

Security Council

PROVISIONAL

S/PV.3313 12 November 1993

ENGLISH

PROVISIONAL VERBATIM RECORD OF THE THREE THOUSAND THREE HUNDRED AND THIRTEENTH MEETING

Held at Headquarters, New York, on Friday, 12 November 1993, at 3.30 p.m.

President: Mr. JESUS

Members: Brazil China Djibouti France Hungary Japan Morocco New Zealand Pakistan Russian Federation Spain United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland United States of America

Venezuela

(Cape Verde)

Mr. SARDENBERG Mr. CHENG Jingye Mr. OLHAYE Mr. MERIMEE Mr. ERDÖS Mr. MARUYAMA Mr. BELLOUKI Mr. ADANK Mr. MARKER Mr. SIDOROV Mr. YAÑEZ BARNUEVO Sir David HANNAY Mr. GREY Mr. TAYLHARDAT

This record contains the original text of speeches delivered in English and interpretations of speeches in the other languages. The final text will be printed in the <u>Official Records of the Security Council</u>.

Corrections should be submitted to original speeches only. They should be sent under the signature of a member of the delegation concerned, <u>within one</u> <u>week</u>, to the Chief, Official Records Editing Section, Office of Conference Services, room DC2-794, 2 United Nations Plaza, and incorporated in a copy of the record.

93-87165 (E)

The meeting was called to order at 5.55 p.m.

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The agenda was adopted.

THE SITUATION RELATING TO NAGORNY KARABAKH

LETTER DATED 26 OCTOBER 1993 FROM THE CHARGE D'AFFAIRES A.I. OF THE PERMANENT MISSION OF AZERBAIJAN TO THE UNITED NATIONS ADDRESSED TO THE PRESIDENT OF THE SECURITY COUNCIL (S/26647)

LETTER DATED 27 OCTOBER 1993 FROM THE PERMANENT REPRESENTATIVE OF TURKEY TO THE UNITED NATIONS ADDRESSED TO THE PRESIDENT OF THE SECURITY COUNCIL (S/26650)

LETTER DATED 28 OCTOBER 1993 FROM THE DEPUTY PERMANENT REPRESENTATIVE OF THE ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF IRAN TO THE UNITED NATIONS ADDRESSED TO THE PRESIDENT OF THE SECURITY COUNCIL (S/26662)

The PRESIDENT: I should like to inform the Council that I have received letters from the representatives of Armenia, Azerbaijan, the Islamic of Iran and Turkey in which they request to be invited to participate in the discussion of the item on the Council's agenda. In conformity with the usual practice, I propose, with the consent of the Council, to invite those representatives to participate in the discussion without the right to vote, in accordance with the relevant provisions of the Charter and rule 37 of the Council's provisional rules of procedure.

There being no objection, it is so decided.

At the invitation of the President, Mr. Aliyev (Azerbaijan) took a place at the Council table; Mr. Arzoumanian (Armenia), Mr. Kharrazi (Islamic Republic of Iran) and Mr. Batu (Turkey) took the places reserved for them at the side of the Council Chamber.

<u>The PRESIDENT</u>: The Security Council will now begin its consideration of the item on its agenda.

The Security Council is meeting in response to the requests contained in the following documents: S/26647, letter dated

(<u>The President</u>)

26 October 1993 from the Chargé d'affaires a.i. of the Permanent Mission of Azerbaijan to the United Nations addressed to the President of the Security Council; S/26650, letter dated 27 October 1993 from the Permanent Representative of Turkey to the United Nations addressed to the President of the Security Council; and S/26662, letter dated 28 October 1993 from the Deputy Permanent Representative of the Islamic Republic of Iran to the United Nations addressed to the President of the Security Council.

Members of the Council have before them document S/26719, which contains the text of a draft resolution prepared in the course of the Council's prior consultations.

I should like to draw the attention of the members of the Council to the following other documents: S/26589, S/26595, S/26602, S/26615, S/26637, S/26647, S/26657, S/26658, S/26682 and S/26693, letters dated 15, 18, 19, 21, 26, 27 and 28 October and 2 and 4 November 1993, respectively, from the Chargé d'affaires a.i. of the Permanent Mission of Azerbaijan to the United Nations addressed to the President of the Security Council; S/26612, S/26643 and S/26645, letters dated 21, 26 and 27 October 1993, respectively, from the Permanent Representative of Armenia to the United Nations addressed to the President of the Security Council; S/26665, letter dated 28 October 1993 from the Permanent Representative of Turkey to the United Nations addressed to the President of the Security Council; S/26674, letter dated 29 October 1993 from the Chargé d'affaires a.i. of the Permanent Mission of Azerbaijan to the United Nations addressed to the Secretary-General; and S/26718, letter dated 9 November 1993 from the Permanent Representative of Italy to the United Nations, transmitting the text of a letter of the same date from the

(<u>The President</u>)

Chairman-in-Office of the CSCE Minsk Conference on Nagorny Karabakh addressed to the President of the Security Council.

Members of the Council have received photocopies of letters dated 11 and 12 November 1993, respectively, from the Permanent Representatives of Belgium and Italy to the United Nations addressed to the President of the Security Council, which will be issued as documents S/26728 and S/26732.

It is my understanding that the Council is ready to proceed to the vote on the draft resolution before it. Unless I hear any objection, I shall take it that that is the case.

There being no objection, it is so decided.

Before putting the draft resolution to the vote, I shall call on those members of the Council who wish to make statements before the voting.

Mr. MARKER (Pakistan): My delegation remains gravely concerned over the situation in the Azerbaijani Republic resulting from the aggression against its territory. The Council must take immediate cognizance of the latest offensive launched by the Armenian forces and the occupation of the Azerbaijani districts of Djebrail, Fizuli, Zangelan and Kubatli. Not only does this constitute a violation of the sovereignty and territorial integrity of a Member State of the United Nations, but the aggression has also resulted in a colossal humanitarian tragedy, forcing more than 60,000 local inhabitants to flee their homes and seek refuge in neighbouring countries. The situation thus constitutes a threat to the peace and security of the region.

We commend the efforts made by the Chairman-in-Office the Minsk Group of the Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe (CSCE) to find a peaceful solution to the conflict, and express the hope that the Security Council's adoption of the draft resolution before it will strengthen the CSCE process. We appeal to all

(<u>Mr. Marker, Pakistan</u>)

parties to refrain from any action that will exacerbate the conflict and to engage sincerely in negotiations towards reaching a just, equitable and lasting solution.

My delegation supports the draft resolution before the Council but would have preferred to see it include an expression of the Council's intention to take further appropriate steps of the resolutions of the Council continue to be defied.

It is my delegation's sincere hope that the draft resolution that the Council will be considering will lead to the immediate cessation of hostilities, the withdrawal from all occupied territories of Azerbaijan, and full respect for the cease-fire and for the territorial integrity of the Azerbaijani Republic.

The PRESIDENT: I shall now put to the vote the draft resolution contained in document S/26719.

A vote was taken by show of hands.

<u>In favour</u>: Brazil, Cape Verde, China, Djibouti, France, Hungary, Japan, Morocco, New Zealand, Pakistan, Russian Federation, Spain, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America, Venezuela

<u>The PRESIDENT</u>: There were 15 votes in favour. The draft resolution has been adopted unanimously as resolution 884 (1993).

I shall now call on those members of the Council who wish to make statements following the voting.

Mr. GREY (United States of America): My Government's support for this resolution rests on a simple premise: where cease-fires are continually violated and the ensuing violence escalates far beyond any conceivable military necessity, innocent civilians on both sides of the conflict suffer more and more. This resolution rightly lays blame for this appalling situation on both the parties - the party that initiated this round of cease-fire

(<u>Mr. Grey, United States</u>)

violations and the party that responded out of all proportion to the violation itself.

These acts are difficult to comprehend when one considers that civilians on both sides of the conflict are the victims of policies that clothe themselves in the justification of defending these very same civilians.

There is a way out. It is offered by the Minsk process and the tireless efforts of the Minsk Group, which has fashioned a framework by which a cease-fire can be stabilized and negotiations undertaken. But this kind of progress takes political will and a realization that continued bloodshed serves no one's good. We call on the parties to awaken to that realization and exert the will to choose peace.

<u>Mr. MERIMEE</u> (France) (interpretation from French): My Government is seriously concerned at the recent resumption of hostilities between the parties involved in the Nagorny Karabakh conflict and by the occupation of the Zangelan district, which has led to the forced displacement of tens of thousands of persons, thus making the civilian population of the region suffer even more.

These events deserve to be most vigorously condemned. The Council has just done that unambiguously by adopting this resolution.

The acquisition of territory by force is inadmissible and doing so for the purposes of negotiation cannot be countenanced.

We demand the immediate cessation of armed hostilities, the unilateral withdrawal of occupying forces from the Zangelan district and the withdrawal from other recently occupied areas of the Azerbaijani Republic in accordance with the adjusted timetable of the Minsk Group.

It behoves the parties concerned to demonstrate their readiness to refrain from recourse to the use of force and their

(<u>Mr. Mérimée, France</u>)

genuine commitment to a negotiated settlement, in particular by means of the adoption of a unilateral cease-fire declaration and by participating constructively in the negotiations under way within the framework of the Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe (CSCE).

In approving the Declaration of the nine members of the Minsk Group adopted on 4 November 1993 in Vienna, the Council is again expressing its full support for the sustained efforts of the CSCE and firmly charging the parties to continue, in this framework, their discussions with a view to the convening of the Minsk Conference as early as possible.

I wish in conclusion to stress my Government's deep concern at the effects that the continuation of the conflict is having on the humanitarian situation. My delegation welcomes the appeal the Council is making today for increased humanitarian assistance to the civilian populations of the region and recalls its insistence on ensuring that such assistance is guaranteed free access.

<u>Mr. SIDOROV</u> (Russian Federation) (interpretation from Russian): The Russian Federation is seriously concerned at the escalation of the Nagorny Karabakh conflict, which is the result of local violations of the cease-fire and the excesses in the use of force in response to those violations, which have had catastrophic consequences for tens of thousands of Azerbaijani refugees.

The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation immediately called on the Karabakh units to cease the offensive and to withdraw their forces to their initial positions. We undertook efforts designed to settle the existing situation on the basis of a joint statement by Azerbaijan, Nagorny Karabakh and Armenia which would have provided for the restoration and continuation of the cease-fire, an investigation of the origin of those incidents that led to the resumption of military hostilities, and the withdrawal

(<u>Mr. Sidorov, Russian Federation</u>)

of the Karabakh forces to the positions that they occupied prior to 21 October.

The Russian Federation takes a positive views of the decisions of the recently concluded Vienna meeting of the Minsk Group of the Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe (CSCE) on Nagorny Karabakh, in which it actively participated, and believes that the parties will heed them.

We hope that the resolution adopted today by the Security Council will be an important, and this time clearly understood, signal that the international community will no longer tolerate the continuation of bloodshed and the ever-more-dangerous escalation of the conflict.

We attach great importance to the demand contained in the resolution for immediately resuming of the cease-fire which was established earlier as a result of direct contacts and with the assistance of the Russian Federation, and for making it effective and permanent. Russia considers as a high-priority objective the achievement of a total cease-fire and the cessation of military actions and the establishment of machinery which with maximum reliability would guarantee that such actions would not be resumed. It is focusing its efforts precisely on this objective.

(<u>Mr. Sidorov, Russian Federation</u>)

We are firmly convinced that a lasting cessation of armed hostilities would create the proper atmosphere for successfully advancing the peace process and promoting a comprehensive political settlement of the conflict through negotiations within the context of the Minsk Group.

In conclusion, I should like once again to express my heartfelt hope that the Security Council's appeal will at last be heeded and that it will receive the right response. The Russian Federation, for its part, will make its best efforts to ensure that that happens.

Mr. ERDÖS (Hungary) (interpretation from French): In voting for resolution 884 (1993), Hungary wished to express its serious concern over the continuing conflict in Nagorny Karabakh and the continuation of tension between Armenia and Azerbaijan. The Council has every reason to take up this matter because this crisis - which, despite the efforts to settle it, seems in no way to be losing its intensity - is likely to jeopardize peace and security throughout the region.

In this context, Hungary welcomes the declaration by the nine members of the Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe (CSCE) Minsk Group, and gives its full support to the peace process that the Group is pursuing.

We should like to stress how important is the reaffirmation, in the resolution that has just been adopted, of the sovereignty and territorial integrity of the Azerbaijani Republic and of all other States in the region, as well as the resolution's reaffirmation of the inadmissibility of the use of force for the acquisition of territory.

We should also like to highlight the position set out in the Minsk Group's declaration of 4 November last, that the occupation

(<u>Mr. Erdös, Hungary</u>)

of territory cannot be used to try to obtain international recognition or to impose a change of legal status.

In this respect, the Council must also take account of the importance of ensuring respect by all those concerned for the principles that it is setting out in its resolutions and the warnings they contain. Otherwise, the stands taken by the international community will hardly be considered to be expressions of a real will to prevent problems or to act, or as demonstrations of a serious, credible commitment to maintain the peace and everything necessary to contain a contagion that has lately begun to spread with appalling intensity in several regions of the world.

The process of achieving a settlement in the region can be supported only on the basis of the Minsk Group's adjusted timetable and by the withdrawal of the occupying forces from all the occupied areas. In addition, the international community's efforts to achieve a negotiated settlement must be based on a real political will and a constructive attitude by the parties to the conflict.

We hope that the protagonists on the basis of the inviolability of international frontiers and respect for, and protection of, the legitimate rights of national minorities and ethnic communities, will act in a spirit of great responsibility not only to restore peace and stability but also to ensure that the peoples of the region enjoy a natural and harmonious coexistence.

Sir David HANNAY (United Kingdom): The British Government is deeply disturbed by the new upsurge in fighting around Nagorny Karabakh and the consequent further wave of refugees, and we call on all States to allow the free transit of humanitarian aid to those in need.

It is vital that the cease-fire now be reinstated and be formally extended. The maximum restraint is needed on all sides; without it there is a clear risk of further escalation of the (Sir David Hannay, United Kingdom)

fighting. Violation of the sovereignty and territorial integrity of the Azerbaijani Republic, and of all other States in the region, must cease, as this and previous resolutions have made clear.

We look to all parties to adopt a positive approach to the Minsk Group negotiations, and in particular to accept the Minsk Group's new package proposal by the deadline of 22 November.

The British Government fully endorses the declaration of the Minsk Group's nine "neutral members" accompanying the revised package. It is clear that acceptance of this timetable is a necessary first step to implement the earlier Security Council resolutions.

As the declaration itself specifies, all issues not dealt with in the timetable, including the status of Nagorny Karabakh, will be decided with the agreement of the parties concerned through the negotiations at the Minsk Conference.

All parties in the region have now said that they want to settle the conflict by peaceful means. Now is the time for them to take concrete steps to show that this is the case.

Mr. SARDENBERG (Brazil): Since the adoption of Security Council resolution 822 (1993) last April the situation that has arisen out of the dispute concerning Nagorny Karabakh has continued to deteriorate. Regrettably, the area affected by the fighting has steadily expanded, and tensions remain high between Armenia and Azerbaijan, despite occasional positive signs on the political side, signs that have so far proved insufficient to break the vicious circle of mutual recriminations following, or followed by military offensives and counter-offensives.

Brazil remains deeply concerned, especially over the precarious humanitarian situation prevailing in the region. As in relation to conflicts in other areas of the world, it is imperative that full attention be paid to tackling the urgent needs of the

(<u>Mr. Sardenberg, Brazil</u>)

civilian population affected by the fighting, independently of political or military considerations.

All the parties and others concerned remain bound to comply with the rules of international humanitarian law and to ensure unimpeded access for humanitarian relief efforts throughout the region.

In order to avoid the disquieting risks that would be involved in any further escalation of the conflict, a cease-fire must be effectively implemented and efforts must be focused on the attainment of a peaceful and negotiated settlement of all the questions arising from the dispute. Moreover, all parties and others concerned, including neighbouring States, must refrain from taking any action that could result in a heightening of the tensions in the region.

The Security Council has from the outset agreed to recognize the prominent role to be played by the Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe (CSCE) in the pursuance of a negotiated solution to the conflict concerning Nagorny Karabakh. The resolution that we have just adopted confirms that the efforts made at the regional level in the context of the CSCE Minsk process continue to have our full support. It is in that framework that the best chance of achieving a lasting solution of the problems that have arisen in connection with the dispute is to be found.

The Minsk Group's adjusted timetable of urgent steps to implement Security Council resolutions has already been welcomed and commended by the Council, which has called on the parties to accept it. Acceptance of the adjusted timetable resulting from the recent Vienna meeting of the Minsk Group would significantly contribute to easing the tensions, enhancing the negotiating process and advancing the prospects of achieving a lasting peace.

(<u>Mr. Sardenberg, Brazil</u>)

Today's resolution complements resolutions 822 (1993), 853 (1933) and 874 (1993). The parties and others concerned must abide fully by those resolutions, including the provisions concerning the cessation of armed hostilities and other hostile acts, and the withdrawal of occupying forces from recently occupied areas of the Azerbaijani Republic.

While the Security Council continues to lend its backing to the diplomatic efforts of the CSCE, it is important that the Council should remain seized of the matter and monitor the situation closely as it develops.

<u>Mr. YAÑEZ-BARNUEVO</u> (Spain) (interpretation from Spanish): My delegation considers that resolution 884 (1993), which the Council has just adopted, is extremely timely, for the situation on the ground in the Azerbaijani Republic has deteriorated markedly since 14 October, when the Council last took action on this item with the adoption of resolution 874 (1993). Our well-founded hopes concerning the permanence of the cease-fire declared on 24 October have been dashed by the recent hostilities, which have resulted in further occupation of territory and which have thus exacerbated the conflict.

The violations of the cease-fire are clearly to be condemned, and resolution 884 (1993) does this, and demands the withdrawal of the forces of the Armenians of the Nargorny Karabakh region from the recently occupied areas. My delegation reaffirms the importance that must be attached to the territorial integrity and sovereignty of the Azerbaijani Republic, without ignoring the rights of the Armenians of Nargorny Karabakh, in conformity with the principles of the United Nations Charter and of the Conference on Security and Cooperation in Europe (CSCE).

(<u>Mr. Yañez-Barnuevo, Spain</u>)

Of special concern is the humanitarian situation, especially the increase in the number of refugees and displaced persons, which is causing the problem to spread beyond the borders of the Azerbaijani Republic. In addition to achieving an immediate cease-fire, the international community must give priority to the problems of securing asylum and protection for the tens of thousands of refugees fleeing the conflict areas and of ensuring the free movement and delivery of humanitarian assistance.

The conflict threatens to spread beyond the territory of the Azerbaijani Republic, endangering peace and security in the region. All of this justifies, indeed necessitates, redoubled efforts by the United Nations and the CSCE to halt and end the conflict.

The parties must demonstrate their readiness to renounce the use of force and to prove, by their deeds, that they are committed to the peace process, participating in it in a constructive manner and putting in place a permanent, effective cease-fire that would allow the Minsk process to proceed and to yield results in the near future.

The CSCE Minsk Group has continued to work to secure peace. On 4 November 1993, its nine member States issued their Vienna declaration addressed to the parties and to all those capable of contributing in any way to the settlement of the conflict. Spain supports that declaration and hopes that it will prompt the parties to accept and put into effect the "Adjusted timetable of urgent steps to implement Security Council resolutions 822 (1993) and 853 (1993)" - and now 874 (1993) - as amended by the Minsk Group meeting recently at Vienna.

On 9 November 1993, the Western European Union, of which Spain is a member, issued a statement in which it lent its full support to the efforts of the Minsk Group to find a lasting political solution to this conflict. The Minsk Group has given the parties (Mr. Yañez-Barnuevo, Spain) until 22 November to respond to the latest package of proposals. We hope the parties will respond positively and without reservations, thus setting in motion a true peace process. Failing this, the Security Council would have to re-examine the item with a view to adopting such measures as might be deemed most appropriate in the light of the information and recommendations we expect to receive from the Secretary-General, in consultation with the Chairman-in-Office of the CSCE and the Chairman of the CSCE Minsk Conference.

The PRESIDENT: There are no further speakers for this meeting. The Security Council has thus concluded the present stage of its consideration of the item on the agenda.

The meeting rose at 6.25 p.m.