



General Assembly

Distr.: General
11 November 1998

Original: English

Fifty-third session

Agenda item 137

Financing of the International Criminal Tribunal for the Prosecution of Persons Responsible for Genocide and Other Serious Violations of International Humanitarian Law Committed in the Territory of Rwanda and Rwandan Citizens Responsible for Genocide and Other Such Violations Committed in the Territory of Neighbouring States between 1 January and 31 December 1994

Revised estimates for 1998 and estimates for 1999

Report of the Advisory Committee on Administrative and Budgetary Questions

I. Introduction

1. The Advisory Committee on Administrative and Budgetary Questions has considered advance drafts of the reports of the Secretary-General on the revised estimates for 1998 (A/C.5/53/14) and the financing for 1999 (A/C.5/53/15) of the International Criminal Tribunal for the Prosecution of Persons Responsible for Genocide and Other Serious Violations of International Humanitarian Law Committed in the Territory of Rwanda and Rwandan Citizens Responsible for Genocide and Other Such Violations Committed in the Territory of Neighbouring States between 1 January and 31 December 1994. During its consideration of the matter, the Committee met with the Prosecutor and the Registrar of the Tribunal and with representatives of the Secretary-General, who provided additional information.

2. By its resolution 1165 (1998) of 30 April 1998, the Security Council, acting under chapter VII of the Charter of the United Nations, decided to establish a third Trial Chamber of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda, and towards that end, amended articles 10, 11 and 12 of the

statute of the Tribunal covering its organization, the composition of its Chambers and the qualifications and election of judges.

3. The Security Council also decided that as an exceptional measure to enable the third Trial Chamber to begin to function at the earliest possible date and without prejudice to article 12, paragraph 5, of the statute, three newly elected judges, designated by the Secretary-General in consultation with the President of the Tribunal, should commence their term of office as soon as possible following the elections. The Committee notes that the elections were held in November 1998.

II. Revised estimates for 1998

4. By its resolution 52/218 of 22 December 1997, the General Assembly appropriated to the Special Account for the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda a total amount of \$56,736,300 gross (\$50,879,100 net) for the period from 1 January to 31 December 1998. The most recent projection

of expenditure is \$52,297,900 gross (see A/C.5/53/14, sect. III, and annex V below). The report on revised estimates for 1998 first projects expenditure on the basis of data available to the end of June 1998. This projection is again revised in section III of the document. In future, this approach should be avoided as it is somewhat confusing.

5. With regard to staff resources, the initial appropriation authorized 582 posts; 34 additional posts are requested for 1998 (A/C.5/53/14, table 2). The additional posts are distributed as follows: 6 for the Chambers, 10 for the Office of the Prosecutor and 18 for the Registry. The Advisory Committee was informed, however, that it was not expected that those posts would be occupied until at least 1 January 1999. This factor has been taken into account in the revised estimates for 1998.

6. By its letter of 8 May 1998, the Advisory Committee concurred with the request of the Secretary-General to enter into commitments in an amount not exceeding \$1,464,600 gross (\$1,350,500 net) in 1998 for activities called for by the Security Council in its resolution 1165 (1998) on the understanding that the resources would be utilized on an as-needed basis.

7. The Advisory Committee notes that vacancy rates for the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda have been very high for 1998. In the Professional category they range from 42 per cent in January to 33.2 per cent in September. In the General Service category, the corresponding numbers are 26.5 and 22.8 per cent. The combined rate for both categories is 32.6 per cent in January 1998 and 26.9 per cent in September 1998. The rates projected for December 1998 are 14.3 and 10.2 per cent, with a combined rate of 11.9 per cent (see annex I below).

8. The Advisory Committee notes that as at September 1998, 164 posts were vacant as follows: 4 General Service posts in the Chambers, 47 posts in the Office of the Prosecutor (38 Professional and 9 General Service) and 113 posts in the Registry (42 Professional and 71 General Service). The Committee was informed that by December 1998, the number of posts projected to be vacant would be 73, as follows: 2 General Service posts in the Chambers, 29 posts in the Office of the Prosecutor (23 Professional and 6 General Service) and 42 posts in the Registry (12 Professional and 30 General Service) (see annex I below). On this basis it is assumed that a total of 97 posts would be filled between September and December 1998. The experience of the Committee leads it to doubt the capacity of the Tribunal to reduce by 56 per cent the vacancy situation between September and December 1998.

9. Upon enquiry, the Advisory Committee confirmed that an estimated 543 staff are expected to be on board as of December 1998. The Committee was also informed that under the revised estimates for 1998, the size of the Personnel Section remains the same as in the 1998 original appropriation, i.e., 13 posts, comprising 1 P-5, 3 P-3s, 1 P-2, 1 General Service (Principal level), 3 General Service (Other level) and 4 local level posts. The Committee notes that of the five Professional posts, one is for a recruitment officer at the P-3 level (see A/C.5/53/15, annex IV, para. 94). The Committee was informed that the United Nations Secretariat has agreed to send a team of three recruitment officers to Arusha for a short time to provide additional support. The Committee questions the time it has taken for this assistance to be provided. The Registrar informed the Committee that in June 1998, new arrangements were agreed to with the Department of Management to expedite the recruitment process. The Committee stresses the importance that the Office of the Prosecutor act quickly in selecting candidates. In view of the fact that the Prosecutor is stationed at The Hague and the Deputy Prosecutor is stationed at Kigali, there is a need to streamline considerably the clearing process for candidates for the Office of the Prosecutor.

10. The Advisory Committee was informed that the projected expenditure for 1998 was based on data available at 30 June 1998. For staff costs, the most recent accounting data were not available. The Committee is concerned at the time it has taken to enter expenditure data from the field into the main expenditure record. It notes that the international payroll continues to be handled from New York while the local staff payroll is handled in Arusha.

11. The Advisory Committee notes that the commitment authority for the third Trial Chamber not exceeding \$1,464,600 million authorized by the Committee did not lead to additional expenditure. The Chamber is to start operating effective 1 January 1999.

12. The Advisory Committee also notes that because of the delay and the high vacancy rate at the Tribunal, projected expenditure to the end of the year shows a reduction in requirements of \$4.34 million gross.

The Chambers

13. The Advisory Committee notes that the posts for the third Chamber (3 P-2 and 3 General Service posts) have not been filled as a result of the postponement of the election of Judges, which took place only on 3 November. The expenditure indicated in the report of the Secretary-General

on revised estimates for 1998 (A/C.5/53/14, paras. 9–12) will not be required.

14. For 1998, out of an initial appropriation of \$2.2 million gross, an expenditure of \$1.8 million gross is projected.

Office of the Prosecutor

15. The 1998 projected expenditure for the Office of the Prosecutor is \$14,064,300 net (\$15,699,500 gross) against an initial appropriation of \$16,308,400 gross (\$14,091,100 net). Under the revised 1998 estimates, there is a total of 138 (initially 130) Professional posts, including 14 extrabudgetary, and 23 General Service and Local level posts (see A/C.5/52/14, table 6, and annex II below). Of the total, five Professional and two General Service posts are at The Hague, for the Office of Prosecutor, the Appeals Unit and the Legal Advisory Group. Under the revised estimates, eight Professional and two General Service posts are for the third Trial Chamber.

16. The Advisory Committee expresses concern at the high vacancy rate in the Office of the Prosecutor. It was informed that the posts of Chief of Investigation (vacant since January 1998) and the Chief of Prosecution have remained vacant for a long time.

17. The Advisory Committee notes that two additional trial teams have been requested for the third Chamber as follows: two P-5 posts for senior trial attorneys, two P-4 co-counsels, two P-3 trial attorneys, two P-2 case managers and two General Service trial assistants. However, the Committee was informed that the third Chamber would not start operating until 1 January 1999. Under the circumstances, the Committee recommends approval of these posts, but from 1 January 1999 only (see para. 19 below).

18. The Advisory Committee notes that a total of 90 investigations are projected for 1998 and 1999 (see A/C.5/53/14, annex II, and A/C.5/53/15, para. 41). The Committee was informed that that number referred to targeted individuals rather than events. With regard to trials, the Committee notes that six trials were envisaged in the initial estimates and that five trials are projected for 1998. For 1999, six trials are projected. The Committee understands that the

number of cases actually tried depends on a number of factors, including the duration of each trial and the complexity of the case.

The Registry

19. As indicated in paragraph 17 above, the 18 posts for the third Chamber will not be required till 1 January 1999. As in other cases above, they have been taken into account in the calculation of the vacancy rates used for the most recent projection of expenditure for the Registry.

20. The Advisory Committee notes that the projected expenditure for supplies and materials has increased from an initial appropriation of \$988,100 to \$1,440,500 (see annex V below). Upon enquiry, the Committee was informed that the increase was due to the following main factors: additional expenditure was projected for vehicle fuel; while the original estimates were based on an average of 1,500 km per vehicle per month, the new estimate was based on 2,500 km per vehicle per month; the Tribunal has 160 vehicles divided between Arusha and Kigali; an increase in fuel for generators is projected because of more use of generators owing to frequent power shortages in Arusha; medical supplies, in particular for detainees, have increased as a result of a number of detainees being in poor health; and more security and safety supplies and anticipated supplies for additional space will be required.

21. The Advisory Committee notes that the construction of the third courtroom, alterations of the second one and alterations of the third and fourth floors for occupation by the Judicial and Legal Services Division and the three new trial Judges are planned to be completed by 31 December 1998 (see A/C.5/53/15, para. 18).

22. Upon enquiry, the Advisory Committee was informed that in the original appropriation for 1998, an amount of \$1,367,600 was allocated for rental and maintenance of premises. However, in the context of the analysis of expenditure trends indicated in the report on revised estimates for 1998 (A/C.5/53/14, sect. III), the total expenditure for rental and maintenance of premises in 1998 is projected at \$1,036,300.

23. With regard to the request for six hard-body vehicles, the Advisory Committee recalled that an amount of \$411,000 was indicated in the 1997 performance report for such vehicles. The Committee notes that the vehicles have not yet been purchased. Upon enquiry, the Committee was informed that the delays in the procurement of hard-body vehicles relate to the time required for a market survey of this highly

specialized field. The Committee notes that the amount of \$820,100 requested for the vehicles is based on quotations received from vendors and includes transportation costs (see A/C.5/53/14, para 22 (d)).

24. As indicated in the summary of the report (A/C.5/53/14), the General Assembly is requested to approve a revised staffing table providing for 34 additional posts and a revised appropriation of \$52,297,900 gross (\$48,043,400 net), which represents a reduction in requirements of \$4,340,700 gross (\$2,835,700 net). Bearing in mind paragraphs 5, 13, 17 and 19 above, the Advisory Committee recommends approval of the Secretary-General's revised estimates for 1998.

III. Estimates for 1999

25. As indicated in the report of the Secretary-General on 1999 resource requirements for the Tribunal (A/C.5/53/15, para. 8), the estimates for 1999 amount to \$80.6 million gross, an increase of \$22.2 million gross, or 43.6 per cent, over the 1998 initial appropriation of \$56.7 million gross. However, this increase is based on the initial estimates. If the most recent projection of expenditure for 1998 is taken as the base, the increase becomes \$28.3 million, or 54.1 per cent. It should be noted, however, that the most recent projection of expenditure for 1998 does not include the full effect of the additional expenditure for the third Chamber and the related cost of 34 additional staff (see para. 11 above).

26. The number of proposed temporary posts for 1999 is 838, an increase of 256 posts, including 34 requested in the context of the revised estimates. The distribution of the new posts is as follows: 76 for the Office of the Prosecutor and 193 for the Registry, including a transfer of 13 posts from the Chambers (see *ibid.*, tables 5 and 6 and paras. 28 and 42). The number of reclassifications proposed for 1999 is nine (1 P-4, 3 P-3 and 5 P-2s).

27. The Advisory Committee notes that factors affecting the budget are the additional estimates in 1999 for the third Chamber, effective 1 January 1999, stepped-up investigations and the arrest and transfer of detainees as well as major enhancements envisaged for the delivery of support services, and the projected increase in the number of suspects in custody from 23 in 1997 to 40 in 1998 and to 54 in 1999. With regard to investigations however, the Committee notes that for 1999, the number of investigations planned is 90, which is the same number planned for 1998. For trial cases, five are indicated for 1998 and six for 1999. As mentioned above the five cases were tried by two Chambers. In connection with the number of suspects, the Committee notes

that their increase will lead to the need for more holding cells at the detention centre.

The Chambers

28. With respect to workload indicators (see A/C.5/53/15, para. 27), the Advisory Committee was informed that four of the five cases expected to be tried in 1998 would be completed; a fifth case is expected to extend into 1999.

29. As indicated in paragraph 26 above and in the report of the Secretary-General (A/C.5/53/15, annex IV, para. 1), 13 posts (7 P-2 and 6 General Service) have been transferred to the Registry.

30. The Advisory Committee welcomes the introduction of pre-trial court management (see *ibid.*, para. 21), and trusts that the new procedure will assist in speeding up the prosecution of cases.

31. With regard to the emoluments of the judges, the Advisory Committee points out that they will depend on what action the General Assembly takes on the report of the Secretary-General on conditions of service and compensation for members of the International Court of Justice (A/C.5/53/11); the Committee has recently completed its consideration of that report and submitted its recommendations to the Assembly.

The Office of the Prosecutor

32. For 1999, the Office of Prosecutor is requesting a total of 66 new posts (53 Professional and 13 General Service). Their functional allocation is indicated in the report of the Secretary-General on requirements for 1999 (A/C.5/53/15, para. 42, table). The Advisory Committee notes that this number excludes 10 posts requested in the 1998 revised estimates.

33. As indicated in the report (*ibid.*, annex IV, para. 2) and in annex II below, because of the distance separating the Prosecutor from the Deputy Prosecutor and the Registrar, five Professional and two General Service posts are situated at The Hague to provide effective coordination and communication with Arusha and Kigali.

34. The Advisory Committee notes that a new P-3 post is requested for a legal assistant to the Deputy Prosecutor (see *ibid.*, para. 5). The Committee doubts the need for a P-3 legal assistant to review all legal materials emanating from the legal advisers and from the Court in Arusha as well as the Court in The Hague and for making recommendations for

action to the Deputy Prosecutor. The Committee points out that there is already a complement of five Professionals with legal background who should undertake the work to be assigned to the new P-3 post. As shown in the report of the Secretary-General (*ibid.*, para. 16), two legal advisers are already at The Hague for the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda supporting the Prosecutor.

35. The Secretary-General proposes to increase the number of trial teams by another three (*ibid.*, para. 9). For the Trial Section, the current staffing comprises four trial teams, each with four Professionals (a P-5 senior trial attorney, a P-4 co-counsel, a P-3 assistant trial attorney and a P-2 case manager) (see A/C.5/52/13, annex IV, para. 7). However, the Advisory Committee notes that the reference to six trial teams in the report of the Secretary-General (A/C.5/53/15, annex IV, para. 8) takes into account the additional two trial teams proposed to be added in the context of the revised estimates. As indicated in paragraph 11 above, the third Chamber will become functional effective 1 January 1999, and the Committee has recommended that the number of teams be increased to six as from that date.

36. The Advisory Committee notes that with four trial teams in 1998, five cases will be tried. However, according to the estimates, it has been assumed that nine trial teams in 1999 (six trial and three preparatory teams) will prosecute six cases.

37. Under the circumstances, and taking into account the views expressed above concerning the optimum use of trial and investigation personnel, the Advisory Committee is of the view that a case has not been made to add more than two preparatory teams over and above the two additional teams already requested in the revised estimates for 1998. The Committee also points out that prosecution and preparatory personnel are often used interchangeably depending on the workload. Furthermore, the Committee doubts the necessity of all the trial attorneys being in court simultaneously during trial. Indeed, some of the trial attorneys could also perform preparatory work during periods when they are not in court. The Committee therefore recommends that eight trial teams be approved comprising the six trial teams proposed in the 1999 estimates and two preparatory teams. Accordingly, of the proposed new posts (see *ibid.*, paras. 9–12), the Committee recommends approval of eight (2 P-5, 2 P-4, 2 P-3 and 2 P-2).

38. The Advisory Committee notes that it is proposed to transfer the entire Trial Section from Kigali to Arusha (see A/C.5/53/15, para. 11).

39. The Advisory Committee also notes that the functions of prosecution legal advisers and investigation legal advisers

have been grouped under one P-5 supervisor (see *ibid.*, annex IV, paras. 13–20). The Committee welcomes this arrangement. For 1998, the number of posts assigned to both functions total 14 Professional (including 1 P-4 post funded from extrabudgetary resources) and 1 General Service post. Of the Professional posts, two are situated at The Hague (1 P-4 and 1 P-3). For 1999, a total of 22 Professional posts are proposed, including 7 new posts, and 1 P-4 redeployed from the Forensic Unit (there is also 1 P-4 funded from extrabudgetary resources); 4 General Service posts are proposed, including 1 new post (see annex II below).

40. The Advisory Committee has no objection to the redeployment of a P-4 post from the Forensic Unit, which has been disbanded (see *ibid.*, para. 41), to the Prosecution Legal Advisers Unit (see *ibid.*, para. 18).

41. An attempt is made to justify the request for six additional P-3 posts for the Investigations Legal Advisers Unit (*ibid.*, paras. 19 and 20). The functions of the investigations legal advisers are explained in the report of the Secretary-General on 1998 resource requirements (A/C.5/52/13, annex IV, para. 8) and are reiterated in the report on 1999 requirements (A/C.5/53/15, annex IV, paras. 19 and 20). The Advisory Committee notes that currently this function is allocated nine P-4 posts.

42. The Advisory Committee notes that the investigations legal advisers eventually are transferred to a trial team to act as co-counsel to the trial attorneys (*ibid.*). It is stated that the nine legal advisers are currently assigned to nine cases that had reached different stages of completion on the way to trial. In time, they would be involved with selected aspects of the trials of the cases to which they were assigned and would join the respective trial teams as co-counsel in Arusha. The Committee is not persuaded by this argument. It points out that each trial team has a co-counsel. If any of the nine current legal advisers become co-counsels, then an equal number of lawyers should be available to perform the functions of legal advisers. Accordingly, the Committee does not recommend approval of the additional six P-3 and one General Service posts requested (*ibid.*, para. 20).

43. With regard to investigations teams, 23 new posts are requested for 1999 (19 Professional and 4 General Service) (A/C.5/53/15, para. 42, table). Justification for the proposed 23 new posts is provided (*ibid.*, annex IV, paras. 27 and 28).

44. The Investigation Section is staffed by experienced criminal investigators and criminal analysts and comprises nine teams under the direction of two investigations commanders (see *ibid.*, para. 22). Furthermore, as can be seen, the nine teams comprise 63 Professional posts augmented by 2 P-3 extrabudgetary posts (*ibid.*, para. 26).

Upon enquiry, the Advisory Committee was informed that there had always been nine investigation teams and that reference to seven teams was erroneous (see A/C.5/52/13). The distribution of the proposed 19 posts in the Professional category among four groups of teams responsible for different sectors of Rwandan society and of the four General Service posts are described in the report of the Secretary-General (A/C.5/53/13, annex IV, paras. 27 and 28). The Committee recommends acceptance of the request for 23 posts.

45. In connection with the Intelligence and Tracking Unit, the Advisory Committee notes that 17 new posts are requested (14 Professional and 3 General Service) (A/C.5/53/15, annex IV, paras. 36 and 37). In addition, two posts are to be redeployed from the former Forensic Unit (see *ibid.*, paras. 34 and 35, and para. 40 above). The current staffing for the Unit is six Professional posts (one P-4, three P-3 and two P-2) (*ibid.*, para. 30). For 1999, therefore, the total posts proposed are 25 (22 Professional and 3 General Service). However, the Committee notes that the functions of the four posts to be assigned to each of the four teams of investigators are not explained (see *ibid.*, para. 37). Accordingly, the Committee recommends that each team comprise three Professional posts. On this basis, of the 16 posts proposed for the 4 teams, 12 posts should be approved, including the 3 P-3 posts currently authorized.

46. With regard to the Information and Evidence Support Section, the current staffing is five Professional and five General Service posts (*ibid.*, para. 44). The Advisory Committee has no objection to the request for five additional General Service posts, three for the Unit at Kigali and two for the Unit at Arusha.

The Registry

47. Initial resources authorized for the Registry for 1998 amount to \$38.2 million gross. According to information provided to the Advisory Committee, the most recent projection based on data as at June 1998 is \$34,768,100 gross (see annex V below). For 1999, the amount requested for the Registry is \$57,609,200.

48. With regard to staff resources, 432 posts were authorized initially and 18 were requested in the context of revised estimates, bringing the 1998 total number of posts to 450. As indicated in paragraph 8 above, throughout 1998, the Registry experienced a high vacancy rate. Information provided to the Advisory Committee indicates that as at June 1998, 41 Professional and 35 other international support staff (General Service, Field Service and Security Service) posts were vacant. As at September 1998, the corresponding

number of vacant posts was 42 Professional and 45 other international support staff, after taking into account the 18 additional posts requested, effective July 1998 for the support of the third Chamber.

49. The Advisory Committee notes that for 1999, a total of 180 new posts (36 Professional posts, 80 General Service and related posts and 64 Local level posts), are requested, including the 24 posts (6 for the Chambers and 18 for the Registry) requested in the context of the 1998 revised estimates (see A/C.5/53/15, table 10).

50. The Advisory Committee has no objection to the one P-4 post for an adviser on gender issues. It recommends that the additional Local level post for a secretary to the Protocol Officer be accommodated from within the current establishment of local posts authorized or to be authorized for the Tribunal.

51. The Advisory Committee notes that seven additional posts are requested for the Press and Information Section (3 Professional, 2 General Service and 2 Local level) (*ibid.*, annex IV, paras. 51–57). The current staffing of the Section comprises three Professional posts and one Local level post. The Committee recommends approval of the new P-2 post to develop Tribunal news items in Kinyarwanda for publication in Rwanda, the additional P-2 post for information activities at Kigali, one General Service post for a bilingual secretary and two Local level posts for Kigali.

52. The Advisory Committee recalls its recommendation against establishing an information office in Nairobi pending a review of the cost-effectiveness of having separate information infrastructures in Nairobi and The Hague (A/52/697, para. 19). In view of the information service at Arusha, the Committee was informed that the situation was being reviewed to determine whether there was still a need for an information unit in Nairobi. The Committee reiterates its opinion that there is no need for an information unit in Nairobi.

53. For the reasons set out in the report of the Secretary-General on requirements for 1999 (A/C.5/53/15, annex IV, para. 59), the Advisory Committee has no objection to the request for a P-3 post in the immediate office of the Deputy Registrar.

54. Three new posts (one P-3, one P-2 and one Local level) have been requested for the Court Management Unit. The Advisory Committee points out that there are no reasons given for the redeployment of a General Service post and the consequent request for a new Local level post (see *ibid.*, para. 61). Under the circumstances, the Committee does not concur in the request for the Local level post. For the reasons set out

in the report of the Secretary-General (*ibid.*, paras. 62 and 63), the Committee recommends the approval of the two Professional posts.

55. For reasons set out in the report of the Secretary-General (*ibid.*, paras. 73 and 74), the Advisory Committee agrees with the request for six posts for the Witness and Victims Support Section as follows: a General Service post for three safe houses, two General Service posts for witness support in Kigali, two international Security Service posts for a safe house at Kigali and a P-2 post for a witness protection officer.

56. A P-3 post is requested for a Legal Officer for enforcement of sentences (see *ibid.*, para. 77). The Advisory Committee recommends approval of this post.

57. Eleven additional posts are requested for the General Legal Services and Chambers Support Section. (For explanation see *ibid.*, paras. 78–86.) All existing posts supporting the Chambers (10 P-2 and 9 General Service) are redeployed to the Registry (*ibid.*, para. 81).

58. The Advisory Committee has no objection to the six new Professional and two General Service posts requested (see *ibid.*, paras. 80–82). Upon enquiry, the Committee was informed that the new P-4, P-2 and General Service posts for the President of the Appeals Chamber would be stationed at The Hague.

59. The Advisory Committee notes that the current establishment for the library consists of one P-2 and one Local level post. Accordingly, the Committee has no objection to the request for three new posts (one P-2 for an associate librarian at Kigali, one General Service and one Local level post) (*ibid.*, para. 86).

60. The Advisory Committee also notes that, under the Division of Administration, a review has been made of the state of medical services at Arusha and it has been concluded that a United Nations clinic should be established (see *ibid.*, para. 89). The Committee further notes that the medical officer at Arusha would be authorized to approve medical clearances of successful candidates for vacancy announcements, both locally recruited and international. He or she would also be responsible for evaluating the state of health of new detainees and for determining the best medical provider for their health needs, either at Arusha or elsewhere.

61. Additional information provided to the Advisory Committee indicates that one P-2 and one Local level post were available for medical services for 1998. The Committee notes that two new posts (one P-4 and one Local level) are being requested for a United Nations clinic (see *ibid.*, para. 91). In addition, one Local level post would be redeployed to

the clinic. However, the Committee notes that the P-2 post has been transferred to the Witness and Victims Support Section (see *ibid.*, para. 97). The Committee questions the basis of this redeployment in view of the potential workload of the new United Nations clinic. The Committee has no objection to the request for two posts (one new P-4 and one Local level post) and one Local level post to be redeployed.

62. The Advisory Committee has no objection to the new General Service post requested for the Recruitment Unit (*ibid.*, para. 95). However, since the Unit already has three General Service posts for personnel assistants, the Committee does not support the additional General Service post requested for a personnel assistant (*ibid.*, para. 96). The Committee recommends that efforts be made to use new technology in processing routine personnel matters.

63. The Advisory Committee notes that while it is proposed to transfer two General Service posts from the Finance Section to the office of the Chief of Administration and to the General Services Section respectively (*ibid.*, paras. 99 and 100), a request is made for two new General Service posts to absorb the anticipated workload. The Committee is of the view that the increase in anticipated workload should be monitored before determining whether additional posts should be established. Furthermore, the Committee points out that the new posts would be for payment and payroll. The Committee understands that international payroll is still handled at Headquarters. Accordingly, the Committee does not recommend approval of the two additional General Service posts.

64. The Advisory Committee notes that under the General Services Section, all general services were combined under one manager in 1998 comprising procurement, transport, communications and buildings management (*ibid.*, para. 101). With regard to procurement, in view of the reasons given in the report of the Secretary-General (*ibid.*, para. 103), namely, the adverse effect of a backlog in procurement activities, the Committee recommends approval of the new General Service post (see *ibid.*, para. 105). For buildings management, the Committee points out that the report of the Secretary-General (*ibid.*, paras. 106–111) does not explain clearly the extent to which additional projects in 1999 would generate enough additional staff work to warrant approval of all 13 posts (nine new and four redeployed posts) described. The report of the Secretary-General states that because of the urgent need to continue to provide accommodations for all staff and defence counsels, the Buildings Management Unit's workload will remain at a high level of delivery during 1999 (*ibid.*, para. 108). In that connection, the Committee points out that the report also indicates that the construction of the third courtroom, alterations to the second and alterations to the

third and fourth floors for occupation by the Judicial and Legal Services Division and the three new trial judges are planned for completion by 31 December 1998 (A/C.5/53/15, para. 18).

65. The Advisory Committee notes that the current staffing for the Buildings Management Unit comprises 2 Professional and 14 Local level posts (see A/C.5/53/15, annex IV, para. 109). Four more Local level posts are to be redeployed to that Unit. Under the circumstances, the Committee recommends approval of four additional Local level building management personnel who, together with the four to be redeployed, would provide the Unit with eight additional Local level personnel for 1999.

66. In connection with communications and information technology/management information systems (IT/MIS), the Advisory Committee notes that the current staffing comprises 5 Professional, 2 General Service, 8 Field Service posts and 12 Local level posts (see *ibid.*, para. 116). A request is made for nine additional Field Service posts, and one General Service post is to be redeployed to the Unit. Upon enquiry, the Committee was informed that the current eight Field Service posts in the Communications and IT/MIS Unit are assigned to the following functions: one satellite technician, one PBX/telephone technician, one radio operator, one communication technician, one computer hardware assistant, one system support assistant for the help desk, one power engineer and one generator technician. The Committee recommends five Field Service posts out of the nine requested.

67. It is proposed to establish a vehicle maintenance workshop and spare parts store for the Transport Unit (*ibid.*, para. 121). For 1999, 18 new posts, comprising 2 Field Service and 16 Local level posts, including 10 posts for drivers, are proposed. The Advisory Committee stresses the importance of monitoring the use of drivers and motor vehicles, in particular on weekends. The Committee notes that 4 dispatchers also double as drivers and that 18 Local level posts are currently for drivers. Accordingly, the Committee recommends that 5 additional Local level posts be authorized for drivers instead of the 10 requested.

68. In the proposal to establish a vehicle maintenance workshop and spare parts store, the Advisory Committee recommends that a comprehensive study of the full administrative and financial implication of the project be made before the plan is implemented. The Committee notes that this proposal has been made because of the high cost of outsourcing the maintenance and repair of vehicles in Arusha. It is the view of the Committee that the proposal should have been preceded by a cost-benefit analysis of the subject of

maintenance and repair of vehicles at Arusha. While the Committee understands that the cost of maintaining vehicles at Arusha is high, it needs to be given the full picture before it recommends approval of the related resources. For example, an explanation is provided for the request for two Field Service and six Local level posts (*ibid.*, para. 123). There is no indication of other related expenditures, such as for security (see *ibid.*, para. 128 (d)), space, utilities and start-up costs for the spare parts store. The full cost of the project is therefore not apparent. Accordingly, the Committee recommends that the need for two Field Service posts and six Local level posts be resubmitted after a thorough study of the project.

69. With regard to the Security Services Section, the Advisory Committee notes that the current staffing comprises a P-5 post for the Chief of Security, a P-3 post for the Chief of Security at Headquarters, a P-3 for the Commander of the Detention Facility, 30 security officers and 35 Local level security officer posts (*ibid.*, para. 127). For 1999, 36 new posts have been requested. The reasons for the request, including the need for additional space rented at the Arusha International Conference Centre and the opening of an off-site annex to the Detention Facility are explained in the report of the Secretary-General (*ibid.*, para. 128). The Committee therefore recommends approval of all the posts requested except the five Local level posts required for night watchmen to guard the gasoline station, transport workshop and auto parts store.

70. A total of 29 new posts are requested for language services under the Language and Conference Services Section. Justification for the additional posts for both Arusha and Kigali is provided in the report of the Secretary-General (*ibid.*, paras. 132–151). For example, it is stated that the increase in workload referred strictly to the creation of the third Trial Chamber (*ibid.*, para. 133).

71. It is also stated that approximately 116 working days per interpreter per year would be available for translation of documents (*ibid.*, paras. 135 and 138). Therefore, less has been requested for translators than would have otherwise been the case. The estimates do not indicate clearly what has been the effect of the transfer of the trial teams from Kigali to Arusha. Accordingly, the Advisory Committee recommends that the interpretation and translation services be monitored carefully and that accurate performance data be compiled to enable an accurate assessment of future needs to be made. Subject to the foregoing and for reasons given in the report of the Secretary-General (*ibid.*, paras. 136–151), the Committee recommends approval of the request for 29 additional posts for language and conference services at Arusha and Kigali (3 revisers, 12 interpreters, 2 Kinyarwanda

typists, 1 bilingual reference assistant, 2 bilingual typists, 1 documents control assistant and 8 Kinyarwanda translators).

72. Regarding administrative services at Kigali, the Advisory Committee is of the view that with the transfer of the trial team from Kigali to Arusha, administrative and related services should have a greater capacity to absorb additional work. The estimates do not show clearly what effect this has had on Kigali. Accordingly, of the 18 administrative posts (1 Field Service and 17 Local level) requested for Kigali, the Committee recommends approval of 8 additional Local level posts. For the additional Field Service post, the Committee notes that the Communications and IT/MIS Unit already has four Field Service posts. Upon enquiry, the Committee was informed that those posts were provided for a senior satellite technician, a radio operator, a PABX/telephone technician and a generator technician. The Committee recommends approval of the request for the Field Service post.

73. An amount of \$2.1 million has been requested for general temporary assistance (\$1,774,900), overtime (\$300,000) and travel (\$682,800) (A/C.5/53/15, paras. 57 and 58). Upon enquiry, the Advisory Committee was informed that the breakdown of the requirement for general temporary assistance was as follows: \$616,700 for 96 work-months for security officers for investigation and witness escorts in Rwanda; \$430,600 for 48 work-months for interpreter-translators in Kinyarwanda; \$322,900 for 36 work-months for legal officers and jurist linguists; and \$404,700 for 240 work-months for locally recruited staff for buildings management, transport and other support personnel.

74. The Advisory Committee was informed that the security situation in Rwanda had not changed substantially from what it was last year. That being the case, the Committee doubts whether the request for additional temporary assistance to accompany investigation teams in Rwanda will be required in its entirety. It should be noted that the Committee is recommending approval of all the language and security staff resources requested except those related to the guarding of the new vehicle maintenance and repair shop at Arusha. Accordingly, the Committee recommends approval of \$1,500,000 for general temporary assistance. The Committee has no objection to the request for \$300,000 for overtime and \$682,800 for travel.

75. The amount of \$6,328,800 has been requested under contractual services, the bulk being \$5,048,600 for defence counsel. The Advisory Committee notes that in addition to a lead counsel and co-counsel, half of the defendants also have investigators or assistants associated with defence teams (*ibid.*, para. 59). The Committee notes that fees for defence

counsel in the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda are similar to those paid for defence counsel for the International Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia, namely, \$110 and \$80 per hour for lead and co-counsel respectively, with maximum allowable hours of 175 per month. The Committee notes that not all defendants ask for co-counsel, but that defendants also have recourse to expert witnesses and opinions, for which an amount of \$155,900 is requested. For medical consultants for detainees, an amount of \$122,000 has been requested.

76. The Advisory Committee requested but did not receive information on the frequency of changes of defence counsel and on the types of services given to indigent defendants by a select group of countries. This information should be submitted separately to the Committee when it considers the next budget of the Tribunal. Subject to the foregoing, the Committee has no objection to the request for \$6.3 million for contractual services.

77. An amount of \$4.2 million has been requested for general operating expenses (*ibid.*, para. 61). The bulk of the request relates to rental and maintenance of premises (\$1.4 million) and communications (\$1.5 million). The Advisory Committee has no objection to those requests.

78. An amount of \$1,390,300 was requested for supplies and materials (*ibid.*, para. 62). The Advisory Committee is of the view that strict control should be maintained of resources under this item and recommends that \$1,300,000 out of the \$1,390,300 requested be approved.

79. With regard to furniture and equipment, an amount of \$2.8 million has been requested (*ibid.*, para. 63). In view of the recommendation of the Committee concerning new staff, the Advisory Committee recommends that \$100,000 of the \$150,000 requested for office furniture be granted.

80. An amount of \$662,500 has been requested for acquisition of new office automation equipment (*ibid.*, para. 63 (b)). The Advisory Committee recommends approval of \$600,000.

81. In the case of communication equipment, an amount of \$632,000 has been requested (*ibid.*, para. 63 (c)). Upon enquiry, the Advisory Committee was informed that voluntary contributions would not duplicate any of the requirements proposed under communication equipment. The Committee has no objection to the amount requested.

82. The Advisory Committee recommends the deletion of \$205,900 for spare parts for the transport workshop pending the submission to the Committee of the cost-benefit study recommended in paragraph 68 above. An amount of \$1,023,600 was requested for construction, alteration,

improvements and major maintenance (ibid., para. 64). The Committee has no objection to the amount requested.

IV. Conclusions and recommendations

83. On the basis of the recommendations and observations indicated in paragraphs 34, 37, 42, 45, 50, 51, 54, 62, 63, 65–69, 72, 74 and 78–82 above, the Advisory Committee recommends that the General Assembly approve the appropriation of the amount of \$76,161,000 gross (\$69,282,800 net) for the operations of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda in 1999. This would represent a reduction of \$4,451,600 gross (\$3,798,500 net), corresponding to 59 posts and other non-post resources and support requirements not recommended for approval by the Committee for 1999, from the estimates of \$80,612,600 gross (\$73,081,300 net) indicated in the report of the Secretary-General (A/C.5/53/15, para. 68). A summary of the post reductions recommended by the Advisory Committee for 1999 follows:

Summary of post reductions recommended by the Advisory Committee on Administrative and Budgetary Questions in the proposed 1999 budget

<i>Paragraph no.</i>	<i>Posts</i>	<i>Organizational unit</i>
34	1 P-3	Office of the Deputy Prosecutor
37	1 P-5, 1 P-4, 1 P-3, 1 P-2	Trial Section
42	6 P-3, 1 General Service	Investigations Legal Advisers Unit
45	4 P-3	Intelligence and Tracking Unit
50	1 Local level post	Immediate Office of Registrar
51	1 P-3 and 1 General Service	Press and Information Section
54	1 Local level post	Court Management Section
62	1 General Service	Personnel Section
63	2 General Service	Finance Section
65	1 General Service and 4 Local level posts	Buildings Management Unit
66	4 Field Service posts	Communications and IT/MIS Unit
67	5 Local level posts for drivers	Transport Unit
68	2 Field Service and 6 Local level posts	Transport Unit
69	5 Local level posts	Security Services Section
72	9 Local level posts	Administrative Services Section at Kigali

A total of 59 posts (16 Professional, 6 General Service, 6 Field Service and 31 Local level) were not recommended for approval for 1999. The following resources under specific items were recommended for deletion:

<i>Paragraph no.</i>	<i>Amount</i>	<i>Item</i>
74	\$274 900	General temporary assistance
78	\$90 300	Supplies and materials
79	\$50 000	Furniture and equipment
80	\$62 500	Furniture and equipment
82	\$205 900	Furniture and equipment

84. In the view of the Advisory Committee, the time has come to have an expert review of the management and organizational structure of each organ of the International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda, in particular the Office of the Prosecutor and the Registry. The Committee recommends that the Secretary-General convene a group of independent experts acting in their individual capacity to evaluate the

operation and functioning of both the Rwanda and Former Yugoslavia Tribunals. The group should comprise judges, prosecution, trial and defence experts with sufficient experience in their profession to be able to evaluate tribunals of an international character. The group should also comprise individuals from the academic community.

85. The evaluation should encompass all aspects of the functioning of the two Tribunals, including the optimum use of investigation personnel, trial and defence attorneys, co-counsels, witnesses and expert witnesses. The organizational structure of the three principal organs of the Tribunals should be assessed and, drawing on the practice of States, particular attention should be given to the services provided to indigent defendants and suspects and the long-term question of enforcement of sentences. The experience so far of operating the two Tribunals with a single Prosecutor should also be assessed.

86. The cost of the evaluation should be borne by the two Tribunals and should be reported in the performance reports. The report should be submitted to the General Assembly at its fifty-fourth session through the Advisory Committee.

Annex I

Actual and forecast staffing, incumbency and vacancy rate for the period 1 January–31 December 1998

	Authorized staffing			Actual staff on board									Forecast		
	Jan.–June	July–Nov.	Dec.	Jan.	Feb.	Mar.	Apr.	May	June	July	Aug.	Sept.	Oct.	Nov.	Dec.
A. International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda – Overall															
Under-Secretary-General	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Assistant Secretary-General	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
D–2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
D–1	4	4	4	1	1	2	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	2	2
P–5	17	19	19	8	8	9	8	9	10	10	11	12	12	15	15
P–4	49	52	52	27	27	27	27	29	30	30	36	38	38	43	46
P–3	83	86	86	58	58	57	58	62	66	67	67	62	62	75	78
P–2	76	78	81	38	38	37	38	40	43	40	44	46	46	57	66
Subtotal	231	241	244	134	134	134	135	144	153	151	162	161	161	194	209
Vacancy rate (percentage)				42.0	42.0	42.0	41.6	37.7	33.8	37.3	32.8	33.2	33.2	20.5	14.3
General Service/Principal level	7	7	7	5	5	5	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	5	6
General Service/Other level	92	104	107	66	66	66	66	68	68	65	67	73	73	78	89
Field Service	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14
Security Service	74	77	77	44	44	47	50	52	52	53	53	53	54	60	70
Local level	164	167	167	129	129	127	126	127	130	132	137	141	141	150	155
Subtotal	351	369	372	258	258	259	260	265	268	268	275	285	286	307	334
Vacancy rate (percentage)				26.5	26.5	26.2	25.9	24.5	23.6	27.4	25.5	22.8	22.5	17.5	10.2
Total	582	610	616	392	392	393	395	409	421	419	437	446	447	501	543
Vacancy rate (percentage)				32.6	32.6	32.5	32.1	29.7	27.7	31.3	28.4	26.9	26.7	18.7	11.9
<i>Note: Posts granted under the commitment authority effective 1 July 1998, except those in the Chambers authorized 1 December 1998.</i>															
B. The Chambers															
Under-Secretary-General	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Assistant Secretary-General	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
D–2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
D–1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
P–5	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
P–4	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
P–3	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
P–2	7	7	10	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	7	7	7	7	10
Subtotal	7	7	10	6	6	6	6	6	6	6	7	7	7	7	10

	Authorized staffing				Actual staff on board												Forecast			
	Jan.-June	July-Nov.	Dec.		Jan.	Feb.	Mar.	Apr.	May	June	July	Aug.	Sept.	Oct.	Nov.	Dec.				
Vacancy rate (average)					14.3	14.3	14.3	14.3	14.3	14.3	14.3									
General Service/Principal level	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
General Service/Other level	6	6	9	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	2	2	4	7			
Subtotal	6	6	9	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	2	2	4	7			
Vacancy rate (average)					66.7	66.7	66.7	66.7	66.7	66.7	83.3	83.3	66.7	66.7	55.6	22.2				
Total, civilian personnel	13	13	19	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	7	8	9	9	11	17				
Vacancy rate (percentage actual)					38	38	38	38	38	38	46	38	31	31	15	11				
<i>Note: Posts for third Trial Chamber effective 1 December 1998.</i>																				
C. The Office of the Prosecutor																				
Under-Secretary-General	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Assistant Secretary-General	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
D-2	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
D-1	2	2	2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
P-5	9	11	11	3	3	3	3	3	3	4	4	4	5	5	5	7	7			
P-4	29	31	31	18	18	18	18	18	19	19	19	22	24	24	24	27	27			
P-3	40	42	42	27	27	27	27	27	30	34	31	32	30	30	30	35	35			
P-2	35	37	37	18	18	18	17	18	19	22	19	24	26	26	26	30	30			
Subtotal	116	124	124	67	67	67	66	67	72	80	74	83	86	86	101	101				
Vacancy rate (average)					42.2	42.2	43.1	42.2	37.9	31.0	40.3	33.1	30.6	30.6	18.5	18.5				
General Service/Principal level	1	1	1	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
General Service/Other level	20	22	22	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	9	11	14	14	17	17				
Subtotal	21	23	23	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	9	11	14	14	17	17				
Vacancy rate (average)					47.6	47.6	47.6	47.6	47.6	47.6	60.9	52.2	39.1	39.1	26.1	26.1				
Total	137	147	147	78	78	78	77	78	83	91	83	94	100	100	118	118				
Vacancy rate (percentage actual)					43.1	43.1	43.8	43.1	39.4	33.6	43.5	36.1	32.0	32.0	19.7	19.7				
<i>Note: Posts granted under the commitment authority effective 1 July 1998.</i>																				

	Authorized staffing				Actual staff on board												Forecast			
	Jan.-June	July-Nov.	Dec.	Jan.	Feb.	Mar.	Apr.	May	June	July	Aug.	Sept.	Oct.	Nov.	Dec.					
D. The Registry																				
Under-Secretary-General	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—					
Assistant Secretary-General	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1					
D-2	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—	—					
D-1	2	2	2	1	1	2	2	2	2	2	2	1	1	1	1					
P-5	8	8	8	5	5	6	5	6	6	6	7	7	7	8	8					
P-4	20	21	21	9	9	9	9	10	11	11	14	14	14	16	19					
P-3	43	44	44	31	31	30	31	32	32	36	35	32	32	40	43					
P-2	34	34	34	14	14	14	14	15	15	15	13	13	13	20	26					
Subtotal	108	110	110	61	61	62	62	66	67	71	72	68	68	86	98					
Vacancy rate (percentage)				43.5	43.5	42.6	42.6	38.9	38.0	35.5	34.5	38.2	38.2	21.8	10.9					
General Service/Principal level	6	6	6	5	5	5	4	4	4	4	4	4	4	5	6					
General Service/Other level	66	76	76	53	53	53	53	55	55	55	55	57	57	57	65					
Field Service	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14	14					
Security Service	74	77	77	44	44	47	50	52	52	53	53	53	54	60	70					
Local level	164	167	167	129	129	127	126	127	130	132	137	141	141	150	155					
Subtotal	324	340	340	245	245	246	247	252	255	258	263	269	270	286	310					
Vacancy rate (percentage)				24.4	24.4	24.1	23.8	22.2	21.3	24.1	22.6	20.9	20.6	15.9	8.8					
Total	432	450	450	306	306	308	309	318	322	329	335	337	338	372	408					
Vacancy rate (percentage actual)				29.2	29.2	28.7	28.5	26.4	25.5	26.9	25.6	25.1	24.9	17.3	9.3					
Note: Posts granted under the commitment authority effective 1 July 1998.																				

