



Friday, 27 June 1952, at 2 p.m.

NEW YORK

CONTENTS

	Page
Examination of the annual report on the Trust Territory of Tanganyika for the year 1951 and of the report of the United Nations Visiting Mission to Trust Territories in East Africa, 1951, on that Territory (T/946 and Corr.1, T/977, T/989, T/1012) (<i>continued</i>).....	1
Examination of the annual report on the Trust Territory of Ruanda-Urundi for the year 1951 and of the report of the United Nations Visiting Mission to Trust Territories in East Africa, 1951, on that Territory (T/948, T/998, T/1012) (<i>continued</i>)	2
Examination of the annual report on the Trust Territory of Togoland under British administration for the year 1951 (T/990, T/1012).....	9

President: Mr. Awni KHALIDY (Iraq).

Present:

The representatives of the following States members of the Trusteeship Council: Australia, Belgium, China, Dominican Republic, El Salvador, France, Iraq, New Zealand, Thailand, Union of Soviet Socialist Republics, United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland, United States of America.

The representative of the following State non-member of the Trusteeship Council: Italy.

Examination of the annual report on the Trust Territory of Tanganyika for the year 1951 and of the report of the United Nations Visiting Mission to Trust Territories in East Africa, 1951, on that Territory (T/946 and Corr.1, T/977, T/989, T/1012) (*continued*)

[Agenda items 4 (b) and 6]

1. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): I have two questions to ask, the first of which concerns the petition of the Wa-Meru tribe (T/Pet.2/99 and Add.1 to 7). The members of the Trusteeship Council have no map showing clearly where the Wa-Meru tribe lands are situated and how the lands in the adjacent areas have been allotted. Moreover, we have no map of the lands to which the Wa-Meru tribe is being, or rather has been, moved. It would be helpful if the members of the Council could be given a detailed map showing where the lands of the Wa-Meru tribe under discussion are situated, how the lands in the adjacent areas have been allotted, where they are situated and to whom they belong. The position and distribution of the lands to which the Wa-Meru tribe has been moved should also be shown, and it would be useful if the map could somehow show the quality of these lands. That is my first point.

2. My second point concerns Tanganyika. There is a small clarification which I think should be made. At our last meeting [429th] when we discussed the question of Tanganyika the special representative, as you will recall, said that the Soviet Union representative had based his statement that there were only fifty doctors in the Territory on some obscure data. In glancing through the record just now, I noticed that I had failed to reply to the special representative's remark. That was merely an oversight on my part. I should like now to read the text on which I based my figures so that there should be no confusion. I took the figure from the report of the Visiting Mission (T/946), paragraph 309 of which reads as follows:

"As far as the Territory as a whole was concerned, the Mission was informed that one of the main obstacles to effecting improvements was the difficulty of recruiting adequate staff. Of the 120 medical officers recommended under the Pridie report, the Territory had at the present time only 50, and of the authorized establishment of 120 nursing sisters, only 65. Expansion thus depended on increases in staff and though salary scales had been increased it was anticipated that it would be many years before the full establishments were completed."

3. Consequently, the information concerning the fifty doctors was obtained by me from an official Trusteeship Council document—the report of the Visiting Mission. It is immaterial whether this will be recorded in today's record or that of our last meeting, but I should like this correction to be included in the record, since, I repeat, all the facts and figures quoted by me were drawn only from the official documents of the Trusteeship Council, the Administering Authority or the Visiting Mission.

4. Sir Alan BURNS (United Kingdom): As regards the first point raised by the Soviet Union representative, I have here a map which could be made available; if the Secretariat can reproduce it and circulate it to members of the Council, it will perhaps be of some use. Failing that, this map can be posted on the screen for the use of members.

5. With regard to the second point, the representative of the Soviet Union has quoted from the Visiting Mission's report, which is an official document of the Council. But he has failed to quote from other official documents of the Council—the Administering Authority's annual report¹ and document T/977 which contains the observations of the Administering Authority on the Visiting Mission's report. The observations contained in the latter document refer quite clearly to the difficulties in recruiting staff. That document states:

"During the year twenty new medical officers arrived in the Territory and ten others have either accepted or been offered appointment. At the end of the year, in addition to five senior medical officers and eight specialists, there were sixty-seven medical officers. There were also some sixty Asian and nine African doctors in the service."

I merely want to point out that, when official documents are to be quoted it would be more convenient and more useful to the Council if all the official documents were quoted in the same context.

Examination of the annual report on the Trust Territory of Ruanda-Urundi for the year 1951 and of the report of the United Nations Visiting Mission to Trust Territories in East Africa, 1951, on that Territory (T/948, T/998, T/1012) (continued)

[Agenda items 4 (c) and 6]

At the invitation of the President, Mr. Leroy, special representative of the Administering Authority for the Trust Territory of Ruanda-Urundi, took a place at the Council table.

6. Mr. LEROY (Special representative for Ruanda-Urundi): Before beginning my last statement, I should like to give the Soviet Union representative the information he asked for [424th meeting] concerning the number of persons imprisoned for vagrancy in 1951. The figure is seventy-four.

7. In the course of my introductory statement [421st meeting], I told the Council how much the Administration of the Trust Territory had appreciated the visit of the Visiting Mission and the objectivity and understanding of its members. I wish to add—and I am sure that my sentiments will be shared by the Council—that the report prepared by that Mission [T/948] and signed by all its members, is a full and remarkably clear account and, to my mind, a fine example of constructive co-operation.

8. There have been some misunderstandings, and I very much hope to be able to dissipate any that may still remain after the explanations given by the repre-

sentative of Belgium and by myself. I propose to deal in some detail with the political difficulties and, more briefly, with economic, social and educational problems.

9. The nature of the observations made by the various delegations make it possible for me to group most of them in the Visiting Mission's report, but some of the points made by the representative of the Soviet Union are such that I must consider them separately.

10. In the political field, the general conclusion of the Visiting Mission and of some delegations is that real progress has been made, although it has been too slow. That is because the Belgian Administration considers that the population must be first assured of a minimum of economic security. Doubtless, to some extent, political and social progress must accompany economic development, but experience has shown that economic progress conditions other forms of progress and that is why it has to some extent been stressed in the *Plan décennal pour le développement économique et social du Ruanda-Urundi*², page XXXIX of which states:

"The United Nations is particularly concerned with the political progress of the Territory. That is natural, as the *raison d'être* of trusteeship is to lead the populations to self-government. Before attaining self-government, however, they must build their economy on a solid and lasting basis; they must adapt their social structure to the democratic principles; they must, while learning and educating themselves, acquire the necessary political training."

11. I shall now examine the four points which seem to be of special interest to the Council. First, the organic law and the status of the inhabitants; then the trend of political reform; the opportunities available to the indigenous inhabitants of filling important posts and the exercise of the right of petition.

12. Let us consider first the organic law and the status of the inhabitants. On 17 June [422nd meeting] the representative of Belgium explained to the Council that the Law of 1925 was in no way incompatible with the provisions of the Trusteeship Agreement. I myself pointed out that the law was so flexible that it had been possible to reform completely the judicial and political structure of the country. I also stressed the value to the Territory of a broad interpretation of these provisions, which has become traditional. Nevertheless, the views of the Trusteeship Council on the matter will be taken most seriously into account by the Belgian Administration.

13. With respect to the trend of political reform, under the political reform which is about to be introduced and which the Soviet Union representative condemns without being aware of the legislative texts constituting that reform and without having seen its application, partially elective councils will be organized at all levels of indigenous organization. There can be no doubt that the activities of these councils will have repercussions upon those of the Council of the Vice-Government-General, as they will on its composition. As the representative of Thailand most wisely remarked [429th meeting], the reform is not complete since it affects only the district and not the central organs. Experience will show its value. The

¹ See Report by Her Majesty's Government in the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland to the General Assembly of the United Nations on the Administration of Tanganyika for the year 1951.

² Published by the Ministry of the Colonies, Brussels, 1951.

Visiting Mission made this point in paragraph 67 of its report, by the following statement: "It seems clear that the Council could not satisfactorily exercise powers of legislation for the Territory as a whole without substantial changes in its composition..."

14. The Administration's immediate plan is to have more indigenous inhabitants in the Council and to see that the new councils operate regularly. Once that is accomplished, the Administration will adapt its policy to the requirements of the times, taking into account its obligations under the Trusteeship Agreement.

15. With regard to the opportunities available to the indigenous inhabitants of filling important posts, I fear that the somewhat concise manner in which I expressed myself in my preliminary statement may have given rise to some apprehension. I have already explained my thought in reply to the questions asked by the representative of the Dominican Republic [422nd meeting]. I wish to recall that during the ninth session of the Trusteeship Council, at the 357th meeting, held at Flushing Meadow on 21 June 1951, I stated in reply to a question by one of the representatives:

"Besides the truly administrative officials, such as the Vice-Governor-General, the Residents, and the seventeen Territorial Administrators, a number of high-ranking specialized officials are attached to the Governor and act as his advisers. I feel that great benefits would be derived if the indigenous inhabitants were able to fill these specialized posts. The administrative structure, properly speaking, that is the Governor, the Residents and the Administrators would disappear when authority passed from the European authorities to an indigenous authority set up on new lines."

16. On 12 August 1951, the Governor of Ruanda-Urundi, at Usumbura, made a statement to the Visiting Mission, which I cannot quote verbatim, but the gist of which I can give you, and which the members of the Mission will probably remember.

"I think", said Mr. Pétillon, "as Mr. Ryckmans recently stated in the Trusteeship Council, there are two ways of bringing about political progress: first, by admitting into the European administration an increasing number of young indigenous inhabitants especially trained for the functions which they will be called upon to perform, such as those of veterinary surgeon, doctor and engineer; and secondly, by introducing more radical reforms under which customary institutions and authorities would be given increasingly extensive powers which would be gradually relinquished by the Administering Authority. My thought is that both methods should be used, but that the second would bring about the more harmonious and more complete change."

17. That conception has not altered and the Administration still holds that view.

18. As regards the exercise of the right of petition, I did not expect my statements to produce what the representative of the Dominican Republic went so far as to call a feeling of uneasiness [429th meeting]. I fear that I must have expressed myself badly, and would like to explain what I have in mind.

19. The Administration undertook to co-operate fully with the General Assembly and the Trusteeship Council in the fulfilment of all its functions and in particular in receiving and examining petitions.

20. When the Administration stated that it considered the right of petition to be an exceptional recourse, it did not mean that petitioners should first approach the Belgian Administration. I would emphasize that the Administration considers that every indigenous inhabitant has the right to appeal to the Trusteeship Council directly without first exhausting all the possibilities of appeal to the local authorities or the Administering Authority. Moreover, in view of its obligations, the Administration considers it its duty to inform the indigenous inhabitants of their right of petition as well as of all their other rights and obligations.

21. It is characteristic of the indigenous inhabitants to take their troubles first to the highest authority. It would be troublesome if the Trusteeship Council were daily seized of requests with which the local authority could easily deal.

22. The representative of New Zealand, with whom several other representatives agreed, including the representatives of the United States and of Australia, very aptly sized up the situation when he said [428th meeting] that a happy medium should be sought in exercising the right of petition.

23. As regards the economic and social fields, the Belgian Administration will certainly be very gratified to learn of the reception given by the Trusteeship Council to the ten-year economic and social plan for Ruanda-Urundi. The approbation contained in the Visiting Mission's report was most gratifying, and I shall have great pleasure in taking back to Belgium and to Ruanda-Urundi as well as to the Governor-General, Mr. Pétillon, the commendations voiced by the delegations.

24. The Administration's aims are the same as those of the Trusteeship Council. It is in closer touch with the difficulties involved in carrying out certain plans. It will give its full attention to any recommendations which might be made to it and will do everything in its power to comply with them. It is already dealing with the problems on which recommendations have previously been made and which were taken up as a whole in the Visiting Mission's report.

25. I am now obliged to reply separately to the representative of the Soviet Union. I hesitate to take up too much of the Council's time, but since the USSR representative untiringly repeats the same accusations, I too am forced to repeat myself sometimes.

26. There is nothing more to say about the administrative union and the alleged subordination of Ruanda-Urundi to the Belgian Congo. The administrative union favours Ruanda-Urundi, which is not subordinated to the Belgian Congo. It is not true that Ruanda-Urundi is being dragged into a colonial system which no longer exists in the Belgian Congo itself. Page XXXVIII of the *Plan décennal* states that although the ten-year plan for Ruanda-Urundi is in many ways similar to the plan for the Belgian Congo, it must be kept separate. The two territories have a different judicial system; they have separate budgets;

and finally, and most important, their problems are profoundly different.

27. The USSR representative asserts that only the more lowly occupations are open to the indigenous inhabitants. That is not true. The functions of the Bami, chiefs and sub-chiefs are not lowly; they are important, heavy with responsibility and well paid. As the representative of Thailand so rightly said [429th meeting], the defect in the régime is not the absence of important posts to be filled by the indigenous inhabitants, but the manner in which the appointments are made. The Administering Authority is making every effort to democratize this system; that is why it has created the new political régime, which the representative of the Soviet Union condemned, I repeat, without having seen the organic text on which it is based and without having seen it at work.

28. The representative of the Soviet Union asserts that the Administration is restraining the movement of indigenous inhabitants into industry, and says that there is only one industrial company. Clearly, his purpose is to create the impression that among the indigenous inhabitants, this is the only industrial company. Page 48 of the annual report³ shows that there are sixty industrial firms in the Territory representing seventy-five establishments, and seven other firms engaged in commerce and industry. Apart from agriculture and stock raising, the indigenous inhabitants tend to go into trade rather than industry. As to the restraining influence exerted by the Administration, that is explained in the *Plan décennal* (p. 502), which says: "The harmonious development of the country urgently requires that the indigenous population be integrated into the complex economy which will be brought about by the development of production. The tempo of such integration may be somewhat slow as the psychological motives and the traditional way of life of the indigenous population do not predispose them to such reforms . . . The State has a fundamental role to play, which it cannot abandon."

29. In speaking of living conditions, the Soviet Union representative, repeating the exact words to which I did not reply last year, says that the daily wage of a worker is only enough to buy a box of matches. I have already agreed that wages are inadequate, and I can state that the Government is pursuing a deliberate policy of raising the wages of the indigenous workers. What must be stressed, however, is the tendentious manner in which this information can be used: when mention is made of a box of matches, the listener, struck by the phrase, sees one of those objects which are given away free in the United States. Now five francs purchase not a box but a whole packet containing ten boxes which are equivalent to twenty-five books of matches. Furthermore, the indigenous inhabitant uses very few matches in the hills, and for five francs he can, if he does not wish to cut it himself, buy a substantial supply of wood.

30. Speaking of the poll tax, the USSR representative stated that this tax hits the poor while the chiefs are exempt from it. The Belgian representative explained at the ninth session [358th meeting] the reasons for

this exemption. The exemption of the chiefs, which was granted them because they assumed heavy duties and because one of the chief purposes of the poll tax was to induce the indigenous inhabitants to take up lucrative employment, is no longer of any importance since, having annual incomes of over 9,000 francs, the chiefs are subject to other forms of taxation. Furthermore, they all own cattle, which is taxed. As regards other taxpayers, the decree expressly exempts all those who have been unable, as a result of sickness, to work for a period of six months. I have already explained that indigenous inhabitants paying other personal taxes are not affected by the poll tax, the rate of which is fixed according to regions and their minimum resources; and that it is proportionately raised in the case of persons owning cattle.

31. I replied in my introductory statement and in the course of the questioning to the question of corporal punishment and racial discrimination, and I shall not reopen that matter. Two assertions, however, call for special mention. It is not true that the courts automatically decide in favour of the non-indigenous inhabitant. A petitioner may have said that, but the Union des colons complained of the reverse [T/Pet.3/39]. I too shall give some statistics. Out of the 7,293 persons who make up the non-indigenous population, 27 were imprisoned in 1951; out of the 3,904,779 indigenous inhabitants, 10,908 served prison terms, in other words, a proportion of 2.07 per thousand indigenous inhabitants and 3.07 per thousand non-indigenous inhabitants. I know the value of such reasoning; but I hope the Council will not object to my using, in answering the Soviet Union representative, the methods used by him in regard to the Administering Authority.

32. The USSR representative also asserted that the indigenous inhabitants are not allowed in hotels: this too is quite untrue. I myself on several occasions shared a table with indigenous inhabitants at Usumbura, Astrida, Kigali and Kitega. Such cases are rare, I admit, but only one would suffice to show that such discrimination is not racial but is due to educational differences.

33. As regards the alienation of land, the representative of the Soviet Union always urges the need to restore to the indigenous inhabitants the land thus taken from them. The word "restore" suggests that the land was alienated unlawfully. There is no such land in Ruanda-Urundi. What land does the representative of the Soviet Union mean? He mentioned land belonging to the State, such as roads, airfields, ports, buildings belonging to the Administration, forest reservations. All this land belongs to the State, that is to say to the indigenous population, who benefit by it as do the other inhabitants of the Territory.

34. Land granted to private non-indigenous persons is acquired in the normal way with the consent of the parties concerned, against payment and under the supervision of the judicial power. It would be just as illogical to restore this land to the indigenous inhabitants as to restore to the Belgian people land or property purchased by Africans in Brussels.

35. The USSR representative says that corporal punishment is still inflicted by the chiefs, their assistants and Europeans. This is absolutely untrue, and

³ See *Rapport soumis par le Gouvernement belge à l'Assemblée générale des Nations Unies au sujet de l'administration du Ruanda-Urundi pendant l'année 1951*, Brussels, 1952.

criminal proceedings would be instituted against anyone inflicting such punishment.

36. The USSR representative places the number of endemic and epidemic diseases at 712,122. Everyone knows that in countries such as Ruanda-Urundi, it is the task of the medical authorities to track down disease. Thanks to the 7,900,000 consultations held by the medical service, 712,122 cases of disease were discovered, approximately nine-tenths of which were cases of malaria, yaws and helminthiasis. I must inform the Soviet Union representative that when the anti-tuberculosis mission, which is now carrying out examinations of the population by means of X-ray microfilms, has completed its work, the number of cases of tuberculosis diagnosed will probably be doubled. The representative of the Soviet Union will doubtless conclude from that that the medical services are inadequate. The Council will be able to gauge the real value of such polemics. The USSR representative tells us that out of a total of 712,122 cases, 1,735 were fatal. That would be only 2.43 per 1,000, which does not seem excessive for such an allegedly neglected country.

37. In the field of education, the USSR representative returned, as he did last year and almost in the same terms, to a statement by UNESCO [T/903] concerning the restricted access to secondary schools. Both the representative of Belgium and I refused last year to assume any responsibility for UNESCO's statement. The discussion of this question fills several pages of document T/PV.360 of 26 June 1951, and I can see no need to revert to the question.

38. I wish to conclude with an edifying question of budget figures. I have extracted the following from the statements made at the 429th meeting by the representative of the Soviet Union: first, Ruanda-Urundi spent in 1951, 10,574,006.54 francs on its police force; secondly, Ruanda-Urundi spent in 1951, 28 cents per inhabitant on medical care expenses and 16 cents per inhabitant on education.

39. This is an obvious attempt to use sources not to obtain objective and scientific data which would make adequate comparison possible, but rather to pick on unfavourable figures calculated to make an impression.

40. I should like to state the facts as they are. The representative of the Soviet Union has lost sight of the fact that the sum of 41.5 million francs, shown as medical expenditures on pages 254 and 255 of the report, represent expenditures up to 31 December 1951, whereas the financial year does not end till 31 October 1952, and that the sums allocated for the year, and certainly already being drawn upon amount to 64,937,800 francs, as will be seen from page 156 of the annual report.

41. The USSR representative has also overlooked the sum of more than 8 million francs spent by the indigenous *circumscriptions* on medical aid; 12.5 million francs spent by the Indigenous Welfare Fund; 8 million francs spent by private organizations and finally the 17 million francs spent on the construction of hospitals and dispensaries. The USSR representative based his calculations on some 41 million francs, whereas the sums devoted exclusively to medical work exceed 110 million francs.

42. In the matter of education, the Soviet Union representative forgot to take into consideration the pro-

visions of the special budget (building of schools) and the sums spent by the Indigenous Welfare Fund, amounting in all to 19 million francs.

43. He spoke indignantly of the military expenditures of 10.5 million francs, which amounts to 5 cents per inhabitant. I am sure that a number of the nations represented in this Council would be happy if their military expenditures did not exceed that level.

44. The four following figures will suffice to enlighten the Council: the police force consists of 8 Europeans and 649 Africans, and the medical services are composed of 189 Europeans and 1,110 Africans.

45. All that remains, Mr. President, is for me to thank you and the members of the Council for the welcome and courtesy extended to me. I should also like to thank the Secretariat and the interpreters for their valuable help.

46. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): The special representative, in his statement on Ruanda-Urundi, has tried to tone down the unfortunate impression obtained from an analysis of the facts and figures regarding the Trust Territory of Ruanda-Urundi. He has done so more particularly in connexion with the statement by the delegation of the Soviet Union. I must admit, however, that the special representative confined himself to general remarks instead of trying to refute the positive facts and conclusions adduced by the USSR delegation.

47. In one instance I noted that the special representative endeavoured to some extent to analyse some concrete figures, particularly those related to public health. It is true, I said in my statement that the Administering Authority is spending only a negligible amount on public health. I said that medical expenditures in 1950 amounted to the insignificant sum of 28 cents per inhabitant per annum. The special representative tells us that this is not so; the amount is not 28 cents per inhabitant per annum, but about 60 cents. He included all the voluntary contributions and all the expenditures under that heading—as I understand it—for 1951.

48. Let us assume for the sake of argument that these figures, which refer to a later period, more or less represent expenditures on public health; I should like to know whether the special representative thinks 60 cents per person per annum for public health adequate. Let us assume for a moment that we agree with his figures, although they do refer to another period (for I did not distort the data for the period I had in mind). The special representative tells us that 60 cents is being spent per person per annum. It is absurd to pretend that that is a satisfactory amount to spend. That is the first point I wish to make, i.e., that the special representative is quoting figures for another period. Secondly, even if these figures for the other period are correct, that does not alter the fact that 60 cents per person for public health is so insignificant that the Trusteeship Council would be justified in adopting a recommendation calling upon the Administering Authority substantially to increase appropriations for public health.

49. Furthermore, as regards corporal punishment, there again the special representative tried to imply that the USSR representative had said something incorrect. I beg to differ. I said nothing that was not

absolutely correct. I said that medieval methods of punishment were still being applied to the indigenous inhabitants, namely, whipping. Furthermore, as the first United Nations Visiting Mission noted in a passage of its report, which I quote:

"... whipping still survives and is commonly practised by chiefs and sub-chiefs, Native subordinates and even some European officials, especially in connexion with agriculture and forced labour on roads".⁴

50. In spite of the fact that, at its ninth session, the Trusteeship Council adopted a recommendation calling upon the Administering Authority to abolish corporal punish immediately⁵, that has not been done. There is also a General Assembly resolution [440 (V)] calling for the abolition of corporal punishment. I have repeatedly urged, on the basis of these facts, that the Trusteeship Council should insist that the Administering Authority should observe these recommendations requiring the immediate abolition of corporal punishment. That is the second point on which the special representative tried to refute what I had said.

51. There is also the fact that the special representative tried to pass over the information quoted by me in my statement on the flouting of human rights and freedoms in the Trust Territory. I realize why he did so. It was because in this case there was nothing for him to refute, even from a formal point of view. He said that the USSR representative was not speaking the truth when he alleged that the indigenous inhabitants were excluded from restaurants and hotels reserved for white persons. But I did not invent this. What I said was:

"The petitions from indigenous inhabitants of the Trust Territory also contain many complaints about the policy of racial discrimination practised by the Administering Authority. For example, the petition of Mr. Mugutu (T/Pet.3/53) states that flagrant racial discrimination towards the indigenous inhabitants is practised in the courts. Where the parties to the case are an African and a European, the European judge will declare the African incapable of telling the truth and will insult him in every possible way.

"The indigenous population is debarred from entering hotels and restaurants for whites, as stated in petitions T/Pet.3/38, T/Pet.3/52 and in several others." (T/PV.429)

52. If, therefore, he insists on refuting anything in this connexion the special representative should be a little more scrupulous and say that the USSR representative quoted concrete petitions received by the Trusteeship Council. In point of fact, the special representative is trying to refute the petitioners' and not my statements. I am personally convinced that if we were to ask the petitioners they would stand by their statements to us. I am also certain that an inquiry would confirm that the petitioners were telling the truth.

53. I would remind the special representative of something which took place during the Trusteeship

Council's third session,⁶ when the Belgian representative, Mr. Ryckmans, said in connexion with a statement by the Soviet Union representative, who was then Mr. Tsarapkin, that were the indigenous inhabitants to learn about the statements made by the USSR representative about their situation in the Trust Territories they would make a laughing-stock of the Soviet Union representative. The Council will recall that, thereupon, the USSR delegation demanded that all its statements in the Trusteeship Council should be communicated to the indigenous inhabitants of the Trust Territory, so as to observe their reaction to any remarks which had been made. What did the Belgian authorities do? When the Visiting Mission went to the Territory, the Belgian authorities refused to make known to the indigenous inhabitants the statements of the Soviet Union representative and when I raised the matter with the Belgian representative during the Trusteeship Council's fourth session,⁷ far from giving me a satisfactory reply, he failed to give any explanation at all.

54. Therefore I would ask the special representative to be more specific when trying to refute facts, provided he has any refutations to offer, and not to indulge in generalities such as "our ten-year plan provides..." The ten-year plan may well "provide", but Belgium has done nothing for the past twenty-five years in Ruanda-Urundi or even during the five years it has been there as Administering Authority of the Trust Territory. That is the whole point. I have never had the slightest doubt of the special representative's ability to generalize, or that some sort of plans, which are never implemented, exist.

55. Now, what is the situation in regard to certain facts? I could, of course, enlarge on these facts considerably, or to put it briefly, I could repeat the whole of my statement, especially since the special representative, as I have said, was unable to refute a single fact cited by me.

56. The special representative spoke of the Administering Authority's solicitude for the welfare of the indigenous inhabitants. But educational expenditures still amount to 16 cents per person per annum. What can be done in the educational sphere with 16 cents? I can give other figures. The special representatives spoke about wages, but even he had to admit that wages are really inadequate. It is not enough merely to say inadequate. Ten francs, or 50 francs or 100 francs would be inadequate. The chiefs apparently receive from 5,000 to 200,000 francs a year. A chief receiving 10,000 francs a year regards himself as underpaid. But what of the worker who earns 3.50 or 5 francs a day? That is whom I am thinking of. What can he do on a wage of 5 francs a day, that is about 10 American cents, when a box of matches costs 7 to 7.50 francs. The special representative says that they do not need any matches. I presume that they get a light by rubbing stone against stone or by using flint. Either that or they must have matches. Matches are an essential article, and it would seem that a man has to work for a day and a half to earn enough money to buy one box.

⁴ See *Official Records of the Trusteeship Council, Fourth Session, Supplement No. 2*, p. 44.

⁵ See *Official Records of the General Assembly, Sixth Session, Supplement No. 4*, p. 74.

⁶ See *Official Records of the Trusteeship Council, Third Session, 21st meeting*.

⁷ *Ibid.*, *Fourth Session, 33rd meeting*.

57. It is quite correct that I said that workers from Ruanda-Urundi who go to Tanganyika and the Belgian Congo to find work are even worse off. In the Belgian Congo, for example, workers employed by European enterprises receive from 3.50 francs to 5 francs a day, as stated by the Visiting Mission. What can be done on such wages? Even the special representative did not attempt to deny that wages are very low, but it is not enough to admit that wages are so wretched and so impossibly low that a man cannot exist on them. The Administering Authority must take steps as a matter of urgency to improve the indigenous inhabitants' situation.

58. I repeat that I do not want to make my statement over again; I merely wish to say that all the attempts of the representative of Belgium and the special representative to refute the facts cited by me will fail as all these facts were taken from the official information furnished by the Administering Authority or the Visiting Mission.

59. I drew the appropriate conclusions from these facts, and the Soviet Union delegation officially submitted proposals [T/L.284] to the effect that the Trusteeship Council should recommend the establishment of a democratic system of government; the establishment of organs of government not on the basis of an administrative union with the Belgian Congo but independently; the cessation of racial discrimination; the cessation of the alienation of land and the return of already alienated land to the indigenous inhabitants; the introduction of a fair system of taxation; an increase in budgetary appropriations for health and education; and the establishment of a system of primary, secondary and higher education.

60. We urge that these proposals should be adopted, and we shall continue to do so both in the Trusteeship Council and in any other organ of the United Nations which may discuss the Trusteeship Council's report, since the adoption and implementation of these proposals is the absolute minimum which could at present testify to the willingness of the Administering Authority to do something, at any rate, to comply with the provisions of the Charter and of the Trusteeship Agreement.

61. That is all I have to say concerning the special representative's comments. I should like to reserve my right, should the special representative or the representative of Belgium speak again, to mention any appropriate facts so that there should be no ambiguity as to the Soviet Union delegation's position in regard to the report of the Administering Authority on the administration of Ruanda-Urundi for the current year.

62. Mr. RYCKMANS (Belgium): The special representative confined himself to commenting upon some of the figures given by the representative of the Soviet Union, which the latter has now repeated. We shall not reopen the discussion. I should, however, like to reply to one question raised by him.

63. He asked whether we consider the present medical expenditure, which amounts to about three times the figure he mentioned in his statement the day before yesterday, adequate. My reply is that we do not consider the budget for the medical services adequate, and that the present resources of the country are too small. That is the reason for the ten-year plan. Its

purpose will be to increase the Territory's resources, with the assistance of the Administering Authority which provides in a completely disinterested manner the necessary sums for the special budget, so that the medical services may be further developed.

64. Moreover, I would point out to the USSR representative that were he to compare the medical expenditure with the Territory's resources he would find that medical expenditure alone, for 1951, represents about 150 per cent of the total revenue from indigenous taxation.

65. The USSR representative wishes to know what we have done in the Territory during the thirty-five years of our presence there and during the five years we have been there as the Administering Authority under the Trusteeship Agreement. I have already told the Council that Ruanda-Urundi's first budget after we came there amounted to 1,500,000 francs. The present budget amounts to 500 million francs. What, indeed, have we done during the past five years? The 1951 budget is exactly three times the size of the 1946 budget. That is what has been done in the past five years.

66. The USSR representative justifies his accusations by pointing out that he based his statement on the report of the first Visiting Mission. However, we are not discussing the report of the first Visiting Mission today, but that of the second Visiting Mission. If there were certain abuses three years ago which no longer exist today, it merely goes to prove that progress has been made in the last three years.

67. As to the way in which the USSR representative took refuge behind Messrs. Mugutu and Sebukuavu by saying: "It is not I who say so, it is in a petition", I would point out that the special representative merely said: "Since you attach such importance to a petition, I too may attach equal importance to another petition complaining of just the reverse." The representative of the Soviet Union based his remarks on Mugutu's petition while the special representative based his reply on that of the petition from the Union des colons. For the rest, I think the Council will be able to form a sufficiently clear idea of the situation from the explanations of the special representative, and there is no point in pursuing the discussion further.

68. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): In connexion with expenditures on public health, the Belgian representative seems to be trying to suggest that I cited incorrect data. That is not so. The figure of 54 million francs is given in the information supplied by the Belgian delegation itself, and it is on that information that I based myself; I said that even were we to take the data submitted by the special representative—that is to say, approximately 100 million—the per capita expenditure for medical services would still be only the equivalent of 60 cents, which is a wretchedly inadequate amount. Let there be no confusion on that score.

69. With regard to corporal punishment, does Mr. Ryckmans remember that, at the fourth session of the Trusteeship Council, he denied the statement in the report of the Visiting Mission concerning corporal punishment. I have quoted that statement now, and he has admitted it, saying that the evils of those days no longer exist. But in 1949 he denied the exist-

ence of that evil, and he does so with equal blandness now with regard to 1951. Since he denied in 1949 the Visiting Mission's findings but now admits their truth, while in turn refuting the Mission's findings in 1951, I wonder whether he will change his tactics again when we discuss the report of the next visiting mission.

70. No progress has been made by the Administering Authority. Did it not deny in 1949 that corporal punishment was still practised, as the Visiting Mission had reported? Now it asks us to disregard the report of the first Visiting Mission and to quote only from that of the second. I must explain that this is precisely what I have been doing and I note that that report gives no indication of any progress in the Trust Territory or any improvement in the situation of the indigenous inhabitants. If you are interested in my quotations from the report of the second Visiting Mission, I can, of course, cite them.

71. For instance, I said that the Visiting Mission's report—the report of the second Visiting Mission [T/948]—stated that the wages of an unskilled agricultural worker are equal to 5 francs, that is to say to 10 American cents, per day. That too is hardly an indication of progress in the Trust Territory.

72. As regards corporal punishment, the report of the second Visiting Mission states that corporal punishment has not been abolished. If you have abolished it, then say so, and I shall say no more about corporal punishment in the Trust Territory. I shall then not mention it when the next report is considered, but shall only discuss how your local authorities comply with the edict abolishing corporal punishment, that is if you have abolished it. You cannot say at present that corporal punishment has been abolished. I demand its abolition, particularly as you cannot justify it on any grounds, for there can be no justification for such a barbarous form of punishment.

73. Mr. RYCKMANS (Belgium): I am more amused than I am annoyed. The USSR representative's arguments are, to my mind, most peculiar. He now tells me that at the fourth session I denied what the Visiting Mission reported and that I now admit it. But I have admitted no such thing. I simply said that if the Visiting Mission noted certain abuses three years ago, and if those abuses no longer exist today, that would prove that progress had been made in the past three years. However, I never admitted the existence of any abuses. All I say is that we are not at the moment discussing the report of the 1948 Visiting Mission, but that of the 1951 Visiting Mission.

74. The representative of the Soviet Union asks me once again whether I consider an expenditure of 60 cents per capita of the population on medical services sufficient. My reply is that a tax of 40 cents per capita is too little; but if that is all we can raise, then to spend 60 cents for medical services alone is not too bad. The sole purpose of our administration is to develop resources so that more can be spent. I have already shown the USSR representative that, since the beginning of the Belgian administration in Ruanda-Urundi, the budget has increased from one million francs to 500 million francs, and that in the last five years the budget has tripled. Those are real results; I hope that five years hence, or at any rate at the end of the ten-year plan, the budget will have tripled again, so that we

shall be able to spend a great deal more on medical services. That is my earnest hope.

75. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): The question of obligations must be thoroughly explained once more.

76. When you, Mr. Ryckmans—or rather, the Belgian Government—assumed in 1947 or earlier the obligations of an Administering Authority of a Trust Territory, you did so in the light of the Charter and the Trusteeship Agreement. These obligations were freely assumed. There was no question then as to whether or not you had any money or whether or not you would have any. You did assume an obligation, however.

77. What was that obligation? To ensure the economic, social and political development of the Trust Territory and the educational advancement of the indigenous population. Now you tell us that the fulfilment of that obligation depends on how much money you receive from the Trust Territory. Why should you receive any such money? The fulfilment of your obligations does not mean that you should receive money from the Trust Territory, but rather that you must invest your own money to develop that Trust Territory so that you may fulfil your international obligations.

78. Nobody forced you to assume those obligations. On the contrary, you insisted on your right to assume those obligations in regard to Ruanda-Urundi. You asked to be allowed to administer Ruanda-Urundi and were opposed to anyone else doing so. And now you tell us that you have no money. The question cannot be broached in that way. You assumed an international obligation which it is your duty to fulfil. That does not mean that you should spend only what you are able to levy by taxation. You might have to spend ten, twenty or even a hundred times more than you are able to levy in taxes and it is your duty to do so for as long as you remain the Administering Authority. If you are unable to fulfil your obligations for one reason or another, you should say so. The arguments with which you are trying to some extent to vindicate your position are unacceptable.

79. Does the Belgian Government wish to say that because of its poverty it is unable to fulfil its obligations with regard to Ruanda-Urundi? If that is the case I should like to hear from the Belgian representative a clear and definite statement to that effect.

80. Mr. RYCKMANS (Belgium): The last word will be with the representative of the Soviet Union.

81. The PRESIDENT: I take it that take this concludes for the time being our debate on Ruanda-Urundi, before the Drafting Committee goes into action on the subject. It remains for me to thank the special representative very warmly for his patient, generous and kind co-operation with the Council. We are indebted to Mr. Leroy for his co-operation.

Mr. Leroy special representative of the Administering Authority for the Trust Territory of Ruanda-Urundi, withdrew.

Examination of the annual report on the Trust Territory of Togoland under British administration for the year 1951 (T/990, T/1012)

[Agenda item 4 (d)]

At the invitation of the President, Mr. Ensor, special representative of the Administering Authority for the Trust Territory of Togoland under British administration, took a place at the Council table.

82. The PRESIDENT: Mr. Ensor, I should like to welcome you to the Council. You are not a total stranger here, and we expect that you will do as well as in previous years. We hope we will not overtax your patience but, in any event, I am sure that you will give the Council your best and most generous co-operation. I now call on the special representative.

83. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): I thank the President for his kind words. I feel greatly privileged by the invitation to say a few words to the Council. I propose to restrict myself to a few words since the annual report on Togoland under British administration,⁸ which the members of the Council have before them, is comprehensive and relates to a period which ended only six months ago. In preparing this report, we have endeavoured to deal as fully as possible with those matters in which the Council expressed particular interest last year and to furnish answers to the questions put at that time by members. If there are any questions on these or other matters, I will do what I can to answer them.

84. The important developments which occurred in Togoland under United Kingdom trusteeship in 1951 and are described in the report now before you have been continued in the first six months of this year; in particular the new regional arrangements which were proposed for the Southern Section and adjoining areas of the Gold Coast Colony are now being brought into effect and the reorganization of the local government bodies throughout the Territory is in progress. A forecast of these developments was provided in paragraphs 140 to 163 of the annual report; but in view of their importance the Council will doubtless wish to receive an up-to-date account of the progress achieved.

85. On 1 June a regional officer—who is a senior administrative officer below the rank of chief commissioner but above that of assistant chief commissioner—was posted to Ho in the Southern Section of the Territory where he is now engaged in setting up the headquarters of the new Trans-Volta/Togoland Region, referred to in paragraph 141 of the annual report. This officer is responsible directly to the Governor and central Government in Accra. The ordinance to provide for the setting up of the Trans-Volta/Togoland Council has been passed by the Legislative Assembly and enacted, but the regulations setting out the details of the Council's composition and the electoral arrangements have not yet been promulgated. I can say that even at this early stage the benefits of having posted to this region a senior administrative officer whose task it is to devote himself to the region's peculiar problems and who is not tied to the details of district work have become apparent to the Government and, I hope, to the people of the region.

⁸ See Report by Her Majesty's Government in the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland to the General Assembly of the United Nations on the Administration of Togoland under United Kingdom Trusteeship for the year 1951.

86. We feel that the reorganization of the Territory's local government machinery is a most important step in the Territory's political advancement. As will be seen from the annual report, this reorganization will involve the democratization of local government councils, the modernization of local government machinery, and the readjustment—particularly in the south—of the units of local government so that these coincide most nearly with the wishes of the people. In this last respect we have had to accept, in a number of areas, smaller units than were thought likely to achieve the maximum efficiency since the people of those areas were reluctant to co-operate in larger units. This has caused a delay in setting up some of the councils and has also meant that the number of the new councils is to be somewhat greater than that forecast in the annual report.

87. In the Northern Section the reorganization is complete, the last council having come into being on 1 July. The Northern Section is now divided between the areas of four district councils, three of which extend into the Protectorate of the Northern Territories, and there are seventeen local councils, nearly all of which lie entirely in the Trust Territory.

88. In the Southern Section, as I have said, there has been a great deal of discussion with the people regarding the exact area of each unit. The result has been that only one local council—which is responsible for the same area as the Native Authority which preceded it—has so far been set up. But the instruments for twelve more local councils have been published and in the areas of eight of these the electoral processes have been started and the councils will come into existence in August. There are still two areas where no final decision has been reached, but the local councils for these—one of which may extend across the boundary between the Territory and the Gold Coast Colony—and for the remaining four areas whose instruments have already been published will almost certainly be set up in October or November. Thus in the Southern Section, nine of the eventual fifteen local councils should be working by August and the remainder before the end of the year. When this process is complete, the two district councils for the Southern Section can be established and the electoral arrangements completed for the Trans-Volta/Togoland Council, the members of which will be elected by local government bodies.

89. We do not, of course, expect miracles to happen. Really efficient modern local government bodies cannot appear in Africa overnight as the result of new legislation, but we have provided the framework, and will continue to provide the advice and encouragement on which the people of the Territory themselves must build. The new local government bodies already have for the most part wider powers than the previous Native Authorities and as they flourish, their powers will be extended until they enjoy the whole of the very long list of powers set out in appendix II, section D, of the annual report. The new local government bodies are everywhere being welcomed.

90. We are fully aware that the success of these new bodies must to a great extent depend on the quality of the staff which serves them, and we attach the highest importance to the training of that staff. I am particularly glad to be able to inform you that the local gov-

ernment school set up last year in Accra is proving very successful. Two courses — each for twenty-six students — have been completed, and by the opening of the next course in August the capacity of the school will have been doubled so as to take fifty-two students. Most of the students so far have been employees of Native Authorities, selected from among the most promising in each area, but a few have been junior civil servants who have volunteered for service with local government bodies. The course costs the students nothing, for in addition to free tuition and accommodation they receive an allowance to cover their board. The principal subjects studied are the principles of local government with particular regard to their applicability to local conditions; the new local government legislation; accounting and financial control; and the keeping of minutes and office records. The best students each year will be sent to the United Kingdom for attachment to local government bodies there for further training.

91. To complete the account of developments in the political field I should mention that the requisite amendment of the Constitution has been made to provide for the establishment of the new electoral college for the Trans-Volta/Togoland Region, the need for which is explained in paragraph 142 of the report. This college will elect the three territorial members for the region to the Legislative Assembly. The Constitution provides that at least one of these must be a native of the Southern Section of Togoland. Another constitutional amendment provides for the replacement of the office of Leader of Government Business by the office of Prime Minister. In practice Dr. Nkrumah, who was Leader of Government Business, has now become Prime Minister, and there has been no change in the composition of the rest of the Executive Council.

92. The Lidbury Commission referred to in paragraph 165 of the annual report, which was appointed to investigate the civil Service, has now reported. A copy of the Commission's report⁹, which is too detailed for me even to summarize here, has been sent to the United Nations library. This report was in turn considered by a Select Committee of the Legislative Assembly consisting of nineteen members, the Chairman and all but three of whom were Africans. The report¹⁰ of this Committee has also been sent to the United Nations library. This Committee has decided on considerable improvements in the conditions of employment of the public service, and its decisions are being put into effect as rapidly as the Government's administrative machinery will allow, starting with the increase in wages of the lower-paid government employees and working up to the higher salary ranges. Briefly the increase at the lowest level are those forecast in paragraph 846 of the annual report — as much as 45 per cent in the Northern Section and 17 per cent in the Southern Section over and above present basic pay and allowances.

93. It is, moreover, expected that most other employers will follow suit. At the higher levels, salaries have been increased only to the extent that present temporary cost-of-living allowances have been more or

less embodied in pensionable emoluments, though there has been some increase in basic salaries which benefits African civil servants but is more or less compensated in the case of expatriate officers by an equivalent reduction in overseas pay. The gap between the total emoluments of African and expatriate officers has thus been narrowed, and I would invite any member who wishes to know why this gap has not been removed altogether to read the views of this preponderantly African and elected Committee in paragraph 33 of its report. I should add that this Committee has reaffirmed the Government's policy of equal pay for men and women doing the same work.

94. Meanwhile the policy of Africanization of the public service continues. A recent example of interest is the sending to an officer cadet training unit in the United Kingdom of a Dagomba sergeant in the Gold Coast Regiment, of partly Togoland parentage. I should perhaps add in parentheses that the Commissioner for Africanization, in whom a member of this Council expressed so great an interest last year, has recently been awarded a United Nations fellowship in public administration and is at present pursuing his studies in Puerto Rico.

95. In the economic sphere, the cocoa industry of the Territory continues to escape the ravages of the deadly swollen shoot disease and the crop continues to increase. The new road to Ahamansu and Papase in the heart of the new cocoa areas, which was constructed at a cost of nearly £80,000, was opened early this year and gives great satisfaction to the people of the area, which lorries can reach for the first time.

96. A communication has been circulated which makes representations on the subject of the reservation of land in the Southern Section for forest reserves. I should explain that the communication arises not from some sudden decision on the part of the Government to extend the area of forest reservation but rather from the availability at last of a Reserve Settlement Commissioner to undertake the necessary inquiries in area long demarcated for formal reservation and where an extension of cultivation has long been prohibited. In the detailed inquiries which the Reserve Settlement Commissioner is now undertaking, the views of the people will be given very careful consideration but it is not possible, for reasons which I will be happy to explain in detail if asked to do so, to abandon the proposal to constitute as forest reserves the strictly limited hill-top areas which form the subject of the Commissioner's inquiries. The carrying out of a carefully planned policy of land conservation and forest reservation is considered to be essential in the interests of the inhabitants of the area as a whole.

97. In the field of education, free primary education is now a reality, though it has not yet proved possible to make it universal. It is the Government's aim to make free primary education available to all as soon as possible. Considerable progress has been made with the permanent buildings for the Mawuli Secondary School at Ho and some of the new buildings are now in use. The number of scholarships for which the inhabitants of the Territory are eligible to compete continues to increase. In addition to those granted by the Cocoa Marketing Board for secondary and higher education, the Board has recently provided the funds for twenty-five medical scholarships. On my way here through

⁹ See *Report of the Commission on the Civil Service of the Gold Coast, 1950/51*, Government Printing Department, Accra, Gold Coast, 1951.

¹⁰ See *Report of the Select Committee on the Lidbury Report, Sessional Paper No. III of 1952*, Government Printing Department, Accra, Gold Coast, 1952.

London, I received good reports of the two Togolandians who are in the United Kingdom under the scholarship scheme for the training of artisans. The number of private students from the Territory in North Africa who are receiving government assistance has risen to two who are receiving full scholarship and five who are receiving *ex gratia* awards equal to the difference in dollars between the allowances sent them by their families before and since the devaluation of the pound sterling.

98. At the ninth session, a member of the Council drew attention to the fact that the amount of space per inmate in the prison at Ho was less than that available in the other prisons in the Territory. The work of extending this prison's accommodation more than half again its present size had already been put in hand.

99. A recent visitor to the Territory who was particularly interested in developments in the field of mass education and the work of the Togoland United Nations Association was Mr. J. A. F. Ennals, the Secretary-General of the World Federation of United Nations Associations.

100. Finally I should like to express a warm welcome to the members of the Visiting Mission which is shortly to tour Togoland. Unfortunately, as has already been explained in this Council, the weather in September in that part of the world is not at its most clement and road travel may well be difficult in places. But whatever travel difficulties are encountered, we shall do our best to make the Mission comfortable and to enable them to see all they want to.

101. Members of the Council may have seen resolutions made by the chiefs and people of the Dagomba, Nanumba and Mamprusi which have been circulated in documents T/Com.6/L.1, T/Pet.6/317 and T/Pet. 6/318, respectively. These come from people who occupy just over half the area of the Territory and constitute just under half its population. The resolutions indicate the unwillingness of these peoples to receive another visiting mission. Coming from people who by tradition are most courteous, polite and hospitable, these resolutions express a considerable strength of feeling over the lack of attention given to previous expressions of their wishes by these people. Nevertheless, I feel confident that it will be possible for us to persuade them to receive the Visiting Mission when it arrives.

The meeting was suspended at 3.45 p.m. and was resumed at 4.10 p.m.

POLITICAL ADVANCEMENT

General political structure

102. Mr. QUIROS (El Salvador): The Executive Council of the Territory of the Gold Coast is composed, as we have been informed, of twelve persons, eight of whom are elected, three are members *ex officio* and the Governor of the Territory acts as President. Paragraph 55 of the annual report states that a quorum of the Council consists of five persons "in addition to the Governor or other member presiding". In other words, six persons are required for a quorum.

103. I should like to ask the special representative whether there is any special reason for deciding on six as a quorum. I ask this question because in nearly every national or international organ, a quorum usually

consists of half the members plus one; in some cases it is two-thirds of the members. In international organs such, for example, as the General Assembly of the United Nations, a quorum consists of half the members plus one; in this Council a quorum is two-thirds of the membership. In the legislative assemblies of most countries a quorum consists of half plus one or of two-thirds. In the case under discussion the quorum consists of exactly half the members, that is to say, of six persons. Why this exception to the more or less general rule?

104. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): I do not know the exact reason why the figure was fixed at six. I do know, however, that the Ministers in the Gold Coast have a number of other functions as well as actually attending meetings of the Cabinet, and they have been most vigorous in their programmes of trekking, and a number of them have in fact represented the Gold Coast and Togoland abroad, on a number of occasions. I feel sure that one of the reasons for fixing the quorum so low was so as not to tie them to the continual meetings of the Council which occur in Accra at frequent intervals, and to enable them, whenever they think fit, to get away and see for themselves what is going on both in the Gold Coast and in the Territory and indeed, if they think fit, abroad.

105. Mr. QUIROS (El Salvador): From this explanation, which does not entirely satisfy us, we gather the difficulty of bringing all the members together accounts for the fact that the quorum was fixed at half the membership. I take it that this is an exception. I nevertheless think that the more or less general rule should be followed, and that the quorum should be fixed at at least half the membership plus one, in order to ascertain the views of the majority in the Council.

106. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): I am not certain that we should entirely accept the fact that a quorum is always more than half. For example, in the United Kingdom Parliament, the quorum is by no means half, nor in the Legislative Assembly of the Gold Coast is the quorum a half. If we turn further we see that the quorum there is only twenty-five members out of seventy-four. Therefore, I do not think it is entirely the case that more than half is a standard quorum everywhere.

107. Mr. S. S. LIU (China): I note in paragraph 58 of the annual report that the new Legislative Assembly has eighty-four members and a Speaker. We also note that three members are from the Southern Section of the Territory and that nineteen members are from the Northern Territories, which include the Northern Section of the Territory. I wonder if the special representative can tell the Trusteeship Council how many of these eighty-five members of the Legislative Assembly are indigenous inhabitants and how many come from the two sections of the Territory?

108. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): The answer to that question is, I think, given somewhere else in the report, but I can say that the three members who present the Southern Section are all indigenous inhabitants of the Territory; and, in fact, of the nineteen

members who represent the joint area of the Northern Territories and the Northern Section of the Territory, two are indigenous inhabitants of the Territory and one is a Dagomba from just on the border. In fact, he has lived mostly in the Territory; technically, he was born just outside of it.

109. Mr. S. S. LIU (China): In other words, five members are from the Trust Territory. What is the total number of African members of the Legislative Assembly?

110. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): I take it that the question relates to the number of the members of the Assembly who happen to be Africans at the moment, because there is of course no specification anywhere in the Constitution that any number of the members must be Africans or any number of the members must be Europeans. At the moment, the number who are Africans is seventy-five, plus the Speaker. May I explain that the Speaker is in a rather particular position because the Constitution enables him to be chosen by the Assembly from outside its own membership and, in fact, the Speaker was chosen from outside the membership of the Assembly.

111. Mr. S. S. LIU (China): I also note from the report that women have the same right to vote as men, so long as they have the qualifications prescribed for the men. I wonder whether actually a large number of women did participate in the selections.

112. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): I am afraid that no accurate figures by sex were kept during the elections in the Territory. I can add from my personal experience that, while assisting in the elections which were held in the municipality of Accra, I was present in a polling booth, and I can assure the representative of China that a very large number of voters, amounting almost to half the number, were in fact women. In rural areas the proportion was probably slightly less, but I imagine that a considerable proportion of the electors in Togoland were in fact women.

113. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): As is known, the Southern Section of the Territory is administered as a constituent part of the Gold Coast, while the Northern Section is administered as an integral part of the Northern Territories. I should like to know whether it is the intention of the Administering Authority that the Trust Territory should become an independent unit, and whether any legislation is contemplated that would determine the special status of Togoland as a Trust Territory.

114. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): I am unaware of any intention to alter the present legislation in such a way as to vary the relationship between the Gold Coast and Togoland under United Kingdom trusteeship.

115. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): It is clear from the information in paragraph 48 of the report that the status of the inhabitants of the Trust Territory is indistinguishable from that of the inhabitants of the Gold Coast Colony. I should like to know what the Administering Authority contemplates doing to assure for the indigenous inhabitants of the Trust Territory the status of indigenous inhabitants of a Trust Territory rather than the

status and rights of the inhabitants of an ordinary British colony.

116. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): As the status and rights of the inhabitant of a British colony are exactly the same as those of the inhabitants of the United Kingdom, I cannot myself see that the inhabitants of a Trust Territory can reasonably ask or expect to receive something higher than that.

117. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): How is the creation of an independent Togoland State contemplated, inasmuch as the Charter confers on the Administering Authority the obligation to promote the advancement of the Territory towards self-government and independence. What plans has the Administering Authority for transforming the present Trust Territory into an independent State of Togoland?

118. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): I am afraid I am unaware of any article in the Trusteeship Agreement that specifies that an independent State has to be the aim of the Administering Authority. So far as I am aware, the goal which we are pursuing in self-government or independence. I should have thought that the first would be the first stage; and when that was reached, the inhabitants could decide whether they wished to pursue the matter to the second goal listed.

119. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): Hence my question. I wished to know how the Administering Authority envisages the self-government of the Trust Territory as a single unit and a separate entity.

120. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): We are providing the democratic basis upon which the people of the Gold Coast and Togoland under United Kingdom trusteeship can build up their representative institutions, which will gradually amount to self-government. When that stage has been reached, the people of the Trust Territory will have to choose whether they wish to be a unit completely separate from anything else whether they wish to participate with the Gold Coast or possibly some other territory in West Africa in their eventual progress towards the final political status which the Territory will achieve. I do not think it is necessary at this stage to prejudge in any way their choice in the matter.

121. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): The Charter of the United Nations lays down that the purpose of the International Trusteeship System is to promote the political, economic, social and educational advancement of the inhabitants of the Trust Territories with a view to ensuring their progressive development towards self-government or independence. Consequently, the measures taken by the Administering Authority in the Trust Territory to promote the political, economic, social and educational advancement of the peoples should be designed to ensure the development of the Territory towards self-government or the establishment of the independent State about which I have already spoken.

122. At present, however, the Trust Territory is not even a single province within the British colonial system, but is divided into two parts which are governed

as separate units of the British colonial system. That is why I wish to know how the Administering Authority intends to comply with its obligations under the Charter to promote the political, economic, social and educational advancement of the inhabitants of the Trust Territory so that it may become a simple self-governing territory or an independent State. At the moment the Administering Authority is doing everything in its power to prevent the attainment of that goal. Now I wish to know what the Administering Authority is doing to comply with the provisions of the Charter.

123. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): If, as I assume, the representative of the Soviet Union is referring to Article 76 b of the United Nations Charter, I can assure him that we are pursuing this goal most vigorously, and if he feels unhappy that there are differences between the northern and southern sections of Togoland, those differences, which are of race and geography, were created by God and not by us.

124. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): In point of fact, the general statement by the special representative—which might have been made by the representative of the United Kingdom—proves only one thing: that, somehow or other, such statements must justify the failure of the Administration to abide by the provisions of the Charter.

125. Sir Alan BURNS (United Kingdom): Before the next question is asked, may I just state that my Government, as Administering Authority, is carrying out its obligations in respect to Togoland in full accordance with the terms of the Charter and of the Trusteeship Agreement. And I do not wish the representative of the Soviet Union to put speeches into my mouth; I am quite capable of making my own.

126. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): I know that the United Kingdom representative is quite capable of speaking for himself. It is true that what he says is different from what I am about to say, but there are many reasons for that. Do not think that I am naïve enough to expect him, as representative of the United Kingdom, to agree with what I say; I know that he will not. It is not my purpose to persuade him to agree with me when I know in advance that he does not. I know why he does not agree with me. But that is a somewhat different matter.

127. My next question relates to paragraph 52 of the annual report. I should like to know how many indigenous inhabitants of the Trust Territory are members of the Executive Council as so-called representative members, and why they are known as representative members inasmuch as they are ultimately appointed to the Council by the Governor? I should like the special representative to explain this to me.

128 Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): The answer to the first part of the question asked by the representative of the Soviet Union is: none. The answer to the second part is that the Governor is confined in his choice to representative members of the Legislative Assembly who have, in turn, been approved for that purpose by a majority vote of the Legislative Assembly itself. It seems to me that the members so chosen cannot fail to be fully representative.

129. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): I therefore take it that there are no such representative members from the Trust Territory.

130. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): No, that is not correct.

131. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): I should like to explain myself. I asked how many indigenous inhabitants of the Trust Territory are included in the Executive Council in the capacity of so-called representative members? The special representative first said that there were none. Now he says that what I said, namely that there are none, is wrong. I should like to know whether or not there are any indigenous inhabitants in the Executive Council as so-called representative members?

132. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): I must apologize to the representative of the Soviet Union; I must have misunderstood his questions. The first question I understood to relate to representative members of the Executive Council, and I informed him correctly that there were no Togolandans among that membership. The second question, as I understood it, related to the representative members of the Legislative Assembly. That is how it was interpreted to me—perhaps wrongly—and the answer to that is, of course, that which I gave to the representative of China a few moments ago, namely, that there are five members of the Legislative Assembly who are Togolandans.

133. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): I have been talking all the time about the Executive Council, and, as I am told, the interpretation was correct. I cannot, therefore, complain of the interpreters in this instance. I should like to know whether the Administering Authority intends to have representative members on the Executive Council from the Trust Territory.

134. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): I am sorry about my previous replies. I did not think that the representative of the Soviet Union would ask the same question in exactly the same way again. The position is that there are no geographical limits set as to the membership of the Executive Council. There is nothing in the law to stop all the representative members of the Executive Council being Togolandans. At the same time, there is nothing to require that any specific number of them should be Togolandans.

135. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): That is a general statement. I should like to know, however, what the Administering Authority is doing in the Trust Territory to see that representatives of the Territory are in the membership of the Executive Council. It is one thing to have a general provision but quite another thing to have this provision implemented so that there are representatives of the Trust Territory on the Executive Council. Otherwise, the impression is given that you have drafted the law on membership of the Executive Council so as to justify the non-appointment of representatives of the Trust Territory to the Executive Council. Since we are now dealing with Trust Territories as the Trusteeship Council is bound to do, I should like to know what

plans the Administering Authority has and what it is doing to guarantee representation of the Trust Territory by means of representatives of the Territory on the Executive Council. I gather from the special representative's general answer that nothing is being done. I should like the special representative to confirm that nothing is being done; after which I shall go on to the next question.

136. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): The choice of the highest executive body in every country is an extremely difficult one, and among the characteristics of the members of that body are the characters of the persons involved. The inhabitants of Togoland under United Kingdom trusteeship are receiving, and will continue to receive, the same educational opportunities as the people in the Gold Coast, and if education alone were sufficient to ensure representation on the Council, then I am sure that a representative would not be lacking.

137. The party political system is, however, developing. It may well be that the Togolandese will have to use their political acumen in such a way as to bargain their votes in the Legislative Assembly with other groups, in order to acquire the position where their membership of the Executive Council becomes necessary. But the Governor will, of course, continue to require members of the Executive Council to be men of the very highest calibre. It would be unreasonable to expect him to nominate for appointment to that Council anyone who was not of the highest calibre.

138. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): My next question relates to paragraph 59 of the annual report, which states that the Legislative Assembly of the Gold Coast has power to pass laws for the Gold Coast and the Trust Territory. Thus, as is known, there are no legislative, administrative or judicial organs in the Trust Territory independent of those of the Gold Coast. I should like to know whether the Administering Authority has any plans for setting up legislative, executive and judicial organs in the Trust Territory which would be independent of those of the Gold Coast.

139. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): As I have already explained, so far as I am aware there are no plans for altering the legislation dealing with the present relationship between the Gold Coast and Togoland under United Kingdom trusteeship.

140. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): I should like to know how many indigenous inhabitants have been nominated as ministers, ministerial secretaries, permanent secretaries and heads of departments, if such exist.

141. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): I have already given the figure as regards ministers; it was none. As regards ministerial secretaries, one is a Togolander, and another is the person to whom I have referred, from the borders of the Trust Territory, who has resided mainly in the Trust Territory although he was, technically, born outside it; he has, in fact, a wide knowledge of the particular area of the Territory in which he lives.

142. I believe the representative of the Soviet Union also asked for the number of Togolandese who are permanent secretaries and the number who are heads of departments. May I refer him to the complete list of Togolandese in the senior branches of the civil service, to be found in paragraph 827 of the annual report.

143. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): My next question relates to paragraph 58 of the report, in which it is stated that: "The new Legislative Assembly now comprises representatives of all parts of the Gold Coast..." The special representative's reply concerning the composition of the Legislative Assembly is therefore to be construed to mean that there are at present representatives of Togoland in the Legislative Assembly.

144. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): that is correct.

145. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): I should like to know why the Trust Territory is not represented in the Legislative Assembly as a separate unit.

146. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): The opening sentence of paragraph 58 of the report was not meant to be exclusive. It was meant merely to indicate that the Northern Territories and Northern Section had for the first time been brought into the new legislative body. In practice, the Southern Section of Togoland is represented as a distinct unit: it has two representatives from constituencies and one territorial member. The Northern Section, however, is not represented as a distinct unit, since, at the moment, the members for that area are elected by a single electoral college for the joint area of the Northern Territories and the Northern Section. In view of the extremely close ties which exist between the people who live in those two areas, they prefer the situation to remain as it now is.

147. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): But the point is that the Trust Territory as such, as a unit, is not represented in the Legislative Assembly. It cannot be said that the representatives of the Trust Territory constitute a representative council within the Legislative Assembly as representatives of the Trust Territory or that they are in a special position or even have a certain organizational structure as representatives of the Trust Territory. They are simply representatives of the various constituencies, as the special representative has said. Is that correct?

148. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): They are, as I have explained, representatives of various constituencies. I am afraid I see nothing improper in that, or in the fact that they have not, as the URSS representative suggests, a status superior to or different from that of the other members of the Legislative Assembly.

149. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): I do not know what the special representative is referring to. I did not use either word; I asked whether the representatives from the Trust Territory are organizationally distinct within the Legislative Assembly. I did not say that anything was "superior to" or "different from" anything else.

150. Sir Alan BURNS (United Kingdom): The special representative has twice answered the question. He has made it perfectly clear that, as is stated at the end of paragraph 58 of the annual report, three members represent the Southern Section of the Territory, and the rest, representing the Northern Section, are elected by a special electoral college.

151. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): That is not the point. I am clarifying what I said. I should not like the special representative to attribute to me words which I never used. That is the point.

152. Now as regards paragraph 57 of the report: when I asked the special representative about indigenous inhabitants of the Trust Territory being appointed ministers, ministerial secretaries, permanent secretaries and heads of departments, he referred me to paragraph 827 of the report. I have again looked at that list but it is not clear from it how many permanent secretaries, ministers and so forth there are. The list merely states:

"There are now nine Togolandians holding senior posts in the Civil Service, as follows: one Administrative Officer; one Medical Officer; two Masters, Achimota School; one Wireless Officer, Posts and Telegraphs Department; one Inspector, Posts and Telegraphs Department; one Certifying and Examining Officer, Transport Department; one Office Assistant, Education Department; one Engineer, Public Works Department."

153. It is not clear to me whether the references to "one Administrative Officer" or "one Medical Officer" mean that they are, say, heads of departments, or indeed what position they fill in a department. That is why I asked and again ask the special representative to explain, if possible, what is meant by "medical officer"? He apparently regards it as a post, which is not quite clear to me. Can it be said, for example, that he has the same rank as a head of department? In my opinion, no.

154. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): I did not intend to conceal anything in my reply, but to give the fullest possible information. I can only say that none of the persons holding the posts listed in the paragraph in question are either permanent secretaries or heads of departments. In fact, the head of the Medical Department, as will be seen from the report, is the Director of Medical Services. He is responsible for a number of medical officers who carry out the medical work under his control. As I say, the posts listed there are not those of heads of departments.

155. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): My next question refers to paragraph 70 of the report. I should like to know how many voters in the Trust Territory took part in the general elections to the Legislative Assembly and what local tax, if any, has to be paid by a voter in order to be put on the list of voters.

156. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): I am afraid that the only information I have regarding the number of persons who participated in the last general election in the Territory is contained in the figures to be found in paragraph 129 of the report. The tax which has to be paid to qualify for registration is, of course, the Native Authority annual rate. The classes, generally speaking, which are eligible to pay annual rate are to be found listed in appendix V, section A, of the annual report. Perhaps I can just conveniently summarize this for the information of the Council. For example, in the south all men and all women, except those in one division which did not at that time form part of a Native Authority, were required to pay annual rate. Therefore, payment of annual rate is a qualification for voters in all except that one division.

157. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): As the special representative knows, the information in paragraph 129 is not particularly full or accurate. I was interested therefore in getting fuller information. I should also like to know, in connexion with paragraph 74, which candidates are put forward in the first stage of the elections.

158. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): I believe that in the primary elections any one person who is eligible to vote may nominate a candidate, and the candidate is seconded by any other person who is eligible to vote.

159. Mr. SOLDATOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics): If I correctly understand the data in paragraphs 74 and 77 of the report, in the Northern Section of Togoland there is one elector for every 10,000 persons, while in the Southern Section there is one for every 1,000. I am not quite sure whether I have understood this passage of the report correctly. I should therefore like to know whether those proportional figures are correct and, if so, why is there such a difference.

160. Mr. ENSOR (Special representative for Togoland under British administration): The systems of election in the two sections are entirely different. In the north there is a single electoral college which meets at one central place, Tamale, for the whole of the Northern Territories and the Northern Section. There, if we exclude the members of the Northern Territories Council, we find that the members of the electoral college are on a basis of roughly one per 10,000. In the south, however, there are distinct constituencies. The elections take place within those constituencies, and the electoral college which sits in each constituency is, as the representative who has asked the question puts it, on a basis of approximately one per 1,000 persons.

The meeting rose at 5 p.m.