

# United Nations GENERAL ASSEMBLY

TWENTY-SECOND SESSION

Official Records



**SECOND COMMITTEE, 1177th  
MEETING**  
(Closing meeting)

Tuesday, 12 December 1967,  
at 9.10 p.m.

**NEW YORK**

## CONTENTS

	Page
<i>Agenda item 12:</i>	
<i>Report of the Economic and Social Council (concluded)</i>	
<i>Consideration of the draft resolution entitled "Outflow of trained personnel from de- veloping countries" . . . . .</i>	387
<i>Completion of the Committee's work. . . . .</i>	391

*Chairman:* Mr. Jorge Pablo FERNANDINI  
(Peru).

## AGENDA ITEM 12

Report of the Economic and Social Council (con-  
cluded) (A/6703 and Corr.1, chap. I-X, XIII, XIV  
(sect. II and VIII-X), XV and XVII; A/6703/Add.1,  
chap. I, III and IV; A/C.2/L.994/Rev.1, A/C.2/L.998)

CONSIDERATION OF THE DRAFT RESOLUTION  
ENTITLED "OUTFLOW OF TRAINED PERSONNEL  
FROM DEVELOPING COUNTRIES" (A/C.2/L.994/  
REV.1)

1. Mr. DIALLO (Upper Volta), introducing a re-  
vised version of the draft resolution (A/C.2/L.994/  
Rev.1), which was circulated earlier by the sponsors  
as document A/C.2/L.994, recalled that, at the 1125th  
meeting, the Committee had decided to adjourn the  
discussion of draft resolution A/C.2/L.958 under  
agenda item 44 and to consider the question of a  
draft resolution on the brain drain problem in con-  
nexion with agenda item 12. The sponsors of draft  
resolution A/C.2/L.994/Rev.1 had tried to take ac-  
count of the suggestions and comments that had been  
made on the earlier proposal and to submit as balanced  
a text as possible.

2. Two minor changes should be made in the text  
of the revised draft resolution (A/C.2/L.994/Rev.1).  
The words "dans le cadre des Nations Unies" in  
the third preambular paragraph of the French text  
should be replaced by the words "dans le cadre du  
système des Nations Unies". The words "interested  
developing countries" in operative paragraph 1 should  
be replaced by the words "developing countries, at  
their request".

3. Mr. KASSUM (Secretary of the Committee) said  
that the statement of financial implications contained  
in document A/C.2/L.998 had been based on an  
earlier text of the draft resolution (A/C.2/L.994).  
In the light of the changes made in the text, that  
statement would have to be amended with regard  
to the requirements for consultant services and  
travel. The Secretary-General would now require

the services of a consultant for a period of only two  
months, and travel requirements would be reduced  
to travel upon appointment and, tentatively, one  
journey for consultation with specialized agencies in  
Geneva, Paris, Rome and Vienna. Consequently, the  
financial implications for consultant's fees, sub-  
sistence and travel referred to in paragraphs 2 and  
3 of document A/C.2/L.998 should now be \$3,500,  
\$1,500 and \$1,500 respectively, making a total of  
\$6,500. It was also expected that there would be a  
significant reduction in the length of the report which  
was requested of the Secretary-General in the draft  
resolution, with corresponding reductions in the  
estimated cost of its translation, typing and repro-  
duction. Consequently, the adoption of the revised  
draft resolution (A/C.2/L.994/Rev.1) would entail  
additional expenditure in the amount of approximately  
\$9,500.

4. Mr. FIGUEREDO PLANCHART (Venezuela) said  
that the earlier decision of the sponsors to with-  
draw draft resolution A/C.2/L.958 and submit instead  
a draft resolution under agenda item 12 had given  
them time for extensive consultation with other dele-  
gations. A number of the suggestions made during the  
consultations had been taken into account in the re-  
vised draft resolution (A/C.2/L.994/Rev.1) and, as  
a result, several delegations had been added to the  
original list of sponsors.

5. The proposal in operative paragraph 4 that the  
brain drain problem should be placed on the agenda  
of the twenty-third session of the General Assembly  
reflected the conviction of the sponsors that the  
subject should be treated specifically as an important  
element within the general question of the develop-  
ment of human resources. If all the efforts in  
education, planning and other priority fields being  
discussed for the next decade were to have any  
meaning and be translated into "concrete action"  
for development, the effects could not remain unde-  
termined.

6. The provisions of operative paragraph 2 of the  
revised draft resolution took into account the fact that  
a student was inevitably deeply influenced by the en-  
vironment in which he was trained and suggested  
ways of creating a training environment which would  
encourage students to place the skills and experience  
they acquired at the service of their own countries.  
There must be a conscious effort to inculcate in the  
individual a keen determination to help solve the  
problems of his own country. The more intimately  
aware he was of the inherent problems of the en-  
vironment in which he would normally have to work,  
the more he would be immunized against the danger of  
emigration. He wished to explain that the institutions  
mentioned in the paragraph included not only those

established or supported by organizations in the United Nations system, but those maintained by the countries of different regions. The support of international organizations, universities or foundations for the latter type of institution might take such forms as fellowships or the provision of technical staff. It was significant, in that connexion, that a recent report on the effects of the brain drain problem on the United Kingdom had concluded that one way of checking that process was to set up or expand certain research institutions with a view to attracting scientific and academic personnel to the country.

7. The mere establishment of institutions would not, however, solve the acute problem facing developing countries. As the report to which he had referred had stated, the brain drain was an international problem and could not be solved by unilateral action. International co-operation with the developing countries to help them stem their growing losses was becoming urgent.

8. The ILO, UNESCO, the United Nations Institute for Training and Research (UNITAR) and other organs of the United Nations were already studying the problem. It was to be hoped that the results of their work would be incorporated in the Secretary-General's report to the following session so as to provide the General Assembly with the basis for a programme of action to be carried out within the framework of the second development decade.

9. Mr. BRATHWAITE (Barbados) said that the problem of the brain drain had been a matter of concern to his Government for some years. The Minister of Education of Barbados had recently drawn attention to the fact that less than 10 per cent of Barbados nationals educated abroad at government expense returned to the country. Barbados, which allocated 25 per cent of its national budget to education, was constantly seeking to improve the structure and quality of its educational facilities, and the literacy rate was now almost 100 per cent. As a basically agricultural country with a high population density, education was vital to its economic development, but skilled personnel were often persuaded to migrate to developed countries which encouraged them to do so. He therefore hoped that the draft resolution before the Committee would lead to a satisfactory solution of the problem and enable developing countries to retain the services of an adequate proportion of their trained personnel.

10. Mr. BADAWI (United Arab Republic) said that, although his delegation endorsed the general aims of the draft resolution, it thought it involved some duplication with a previous draft resolution considered under agenda item 44 that had already been approved by the Committee<sup>1/</sup> and adopted by the General Assembly as resolution 2259 (XXII). Moreover, operative paragraph 1, which in effect called for the provision of a type of technical assistance to developing countries, and operative paragraph 3, especially the reference to the advantages accruing to developed countries and the disadvantages accruing to developing countries, prejudged the out-

come of the studies now being undertaken with a view to assessing the full scope of the problem. He therefore suggested that the sponsors of the revised draft resolution might consider deleting operative paragraph 1 and redrafting operative paragraph 3 in such a way that it did not prejudge the outcome of those studies.

11. Mr. GOLDSCHMIDT (United States of America) said that his delegation regarded the revised draft resolution (A/C.2/L.994/Rev.1) as a useful and important proposal, but wished to suggest a few amendments. In the last preambular paragraph, the word "co-ordinate" should be replaced by the word "review", since the Secretary-General would hardly be able to co-ordinate the many studies already in progress in various United Nations bodies. In operative paragraph 2, the words "at their request" should be inserted after the words "developing countries", in accordance with the amendment made by the sponsors to operative paragraph 1. The recommendation in operative paragraph 2 should not be confined to national and regional institutions where research would be carried out or professional personnel trained, since an important role could also be played by other organizations, such as those concerned with geological exploration, which could train personnel in the field. He therefore suggested that the words "including those" should be inserted after the word "institutions" in that paragraph.

12. He agreed that the provisions of operative paragraph 3 prejudged the outcome of the studies now being carried out and suggested that the words "the advantages accruing to developed countries, and the disadvantages accruing to developing countries" should be replaced by the words "the effects on developed and developing countries". Migration was not in itself an undesirable phenomenon and required no remedy; the words "remedies for it" at the end of operative paragraph 4 should therefore be replaced by the words "remedies for problems resulting from it".

13. If those suggestions were taken into account, his delegation would have no difficulty in supporting the revised draft resolution, whose financial implications would probably be rather less than had been estimated, since the Secretary-General's proposed report need contain little more than a catalogue of the substantive studies on the brain drain problem already in progress in a number of organizations.

14. Mr. MARTIN WITKOWSKI (France) said that the revised draft resolution placed too much emphasis on the effects, and too little on the causes, of the brain drain problem. As the representative of the United Arab Republic had rightly pointed out, the organizations of the United Nations system were being asked, in operative paragraph 1, to assist developing countries to eliminate certain obstacles before the nature of those obstacles was known. Similarly, the provisions of operative paragraphs 3 and 4 were directed towards the consequences, but not the causes, of the problem. He therefore suggested the insertion of the words "causes and" before the word "effects" in the third preambular paragraph, and before the word "consequences" in operative paragraph 4. The French delegation also supported the United States representative's suggestion that the word "co-ordinate"

<sup>1/</sup> See Official Records of the General Assembly, Twenty-second session, Annexes, agenda item 44, document A/6881, para. 9.

in the third preambular paragraph should be replaced by the word "review".

15. Mr. LOBANOV (Union of Soviet Socialist Republics) said that the acute nature of the problem with which the revised draft resolution (A/C.2/L.994/Rev.1) was concerned was indicated by the fact it was currently being studied by such United Nations bodies as UNITAR, the Economic Commission for Europe, UNESCO and the ILO, as well as by some national institutions. It was to be hoped that the reports of all those bodies would be available in time for the twenty-third session of the General Assembly. If that were possible, the Assembly could devote its attention at that session to finding practical ways of dealing with a very serious problem of contemporary economic life.

16. The revised draft resolution, on the whole, took the correct approach to the problem. There were, however, a few respects in which his delegation believed it could be improved. The sponsors might, for instance, reconsider their use of the word "migration" in operative paragraph 4 and elsewhere; the phenomenon with which the document was concerned was not, after all, migration as such, but the permanent loss of the developing countries' qualified personnel to the developed countries, with its adverse consequences on their economic and social development.

17. His delegation agreed with the observations of the representative of the United Arab Republic on operative paragraph 1; the inclusion of such a provision before the various studies in progress had been completed was premature. Moreover, the reference to "local obstacles" implied that the situation was due primarily to the failure of the developing countries to create suitable conditions for the employment of their qualified personnel, which was not the case.

18. His delegation also had reservations about the progress report requested in operative paragraph 3, particularly in view of the financial implications of its preparation. It was doubtful whether such a report could add anything to the other studies by United Nations bodies to be submitted at the same time.

19. In conclusion, he said that the main defect of the revised draft resolution as a whole was its failure to emphasize the consequences of the brain drain on the developing countries. Moreover, it was in some respects weaker than recent resolutions of the Economic and Social Council and the General Assembly on the same subject. His delegation therefore suggested that it might be advisable to defer submission of a further draft resolution until the forthcoming detailed studies of the problem became available.

20. Mr. VASCONCELLOS (Brazil) said that there appeared to have been some misunderstanding regarding the revised draft resolution (A/C.2/L.994/Rev.1). When the Committee had approved the draft resolution referred to by the representative of the United Arab Republic in regard to agenda item 44,<sup>2/</sup> it had agreed that the implications of the brain drain problem far transcended the sphere of in-

dustrial training and that the problem should consequently be discussed in its broader context under item 12. Discussion of the problem in the General Assembly would be facilitated by the preparation of a single document containing the findings of the various studies now in progress, and there was therefore no danger that the report requested in operative paragraph 3 would in any way duplicate the work already done. Possible duplication and dispersal of effort could, however, be avoided if the question were to be considered by the General Assembly as a separate item, as proposed in operative paragraph 4.

21. Mr. POSNETT (United Kingdom) said that his delegation had explained its general views on the brain drain problem at the forty-third session of the Economic and Social Council, but he wished to point out first, that it was a two-way flow and, second, that developed as well as developing countries suffered from the effects of that phenomenon, as was recognized in the Secretary-General's report on the development and utilization of human resources in developing countries.<sup>3/</sup> Some developed countries, including his own, lost their highly trained personnel to other developed countries, and there was also a substantial flow of such personnel from developed to developing countries, particularly as a result of bilateral and multilateral technical assistance programmes. For example, 3,500 scientists, engineers and technicians, made available by his Government were working in developing countries in 1966, and many more were provided by United Kingdom private companies.

22. The developed countries made a substantial contribution to the training of students from developing countries: for instance, about 8,000 students of technology and science from the latter countries, many at the graduate level, were attending institutions of higher education in the United Kingdom, and represented approximately 10 per cent of the student body of those faculties. Many of the students trained in developed countries did in fact return to their own countries, taking with them the education gladly provided by the developed countries concerned. That fact should be taken into account in the studies to be prepared by the Secretariat.

23. His delegation supported the general aims of the revised draft resolution (A/C.2/L.994/Rev.1), but would like the word "drainage" in the third preambular paragraph to be replaced by the word "loss" or "migration". It shared, to some extent, the reservations expressed by other delegations regarding operative paragraph 3 and would have preferred that paragraph to reflect the complexity of the problem more clearly. For example, the brain drain from the developing countries did provide them with some advantages, as the representative of Barbados had observed at the Committee's 1123rd meeting. Similarly, there was also a brain drain among developed countries, an aspect of the problem which was of particular interest to his own country. His delegation therefore hoped that, in preparing the progress report called for in operative paragraph 3, the Secretary-General would not necessarily con-

<sup>2/</sup> Ibid.

<sup>3/</sup> Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, Forty-third Session, Annexes, agenda item 8, documents E/4353 and Add.1.

fine his attention to the somewhat narrow segment of the brain drain problem to which that paragraph now referred. His delegation realized that the sponsors had wished to concentrate on that segment, and it would therefore not go as far as those delegations which had contended that the present wording prejudged the content of the progress report. It hoped, however, that the sponsors would remember that other delegations were interested in other aspects of the problem and that the paragraph would be more in line with the general interests of the Committee as a whole if it were less restrictive.

24. The wording of operative paragraph 4, too, was somewhat restrictive. At the present stage it would be inadvisable to limit the discussion at the twenty-third session of the General Assembly to any one aspect of the problem, and it would therefore be preferable to delete the words "from the developing to the developed countries". Furthermore, his delegation associated itself with the previous speakers who had objected to the implication that migration was in itself an undesirable phenomenon which must be remedied. It therefore considered that the words "the problems resulting from" should be inserted between the words "for" and "it" at the end of that paragraph.

25. His delegation was looking forward to the progress report called for in operative paragraph 3 of the revised draft resolution, and hoped that it would mention the commendable work being done by UNITAR.

26. Mr. WILMOT (Ghana) said that his delegation supported the general aims of the revised draft resolution (A/C.2/L.994/Rev.1), which was designed to help solve a serious problem of particular concern to the developing countries. It considered, however, that the relationship between the third preambular paragraph and operative paragraph 3 needed some clarification. The third preambular paragraph noted that the Secretary-General intended "to compile and co-ordinate studies, undertaken by the United Nations system", while operative paragraph 3 requested the Secretary-General to "assemble and analyse the comments and information" received from Governments and the United Nations system. He would be grateful if the sponsors could explain the difference, if any, between the "studies" referred to in the third preambular paragraph and the "comments and information" mentioned in operative paragraph 3. If, as he suspected, they were the same, the draft resolution would have no financial implications, for the Secretary-General already intended to undertake the work called for in operative paragraph 3 and funds must have been allocated for that purpose. Much confusion would be avoided if operative paragraph 3 were reworded as follows:

"Requests the Secretary-General to expedite the compilation and co-ordination of the studies envisaged in the third preambular paragraph, highlighting, *inter alia*, the effects on developed and developing countries as a result of the tendency of trained personnel from the latter to remain in the industrialized countries or to leave their country after they have received their training and to submit a report on that subject to the General Assembly at its next session;"

27. Mr. WALDRON-RAMSEY (United Republic of Tanzania) said that the contradiction between the two paragraphs mentioned by the representative of Ghana was more apparent than real: the action mentioned in the third preambular paragraph was somewhat vague and no time had been set for its completion, whereas the action requested in operative paragraph 3 was clearly defined. The latter paragraph was the most important in the draft resolution, but the third preambular paragraph was not essential and could be deleted if necessary. With regard to the financial implications, his delegation considered that the action called for in the revised draft resolution could be undertaken by the existing Secretariat staff and need not involve any additional expenditure.

28. As to the suggested amendments, it would perhaps be advisable to replace the word "compile" in the third preambular paragraph by the word "review", as suggested by the United States representative. He agreed with the United Kingdom representative that the word "drainage" in the same paragraph was unsuitable; he himself would prefer to replace it by the word "outflow". He would prefer to retain the existing wording of operative paragraph 3, which defined the aspect of the brain drain problem in which the sponsors were particularly interested. He agreed with the USSR representative that the word "migration" in operative paragraph 4 was inappropriate, and supported the United Kingdom proposal that the words "the problems resulting from" should be inserted after the word "for" at the end of that paragraph.

29. Mr. DELGADO (Senegal) said that his delegation, too, favoured the general aims of the revised draft resolution (A/C.2/L.994/Rev.1), but was not completely satisfied with the existing wording. The brain drain problem was not placed in its proper context and was perhaps over-dramatized. Various organizations in the United Nations system were already studying that problem, and the draft resolution would be useful only if it called for action which complemented rather than duplicated work already in progress. Some delegations might have reservations regarding the implications of operative paragraph 1. With regard to operative paragraph 2, his delegation considered it would be unwise to recommend that the organizations in the United Nations system should intensify their support for Governments "through the United Nations Development Programme", for that would give undue prominence to the latter body. Lastly, with regard to operative paragraph 4, he agreed with the United Kingdom representative that the Committee should not prejudge the aspects of the brain drain problem which should be considered at the twenty-third session of the General Assembly.

30. Mr. WILMOT (Ghana) inquired whether the Secretary-General did in fact intend to carry out the studies referred to in the third preambular paragraph.

31. Mr. DE SEYNES (Under-Secretary for Economic and Social Affairs) replied that the action called for in the revised draft resolution seemed to go further than that requested in previous resolutions dealing with the brain drain problem, especially since it involved an analysis of the advantages accruing to the developed countries and the disadvantages

accruing to the developing countries as a result of that phenomenon.

32. The first assessment of the financial implications of the draft resolution which had been prepared somewhat hastily, had been based on the erroneous assumption that the sponsors wished the Secretariat to undertake statistical studies in the field. The revised estimate of the financial implications seemed fully justified, however, for the available information on the brain drain was highly controversial, and an experienced and competent consultant would be needed to help carry out the work called for in the revised draft resolution.

33. The CHAIRMAN suggested that the meeting should be suspended to enable the sponsors of the revised draft resolution to consult with delegations which had proposed amendments to it.

*It was so agreed.*

*The meeting was suspended at 11.20 p.m. and resumed at 12.10 a.m.*

34. Mr. DIALLO (Upper Volta) announced that, as a result of consultations with a number of delegations during the recess, the sponsors had decided to make a number of amendments to the revised draft resolution (A/C.2/L.994/Rev.1). The first was to substitute the following text for the third preambular paragraph.

*"Noting with satisfaction that the Secretary-General intends to report on the studies undertaken within the United Nations systems on the various aspects of the problem of the outflow of highly trained personnel from developing countries,".*

The second was to amend operative paragraph 1 or replacing the word "Requests" by the word "Invites", deleting the words "interested" and "local", and inserting the words "at their request" after the

words "developing countries". The third was to amend operative paragraph 2 in the following manner:

*"2. Recommends that the United Nations, the United Nations Industrial Development Organization, the United Nations Development Programme, the specialized agencies and the International Atomic Energy Agency intensify... national or regional institutions or to expand existing ones, including those where ... reg ... is";.*

The fourth amendment was to replace the part of operative paragraph 3 between the words reading "and submit" and "developing countries" by: "and, when submitting the report, to highlight the advantages and disadvantages accruing to both the developed and the developing countries". The fifth was to amend operative paragraph 4 by inserting the word "provisional" before the word "agenda", replacing the word "migration" by the word "outflow", and the words following "developed countries" by "its causes, its consequences and practical remedies for the problems resulting from it".

35. The CHAIRMAN invited the Committee to vote on the revised draft resolution (A/C.2/L.994/Rev.1), as amended.

*The revised draft resolution, as amended, was adopted unanimously.*

36. The CHAIRMAN suggested that the Rapporteur should be authorized to report directly on the item to the General Assembly.

*It was so decided.*

#### Completion of the Committee's work

37. The CHAIRMAN announced that the Committee had completed its work. After the customary exchange of courtesies, he declared the meeting closed.

*The meeting rose on Wednesday, 13 December at 12.45 a.m.*

#### HOW TO OBTAIN UNITED NATIONS PUBLICATIONS

United Nations publications may be obtained from bookstores and distributors throughout the world. Consult your bookstore or write to: United Nations, Sales Section, New York or Geneva.

#### COMMENT SE PROCURER LES PUBLICATIONS DES NATIONS UNIES

Les publications des Nations Unies sont en vente dans les librairies et les agences dépositaires du monde entier. Informez-vous auprès de votre librairie ou adressez-vous à: Nations Unies, Section des ventes, New York ou Genève.

#### COMO CONSEGUIR PUBLICACIONES DE LAS NACIONES UNIDAS

Las publicaciones de las Naciones Unidas están en venta en librerías y casas distribuidoras en todas partes del mundo. Consulte a su librero o diríjase a: Naciones Unidas, Sección de Ventas, Nueva York o Ginebra.