomplish the developmental programme. Obviously, the pressure of events will not permit all of these to be undertaken at once. Perhaps a first step is to make a government-wide inventory of the talents available, especially at the higher and intermediate executive levels of general administrative competence and experience, but not neglecting, if possible, a survey of the available subject-matter specialists in agricultural administration, forestry administration, public works administration, power and irrigation, economics, statistics, law, engineering, and accounting.

95. If, after such an inventory, the essential administrative leadership for the early economic and social projects being undertaken does not seem to be available within the government, sources in the commercial, social, and cultural organizations might be studied and tapped for personnel. Furthermore, if the pressure in some subject-matter fields is not too great, it might be possible to release for training the more promising but less experienced executives at the intermediate level, particularly to build up a back-log of talent in some of the specialized fields of public administration itself, such as budgeting or personnel administration, fiscal management or statistical services. If the shortage of subject-matter specialists is the dominating consideration from the beginning, it will be necessary to meet these requirements directly. It would, nevertheless, be a serious mistake if the marshalling and training of administrative talent is retarded in favour of the preparation of specialists bearing titles more concretely related to the specific or the dramatic elements of the economic and social development programme.

96. Whether an under-developed area should work on the theory of providing technicians who are good administrators, or the alternative theory of developing good administrators who can manage, but not carry on, the subject-matter techniques, will continue to be a moot question in technical assistance, as it is in public administration generally, throughout the world. It would be well if no single open-and-shut answer were attempted to this theoretical question. No doubt, practical decisions regarding administrative priorities will have to be made in the light of some sound administrative theory, but the theory should preferably be a flexible one which would permit alternative approaches to this problem, as the development situation waxes and wanes.

97. Meanwhile, greater mobility of the available administrative personnel might be provided in order to overcome the scarcity of human resources. This may be accomplished by a freer system of inter-departmental transfer under the direction of the higher executive authority, since the characteristic departmental isolation will require some such intervention. If provincial or district administration play an important part in the system of public administration, rotation of the most skilled officials can be undertaken with simultaneous assignments of junior understudies, who can take over as soon as possible and thus release the most experienced senior administrators for other duties. The same system of preparing juniors can be used at various levels of government, and more room at higher levels of responsibility can be made for them by a programme of accelerated retirement of superannuated personnel. A government-wide or departmental system of in-service training can meanwhile be started. Early integration of the personnel programme with the educational system may be necessary because of the tendency to raise educational requirements for positions without raising salaries. Scholarships in public administration for promising candidates will have to be made available long enough beforehand to provide a continued flow of talent, as

the economic, social and governmental undertakings and commitments become heavier.

98. Consideration must be given to the factor of financial administration, with an emphasis on those aspects which are distinctly related to the various priority projects, administrative as well as economic. Thus, the budgeting techniques, the statistical service, the system of accounting, the revenue services and above all the provision of adequate funds to finance the cost of the personnel and other administrative changes, will constitute major priorities on the agenda of the reconstructed financial administration of the government.

99. With regard to the organizational factor, the existing system of administrative departments and other agencies, and the prevailing distribution of functions among them, will meanwhile have to be generally scrutinized. Here, the first step should always be the co-ordination of efforts for a given purpose within the existing framework; the indoctrination of public servants as to the necessity of teamwork regardless of the structural shortcomings which are going to be solved only over the long-range period. The clearer reassignment of functions and the establishment of a more workable hierarchy, within the context of the newer development programme and the limits of financial possibility, should come next. A thorough reconstruction of existing machinery may be necessary, but in most cases it may be advisable to proceed gradually with the structural changes. A decision of the type and qualifications of the leading officers should come first; the personnel structure may thus be more important than the organizational structure. Finally there might be undertaken a redefinition and division of duties, functions and responsibilities. Stricter correlation of functions, more definite devices for co-ordination, the eliminations of duplication and overlapping should then begin to obtain more and more attention.

100. Administrative reorganization and the preparation of staff to take over newer responsibilities is a long-term affair which may be difficult to combine with the execution of development programmes. Reorganization cannot be successfully conducted unless there is a general plan not only for the new organization but for the performance of duties without interruption while the reorganization takes place. During this period of transition, the centralization of policy and supervision and the decentralization of operation or execution will pose the most difficult problems. And yet it is in such periods, which are likely to become continual in underdeveloped countries, that careful centralization along with effective delegation of powers may be most needed.

101. When a more thorough reorganization becomes timely, several questions become relevant: (1) which of the existing agencies or their branches can be merged with the newer developmental bodies? (2) which of the newer developmental agencies or their branches may, after an initial period, be integrated with the older agencies? (3) which of the control and co-ordinating functions of the top executive or auxiliary administrative agencies (dealing with finance, personnel, etc.) may be incorporated into



the work of developmental agencies, as their programme develops; (4) which of the developmental agencies have demonstrated the need and capacity for continued administrative independence? (5) which of the existing independent or regulatory agencies have become redundant in view of the broadening scope of governmental activity into the realm of non-governmental enterprises?

102. Governmental reorganization at the level of the constitutional or provincial structure of the country often may have to await the proper opportunity. The relations between executive and legislative branches, the distribution of powers between the national and the provincial authorities, the proper delineation of the role of the military or of the other centres of power within the State are, of course, among the most fundamental problems of organization. Possibly they can be better solved as constructive progress is made with the more limited administrative devices. On the other hand, the country may be in the throes of fundamental change, and the time might be opportune for certain structural and organic changes that would soundly contribute to good public administration.

103. Specific reforms of administrative management, though frequently routine or procedural in nature, may be quite essential to the achievement of the planning, personnel, financial and organizational priorities. Moreover these managerial questions may be especially relevant during the earlier stages of the elaboration of the machinery for accomplishing the substantive economic and social projects. For this reason they must be improvized and interspersed where they belong, a principle which, in a sense, summarizes the prudential point of view that will have to be applied continually in determining all of the administrative priorities.

104. For the analysis, the delineation, and the implementation of necessary or desirable administrative reforms, whether to be undertaken as a comprehensive, long-run project or in connexion with specific plans for economic or social development, the advice of technical assistance and expert personnel provided by the United Nations and the specialized agencies may prove especially useful.

## *Section 2. INTERNATIONAL SERVICES IN PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION*

105. As of the end of July, 1951, thirty-five countries were receiving technical assistance from the United Nations and the specialized agencies through missions in the field. Many of these may be said to be public administration projects of some kind. These projects range in intensity from mere survey of a single administrative problem, such as the statistical services, to the actual installation of a series of reforms in revenue administration. In the latter case, the United Nations expert is working in a capacity which, although essentially advisory, is not unlike that of a civil servant of the host State, a duality which, especially in technical assistance projects dealing with government and public administration, is delicate in theory but quite workable in practice.

106. Difficulties on this score have thus far been non-existent largely because the situation is always one in which the Member government retains the initiative in requesting the United Nations mission for well-defined purposes and in formally approving the membership of the mission as suggested by the United Nations. A basic agreement is customarily entered into between the United Nations or specialized agencies and the requesting government, the latter undertaking to provide the mission with certain local services. Frequently a preliminary United Nations mission is sent to evaluate the situation and arrive at a specification of the fields of inquiry to be undertaken by the main mission and of the extent to which implementing steps may be expected in each field.

107. In expressing the basic policy on this point the United Nations and the specialized agencies indicated in 1949 that the requesting government would be expected to "undertake the sustained efforts required for successful development, including the organization and adequate support of administrative services capable of progressively assuming responsibility for the administration of operating programmes". Consequently even projects which do not call specifically for work in public administration have administrative implications and require that attention be given to their administrative aspects. In this connexion, projects in the field of public administration, because of the possible governmental or political implications to a Member State, must be defined with particular care, but it has been generally found in practice that national susceptibilities on this score are no barrier.

108. While a large body of relevant national experience does exist, the recruitment of the international staff called upon to go into the field and work with the officials of a host government presents a number of difficulties. The essential problem was clearly pointed out by the Economic and Social Council (resolution 222 (A) IX, annex I) in the following terms: "Experts should be chosen not only for their technical competence, but also for their sympathetic understanding of the cultural backgrounds and specific needs of the countries to be assisted and for their capacity to adapt methods of work to local conditions, social and material." The need for such understanding on the part of the visiting experts and for an identification with the country in which they are serving may perhaps be even greater when they are dealing with the politically sensitive field of governmental administration, than when they are concerned with the more standard practices of medical technology or extraction of minerals or even agricultural economics. In the case of such administrative projects it may be necessary for them to take on the character, for the time being, of a civil servant of the nation to which they are assigned, while remaining on the international panel of experts.

109. In public administration especially, the need seems to be for international personnel who can not only produce the proper technical answers to economic and social problems, but who can also inspire, in officials of

the under-developed countries, a sense of trust in their own unused human resources and the latent administrative capacities of their countries. There is, in a sense, a technique of technical assistance which goes beyond technical skill. What is sought is a combination of experience in governmental functions, knowledge about modern management, practical skill in administration, sensitivity to background and cultural nuances, and a clear understanding of the relationship between the problems of economic and social development, on the one hand, and public management and political affairs on the other.

110. The number of individuals who meet this special set of qualifications is not large and many of those so qualified will not easily be released from posts in their own countries for brief periods without considerable sacrifice, professional and personal. In view of this difficulty, the Committee suggests that the Technical Assistance Administration give consideration to the desirability of building, however gradually, a small and carefully selected panel of specialists in public administration. The panel would consist in the first instance of a nucleus of international experts retained on a full-time basis and subject to assignments in the field at any time, supplemented by a reserve of expert personnel from various governmental or non-governmental services available for assignment from time to time. In making this suggestion the Committee is aware of the obstacles to such a course; especially the uncertainties as to the future financing of the international technical assistance programme. On the other hand it is also cognizant of the fact that the first steps toward building such a nuclear staff have already been taken in terms of repeated assignments to technical assistance missions of several outstanding men.

111. Experience thus far indicates that the kind of technical assistance which is really needed and desired by governments cannot always be effectively rendered by a group of experts, no matter how able, who visit a country for a few months, present a report with recommendations and return to their own countries forthwith. In practice, such an initial report sometimes serves principally to delineate the kind of continuing international assistance which is needed. In several cases experts have remained or returned over a considerably longer period of time in order to help with the implementation of earlier recommendations. This practice can be expected to become more widespread when governments, desiring to bring about reforms, come to appreciate the usefulness of this more extended type of assistance. In each of seven countries there is now a Resident Representative of the United Nations for technical assistance purposes, whose task is to assist the host government with the formulation of requests and the implementation of accepted recommendations and to serve as an informal centre for co-ordination of local activities on the part of the United Nations and specialized agencies. This trend away from the brief mission and written report, in the direction of longer and continuing assistance on actual problems of implementation offers a more direct opportunity to demonstrate concrete results in the field of public administration.

112. Training has come to be a major part of the current programme of international technical assistance in public administration. From a long-term point of view, an important objective of such a programme may be the establishment or development of more local facilities for training related to public administration in a growing number of the less developed countries. But, while in many countries the need for special training appears even in the lowest grades of the public service, the key problem seems to remain the lack of arrangements which would produce a growing number of well-trained younger officials destined to assume increasing responsibility for the management of the public service.

113. The International Administrative Staff College and School of Public Administration, which was seriously proposed in the earlier stages of the United Nations programme, was designed to help meet this need by providing extended training at a central point. It did not materialize and it is open to doubt whether such an extreme centralization would be practicable or desirable. The United Nations scholarship programme for junior officials, which has been in operation for two years, cannot, however, even begin to fulfil the demand for mass training of this level of personnel.

114. For the intermediate and senior groups, who are difficult to detach from their posts for long periods of training, a limited number of fellowships in special subjects has been provided, and international or regional seminars have been conducted by the United Nations with some favorable results. Seminar topics have included such subjects as fiscal administration and public personnel management. This form of training offers the advantage that several score of officials can be given intensive training over periods up to three months at reasonable *per capita* costs both to the international organization and to the governments concerned.

115. On an experimental scale, the United Nations has begun to conduct regional or national centres for training in public administration and is assisting countries interested in building up their training institutions for their own officials or officials of neighbouring States by offering help in formulating the curriculum or in recruiting and training the teaching staff for such institutions. It would be possible to explore the situation further so as to determine in which of the areas of the world there may be developed further regional centres with sufficient faculty and other resources to serve the whole region as a gathering-point for intermediate officials who might be selected by their governments for a year of advanced study or research in their special fields of interest.

116. During the academic year 1950-51, thirty-eight United Nations fellows and scholars from nineteen countries were trained abroad and have returned to their official posts. It is desirable, in the manner of the most advanced training programmes in public administration, to keep a continuing check on the actual contribution this part of the programme is making, through these fellows and scholars, to the public administration in the countries from which they come. There may be some question as to whether

the necessarily modest number of fellowships or scholarships should not be used more generally for special training of personnel with a teaching function, or of senior public servants working in priority fields of specialization, rather than for junior administrators.

117. The development of national training centres for the higher functions in public administration, however, should remain the major goal of the assistance programme. This development can be furthered by creating scholarship opportunities or by organizing seminars for the training of teachers for such institutions or by the temporary assignment of teachers to them by the United Nations. Such teachers if qualified for field operations as well, might be included in the international panel or the international reserve of technical assistance experts, which it is recommended be created by the Technical Assistance Administration. In such case the regional centres might become recruiting and briefing centres for the technical personnel who may continue to be in short supply.

118. Finally the organization of special seminars of experts, both from the under-developed and from the more developed countries, concerning vital subjects of public administration might add valuable material to the body of knowledge and understanding in those fields and to the possibility of comparative studies, which can offer still wider prospects of mutual assistance and improvement. For one of the main obstacles to useful international assistance in the solution of administrative problems is the scarcity of factual information describing current administrative processes and problems in various nations. Except in specialized fields such as fiscal administration, social welfare administration, labour law administration, forestry administration, to which the United Nations and the specialized agencies have already given special attention, research and publication are lacking. The International Institute of Administrative Sciences has been aware of this problem for some time and now, with help from the United Nations technical assistance programme, is extending the circle of countries among which administrative information is exchanged and the subjects concerning which comprehensive studies are made. Valuable returns could be realized through the investment of modest funds, from various sources, to support the production of factual administrative studies in particular countries, on a regional or a continental basis, or through more elaborate studies of comparative public administration.

### *Section 3.* SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

119. In concluding this chapter of the report, the Committee wishes to draw together, in the following brief paragraphs, the principal recommendations which emerge from its examination of the role of the United Nations and the specialized agencies in connexion with technical assistance in public administration:

- (1) In the planning and organization of a technical assistance mission of any sort, careful consideration should be given to the administrative implications of the project or projects under consideration. Comprehensive missions and others having a fairly wide scope should, with the approval of the requesting government, include a member who is properly qualified in the general administrative field. In the case of missions having narrower terms of reference, some briefing on the possible administrative implications of their work will almost always be desirable.
- (2) The United Nations Technical Assistance Administration should appoint a carefully selected small permanent staff of specialists in public administration, primarily for work in the field. This small group should be supplemented by a panel of experts in various countries who could be called upon from time to time for limited assignments in other countries.
- (3) In connexion with training for public administration, the Committee considers that:
  - (a) The continuing contribution being made by the younger government officials who have already received training under the United Nations programme should be ascertained and evaluated as carefully as possible;
  - (b) A number of fellowships and scholarships might well be granted preferably to senior governmental officials or to personnel with a teaching function, for training in fields of special urgency in connexion with their duties. Intermediate and senior officials may also benefit from carefully prepared national or regional training seminars of three months' duration or less;
  - (c) The primary objective in the long run should remain the establishment or improvement of national training facilities in this field, especially those which will provide a growing number of younger officials qualified to assume increasing administrative responsibilities in their public services. The United Nations can assist in formulating curricula and by making available teachers from other countries for specified periods, and by providing training for local personnel who will become teachers. The possibility of developing regional centres for training in public administration in certain areas should be further explored.
- (4) All available measures should be taken toward filling in the notable gaps in our knowledge of the administrative methods and problems of many countries and in the field of comparative public administration generally. Occasional expert seminars would be useful in this connexion, as would financial support and other encouragement of factual administrative studies in a number of countries whose present administrative systems are not widely known.

## Part II

### OUTLINE FOR A SURVEY OF ADMINISTRATIVE CONDITIONS

#### *Section 1. ENVIRONMENT AND BACKGROUND*

120. Before an analysis is undertaken of the governmental organization and of the public administration in a particular country, that country's general background and structure must be the object of a careful if necessarily broader survey. In preparing such a survey on behalf of a technical assistance mission much of the work should be done in advance through a collection and analysis of the relevant published or otherwise available data. This spade work may make it easier to discover what is lacking, to draft the questions arising during such a study, and to complete the survey on the spot, with the assistance of the country's authorities, in the shortest possible time.

121. As the political and social structure and the dynamics of the political situation are of predominant importance for the further factual understanding of the country's government and administration, other factors must be studied particularly with regard to their influence on that structure and situation. The main elements are:

(a) The historical development of the country; its political and constitutional development; the historical background and sources of its legal and administrative system; its relations to other nations and to the United Nations; the frequency and modes of internal change and the existence and nature of international conditions affecting the country in particular;

(b) Its geographical situation; its geological structure and its known natural resources; the accessibility of the country and its means of external and internal communications; its climate and fertility.

(c) The demography of the country; size and composition of its population; average rate of increase and distribution of densities; problems of race and minorities; relation to neighbouring peoples and migration;

(d) The economic situation; nature and distribution of its resources and its national income; types of production, their size and their interrelation; volume and origin of its capital; foreign share in investment and management; its internal and foreign trade and exchange; its credit system and its internal and external debts; its monetary system and stability;

(e) The social structure; distribution of wealth and power; existing social classes; conditions and organization of labour; mobility or rigidity of the social structure;

(f) The general character of the population; main political, educational, religious and traditional trends; external influences on these trends.

122. Particular attention should be given to the nature and functioning of the political forces, because of their determining influence on the character of the government and on the possibilities of administrative reform; they can be of greater importance than the constitutional rules and the institutional forms. The relative strength of personalities, groups and parties and their official or factual participation in the structure of political power and the direction of political movements should be carefully evaluated. Such a study, covering the recent past and projecting itself, if possible, into the near future, can be completed by a survey of the formation and the main currents of public opinion, the working of the electoral system, and the major problems around which revolves the political life of the country.

123. If this picture can be integrated with the natural, economic, and social factors indicated above, and projected on the historical and cultural background of the people, the governmental institutions and the public administration will be much better understood and the possibilities of administrative reform much more clearly discerned than if the survey of the existing public administration were to be undertaken as an isolated subject.

124. It goes without saying that such a preliminary analysis must be made in a spirit of sympathy and of objective, scientific understanding and that, in this phase, all critical judgments and all preconceived notions should be avoided. Their purpose is a description of facts in order to make it possible, at a later stage, to determine what are to be the orientation, the means, and the limits of the measures of administrative reform to which technical assistance can be successfully applied. A visiting mission cannot be successful without widespread understanding, participation, and support among the persons and groups in positions of leadership and technical responsibility within the government. Thorough discussion and joint work before recommendations are formulated — perhaps through which they are formulated — will be absolutely essential if results are to be achieved. This in no way modifies or detracts from the independent responsibility which the mission must, in the last analysis, bear for its recommendations.

125. Recognizing, then, all the hazards of generalization in such a matter, the Committee nevertheless believes experience will prove that the improvement of public administration in under-developed countries will more often than not require special consideration of the following problems, which are treated separately in the sections which follow:



- (a) Governmental Organization;
- (b) Public Finance;
- (c) Public Personnel;
- (d) Administrative Management;
- (e) Planning and Development.

## Section 2. GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATION

126. *The central government.* In a majority of cases the elements composing the central government will, at least in legal theory, conform to certain widely accepted or imitated patterns, of which the presidential and the responsible cabinet governments are the most common. In the following paragraphs the terms "executive", "legislative", and "judicial" are used in the sense in which they are usually defined according to those patterns. In practice, however, considerable variations may occur both in the general structure and in the relations between the several branches of the government. In some cases the structure of the central government will be based on entirely different principles; in those cases the following questions only offer an indication of the direction the inquiry should take.

127. A special case is presented by those States, whether federal or unitarian in composition, where a number of functions that are usually considered to be of general and national character have been retained by or delegated to the governments of the component states, provinces or departments. In those cases the survey of government from the central point of view has to include those major subdivisions and their relations to the national government. Certain questions formulated under the heading "Territorial Governments" will be of importance, in such cases, to complete the survey of the general structure of the government.

128. The main groups of questions covering this subject are:

(a) Where does the real political power reside? Is the principle of legislative supremacy well established or is the responsibility for providing the over-all political orientation of the government shared between the legislature and the executive, or concentrated in the hands of the latter? Is preponderant political power exercised by party organizations as such, either through their leader or through a governing body? Has the control of the military forces or of the police a direct relationship with the localization of political power?

(b) Which part of the government has the main initiative in legislative and budgetary action? Does the executive exercise the primary leadership in the country's legislative programme, or has the legislature a considerable power of initiative and amendment in actual practice? How is the contact between both branches of the government organized? Has the executive a substantial share in making rules and regulations, either through delegation of legislative power or by an extensive use of executive ordinances and decrees, either regularly or in an emergency? Can important legislation

originate in the legislature without the co-operation of the executive? To what extent does the legislature assume executive functions either by law, through its budgeting power, or otherwise? Does the legislature use its budgeting power only as a means of general policy making and control? Has the delegation of governmental regulatory authority to independent boards and commissions been avoided?

(c) Is the principle of judicial independence fully recognized? How are the selection of judges and their tenure regulated? How far do political considerations enter into their appointment? Is the function of public prosecutor filled by election or by appointment in the civil service? Is there any political or executive interference with the enforcement of judicial decisions apart from the usual right of pardon?

(d) Is responsibility for the political direction of the public administration clearly localized in a chief executive or a cabinet? Is executive responsibility for leadership in legislation primarily affecting the public administration recognized, and the executive ordinance power clearly defined and observed? Is regulation by law for the public administration used as a guarantee for its impartiality and stability, or as an opportunity for organization and direction by the legislature and its members? How is control over administrative action exercised by the legislature? Has extensive constitutional or statutory delegation of executive functions to particular authorities, not subject to the chief executive or the cabinet, been avoided?

(e) Are there independent authorities in the central government for the non-political control and review of administrative action? What is the position of the courts in this respect? Is there a central auditing agency; a board of appeal for fiscal or taxation cases; a central agency for matters concerning government personnel; a central court or council to decide conflicts of competence between the central government and the territorial governments or other autonomous bodies? Are they independent from the executive or legislative branches of the government? What is their impact on the functioning of the executive branch? Do they cause rigidity and formalism of procedure, or are they open to changes and improvements and do they promote alertness in the services?

(f) To what extent does a change in the political composition of the government affect the public service? Is the public service seen as a necessary support for the party in power, or as an impartial body of civil servants destined to serve any government? Which categories of functions in the public administration are filled by election or by appointments made on political grounds? With which part of the central government or of the political organizations does the distribution of patronage rest?

129. *Territorial government.* Apart from the autonomous territorial subdivisions of major rank mentioned in paragraph 127, to which the questions concerning the central government may in part apply, there is a wide variety of territorial governments, playing an indispensable part

in public administration, which any survey should include. Through these governments in the regional and local spheres the citizen is often most actively brought into contact with the business and responsibility of government. Moreover it may occur that a local, most often an urban, administration develops more advanced features than a more complicated and more slowly moving central government. Particular attention should be given, in certain countries, to the lowest levels of territorial government in villages and other rural communities. Although it is impossible to cover this category, which often is governed by customary laws of very disparate character and origin, by a number of general questions, their function in public administration is essential where those communities are the basic politico-social—and sometimes economic—units of the nation, and where their members are reached by the central authorities almost exclusively through the intermediary of their village governments and other communal institutions.

130. The following questions have a general application with respect to territorial governments:

(a) Is the structure of a territorial government based on the constitution, on central legislation, or on ordinances and decrees of inferior rank? Can changes in those regulations be made without the assent of this territorial government or not? In what measure is tradition an element in the determination of its territory and its authority? Is there a noticeable difference between the orientation of politics in the local or regional and in the national sphere? Are ethnic differences of population involved? Do these differences and does the status of these subdivisions in general have an influence (legal or conventional) on the composition of the various branches of the central government and of the public service?

(b) How is the autonomy of the territorial governments circumscribed and which fields does it cover? Is the distribution of responsibilities for the performance of the public services between the central and territorial governments based upon a rational reconciliation of administrative and social objectives? How is the police power distributed between the central and the territorial governments? What powers of direction and control does the central government have with regard to autonomous territorial governments, apart from the power of revising the basic legislation? Can it only act repressively, or can it prescribe certain policies within their general competence? Can it apply certain budgetary sanctions? Are the autonomous territorial governments dependent on central grants? Can the central government dissolve such a territorial government or assume its functions in an emergency?

(c) What is the authority of the central government in the composition of autonomous territorial governments and of their personnel? Are autonomous territorial governments wholly based on regional or local elections? Do traditional or hereditary authorities have a place in their structure? Or are they in part appointed by the central government? Is

their personnel appointed entirely by themselves, or provided in part by the central public services? In the latter case, is the central personnel wholly at the disposal of the autonomous territorial government, or does it remain under the general direction of the central government?

(d) Are autonomous territorial governments only charged with the execution of their autonomous task, or are they at the same time acting as agents of the central government and responsible to that government in such functions? Do the autonomous authorities and the agents of the central administration function in the same territorial subdivisions, and if so, what are their relations to each other?

131. *The central executive.* The basic pattern for the executive function — whether a cabinet system, presidential system or some other — is obviously the first point of inquiry. Apart from its relations to and integration with the other branches of the central government, its actual internal organization is of primary importance, particularly with regard to the questions as to where the actual leadership of the executive resides, and how it is organized.

132. The organization and activities of the immediate office or “household” of the central executive should be explored in this connexion. Keeping in mind a noticeable trend in many countries to create and strengthen what might be called the “executive office” (perhaps in such fields as personnel, over-all organization and management, clearance of decrees or ordinances, etc.) a close look at the executive’s immediate establishment will prove most useful. This applies to monarchical and presidential governments as well as to the office of the premier in a cabinet government.

133. Other questions are:

(a) How is co-ordination within the central executive achieved? Is there a machinery or procedure for the central clearance and co-ordination of draft legislation and of the budget? Are interrelated activities of the several organizational units brought together in established central agencies such as those for personnel management, administrative reorganization, or planning? What is the position of the chief executive or the cabinet in this respect?

(b) What are the basic considerations underlying the grouping of departments and services? Have related services been brought together within a small number of departments or ministries, assuring the chief executive or the cabinet of a workable span of control? Are there logical considerations behind the arrangements, such as similarity of function or clientele, or is the location of the various services and activities within the departments more or less haphazard and fortuitous? Are the duties and responsibilities of the department heads and supervisory employees defined and their relationships set forth in organization charts and written instructions? Do the departments embrace all offices and services in the

executive branch? Are organizational changes frequent and often influenced by political considerations?

(c) What is the relationship of the central executive to the military organization? What is the formal and actual situation with regard to the function of commander-in-chief?

(d) Have newer forms of governmental organization been created such as public corporations, mixed enterprises and other autonomous or semi-autonomous institutions? What is their relation and responsibility to the chief executive, the cabinet, or the department heads? Are they permanent in character or meant to be absorbed into the existing departments and services after they have served their purpose of setting new developmental activities into motion?

(e) What are the basic conceptions underlying the delegation of administrative authority and responsibility within the departments and services? Is there a consistent purpose to free the higher officials as much as possible from minor or routine activities and decisions? Is delegation applied only on a functional basis or also on a territorial basis? How are local initiative and talent utilized? How is supervision over the lower ranks of the administration organized?

134. *Territorial administration.* A number of questions apply more particularly to the territorial organization of the services of the central government:

What are the territorial subdivisions for the activities of the various departments and central agencies? Are they as a rule the same for all services? What is their relationship to the departments or agencies to which they belong? Do the services in each territory function independently or are they subordinated to a territorial representative of the central government? What other methods of local co-ordination of their activities exist? What is their relation to autonomous territorial governments in the same territory? To what extent are officials in the territorial service transferable to other territories and to the central offices? Are there groups of officials whose career is restricted to a territorial sphere? What is the scope of territorial delegation of authority and responsibility?

### *Section 3. PUBLIC FINANCE*

135. In undertaking an analysis of financial administration it will be necessary to discover at the outset what are the chief sources of governmental revenue and the chief items of governmental expenditure, how they are related, and what the recent history of the country's budget has been in so far as deficits or surpluses are concerned.

136. It is of particular importance, in cases where deficits are recurrent and serious, to inquire how those deficits are covered. The danger of chronic and rapid inflation with its serious effects on the position and morale of civil servants with fixed salaries would justify an absolute

priority for the examination of the financial administration with an eye to its productivity in the revenue department and its economy in expenditure.

137. *Revenue administration.* The following questions are important with regard to revenue:

(a) Are the current sources of revenue reasonably based on the economic pattern of the country and the methods of transacting business there? Do the current taxation provisions impose a reasonable administrative burden? Are there adequate records and points of control, for example, or are the administrative complications of particular taxes so great that the returns are all out of proportion to the effort expended and the costs involved? Is the system of assessment for the various taxes sufficiently simple or has a desire for modern refinements complicated it beyond the powers of control of the administration and the comprehension of the ordinary taxpayer, fostering abuse by the more sophisticated and corruption of the revenue service?

(b) To what extent do particular revenues go into general funds? Are certain revenues earmarked for special purposes? If there are a large number of earmarked revenues, what are the reasons behind their special status, the major interests involved, and the influence that certain groups exercise in this respect?

(c) To what extent are estimates of revenues co-ordinated with estimates of expenditures? Are they estimated by the same agencies or service? Is the relation between them clearly shown in the budget document? Further, what is the process by which necessary changes in the revenue system can be made to keep step with essential authorized expenditures?

138. *Budgeting.* The general machinery and procedures for formulating the government's budget should be analysed. Such questions as the following will be of significance:

(a) To what extent do the various operating departments or ministries participate in the budget's preparation?

(b) To what extent is there a central review in the executive branch before the budget is considered by the legislative body? Is this done by a special budget agency or bureau or merely by consultation at the cabinet level? If there is a central agency, what is its location in the governmental hierarchy, and what is the extent of its influence in producing a comprehensive and co-ordinated budget plan?

(c) To what extent and at what points does the legislature participate in the budget's formulation? Is the initiative with the executive or with the legislature? Is the legislature authorized to increase expenditure without increasing revenue, or not at all? To what extent does the legislature take budgetary decisions on a piecemeal basis as against consideration of the programme as a whole? To what extent and under what conditions does the legislative body modify the budgetary proposals of

the executive, make corresponding cuts in proposed expenditures when revenues are curtailed, etc.?

(d) In the preparation of the current budget, to what extent and in what way are previous budgets and previous actual experience of revenues and expenditures taken into account?

(e) At what stage in the process are individual projects or proposed expenditures justified, and in what manner? Is this done through hearings or consultations within the executive branch itself, within the office of the central executive, before legislative committees?

(f) To what extent is there public discussion of the budget during the stages of formulation or legislative approval?

(g) Is the general budget the only basis for revenues and expenditure or are supplementary budgets added in the course of the year? Do they authorize or ratify supplementary expenditure? What is their relative importance within the total government programme?

139. In considering the contents of the budget programme, the following questions may be revealing:

(a) Is there a general statement summarizing the major features of the entire budgetary programme, and is this supported by detailed justifications of specific sections or estimates within the budget?

(b) If there are, in the current or most recent budget, striking departures from previous experience, what is the explanation of these changes?

(c) Are all budgeted expenditures covered by estimated sources of revenue?

(d) What proportions of the annual revenue are spent on (i) purely administrative activities, like maintenance of law and order, administration of agencies, collection of revenue, etc.? (ii) developmental activities like education, public health, development of communications, agriculture, etc.?

(e) What are the proportions between the civilian and military expenditure? Has military expenditure any special position or priority?

(f) In countries where there are separate budgets for the central and state (provincial) governments, is the division of over-all revenue as between the two rational and practicable or is it causing administrative complications and difficulties?

(g) Does the budget show future obligations of the government — such as the programme of debt service — with sufficient clarity and completeness?

(h) In the country's recent budgetary experience, to what extent have important projects, particularly those of a developmental nature, been interrupted or hampered by stoppages of, or delays in, available funds?

(i) Do any secret or special funds exist which are at the disposal of the executive and for which he does not need to account?

140. With regard to the execution of the budget the questions are:

(a) Are the budgetary laws final decisions to make expenditures or merely authorizations within which the executive can make expenditure during the budget year? Under what conditions and by whom may transfers be made between the items of expenditure authorized in the budgetary laws? Stated more generally, to what extent can the executive control the actual execution of the budget within its over-all limits, on the basis of experience throughout the year, the actual rates of revenue collection as contrasted with the estimates, the possibilities of savings through more efficient operations, etc.? If a system of allotments, regular reports and current adjustments exists, what is the working of this system in practice? Does the budget authorization make any provision for reserves for contingencies or unforeseen expenditures?

(b) If there is a central department or agency which acts for or advises the central executive in the execution of the budget, what is the role and influence of this agency? Is its function purely retroactive or does it direct and supervise the current execution?

141. *Accounting and auditing practices.* With regard to this subject the following questions suggest themselves:

(a) What are the main characteristics of the governmental accounting system? To what extent are accounting practices uniform throughout the government, and to what extent are they centrally designed or controlled? If there is a central accounting agency, how is it organized and to what extent is it effective in providing an accounting scheme which can be on the one hand an effective tool for getting the government's work done, and on the other an adequate basis for ensuring accountability from the financial standpoint? Is it capable of devising special accounting schemes for special cases, e.g. development agencies, or does it only cover the accounting of general administration? What is the status of the central comptroller or Accountant-General in relation to the executive? to the individual departments? the legislature?

(b) What financial reports are regularly provided to assist the executive and the legislature in appraising the success of administration in so far as its legal and financial aspects are concerned? Are the principal accounting and financial reporting documents prepared in such a form as to be understandable to those who need to use them for administrative and control purposes — specifically, the department heads, the central executive and the legislative body?

(c) To what extent has cost accounting been developed and used for those segments of the government's work for which it is appropriate?

(d) How is accountability of officials determined and distributed? Is the responsibility of accountable officials regulated by law? Is their authority and are the facilities for control at their disposal sufficient for them to carry that responsibility? What are the consequences for them of losses through negligence or fraud of their subordinates, and of



unauthorized expenditures? Are such cases and the corrections applied made public? Is the restraining force of the regulations sufficient to prevent serious defalcations?

(e) What is the time factor in governmental accounting? For example, does the system provide for settlement and closing of governmental accounts without undue delay? Are accounts settled in a single central agency or by individual departments or services?

(f) Is the accounting function of the government clearly divorced from the post-auditing function, and are these responsibilities vested in different agencies or individuals? To what extent is an external audit provided under existing practices? Is this audit performed by an individual or agency, which is, in fact, completely independent of the executive branch and relatively secure from political and other pressures? How frequently are audit reports made, and are they made public?

142. *Procurement and property control.* With regard to this subject which is also related to the problem of administrative management, the following questions are proposed:

(a) What is the general situation in so far as the government's procurement activities are concerned? For example, in what measure is procurement left to individual departments and ministries on the one hand, or centralized in one agency on the other? If procurement is done both centrally and at the departmental level, how is the line drawn — on the basis of financial limits? Are certain ordinary supplies purchased in bulk and distributed by the government to the several services, offices and institutions? Does government enterprise produce part of its material requirements?

(b) To what extent are purchases made through a system of bids, and where bids are used, how does this method work in practice? Is there wide publicity? Are bids secret and competitive?

(c) With regard to construction and maintenance of public works such as roads, irrigation systems, public buildings and schools, bridges, are these functions performed by the governmental departments? By special public corporations? By private contractors? Regardless of the method, to what extent is the assessment or approval of these projects controlled from the point of view of standards of quality and cost?

(d) What is the government's approach to the control of government stores, supplies and property? Are there adequate records for this purpose? Is there a uniform approach to these matters, and perhaps supervision by a central agency, or are they left rather to individual departments and services with little or no central control?

#### Section 4. PUBLIC PERSONNEL

143. *The public service in broad outline.* In beginning an analysis of the national public service the investigator will wish first to have in mind

the general composition and characteristics of the body of public employees as a whole, with a special eye toward those features which may notably distinguish the service. He will wish to notice, for example, whether any significant proportion of the public employees come from a special socio-economic class, professional group, political party, or other special group; whether some kinds of public offices (e.g. at the tribal or village levels, as well as higher) are hereditary in certain families or are otherwise governed by strong factors of tradition.

144. Although the detailed analysis will be focused primarily on the appointed civil employees of the central government, one must also bear in mind the possible role and importance of elected officials at the several levels of government, and of such other differentiated groups as temporary and permanent employees, municipal and provincial employees, military and naval personnel, employees of public or quasi-public economic enterprises, employees coming from outside the country, part-time workers, etc. In the course of the more detailed study a continuing consideration of the interrelationships and mutual influences between such groups and the main body of public civil employees will be most desirable. A study of personnel practices in a particularly well-administered municipality or province, for example, may be very useful for purposes of comparison with conditions and practices at the national level. It may be productive, in some cases, to compare some aspects of recruitment or training for military personnel with the comparable activities in the civil service.

145. With regard to the most prominent elements of weakness or strength in personnel administration the measure of application of the merit system in recruitment and promotion first of all is a useful standard in evaluating the quality and stability of a civil service. Closely connected with this aspect is the security of tenure; especially the relative continuity of service under different political régimes and the relative absence of favouritism or nepotism in appointments and preferments. It all adds up to the question formulated before, as to how far the administrative personnel can be seen as an impartial and efficient tool of government at the service of any regularly constituted authority, whatever its political composition.

146. It must, of course, be recognized that the qualifications required at various levels, even in the best regulated civil service, depend on conditions that may be quite different in different countries; on the system of education and training, the available human resources, the simplicity or complexity of the administration itself. Furthermore, situations are possible where certain restrictions in recruitment as to class, or the hereditary character of certain functions, do not militate in an absolute sense against good government, because certain traditional qualities of honesty and devotion may compensate for the lack of general, competitive admittance. As long as such a system is not ossified and shows signs of continuous improvement in training and in wider selection, it may offer a more stable basis than can be guaranteed by too rapid reforms.

147. It should be even of more importance and usefulness, if possible, to obtain a general survey of the personnel structure in terms of the number and qualifications of civil servants employed by the various departments and services, at headquarters and in the field, and in the different ranks. From such a picture much can be learned about the availability of skilled and qualified personnel at the intermediate and higher levels; about the way in which the structure is adapted to a comparative scarcity of highly trained public servants; about the rationality of the various organizations as to numbers employed and total cost; and about the comparative emphasis on services in the directing and planning centre and in the operational periphery. Furthermore it should be observed whether there is a gradualness in the increase of remuneration for higher position or greater seniority, or whether some functions are much more highly rewarded than the average in the upper ranks. Such exceptional rewards may attract exceptionally able figures for managerial positions; they may also have been created for undue preferment of political favourites. A careful analysis of the entire range of salaries and of their distribution is of fundamental value for obtaining a clear conception of the personnel structure.

148. Related to these points is the matter of the general level of remuneration. Comparison should be made with the general standard of living and the salary and wage rates in private enterprises. Insufficiency of salaries, compelling civil servants to find additional sources of income, and its causes should be noted, such as inflation and inelasticity of scales of payment; habitual acceptance of irregular sources of income; depressed social position of certain groups of government servants. Inequalities between various groups of civilian (and military) personnel are another factor of importance in the general personnel situation.

149. A fourth group of problems has to do with the general character and composition of the public service. Wholly different aspects are represented by the stable, leisurely, somewhat formal and sometimes rather stagnant administration of certain older countries and the somewhat chaotic but at the same time dynamic conditions in services that are in the process of modernization and rejuvenation as a result of periods of rapid change or revolution in the political and social spheres. An analysis of the forces at the back of such different climates in public administration is of vital importance for its evaluation.

150. Finally the study of existing abuses and their origins, however interesting in itself, derives its main significance from its correlation with the political, social, and economic life of the country. Basically it is the place of the public administration in the value judgment of the citizenry, the public, which determines its quality and its methods. Reforms, though they can be initiated by a strong and purposeful government, acquire their sanction and their durability from a changing public opinion, establishing new standards for and making new demands upon the public service.

151. In the following pages of this section a number of detailed questions are formulated concerning the major technical aspects of personnel administration, which may offer guidance for the study of the actual situation.

152. *The constitutional and legal framework of the public service.* A consideration of the legal foundations and real conditions of a national public service raises the following questions:

(a) Is there, in a constitution or on the statute books, a unified set of laws for the governance of the main body of public employees, or are there scattered provisions, executive ordinances, etc., having the same effect? To what extent do any statutory provisions go into detail? What groups of public employees are not covered by these provisions?

(b) What is the general philosophy underlying this legislation and how is this philosophy reflected in the general position of the public service in the national society? To what extent does the legalist frame of mind pervade the public service and how does this influence the functioning of the service? Or is there a more or less general neglect of legal rules in considerable areas of the public service?

153. *Organization of personnel activities.* The question as to the location of authority and responsibility for carrying on or controlling personnel activities will be present, at least by implication, in most of this section; it may be useful, however, to draw attention to this matter as seen broadly in looking at the service as a whole. The most important questions are:

(a) If there is a central personnel agency of the type of a civil service commission or public service board or bureau, how is it composed, whence comes its authority and to whom is it responsible, what are its functions and to what extent are they supervisory or operative? Is it organized outside the ministerial departments or within one particular department, e.g. that of finance? What functions are decentralized to the ministerial departments and to subdivisions of the ministries? If the central agency serves as a board of appeals, what is its authority in this regard, how do cases reach it, etc.? If not, is there a separate board or agency for such appeals and how does it function in relation to the civil service agency?

(b) In countries where no over-all central agency of this type exists, is there a partial centralization of certain functions, as when central responsibility for payroll matters is vested in a finance ministry, appointing authority in the prime minister or the chief-of-state himself, etc.? What is, in broad terms, the degree of centralization in regard to who makes the rules governing personnel administration, who executes the rules, and who oversees or controls the execution of the rules?

154. *The influence of budgetary arrangements on personnel management.* Questions of budget administration *per se* are treated in the preceding section. Attention is drawn here, however, to a consideration of the ways in which budgetary practices may aid or hinder effective personnel administration. The following questions may be relevant:

(a) What are the respective roles of the central personnel agency, the central budget agency, and the operating ministries and subdivisions thereof in budgeting for personnel? How is co-ordination achieved as between personnel and budgetary functions? How detailed are the budget estimates in their provisions relating to personnel? How far do appropriation acts go in detailing posts, grades, salaries, etc.?

(b) More specifically, at what level are effective decisions taken as to the routine, small-scale creation and abolition of posts, etc.? To what extent is this matter firmly fixed by the budget or appropriation act or left to executive discretion within authorized appropriations, etc.?

(c) What special problems arise when circumstances make necessary a general reduction in the number of government employees, a "reduction in force"? What are the tenure rights of public employees or classes thereof; how are such factors as seniority taken into account, and how does the protection of employees' rights affect such a reduction?

155. *How are posts and employees grouped or classified?* The question of the way in which posts are grouped or classified and the matter of salaries are closely interrelated and in some countries may be viewed and dealt with as a single problem. Some of the general questions posed here may be phrased as follows:

(a) What are the methods and procedures by which the duties of jobs are fixed, compared, and related to the requirements of the service and the qualifications of individual employees? If the service is organized into broad classes and categories, what are the factors taken as bases for such divisions, and the principal distinctions among the groups in terms of entrance requirements, manner of admission, tenure rights, privileges, etc.?

(b) Within these larger classes to what extent are differences of rank and pay based on the duties performed, on the qualifications and abilities of the individuals, or on seniority? In how much detail are the individual jobs or occupational classes examined and described? What effect is given to the principle of "equal pay for equal work"? Are classifications or ratings subject to modification by a supervisor, the head of a ministry, a central official or agency, or the legislature itself?

156. *Salaries in government employment.* Here we are approaching what is in large measure the same problem treated briefly just above, but from the other end. The following questions are suggested:

(a) Who fixes salaries and by what criteria? To what extent are salaries rationally and uniformly related to the duties and responsibilities of individuals, or to their qualifications and abilities?

(b) Are there definite provisions for the adjustment of salaries to a changing cost of living, to conjugal status and number of dependants, to seniority in service? Are premiums for efficiency an element in the salary systems?

(c) Are there apparent discrepancies as among the departments or classes, or between salaries paid by the government, and those paid for similar work in special public enterprises or in private employment? Is there some special group (e.g. teachers, military personnel), with a separate salary system and rates, which exercises a special influence on other salary scales in the government?

(d) What important non-monetary benefits or perquisites do government employees receive? (It may be of interest here to try to form some estimate of the prestige of government service in the society generally and the role which this psychological factor may play in relation to existing salary levels as well as in relation to recruitment and other matters.)

(e) To what extent do government employees find it necessary to supplement their incomes? Are there large numbers of part-time workers or others who may hold more than one paid job within or outside the government? What is the extent of traditional extra-legal, or illegal methods of supplementing incomes and how would a general increase in government salary levels affect such practices?

(f) Can quantitative data be supplied which are of special interest as indices and for purposes of comparison? What, for example, are the extremes of government pay; the ratio of the highest to the lowest annual pay for full-time work? What is the relation of the total governmental payroll to the national income?

157. *Pensions.* The absence or presence of a pension plan is of obvious significance in connexion with the development of a "career" attitude, the problem of retiring older employees who are no longer able to contribute fully, etc. The main questions would be:

(a) Is such a plan related to any general national social security scheme? What provisions guarantee the security of pensions (e.g. actuarial control, special funds, etc.)? Has the pension scheme survived any periods of major monetary inflation and in what way?

(b) What are the conditions of entitlement for the granting of pensions? How are pensions related to length of service, salary, or other factors? Is the plan contributory or not? Is there a compulsory retirement age? Is the entitlement protected in law? What provisions are extended to widows and surviving children?

158. *Recruitment and appointment.* It may be helpful to think of the recruitment process, defined in the broad sense, as taking place in three successive stages: attraction, selection and appointment.

159. In many countries the first of these may be largely explained in terms of the factors of salary, perquisites, and especially prestige, to which some attention has already been given. In any case, however, it will be well to consider whether the sum of such factors is sufficient to attract, in adequate numbers, the best qualified people for the various kinds of government jobs, and to ascertain what special measures are taken to accomplish this particular objective.

160. In the matter of employee selection, the relevant questions will be:

(a) Are elements of objective comparison and of competition on pertinent bases introduced into this process for the various categories of employment, and if so, how and to what extent? To what extent are definite qualifications given simply or primarily in terms of levels of formal education? To what degree is comparison or competition organized through written or oral examinations, formal review of qualifications by committees, etc.? Do examinations simply qualify or do they result in ranked lists of eligible candidates?

(b) To what extent and into which levels are outsiders appointed to vacancies occurring in the service? How is this practice related to the promotion system?

(c) To what extent do extraneous factors or pressures condition the appointment process? Are any groups of the population barred, or especially favoured, as such — e.g., minorities, ethnic groups, aliens, sons of government employees, veterans, women, etc.? What categories of jobs are exempted from any standard selection procedures, as, for example, in the case of appointments having an acknowledged political basis? To what extent are special appointments of any kind possible and actual?

161. The induction or appointment process proper merits at least a glance with an eye for the location of the actual authority for appointment, the nature of the procedures involved, the question whether initial appointments are temporary and probationary, etc.

162. Finally there may be special problems to be noted. An example is the situation created especially in some former colonial areas where non-local people are found in appreciable numbers in the public service, or where past participation in the struggle for independence constitutes a priority for appointment. Another group of special problems is connected with regional differences, e.g., restriction of recruitment to people of a certain regional extraction, required knowledge of a regional language, etc.

163. *Training.* From the over-all point of view, the investigator will wish to discover the general relation between training, including various stages of formal education, and jobs in the public service. The following questions are suggested:

(a) In what measure does the educational system provide the number and kinds of trained persons needed by the government? What is the relation of various kinds of specialized training — for example, in such fields as forestry and engineering — to jobs in the government service; particularly in regard to content, costs, and degree of governmental control?

(b) What, if any, is the nature of organized academic training in such fields as the social sciences, business administration, and public administration? Do non-governmental organizations — for example, professional associations or societies — make a significant contribution to the improved training or skill of groups of public servants?

(c) Does the government provide any assistance to outstanding young persons who are financially unable to get the kind of education or training which government service requires? Does it give assistance or preference to those who are outstanding in primary or secondary school work, looking toward their further education and eventful qualification for the government service?

(d) To what extent has in-service training been recognized as an essential or useful part of governmental management? Is any recognition given to the special importance of supervisory training? Of orientation of new employees? Of training in standard work methods and procedures? Of training in administrative or staff functions such as personnel, finance, methods improvement? Has the government a programme for granting leaves of absence or financial assistance to young public servants in order to allow them to complete or improve their formal education? Where the training for the civil service is only in its initial stages, is sufficient attention given to general education and basic all-round training for prospective government employees, or is specialization promoted at the expense of such general, basic training?

164. *Promotions.* Promotion policies and practices are hardly less important than recruitment in determining the quality of the public service. In arriving at the answer to the general question "How are promotions decided and by whom?" the following more detailed queries may be helpful:

(a) What weight is given to efficiency? To seniority? To political affiliation? To what extent are elements of comparison or competition introduced through examinations, committees or boards, etc.? Are there recognized "lines of promotion", promotion lists or registers, provisions for annual or periodic salary increases, or other arrangements which might foster or consolidate a "career" service? Is it possible to form a quantitative impression as to the relative numbers of employees at various levels who have actually remained in the service for given numbers of years?

(b) To what extent does promotion take place across divisional and departmental lines? Is there competition among the departments for exceptionally able personnel? Is there any systematic control or rationalization of such transfers by a higher authority?

165. *Evaluation of personnel.* Bearing in mind that supervisors in any organization inevitably form some qualitative judgments about their subordinates, the attempt here is to learn to what extent this process is recognized and systematized and how the system works.

Are there regular written evaluations and what is their nature and ostensible purpose? Is each employee appraised by more than one supervisor? To what extent is the employee informed, and does he have a recognized right to appeal? To what extent is any formal system of evaluation actually used (as in connexion with promotions, transfers, training on the job, etc.)?



166. *Discipline, demotion, dismissal.* Under this heading, attention is first directed to the rules and procedures involved in disciplinary actions:

What penalties are authorized for what offences? Who can initiate disciplinary action and what procedural guarantees exist, as in provisions for prior investigation, formal appeal to a special board or through the regular courts?

167. Apart from questions of discipline, it is convenient here to draw attention to the problems connected with the removal of staff for other than disciplinary reasons, especially for reasons of inefficiency or incompetence:

How much administrative freedom exists in this regard, and to what extent is there an actual weeding out of the less competent individuals? On the other hand, to what extent do such dismissals take place for reasons of mere political or personal convenience, and how is the employee protected from arbitrary or capricious administrative action? Are there legal provisions barring dismissal on religious, political or similar grounds?

168. *Employee associations.* The following questions seem appropriate:

To what extent have government employees organized in unions and associations to advance their own interests? What is the relation of such organizations to the governmental administration, and how are they related to, or distinguished from, associations of private employees? Is membership compulsory for some categories of employees? What is the legal and factual situation with regard to the right to strike? What is the effective role of the associations in connexion with:

(a) Direct participation in the development and execution of personnel policies through joint committees, appeal boards, etc.;

(b) Indirect influence on governmental administration and general government policy;

(c) Education and training of members for professional advancement?

169. *General measures for employee welfare.* Although some attention has already been given to the general question of perquisites and benefits, one may be reminded here that such privileges (or rights) may be of appreciable significance in relation to employee satisfaction and morale. It is worthwhile noting the situation with respect to health insurance or medical services; special recreational or educational facilities; tax exemptions or payments in kind; leave for vacations, in case of maternity, and in case of sickness, indemnification for injuries sustained in the service; provisions for housing, etc. Some comparison between the government service and private employment in this regard would also be useful.

Section 5. ADMINISTRATIVE MANAGEMENT

170. Various points related to administrative management have already been discussed in section 2 on government organization, and elsewhere. In order to complete the survey for this subject, the following summarization may be useful.

171. The first group concerns the existing legislation:

(a) Have the various laws and basic regulations dealing with administrative management been brought together in usable form; perhaps in one comprehensive code or collection with a workable index? Are such laws and regulations easy to change and improve or difficult to amend? How are desirable changes of organization effected and integrated with the existing structure? Are most of the necessary adjustments within the jurisdiction of the executive, or do they usually or often require legislative sanction, or even changes in the constitution?

(b) Are the laws and regulations clearly defined and understood by the officials concerned? How are conflicting regulations avoided? Is sufficient publicity given to administrative provisions of general organizational interest or of interest to the public personnel? What is the grade of conformity of actual practice to the legal or administrative prescriptions?

172. The second group of questions has to do with the existing machinery for co-ordination in various fields:

(a) What are the methods used and the results obtained in seeking co-ordination of the various departments and branches of the executive? Is there a rational system of inter-departmental or inter-service committees, at the cabinet level or lower? How is their membership organized? Do they possess effective permanent secretariats? Are informal channels of communication and co-ordination between departments, possibly at intermediate and technical levels, of particular importance for a co-ordinated administration? To what extent does the rigidity of bureaucratic channels obstruct co-ordination?

(b) Is there a point at which all draft legislation emanating from individual ministries or services is cleared? What are the powers and functions of such an agency with regard to form and substance of the legislation? Is there a central budgeting agency? Is the budget used as a tool for measuring the factual relationship between the government's activities and the various objects of expenditure? Is there a conscious effort to ascertain the general pattern of distribution of expenditures between major functions and activities, and between various objects, such as personal service, equipment and supplies, construction and maintenance of public works, public debt service, etc.?

(c) Is personnel management co-ordinated by one central agency? Does such an agency pay particular attention to the relationship of personnel regulations in general and the requirements of the various administrative organizations? Does it give assistance to new administrative units in designing their personnel structure?

(d) Are the central accounting and auditing agencies used for organizational development? Is there sufficient flexibility in their methods and regulations to adapt their functions to new forms of governmental activity?

(e) Are there one or more outstandingly well-managed sections of the executive branch which are recognized as examples of good administrative management? What special features and lessons do they offer for the improvement of other branches of the service? What is the reason for their excellence (their novel character, influence of certain individuals, interest of the public or of political parties, liberal financing of remunerative projects, etc.)?

173. The question then arises whether administrative management as such has received organized attention:

(a) To what extent has machinery been established for helping the executive in his over-all responsibility for improving administrative management? If there are special agencies or offices for this purpose, what is their character and influence? Are they permanent or temporary? How are new departments, ministries or primary services established and organized in the early stages? Does the machinery for administrative management provide central advice and assistance based on experience with other new agencies? How and where is such a central agency for administrative management organized and what are its relations to the various departments and to the central agencies mentioned in the preceding paragraph?

(b) Has the value of a central agency devoted to improving "organization and methods", particularly in activities which are common throughout the government, been recognized, and if so with what results? Do individual departments and ministries have their own machinery for stimulating and assisting with improvement of organization and methods?

174. Finally, the extent to which reform and improvement in public administration has caught the public interest and has become or will become a lively political issue, is important for the evaluation of the possibilities of effectively organizing administrative management. The investigator will want to know whether it is generally understood, particularly within the public services, that such co-ordination of co-ordinating agencies and efforts can only be valuable and even essential if it is recognized, not as an aim in itself, but as a method for the better and more effective accomplishment of the government programmes. He should equally be aware of the interests, both political and otherwise, opposed to such a co-ordinated development of administrative reforms, of the forces in favour of them, and of the motives and arguments on both sides.

175. The inquiry into those parts of the administration which are employed more dynamically on development and reform of the public administration itself leads to the separate consideration of the organization of the planning function.

Section 6. PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT

176. The planning function, as conceived here, is taken to include, essentially:

- (a) The organization of planning as an element of public administration.
- (b) Planning especially directed toward development and reform of the public administration. This activity is often thought of as a part of administrative management.
- (c) Planning for economic and social development.
- (d) The function of public administration in the implementation of plans.

177. The extent to which a given country has accepted and put into practice the concept of advance planning will be roughly measured in such questions as the following:

- (a) Has the responsibility for planning been left entirely within the several ministries or departments?
- (b) Are informal or partial efforts made to combine or co-ordinate the plans of a few more or less unrelated ministries?
- (c) Is there some central agency or machinery for putting together more comprehensive and co-ordinated plans?

178. Where organization for planning has progressed beyond the most elementary stage, a number of further questions come to the fore:

(a) What degree of co-ordination among the various categories of plans is achieved, and by what means? Is due consideration given to the inescapable interrelationships among plans for public construction, social welfare programmes, training and educational programmes, anticipated revenues, re-organization or expansion of the governmental establishment, etc.? How has the planning process been brought into relationship with the budgeting process?

(b) What is the nature of the participation at the several levels of the planning process? To what extent and how are local plans and projects assimilated into regional and national schemes, and what part do the lesser units play in the execution?

(c) What relationships exist between government planning and the plans of private business and other non-governmental organizations? What attempts are made to obtain the interest and support of the general public through the publication and dissemination of information about government plans? What is the role and degree of participation of the legislature in the planning process? Does the legislature, for example, occasionally take decisions on long-range projects, apart from its action on the annual budget?

179. In regard to the formulation and, especially, the execution or enforcement of plans:

(a) To what extent is the responsibility for execution left in the hands of the established departments?

(b) What part is played by regulatory agencies of the government in such fields as transportation, communication, power, water supply, etc.?

(c) Has a special role been assigned to one or more public corporations? In what ways are they independent, and in what ways under the control of the government?

180. Where new agencies have already been established, the prevailing distribution of planning and execution functions as among both the older departments and the new bodies may have to be carefully examined with an eye to such questions as the following:

(a) Which of the older agencies or their branches can be merged with the newer developmental bodies?

(b) Which of the controls and co-ordinating functions of the top executive or auxiliary administrative agencies (dealing with finance, personnel, etc.) may be incorporated into the work of the developmental agencies, as their programme develops?

(c) Which of the developmental agencies have demonstrated the need and capacity for continued administrative independence?

181. In some countries the public construction programme of the government may have been among the first subjects for planning. It will, in any case, play an important role in any broader programme of economic development. Some essential questions are:

Does public works planning take the form of capital budgeting over a sufficient period of time? Are proper accounting practices followed with regard to depreciation over an appropriate period of years, separation of maintenance and repair costs from original capital costs? Are long-term provisions made for capital funds for replacement?

182. Successful planning in any field rests upon a prior and continuing collection of all possible relevant information. In connexion with plans for economic development, it will be pertinent to ask:

(a) What is the extent and effectiveness of the organizational arrangements for carrying out geological and soil surveys, engineering surveys for possible highway routes, hydroelectric development, etc., market surveys?

(b) To what extent are reliable statistics available in such fields as: (i) agricultural and industrial production, employment, prices, foreign trade, balance of payments, banking, credit, transportation, government revenue, expenditure and debt? (ii) distributive shares of the national income showing figures for wages, interest, investment? (iii) demographic and social statistics showing births, death, morbidity, migration, literacy, level of education, general and technical?

183. In connexion with plans for administrative development the following questions arise:

What information is maintained as to the costs of the public service; salaries, age in relation to grade and employment turnover in the public personnel establishment, as well as rates of recruitment and training?

184. Are there arrangements to assemble information in the following categories which may provide some indices of progress and development over a period of years:

Infant mortality and average life span, literacy and average number of years of schooling; *per capita* income, family incomes, and percentage of national income ploughed back into investment; average calorie consumption and amount of horsepower being added to manpower. To what degree are these statistics brought together in a central agency or through established procedures? What is the situation in regard to the comparability and continuity of these statistics from year to year and internationally?

# SALES AGENTS FOR UNITED NATIONS PUBLICATIONS

## ARGENTINA

Editorial Sudamericana S.A., Calle Alsina 500, Buenos Aires.

## AUSTRALIA

H. A. Goddard (Pty.), Ltd., 235a George Street, Sydney, N.S.W.

## BELGIUM

Agence et Messageries de la Presse S.A., 14-22 rue du Persil, Bruxelles.  
W. H. Smith & Son  
71-75 Boulevard Adolphe-Max, Bruxelles.

## BOLIVIA

Librería Científica y Literaria, Avenida 16 de Julio 216, Casilla 972, La Paz.

## BRAZIL

Livraria Agr. Rua Mexico 98-B, Caixa Postal 3291, Rio de Janeiro.

## CANADA

The Ryerson Press, 299 Queen Street West, Toronto.

## Ceylon

The Associated Newspapers of Ceylon, Ltd., Lake House, Colombo.

## CHILE

Librería Ivens, Calle Moneda 822, Santiago.

## CHINA

The Commercial Press, Ltd., 211 Nanan Road, Shanghai.

## COLOMBIA

Librería Latina Ltda., Apartado Aéreo 4011, Bogotá.

## COSTA RICA

Trejos Hermanos, Apartado 1313, San José.

## CUBA

La Casa Belga, René de Smedt, O'Reilly 455, La Habana.

## CZECHOSLOVAKIA

F. Topic, Narodní Trida 9, Praha 1.

## DENMARK

Einar Munksgaard, Nørregade 6, København.

## DOMINICAN REPUBLIC

Librería Dominicana, Calle Mercedes No. 49, Apartado 656, Ciudad Trujillo.

## ECUADOR

Muñoz Hermanos y Cía., Plaza del Teatro, Quito.

## EGYPT

Librairie "La Renaissance d'Egypte," 9 SH. Adly Pasha, Cairo.

## ETHIOPIA

Agence Ethiopienne de Publicité, Box B, Addis-Abeba.

## FINLAND

Akatemiinen Kirjakauppa, 2, Keskuskatu, Helsinki.

## FRANCE

Editions A. Pedone, 13, rue Soufflot, Paris V.

## GREECE

"Eleftheroudakis," Librairie Internationale, Place de la Constitution, Athènes.

## GUATEMALA

Goubaud & Cia. Ltda., Sa. Sur No. 6 y 9a. C.P., Guatemala.

## HAITI

Max Bouchereau, Librairie "A la Coravelle," Boite postale 111-B, Port-au-Prince.

## ICELAND

Bokaverzlun Sigfusar Eymundssonar Austurstreti 18, Reykjavik.

## INDIA

Oxford Book & Stationery Co., Scindia House, New Delhi.

## INDONESIA

Jojosan Pembangunan, Gunung Sahari 84, Jakarta.

## IRAQ

Mackenzie's Bookshop, Booksellers and Stationers, Baghdad.

## IRELAND

Hibernian General Agency Ltd., Commercial Buildings, Dame Street, Dublin.

## ISRAEL

Leo Blumstein, P.O.B. 4154  
35 Allenby Road, Tel-Aviv.

## ITALY

Colibri S.A., Via Chiasso 14, Milano.

## LEBANON

Librairie universelle, Beyrouth.

## LUXEMBOURG

Librairie J. Schummer, Place Guillaume, Luxembourg.

## NETHERLANDS

N.V. Martinus Nijhoff, Lange Voorhout 9, 's-Gravenhage.

## NEW ZEALAND

United Nations Association of New Zealand, G.P.O. 1011, Wellington.

## NORWAY

Johan Grundt Tanum Forlag, Kr. Augustgt. 7A, Oslo.

## PAKISTAN

Thomas & Thomas, Fort Mansion, First Road, Karachi.

## PERU

Librería Internacional del Perú, S.A., Casilla 1417, Lima.

## PHILIPPINES

D. P. Pérez Co., 132 Riverside, San Juan, Rizal.

## PORTUGAL

Livraria Rodrigues 186, Rua Aurea, 18 Lisboa.

## SWEDEN

C. E. Fritze's Kungl. Hofbokhandel Å Fredsgatan 2, Stockholm.

## SWITZERLAND

Librairie Payot S.A., Lausanne, Genève.  
Buchhandlung Hans Rauhhardt  
Kirchgasse, 17, Zurich 1.

## SYRIA

Librairie Universelle, Damas.

## THAILAND

Promuan Mit Ltd., 333 Charoen Krung Road, Bangkok.

## TURKEY

Librairie Hachette, 469 Istiklal Caddesi Beyoğlu, Istanbul.

## UNION OF SOUTH AFRICA

Van Schaik's Bookstore (Pty.), Ltd.  
P.O. Box 724, Pretoria.

## UNITED KINGDOM

H.M. Stationery Office, P. O. Box 657 London, S.E. 1 (and at H.M.S.O. Shops at London, Belfast, Birmingham, Cardiff, Edinburgh, and Manchester).

## UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

International Documents Service, Columbia University Press, 2960 Broadway, New York 27, New York.

## URUGUAY

Oficina de Representación de Editoriales Prof. Héctor D'Elia, Av. 18 de Julio 1330 Esc. 1, Montevideo.

## VENEZUELA

Escritorio Pérez Machado, Conde a Pifanço 11, Caracas.

## YUGOSLAVIA

Drzavno Produzeca Jugoslavenska Knjizarska Marsala Tita 23-11, Beograd.

*United Nations publications can further be obtained from the following booksellers:*

### IN AUSTRIA

B. Wüllerstorff  
Waagplatz, 4  
SALZBURG.

### IN GERMANY

Buchhandlung Ewert & Meurer  
Hauptstrasse, 101  
BERLIN — Schöneberg.

### IN GERMANY (continued)

W. E. Saarbach  
Frankenstrasse, 14  
KOELN — Junkersdorf.

Alexander Horn  
Spiegelgasse, 9  
WIESBADEN.

### IN JAPAN

Maruzen Company, Ltd.,  
6 Tori-Nichome Nihonbashi  
TOKYO Central.

### IN SPAIN

Organización Técnica de  
Publicidad y Ediciones  
Sainz de Baranda 24 — MADRID.

### IN SPAIN (continued)

Librería Bosch  
11 Ronda Universidad  
BARCELONA.

Orders and inquiries from countries where sales agents have not yet been appointed may be sent to: Sales and Circulation Section, United Nations, New York, U.S.A.; or Sales Section, United Nations Office, Palais des Nations, Geneva, Switzerland.

Price: 50 cents (U.S.)  
(or equivalent in other currencies)

Printed in U.S.A.  
19896 - December 1951 - 4000

United Nations publication  
Sales No.: 1951.II.B.7