

Distr.  
GENERAL

HRI/GEN/1  
4 September 1992

Original:

ENGLISH

COMPILATION OF GENERAL COMMENTS AND GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS  
ADOPTED BY HUMAN RIGHTS TREATY BODIES

Note by the Secretariat

This document contains a compilation of the general comments or  
general recommendations adopted, respectively, by the Human Rights Committee,  
the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the Committee on the  
Elimination of Racial Discrimination, and the Committee on the  
Elimination of Discrimination against Women.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>Page</u>	<u>Part</u>	<u>Title</u>
1	I.	General comments adopted by the Human Rights Committee .....
35	II.	General comments adopted by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .....
55	III.	General recommendations adopted by the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination .....
62	IV.	General recommendations adopted by the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women .....

GE.92-17392/4899B (E)

Annexes

Page

81	I. List of general comments adopted by the Human Rights Committee .....
83	II. List of general comments adopted by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .....
84	III. List of general recommendations adopted by the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination .....
85	IV. List of general recommendations adopted by the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women .....

I

GENERAL COMMENTS

adopted by the Human Rights Committee\*

Introduction\*\*

adopted by The introduction to document CCPR/C/21/Rev.1 (General comments the Human Rights Committee under art. 40, para. 4, of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; date: 19 May 1989) explains the purpose of the general comments as follows:

purport "The Committee wishes to reiterate its desire to assist States parties in fulfilling their reporting obligations. These general comments draw attention to some aspects of this matter but do not to be limitative or to attribute any priority between different aspects of the implementation of the Covenant. These comments will, from time to time, be followed by others as constraints of time and further experience may make possible.

second "The Committee so far has examined 77 initial reports, 34 periodic reports and, in some cases, additional information and supplementary reports. This experience, therefore, now covers a significant number of the States which have ratified the Covenant, at present 87. They represent different regions of the world with different political, social and legal systems and their reports illustrate most of the problems which may arise in implementing the Covenant, although they do not afford any complete basis for a worldwide review of the situation as regards civil and political rights.

experience "The purpose of these general comments is to make this their available for the benefit of all States parties in order to promote further implementation of the Covenant; to draw their attention to insufficiencies disclosed by a large number of reports; to suggest improvements in the reporting procedure and to stimulate the activities of these States and international organizations in the promotion and

interest to protection of human rights. These comments should also be of  
the other States, especially those preparing to become parties to the  
Covenant and thus to strengthen the cooperation of all States in  
universal promotion and protection of human rights."

GENERAL COMMENT 1 Reporting obligation (Thirteenth session, 1981)

States parties have undertaken to submit reports in accordance with  
the article 40 of the Covenant within one year of its entry into force for  
requests. States parties concerned and, thereafter, whenever the Committee so

---

\* For document references see annex I.

the \*\* See Report of the Human Rights Committee, Official Records of  
annex VII. General Assembly, Thirty-sixth Session, Supplement No.40 (A/36/40),

for  
as  
delays  
still  
Committee.  
obligation  
in  
the  
obligation

Until the present time only the first part of this provision, calling initial reports, has become regularly operative. The Committee notes, as appears from its annual reports, that only a small number of States have submitted their reports on time. Most of them have been submitted with delays ranging from a few months to several years and some States parties are still in default despite repeated reminders and other actions by the Committee. The fact that most States parties have nevertheless, even if somewhat late, engaged in a constructive dialogue with the Committee suggests that the States parties normally ought to be able to fulfil the reporting obligation within the time limit prescribed by article 40 (1) and that it would be in their own interest to do so in the future. In the process of ratifying the Covenant, States should pay immediate attention to their reporting obligation since the proper preparation of a report which covers so many civil and political rights necessarily does require time.

GENERAL COMMENT 2 Reporting guidelines (Thirteenth session, 1981)

initially  
uniform  
complete  
the  
some  
reporting

1. The Committee has noted that some of the reports submitted were so brief and general that the Committee found it necessary to elaborate general guidelines regarding the form and content of reports. These guidelines were designed to ensure that reports are presented in a uniform manner and to enable the Committee and States parties to obtain a complete picture of the situation in each State as regards the implementation of the rights referred to in the Covenant. Despite the guidelines, however, some reports are still so brief and general that they do not satisfy the reporting obligations under article 40.

necessary  
to the  
in the  
any,  
in  
been

2. Article 2 of the Covenant requires States parties to adopt such legislative or other measures and provide such remedies as may be necessary to implement the Covenant. Article 40 requires States parties to submit to the Committee reports on the measures adopted by them, on the progress made in the enjoyment of the Covenant rights and the factors and difficulties, if any, affecting the implementation of the Covenant. Even reports which were in their form generally in accordance with the guidelines have in substance been incomplete. It has been difficult to understand from some reports

whether the Covenant had been implemented as part of national legislation and many of them were clearly incomplete as regards relevant legislation. In some reports the role of national bodies or organs in supervising and in implementing the rights had not been made clear. Further, very few reports have given any account of the factors and difficulties affecting the implementation of the Covenant.

3. The Committee considers that the reporting obligation embraces not only the relevant laws and other norms relating to the obligations under the Covenant but also the practices and decisions of courts and other organs of the State party as well as further relevant facts which are likely to show the degree of the actual implementation and enjoyment of the rights recognized in the Covenant, the progress achieved and factors and difficulties in implementing the obligations under the Covenant.

its  
been  
obtain  
be in  
the

4. It is the practice of the Committee, in accordance with Rule 68 of Provisional Rules of Procedure, to examine reports in the presence of representatives of the reporting States. All States whose reports have been examined have cooperated with the Committee in this way but the level, experience and the number of representatives have varied. The Committee wishes to state that, if it is to be able to perform its functions under article 40 as effectively as possible and if the reporting State is to obtain the maximum benefit from the dialogue, it is desirable that the States representatives should have such status and experience (and preferably be in such number) as to respond to questions put, and the comments made, in the Committee over the whole range of matters covered by the Covenant.

GENERAL COMMENT 3 (Thirteenth session, 1981)

Article 2: Implementation at the national level

it to  
in their  
recognizes, in  
constitutional  
of  
also  
under  
States  
in a  
4  
forth in

1. The Committee notes that article 2 of the Covenant generally leaves the States parties concerned to choose their method of implementation in their territories within the framework set out in that article. It recognizes, in particular, that the implementation does not depend solely on constitutional or legislative enactments, which in themselves are often not per se sufficient. The Committee considers it necessary to draw the attention of States parties to the fact that the obligation under the Covenant is not confined to the respect of human rights, but that States parties have also undertaken to ensure the enjoyment of these rights to all individuals under their jurisdiction. This aspect calls for specific activities by the States parties to enable individuals to enjoy their rights. This is obvious in a number of articles (e.g. art. 3 which is dealt with in General Comment 4 below), but in principle this undertaking relates to all rights set forth in the Covenant.

know  
case

2. In this connection, it is very important that individuals should know what their rights under the Covenant (and the Optional Protocol, as the case may be) are and also that all administrative and judicial authorities



should

be aware of the obligations which the State party has assumed under the Covenant. To this end, the Covenant should be publicized in all

official

languages of the State and steps should be taken to familiarize the authorities concerned with its contents as part of their training. It

is

desirable also to give publicity to the State party's cooperation with

the

Committee.

GENERAL COMMENT 4 Article 3 (Thirteenth session, 1981)

ensure

1. Article 3 of the Covenant requiring, as it does, States parties to

political

the equal right of men and women to the enjoyment of all civil and

in a

rights provided for in the Covenant, has been insufficiently dealt with

concerns,

considerable number of States reports and has raised a number of  
two

of which may be highlighted.

articles

2. Firstly, article 3, as articles 2 (1) and 26 in so far as those

grounds,

primarily deal with the prevention of discrimination on a number of

also

among which sex is one, requires not only measures of protection but

This

affirmative action designed to ensure the positive enjoyment of rights.

generally cannot be done simply by enacting laws. Hence, more information has  
of been required regarding the role of women in practice with a view to  
and ascertaining what measures, in addition to purely legislative measures  
being protection, have been or are being taken to give effect to the precise  
positive obligations under article 3 and to ascertain what progress is  
made or what factors or difficulties are being met in this regard.

3. Secondly, the positive obligation undertaken by States parties  
under that article may itself have an inevitable impact on legislation or  
administrative measures specifically designed to regulate matters other than those  
dealt with in the Covenant but which may adversely affect rights recognized in the  
laws Covenant. One example, among others, is the degree to which immigration  
adversely which distinguish between a male and a female citizen may or may not  
or to affect the scope of the right of the woman to marriage to non-citizens  
hold public office.

4. The Committee, therefore, considers that it might assist States  
parties if special attention were given to a review by specially appointed  
bodies or institutions of laws or measures which inherently draw a distinction  
between men and women in so far as those laws or measures adversely affect the  
rights provided for in the Covenant and, secondly, that States parties should  
give specific information in their reports about all measures, legislative  
or otherwise, designed to implement their undertaking under this article.

5. The Committee considers that it might help the States parties in  
means of implementing this obligation, if more use could be made of existing  
organizing international cooperation with a view to exchanging experience and  
assistance in solving the practical problems connected with the  
ensurance of equal rights for men and women.

GENERAL COMMENT 5 Article 4 (Thirteenth session, 1981)

1. Article 4 of the Covenant has posed a number of problems for the  
public Committee when considering reports from some States parties. When a  
officially emergency which threatens the life of a nation arises and it is

extent  
measures  
inform  
the  
which

proclaimed, a State party may derogate from a number of rights to the strictly required by the situation. The State party, however, may not derogate from certain specific rights and may not take discriminatory on a number of grounds. The State party is also under an obligation to the other States parties immediately, through the Secretary-General, of derogations it has made including the reasons therefor and the date on the derogations are terminated.

their  
applicable  
a few  
unclear not  
not  
been

2. States parties have generally indicated the mechanism provided in legal systems for the declaration of a state of emergency and the provisions of the law governing derogations. However, in the case of States which had apparently derogated from Covenant rights, it was only whether a state of emergency had been officially declared but also whether rights from which the Covenant allows no derogation had in fact been derogated from and further whether the other States parties had informed of the derogations and of the reasons for the derogations.

are of  
life of  
those  
considers  
emergency,  
derogations  
relevant

3. The Committee holds the view that measures taken under article 4 are of an exceptional and temporary nature and may only last as long as the life of the nation concerned is threatened and that, in times of emergency, the protection of human rights becomes all the more important, particularly those rights from which no derogations can be made. The Committee also considers that it is equally important for States parties, in times of public emergency, to inform the other States parties of the nature and extent of the derogations they have made and of the reasons therefor and, further, to fulfil their reporting obligations under article 40 of the Covenant by indicating the nature and extent of each right derogated from together with the relevant documentation.

GENERAL COMMENT 6 Article 6 (Sixteenth session, 1982)

dealt  
derogation  
of the  
aspect

1. The right to life enunciated in article 6 of the Covenant has been dealt with in all State reports. It is the supreme right from which no derogation is permitted even in time of public emergency which threatens the life of the nation (art. 4). However, the Committee has noted that quite often the information given concerning article 6 was limited to only one or other aspect of this right. It is a right which should not be interpreted narrowly.

continue  
human  
or use  
genocide  
effort  
to  
life.  
between

2. The Committee observes that war and other acts of mass violence continue to be a scourge of humanity and take the lives of thousands of innocent human beings every year. Under the Charter of the United Nations the threat or use of force by any State against another State, except in exercise of the inherent right of self-defence, is already prohibited. The Committee considers that States have the supreme duty to prevent wars, acts of genocide and other acts of mass violence causing arbitrary loss of life. Every effort they make to avert the danger of war, especially thermonuclear war, and to strengthen international peace and security would constitute the most important condition and guarantee for the safeguarding of the right to life. In this respect, the Committee notes, in particular, a connection between article 6 and article 20, which states that the law shall prohibit any

propaganda for war (para. 1) or incitement to violence (para. 2) as  
therein described.

3. The protection against arbitrary deprivation of life which is  
explicitly required by the third sentence of article 6 (1) is of paramount  
importance.

The Committee considers that States parties should take measures not  
only to prevent and punish deprivation of life by criminal acts, but also to  
prevent arbitrary killing by their own security forces. The deprivation of life  
by the authorities of the State is a matter of the utmost gravity.  
Therefore, the law must strictly control and limit the circumstances in which a  
person may be deprived of his life by such authorities.

4. States parties should also take specific and effective measures to  
prevent the disappearance of individuals, something which unfortunately  
has become all too frequent and leads too often to arbitrary deprivation of  
life.  
Furthermore, States should establish effective facilities and procedures  
to investigate thoroughly cases of missing and disappeared persons in  
circumstances which may involve a violation of the right to life.

5. Moreover, the Committee has noted that the right to life has been too often narrowly interpreted. The expression "inherent right to life" cannot properly be understood in a restrictive manner, and the protection of this right requires that States adopt positive measures. In this connection, the Committee considers that it would be desirable for States parties to take all possible measures to reduce infant mortality and to increase life expectancy, especially in adopting measures to eliminate malnutrition and epidemics.

6. While it follows from article 6 (2) to (6) that States parties are not obliged to abolish the death penalty totally they are obliged to limit its use and, in particular, to abolish it for other than the "most serious crimes". Accordingly, they ought to consider reviewing their criminal laws in this light and, in any event, are obliged to restrict the application of the death penalty to the "most serious crimes". The article also refers generally to abolition in terms which strongly suggest (paras. 2 (2) and (6)) that abolition is desirable. The Committee concludes that all measures of abolition should be considered as progress in the enjoyment of the right to life within the meaning of article 40, and should as such be reported to the Committee. The Committee notes that a number of States have already abolished the death penalty or suspended its application. Nevertheless, States' reports show that progress made towards abolishing or limiting the application of the death penalty is quite inadequate.

7. The Committee is of the opinion that the expression "most serious crimes" must be read restrictively to mean that the death penalty should be a quite exceptional measure. It also follows from the express terms of article 6 that it can only be imposed in accordance with the law in force at the time of the commission of the crime and not contrary to the Covenant. The procedural guarantees therein prescribed must be observed, including the right to a fair hearing by an independent tribunal, the presumption of innocence, the minimum guarantees for the defence, and the right to review by a higher tribunal.

pardon These rights are applicable in addition to the particular right to seek  
or commutation of the sentence.

GENERAL COMMENT 7 Article 7 (Sixteenth session, 1982)\*

Committee have 1. In examining the reports of States parties, members of the  
the often asked for further information under article 7 which prohibits, in  
punishment. first place, torture or cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or  
as are The Committee recalls that even in situations of public emergency such  
the envisaged by article 4 (1) this provision is non-derogable under  
or to article 4 (2). Its purpose is to protect the integrity and dignity of  
to individual. The Committee notes that it is not sufficient for the  
occur, implementation of this article to prohibit such treatment or punishment  
that make it a crime. Most States have penal provisions which are applicable  
control. cases of torture or similar practices. Because such cases nevertheless  
it follows from article 7, read together with article 2 of the Covenant,  
States must ensure an effective protection through some machinery of

---

(Forty-fourth \* General Comment 7 was replaced by General Comment 20  
session, 1992).

Complaints about ill-treatment must be investigated effectively by competent authorities. Those found guilty must be held responsible, and the alleged victims must themselves have effective remedies at their disposal, including the right to obtain compensation. Among the safeguards which may make control effective are provisions against detention incommunicado, granting, without prejudice to the investigation, persons such as doctors, lawyers and family members access to the detainees; provisions requiring that detainees should be held in places that are publicly recognized and that their names and places of detention should be entered in a central register available to persons concerned, such as relatives; provisions making confessions or other evidence obtained through torture or other treatment contrary to article 7 inadmissible in court; and measures of training and instruction of law enforcement officials not to apply such treatment.

2. As appears from the terms of this article, the scope of protection required goes far beyond torture as normally understood. It may not be necessary to draw sharp distinctions between the various prohibited forms of treatment or punishment. These distinctions depend on the kind, purpose and severity of the particular treatment. In the view of the Committee the prohibition must extend to corporal punishment, including excessive chastisement as an educational or disciplinary measure. Even such a measure as solitary confinement may, according to the circumstances, and especially when the person is kept incommunicado, be contrary to this article. Moreover, the article clearly protects not only persons arrested or imprisoned, but also pupils and patients in educational and medical institutions. Finally, it is also the duty of public authorities to ensure protection by the law against such treatment even when committed by persons acting outside or without any official authority. For all persons deprived of their liberty, the prohibition of treatment contrary to article 7 is supplemented by the positive requirement of article 10 (1) of the Covenant that they shall be treated with humanity and with respect for the inherent dignity of the human person.



7, 3. In particular, the prohibition extends to medical or scientific experimentation without the free consent of the person concerned (art. second sentence). The Committee notes that the reports of States parties have generally given little or no information on this point. It takes the view that at least in countries where science and medicine are highly developed, and even for peoples and areas outside their borders if affected by their experiments, more attention should be given to the possible need and means to ensure the observance of this provision. Special protection in regard to such experiments is necessary in the case of persons not capable of giving their consent.

GENERAL COMMENT 8 Article 9 (Sixteenth session, 1982)

persons 1. Article 9 which deals with the right to liberty and security of parties, and has often been somewhat narrowly understood in reports by States out they have therefore given incomplete information. The Committee points in that paragraph 1 is applicable to all deprivations of liberty, whether criminal cases or in other cases such as, for example, mental illness, etc. It vagrancy, drug addiction, educational purposes, immigration control, the is true that some of the provisions of article 9 (part of para. 2 and charges whole of para. 3) are only applicable to persons against whom criminal

are brought. But the rest, and in particular the important guarantee laid down in paragraph 4, i.e. the right to control by a court of the legality of the detention, applies to all persons deprived of their liberty by arrest or detention. Furthermore, States parties have in accordance with article 2 (3) also to ensure that an effective remedy is provided in other cases in which an individual claims to be deprived of his liberty in violation of the Covenant.

2. Paragraph 3 of article 9 requires that in criminal cases any person arrested or detained has to be brought "promptly" before a judge or other officer authorized by law to exercise judicial power. More precise time-limits are fixed by law in most States parties and, in the view of the Committee, delays must not exceed a few days. Many States have given insufficient information about the actual practices in this respect.

3. Another matter is the total length of detention pending trial. In certain categories of criminal cases in some countries this matter has caused some concern within the Committee, and members have questioned whether their practices have been in conformity with the entitlement "to trial within a reasonable time or to release" under paragraph 3. Pre-trial detention should be an exception and as short as possible. The Committee would welcome information concerning mechanisms existing and measures taken with a view to reducing the duration of such detention.

4. Also if so-called preventive detention is used, for reasons of public security, it must be controlled by these same provisions, i.e. it must not be arbitrary, and must be based on grounds and procedures established by law (para. 1), information of the reasons must be given (para. 2) and court control of the detention must be available (para. 4) as well as compensation in the case of a breach (para. 5). And if, in addition, criminal charges are brought in such cases, the full protection of article 9 (2) and (3), as well as article 14, must also be granted.

GENERAL COMMENT 9 Article 10 (Sixteenth session, 1982)\*

1. Article 10, paragraph 1 of the Covenant provides that all persons deprived of their liberty shall be treated with humanity and with respect for

way in  
is of  
to  
that  
concrete  
mandatory  
and  
that

the inherent dignity of the human person. However, by no means all the reports submitted by States parties have contained information on the which this paragraph of the article is being implemented. The Committee the opinion that it would be desirable for the reports of States parties contain specific information on the legal measures designed to protect that right. The Committee also considers that reports should indicate the concrete measures being taken by the competent State organs to monitor the mandatory implementation of national legislation concerning the humane treatment and respect for the human dignity of all persons deprived of their liberty that paragraph 1 requires.

---

\* General Comment 9 was replaced by General Comment 21 (Forty-fourth session, 1992).

The Committee notes, in particular, that paragraph 1 of this article is generally applicable to persons deprived of their liberty, whereas paragraph 2 deals with accused as distinct from convicted persons, and paragraph 3 with convicted persons only. This structure quite often is not reflected in the reports, which mainly have related to accused and convicted persons. The wording of paragraph 1, its context - especially its proximity to article 9, paragraph 1, which also deals with all deprivations of liberty - and its purpose support a broad application of the principle expressed in that provision. Moreover, the Committee recalls that this article supplements article 7 as regards the treatment of all persons deprived of their liberty.

The humane treatment and the respect for the dignity of all persons deprived of their liberty is a basic standard of universal application which cannot depend entirely on material resources. While the Committee is aware that in other respects the modalities and conditions of detention may vary with the available resources, they must always be applied without discrimination, as required by article 2 (1).

Ultimate responsibility for the observance of this principle rests with the State as regards all institutions where persons are lawfully held against their will, not only in prisons but also, for example, hospitals, detention camps or correctional institutions.

2. Subparagraph 2 (a) of the article provides that, save in exceptional circumstances, accused persons shall be segregated from convicted persons and shall receive separate treatment appropriate to their status as unconvicted persons. Some reports have failed to pay proper attention to this direct requirement of the Covenant and, as a result, to provide adequate information on the way in which the treatment of accused persons differs from that of convicted persons. Such information should be included in future reports.

juvenile  
that a  
is an  
opinion

Subparagraph 2 (b) of the article calls, inter alia, for accused persons to be separated from adults. The information in reports shows that a number of States are not taking sufficient account of the fact that this unconditional requirement of the Covenant. It is the Committee's opinion that, as is clear from the text of the Covenant, deviation from States parties' obligations under subparagraph 2 (b) cannot be justified by any consideration whatsoever.

respect  
of  
the  
juvenile  
appropriate

3. In a number of cases, the information appearing in reports with respect to paragraph 3 of the article has contained no concrete mention either legislative or administrative measures or of practical steps to promote the reformation and social rehabilitation of prisoners, by, for example, education, vocational training and useful work. Allowing visits, in particular by family members, is normally also such a measure which is required for reasons of humanity. There are also similar lacunae in the reports of certain States with respect to information concerning offenders, who must be segregated from adults and given treatment appropriate to their age and legal status.

and  
more  
justice

4. The Committee further notes that the principles of humane treatment and respect for human dignity set out in paragraph 1 are the basis for the specific and limited obligations of States in the field of criminal justice

set out in paragraphs 2 and 3 of article 10. The segregation of accused persons from convicted ones is required in order to emphasize their status as unconvicted persons who are at the same time protected by the presumption of innocence stated in article 14, paragraph 2. The aim of these provisions is to protect the groups mentioned, and the requirements contained therein should be seen in that light. Thus, for example, the segregation and treatment of juvenile offenders should be provided for in such a way that it promotes their reformation and social rehabilitation.

GENERAL COMMENT 10 Article 19 (Nineteenth session, 1983)

1. Paragraph 1 requires protection of the "right to hold opinions without exception or restriction. The Committee would welcome information from States parties concerning paragraph 1.

2. Paragraph 2 requires protection of the right to freedom of expression, which includes not only freedom to "impart information and ideas of all kinds", but also freedom to "seek" and "receive" them "regardless of frontiers" and in whatever medium, "either orally, in writing or in print, in the form of art, or through any other media of his choice". Not all States parties have provided information concerning all aspects of the freedom of expression. For instance, little attention has so far been given to the fact that, because of the development of modern mass media, effective measures are necessary to prevent such control of the media as would interfere with the right of everyone to freedom of expression in a way that is not provided for in paragraph 3.

3. Many State reports confine themselves to mentioning that freedom of expression is guaranteed under the Constitution or the law. However, in order to know the precise regime of freedom of expression in law and in practice, the Committee needs in addition pertinent information about the rules which either define the scope of freedom of expression or which set forth certain restrictions, as well as any other conditions which in practice affect

the  
freedom  
exercise of this right. It is the interplay between the principle of  
of expression and such limitations and restrictions which determines the  
actual scope of the individual's right.

4. Paragraph 3 expressly stresses that the exercise of the right to  
freedom  
of expression carries with it special duties and responsibilities and  
for this  
reason certain restrictions on the right are permitted which may relate  
either  
to the interests of other persons or to those of the community as a  
whole.

of  
However, when a State party imposes certain restrictions on the exercise  
freedom of expression, these may not put in jeopardy the right itself.  
Paragraph 3 lays down conditions and it is only subject to these  
conditions  
that restrictions may be imposed: the restrictions must be "provided  
by law";

they may only be imposed for one of the purposes set out in  
subparagraphs (a)  
and (b) of paragraph 3; and they must be justified as being "necessary"  
for  
that State party for one of those purposes.

GENERAL COMMENT 11 Article 20 (Nineteenth session, 1983)

1. Not all reports submitted by States parties have provided sufficient information as to the implementation of article 20 of the Covenant. In view of the nature of article 20, States parties are obliged to adopt the necessary legislative measures prohibiting the actions referred to therein. However, the reports have shown that in some States such actions are neither prohibited by law nor are appropriate efforts intended or made to prohibit them. Furthermore, many reports failed to give sufficient information concerning the relevant national legislation and practice.

2. Article 20 of the Covenant states that any propanganda for war and any advocacy of national, racial or religious hatred that constitutes incitement to discrimination, hostility or violence shall be prohibited by law. In the opinion of the Committee, these required prohibitions are fully compatible with the right of freedom of expression as contained in article 19, the exercise of which carries with it special duties and responsibilities. The prohibition under paragraph 1 extends to all forms of propaganda threatening or resulting in an act of aggression or breach of the peace contrary to the Charter of the United Nations, while paragraph 2 is directed against any incitement to discrimination, hostility or violence, whether such propaganda or advocacy has aims which are internal or external to the State concerned. The provisions of article 20, paragraph 1, do not prohibit advocacy of the sovereign right of self-defence or the right of peoples to self-determination and independence in accordance with the Charter of the United Nations. For article 20 to become fully effective there ought to be a law making it clear that propaganda and advocacy as described therein are contrary to public policy and providing for an appropriate sanction in case of violation. The Committee, therefore, believes that States parties which have not yet done so should take the measures necessary to fulfil the obligations contained in



article 20, and should themselves refrain from any such propaganda or advocacy.

GENERAL COMMENT 12 Article 1 (Twenty-first session, 1984)

1. In accordance with the purposes and principles of the Charter of the United Nations, article 1 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights recognizes that all peoples have the right of self-determination. The right of self-determination is of particular importance because its realization is an essential condition for the effective guarantee and observance of individual human rights and for the promotion and strengthening of those rights. It is for that reason that States set forth the right of self-determination in a provision of positive law in both Covenants and placed this provision as article 1 apart from and before all of the other rights in the two Covenants.

2. Article 1 enshrines an inalienable right of all peoples as described in its paragraphs 1 and 2. By virtue of that right they freely "determine their political status and freely pursue their economic, social and cultural development". The article imposes on all States parties corresponding obligations. This right and the corresponding obligations concerning its implementation are interrelated with other provisions of the Covenant and rules of international law.

3. Although the reporting obligations of all States parties include article 1, only some reports give detailed explanations regarding each of its paragraphs. The Committee has noted that many of them completely ignore article 1, provide inadequate information in regard to it or confine themselves to a reference to election laws. The Committee considers it highly desirable that States parties' reports should contain information on each paragraph of article 1.

4. With regard to paragraph 1 of article 1, States parties should describe the constitutional and political processes which in practice allow the exercise of this right.

5. Paragraph 2 affirms a particular aspect of the economic content of the right of self-determination, namely the right of peoples, for their own ends, freely to "dispose of their natural wealth and resources without prejudice to any obligations arising out of international economic cooperation, based upon the principle of mutual benefit, and international law. In no case may a people be deprived of its own means of subsistence". This right entails corresponding duties for all States and the international community. States should indicate any factors or difficulties which prevent the free disposal of their natural wealth and resources contrary to the provisions of this paragraph and to what extent that affects the enjoyment of other rights set forth in the Covenant.

6. Paragraph 3, in the Committee's opinion, is particularly important in that it imposes specific obligations on States parties, not only in relation to their own peoples but vis-à-vis all peoples which have not been able to exercise or have been deprived of the possibility of exercising their right to self-determination. The general nature of this paragraph is confirmed by its drafting history. It stipulates that "The States Parties to the present Covenant, including those having responsibility for the administration of the Non-Self-Governing and Trust Territories, shall promote the realization of the right of self-determination, and shall respect that right, in conformity with the provisions of the Charter of the United Nations". The obligations exist irrespective of whether a people entitled to self-determination depends

on a State party to the Covenant or not. It follows that all States parties to the Covenant should take positive action to facilitate realization of and respect for the right of peoples to self-determination. Such positive action must be consistent with the States' obligations under the Charter of the United Nations and under international law: in particular, States must refrain from interfering in the internal affairs of other States and thereby adversely affecting the exercise of the right to self-determination. The reports should contain information on the performance of these obligations and the measures taken to that end.

7. In connection with article 1 of the Covenant, the Committee refers to other international instruments concerning the right of all peoples to self-determination, in particular the Declaration on Principles of International Law concerning Friendly Relations and Co-operation among States in accordance with the Charter of the United Nations, adopted by the General Assembly on 24 October 1970 (General Assembly resolution 2625 (XXV)).

8. The Committee considers that history has proved that the realization of and respect for the right of self-determination of peoples contributes to the establishment of friendly relations and cooperation between States and to strengthening international peace and understanding.

GENERAL COMMENT 13 Article 14 (Twenty-first session, 1984)

1. The Committee notes that article 14 of the Covenant is of a complex nature and that different aspects of its provisions will need specific comments. All of these provisions are aimed at ensuring the proper administration of justice, and to this end uphold a series of individual rights such as equality before the courts and tribunals and the right to a fair and public hearing by a competent, independent and impartial tribunal established by law. Not all reports provided details on the legislative or other measures adopted specifically to implement each of the provisions of article 14.

2. In general, the reports of States parties fail to recognize that article 14 applies not only to procedures for the determination of criminal charges against individuals but also to procedures to determine their rights and obligations in a suit at law. Laws and practices dealing with these matters vary widely from State to State. This diversity makes it all the more necessary for States parties to provide all relevant information and to explain in greater detail how the concepts of "criminal charge" and "rights and obligations in a suit at law" are interpreted in relation to their respective legal systems.

3. The Committee would find it useful if, in their future reports, States parties could provide more detailed information on the steps taken to ensure that equality before the courts, including equal access to courts, fair and public hearings and competence, impartiality and independence of the judiciary are established by law and guaranteed in practice. In particular, States parties should specify the relevant constitutional and legislative texts which provide for the establishment of the courts and ensure that they are independent, impartial and competent, in particular with regard to the

manner  
the  
transfer  
judiciary

in which judges are appointed, the qualifications for appointment, and duration of their terms of office; the condition governing promotion, and cessation of their functions and the actual independence of the judiciary from the executive branch and the legislative.

within the  
notes  
try  
often  
courts,  
place  
in  
this

4. The provisions of article 14 apply to all courts and tribunals scope of that article whether ordinary or specialized. The Committee notes the existence, in many countries, of military or special courts which try civilians. This could present serious problems as far as the equitable, impartial and independent administration of justice is concerned. Quite often the reason for the establishment of such courts is to enable exceptional procedures to be applied which do not comply with normal standards of justice. While the Covenant does not prohibit such categories of courts, nevertheless the conditions which it lays down clearly indicate that the trying of civilians by such courts should be very exceptional and take place under conditions which genuinely afford the full guarantees stipulated in article 14. The Committee has noted a serious lack of information in this regard in the reports of some States parties whose judicial institutions

proper  
14  
States  
by  
they  
required by  
in

include such courts for the trying of civilians. In some countries such military and special courts do not afford the strict guarantees of the administration of justice in accordance with the requirements of article which are essential for the effective protection of human rights. If parties decide in circumstances of a public emergency as contemplated article 4 to derogate from normal procedures required under article 14, they should ensure that such derogations do not exceed those strictly required by the exigencies of the actual situation, and respect the other conditions in paragraph 1 of article 14.

"everyone  
the  
paragraph 3  
to

5. The second sentence of article 14, paragraph 1, provides that shall be entitled to a fair and public hearing". Paragraph 3 of the article elaborates on the requirements of a "fair hearing" in regard to determination of criminal charges. However, the requirements of paragraph 3 are minimum guarantees, the observance of which is not always sufficient to ensure the fairness of a hearing as required by paragraph 1.

of  
part of  
that,  
a  
press,  
defined

6. The publicity of hearings is an important safeguard in the interest of the individual and of society at large. At the same time article 14, paragraph 1, acknowledges that courts have the power to exclude all or the public for reasons spelt out in that paragraph. It should be noted apart from such exceptional circumstances, the Committee considers that a hearing must be open to the public in general, including members of the press, and must not, for instance, be limited only to a particular category of persons. It should be noted that, even in cases in which the public is excluded from the trial, the judgement must, with certain strictly defined exceptions, be made public.

of  
proof  
doubt.  
reasonable

7. The Committee has noted a lack of information regarding article 14, paragraph 2 and, in some cases, has even observed that the presumption of innocence, which is fundamental to the protection of human rights, is expressed in very ambiguous terms or entails conditions which render it ineffective. By reason of the presumption of innocence, the burden of proof of the charge is on the prosecution and the accused has the benefit of doubt. No guilt can be presumed until the charge has been proved beyond reasonable

doubt. Further, the presumption of innocence implies a right to be treated in accordance with this principle. It is, therefore, a duty for all public authorities to refrain from prejudging the outcome of a trial.

8. Among the minimum guarantees in criminal proceedings prescribed by paragraph 3, the first concerns the right of everyone to be informed in language which he understands of the charge against him (subpara. (a)). The Committee notes that State reports often do not explain how this right is respected and ensured. Article 14 (3) (a) applies to all cases of criminal charges, including those of persons not in detention. The Committee notes that further that the right to be informed of the charge "promptly" requires first information is given in the manner described as soon as the charge is right made by a competent authority. In the opinion of the Committee this authority must arise when in the course of an investigation a court or an suspected of the prosecution decides to take procedural steps against a person of a crime or publicly names him as such. The specific requirements of subparagraph 3 (a) may be met by stating the charge either orally or in alleged writing, provided that the information indicates both the law and the facts on which it is based.

time and  
counsel  
circumstances of  
does not  
of his  
this  
conditions  
Lawyers  
with  
quarter.

9. Subparagraph 3 (b) provides that the accused must have adequate facilities for the preparation of his defence and to communicate with of his own choosing. What is "adequate time" depends on the each case, but the facilities must include access to documents and other evidence which the accused requires to prepare his case, as well as the opportunity to engage and communicate with counsel. When the accused want to defend himself in person or request a person or an association of his choice, he should be able to have recourse to a lawyer. Furthermore, this subparagraph requires counsel to communicate with the accused in conditions giving full respect for the confidentiality of their communications. Lawyers should be able to counsel and to represent their clients in accordance with their established professional standards and judgement without any restrictions, influences, pressures or undue interference from any quarter.

undue  
should  
rendered;  
trial  
appeal.

10. Subparagraph 3 (c) provides that the accused shall be tried without delay. This guarantee relates not only to the time by which a trial commence, but also the time by which it should end and judgement be rendered; all stages must take place "without undue delay". To make this right effective, a procedure must be available in order to ensure that the trial will proceed "without undue delay", both in first instance and on appeal.

as  
accused  
the  
be  
if a  
fearlessly in  
of the

11. Not all reports have dealt with all aspects of the right of defence as defined in subparagraph 3 (d). The Committee has not always received sufficient information concerning the protection of the right of the accused to be present during the determination of any charge against him nor how the legal system assures his right either to defend himself in person or to be assisted by counsel of his own choosing, or what arrangements are made if a person does not have sufficient means to pay for legal assistance. The accused or his lawyer must have the right to act diligently and fearlessly in pursuing all available defences and the right to challenge the conduct of the



case if they believe it to be unfair. When exceptionally for justified reasons trials in absentia are held, strict observance of the rights of the defence is all the more necessary.

12. Subparagraph 3 (e) states that the accused shall be entitled to examine or have examined the witnesses against him and to obtain the attendance and examination of witnesses on his behalf under the same conditions as against him. This provision is designed to guarantee to the accused the same legal powers of compelling the attendance of witnesses and of examining or cross-examining any witnesses as are available to the prosecution.

13. Subparagraph 3 (f) provides that if the accused cannot understand or speak the language used in court he is entitled to the assistance of an interpreter free of any charge. This right is independent of the outcome of the proceedings and applies to aliens as well as to nationals. It is of basic importance in cases in which ignorance of the language used by a court or difficulty in understanding may constitute a major obstacle to the right of defence.

14. Subparagraph 3 (g) provides that the accused may not be compelled to testify against himself or to confess guilt. In considering this safeguard the provisions of article 7 and article 10, paragraph 1, should be borne in mind. In order to compel the accused to confess or to testify against

The law  
other  
himself, frequently methods which violate these provisions are used.  
should require that evidence provided by means of such methods or any  
form of compulsion is wholly unacceptable.

1 and 3  
made  
15. In order to safeguard the rights of the accused under paragraphs  
of article 14, judges should have authority to consider any allegations  
of violations of the rights of the accused during any stage of the  
prosecution.

persons,  
the  
procedures  
take  
Juveniles  
to  
16. Article 14, paragraph 4, provides that in the case of juvenile  
the procedure shall be such as will take account of their age and the  
desirability of promoting their rehabilitation. Not many reports have  
furnished sufficient information concerning such relevant matters as the  
minimum age at which a juvenile may be charged with a criminal offence,  
maximum age at which a person is still considered to be a juvenile, the  
existence of special courts and procedures, the laws governing  
against juveniles and how all these special arrangements for juveniles  
account of "the desirability of promoting their rehabilitation".  
are to enjoy at least the same guarantees and protection as are accorded  
adults under article 14.

crime  
a higher  
"prestuplenie")  
appeal  
17. Article 14, paragraph 5, provides that everyone convicted of a  
shall have the right to his conviction and sentence being reviewed by  
tribunal according to law. Particular attention is drawn to the other  
language versions of the word "crime" ("infraction", "delito",  
which show that the guarantee is not confined only to the most serious  
offences. In this connection, not enough information has been provided  
concerning the procedures of appeal, in particular the access to and the  
powers of reviewing tribunals, what requirements must be satisfied to  
against a judgement, and the way in which the procedures before review  
tribunals take account of the fair and public hearing requirements of  
paragraph 1 of article 14.

in  
seems from  
insufficiently  
with  
18. Article 14, paragraph 6, provides for compensation according to law  
certain cases of a miscarriage of justice as described therein. It  
many State reports that this right is often not observed or  
guaranteed by domestic legislation. States should, where necessary,  
supplement their legislation in this area in order to bring it into line

the provisions of the Covenant.

19. In considering State reports differing views have often been expressed as to the scope of paragraph 7 of article 14. Some States parties have even felt the need to make reservations in relation to procedures for the resumption of criminal cases. It seems to the Committee that most States parties make a clear distinction between a resumption of a trial justified by exceptional circumstances and a re-trial prohibited pursuant to the principle of ne bis in idem as contained in paragraph 7. This understanding of the meaning of ne bis in idem may encourage States parties to reconsider their reservations to article 14, paragraph 7.

GENERAL COMMENT 14 Article 6 (Twenty-third session, 1984)

life  
Covenant  
derogation is  
adopted by  
basic

1. In its general comment 6 [16] adopted at its 378th meeting on 27 July 1982, the Human Rights Committee observed that the right to life enunciated in the first paragraph of article 6 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights is the supreme right from which no derogation is permitted even in time of public emergency. The same right to life is enshrined in article 3 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights adopted by the General Assembly of the United Nations on 10 December 1948. It is basic to all human rights.

it is  
thousands

2. In its previous general comment, the Committee also observed that the supreme duty of States to prevent wars. War and other acts of mass violence continue to be a scourge of humanity and take the lives of thousands of innocent human beings every year.

by  
during  
development  
which  
otherwise be  
benefit of  
enjoyment of

3. While remaining deeply concerned by the toll of human life taken by conventional weapons in armed conflicts, the Committee has noted that, during successive sessions of the General Assembly, representatives from all geographical regions have expressed their growing concern at the development and proliferation of increasingly awesome weapons of mass destruction, which not only threaten human life but also absorb resources that could otherwise be used for vital economic and social purposes, particularly for the benefit of developing countries, and thereby for promoting and securing the enjoyment of human rights for all.

that  
nuclear  
confront  
use of  
even

4. The Committee associates itself with this concern. It is evident that the designing, testing, manufacture, possession and deployment of nuclear weapons are among the greatest threats to the right to life which confront mankind today. This threat is compounded by the danger that the actual use of such weapons may be brought about, not only in the event of war, but even through human or mechanical error or failure.

5. Furthermore, the very existence and gravity of this threat generates a climate of suspicion and fear between States, which is in itself antagonistic to the promotion of universal respect for and observance of human rights and fundamental freedoms in accordance with the Charter of the United Nations and the International Covenants on Human Rights.

6. The production, testing, possession, deployment and use of nuclear weapons should be prohibited and recognized as crimes against humanity.

7. The Committee accordingly, in the interest of mankind, calls upon all States, whether Parties to the Covenant or not, to take urgent steps, unilaterally and by agreement, to rid the world of this menace.

GENERAL COMMENT 15 Twenty-seventh session, 1986

The position of aliens under the Covenant

1. Reports from States parties have often failed to take into account that each State party must ensure the rights in the Covenant to "all individuals within its territory and subject to its jurisdiction" (art. 2, para. 1).

In general, the rights set forth in the Covenant apply to everyone, irrespective of reciprocity, and irrespective of his or her nationality or statelessness.

2. Thus, the general rule is that each one of the rights of the Covenant must be guaranteed without discrimination between citizens and aliens. Aliens receive the benefit of the general requirement of non-discrimination in respect of the rights guaranteed in the Covenant, as provided for in article 2 thereof. This guarantee applies to aliens and citizens alike. Exceptionally, some of the rights recognized in the Covenant are expressly applicable only to citizens (art. 25), while article 13 applies only to aliens. However, the Committee's experience in examining reports shows that in a number of countries other rights that aliens should enjoy under the Covenant are denied to them or are subject to limitations that cannot always be justified under the Covenant.

3. A few constitutions provide for equality of aliens with citizens. Some constitutions adopted more recently carefully distinguish fundamental rights that apply to all and those granted to citizens only, and deal with each in detail. In many States, however, the constitutions are drafted in terms of citizens only when granting relevant rights. Legislation and case law may also play an important part in providing for the rights of aliens. The Committee has been informed that in some States fundamental rights, though not guaranteed to aliens by the Constitution or other legislation, will also be extended to them as required by the Covenant. In certain cases, however, there has clearly been a failure to implement Covenant rights without discrimination in respect of aliens.

4. The Committee considers that in their reports States parties should give attention to the position of aliens, both under their law and in actual practice. The Covenant gives aliens all the protection regarding rights guaranteed therein, and its requirements should be observed by States parties in their legislation and in practice as appropriate. The position of aliens would thus be considerably improved. States parties should ensure that the provisions of the Covenant and the rights under it are made known to

aliens

within their jurisdiction.

5. The Covenant does not recognize the right of aliens to enter or reside in the territory of a State party. It is in principle a matter for the State to decide who it will admit to its territory. However, in certain circumstances an alien may enjoy the protection of the Covenant even in relation to entry or residence, for example, when considerations of non-discrimination, prohibition of inhuman treatment and respect for family life arise.

6. Consent for entry may be given subject to conditions relating, for example, to movement, residence and employment. A State may also impose general conditions upon an alien who is in transit. However, once aliens are allowed to enter the territory of a State party they are entitled to the rights set out in the Covenant.

7. Aliens thus have an inherent right to life, protected by law, and may not be arbitrarily deprived of life. They must not be subjected to torture or to cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment; nor may they be held in

slavery or servitude. Aliens have the full right to liberty and security of the person. If lawfully deprived of their liberty, they shall be treated with humanity and with respect for the inherent dignity of their person. Aliens may not be imprisoned for failure to fulfil a contractual obligation. They have the right to liberty of movement and free choice of residence; they shall be free to leave the country. Aliens shall be equal before the courts and tribunals, and shall be entitled to a fair and public hearing by a competent, independent and impartial tribunal established by law in the determination of any criminal charge or of rights and obligations in a suit at law. Aliens shall not be subjected to retrospective penal legislation, and are entitled to recognition before the law. They may not be subjected to arbitrary or unlawful interference with their privacy, family, home or correspondence. They have the right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion, and the right to hold opinions and to express them. Aliens receive the benefit of the right of peaceful assembly and of freedom of association. They may marry when at marriageable age. Their children are entitled to those measures of protection required by their status as minors. In those cases where aliens constitute a minority within the meaning of article 27, they shall not be denied the right, in community with other members of their group, to enjoy their own culture, to profess and practise their own religion and to use their own language. Aliens are entitled to equal protection by the law. There shall be no discrimination between aliens and citizens in the application of these rights. These rights of aliens may be qualified only by such limitations as may be lawfully imposed under the Covenant.

8. Once an alien is lawfully within a territory, his freedom of movement within the territory and his right to leave that territory may only be restricted in accordance with article 12, paragraph 3. Differences in treatment in this regard between aliens and nationals, or between different categories of aliens, need to be justified under article 12, paragraph



3. Since such restrictions must, inter alia, be consistent with the other rights recognized in the Covenant, a State party cannot, by restraining an alien or deporting him to a third country, arbitrarily prevent his return to his own country (art. 12, para. 4).

9. Many reports have given insufficient information on matters relevant to article 13. That article is applicable to all procedures aimed at the obligatory departure of an alien, whether described in national law as expulsion or otherwise. If such procedures entail arrest, the safeguards of the Covenant relating to deprivation of liberty (arts. 9 and 10) may also be applicable. If the arrest is for the particular purpose of extradition, other provisions of national and international law may apply. Normally an alien who is expelled must be allowed to leave for any country that agrees to take him. The particular rights of article 13 only protect those aliens who are lawfully in the territory of a State party. This means that national law concerning the requirements for entry and stay must be taken into account in determining the scope of that protection, and that illegal entrants and aliens who have stayed longer than the law or their permits allow, in particular, are not covered by its provisions. However, if the legality of an alien's entry or stay is in dispute, any decision on this point leading to his expulsion or deportation ought to be taken in accordance with article 13. It is for the competent authorities of the State party, in good faith and in the exercise of

however, their powers, to apply and interpret the domestic law, observing, such requirements under the Covenant as equality before the law (art. 26).

10. Article 13 directly regulates only the procedure and not the substantive grounds for expulsion. However, by allowing only those carried out "in pursuance of a decision reached in accordance with law", its purpose is clearly to prevent arbitrary expulsions. On the other hand, it entitles each alien to a decision in his own case and, hence, article 13 would not be satisfied with laws or decisions providing for collective or mass expulsions. This understanding, in the opinion of the Committee, is confirmed by further provisions concerning the right to submit reasons against expulsion and to have the decision reviewed by and to be represented before the competent authority or someone designated by it. An alien must be given full facilities for pursuing his remedy against expulsion so that this right will in all the circumstances of his case be an effective one. The principles of article 13 relating to appeal against expulsion and the entitlement to review by a competent authority may only be departed from when "compelling reasons of national security" so require. Discrimination may not be made between different categories of aliens in the application of article 13.

GENERAL COMMENT 16 Article 17 (Thirty-second session, 1988)

1. Article 17 provides for the right of every person to be protected against arbitrary or unlawful interference with his privacy, family, home or correspondence as well as against unlawful attacks on his honour and reputation. In the view of the Committee this right is required to be emanate guaranteed against all such interferences and attacks whether they obligations from State authorities or from natural or legal persons. The obligations imposed by this article require the State to adopt legislative and other and measures to give effect to the prohibition against such interferences attacks as well as to the protection of this right.

2. In this connection, the Committee wishes to point out that in the reports of States parties to the Covenant the necessary attention is not being given to information concerning the manner in which respect for this right is in general by the competent organs established in the State. In

particular,  
insufficient attention is paid to the fact that article 17 of the  
Covenant  
deals with protection against both unlawful and arbitrary interference.  
That  
means that it is precisely in State legislation above all that provision  
must  
be made for the protection of the right set forth in that article. At  
present  
the reports either say nothing about such legislation or provide  
insufficient  
information on the subject.

3. The term "unlawful" means that no interference can take place  
except in  
cases envisaged by the law. Interference authorized by States can only  
take  
place on the basis of law, which itself must comply with the provisions,  
aims  
and objectives of the Covenant.

4. The expression "arbitrary interference" is also relevant to the  
view  
protection of the right provided for in article 17. In the Committee's  
the expression "arbitrary interference" can also extend to interference  
provided for under the law. The introduction of the concept of  
arbitrariness

should be is intended to guarantee that even interference provided for by law  
and in accordance with the provisions, aims and objectives of the Covenant  
should be, in any event, reasonable in the particular circumstances.

that 5. Regarding the term "family", the objectives of the Covenant require  
the for purposes of article 17 this term be given a broad interpretation to  
include all those comprising the family as understood in the society of  
his State party concerned. The term "home" in English, "manzel" in Arabic,  
"zhùzhái" in Chinese, "domicile" in French, "zhilische" in Russian and  
"domicilio" in Spanish, as used in article 17 of the Covenant, is to be  
terms understood to indicate the place where a person resides or carries out  
usual occupation. In this connection, the Committee invites States to  
indicate in their reports the meaning given in their society to the  
"family" and "home".

on 6. The Committee considers that the reports should include information  
which the authorities and organs set up within the legal system of the State  
to are competent to authorize interference allowed by the law. It is also  
and to indispensable to have information on the authorities which are entitled  
complain of exercise control over such interference with strict regard for the law,  
States know in what manner and through which organs persons concerned may  
information on a violation of the right provided for in article 17 of the Covenant.  
the should in their reports make clear the extent to which actual practice  
in conforms to the law. State party reports should also contain  
such cases. complaints lodged in respect of arbitrary or unlawful interference, and  
number of any findings in that regard, as well as the remedies provided

necessarily 7. As all persons live in society, the protection of privacy is  
to relative. However, the competent public authorities should only be able  
understood call for such information relating to an individual's private life the  
should knowledge of which is essential in the interests of society as  
under the Covenant. Accordingly, the Committee recommends that States

indicate in their reports the laws and regulations that govern authorized interferences with private life.

8. Even with regard to interferences that conform to the Covenant, relevant legislation must specify in detail the precise circumstances in which such interferences may be permitted. A decision to make use of such authorized interference must be made only by the authority designated under the law, and on a case-by-case basis. Compliance with article 17 requires that the integrity and confidentiality of correspondence should be guaranteed de jure and de facto. Correspondence should be delivered to the addressee without interception and without being opened or otherwise read. Surveillance, whether electronic or otherwise, interceptions of telephonic, telegraphic and other forms of communication, wire-tapping and recording of conversations should be prohibited. Searches of a person's home should be restricted to a search for necessary evidence and should not be allowed to amount to harassment. So far as personal and body search is concerned, effective measures should ensure that such searches are carried out in a manner consistent with the dignity of the person who is being searched. Persons being subjected to body search by State officials, or medical personnel acting at the request of the State, should only be examined by persons of the same sex.

9. States parties are under a duty themselves not to engage in interferences inconsistent with article 17 of the Covenant and to provide the legislative framework prohibiting such acts by natural or legal persons.

10. The gathering and holding of personal information on computers, databanks and other devices, whether by public authorities or private individuals or bodies, must be regulated by law. Effective measures have to be taken by States to ensure that information concerning a person's private life does not reach the hands of persons who are not authorized by law to receive, process and use it, and is never used for purposes incompatible with the Covenant. In order to have the most effective protection of his private life, every individual should have the right to ascertain in an intelligible form, files, and whether, and if so, what personal data is stored in automatic data which for what purposes. Every individual should also be able to ascertain control public authorities or private individuals or bodies control or may individual their files. If such files contain incorrect personal data or have been collected or processed contrary to the provisions of the law, every individual should have the right to request rectification or elimination.

11. Article 17 affords protection to personal honour and reputation and States are under an obligation to provide adequate legislation to that end. Provision must also be made for everyone effectively to be able to protect himself against any unlawful attacks that do occur and to have an effective remedy against those responsible. States parties should indicate in their reports to what extent the honour or reputation of individuals is protected by law and how this protection is achieved according to their legal system.

GENERAL COMMENT 17 Article 24 (Thirty-fifth session, 1989)

1. Article 24 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights recognizes the right of every child, without any discrimination, to receive from his family, society and the State the protection required by his status as a minor. Consequently, the implementation of this provision entails the adoption of special measures to protect children, in addition to the measures

that States are required to take under article 2 to ensure that everyone enjoys the rights provided for in the Covenant. The reports submitted

by

States parties often seem to underestimate this obligation and supply inadequate information on the way in which children are afforded their right to a special protection.

enjoyment of

2. In this connection, the Committee points out that the rights provided for in article 24 are not the only ones that the Covenant recognizes for

provided for

children

and that, as individuals, children benefit from all of the civil rights enunciated in the Covenant. In enunciating a right, some provisions of

the

Covenant expressly indicate to States measures to be adopted with a view

to

affording minors greater protection than adults. Thus, as far as the

right to

life is concerned, the death penalty cannot be imposed for crimes committed by

committed by

persons under 18 years of age. Similarly, if lawfully deprived of their liberty, accused juvenile persons shall be separated from adults and are entitled to be brought as speedily as possible for adjudication; in

turn,

convicted juvenile offenders shall be subject to a penitentiary system

that

involves segregation from adults and is appropriate to their age and

legal

In status, the aim being to foster reformation and social rehabilitation.  
In other instances, children are protected by the possibility of the  
restriction - provided that such restriction is warranted - of a right  
in a recognized by the Covenant, such as the right to publicize a judgement  
the suit at law or a criminal case, from which an exception may be made when  
the interest of the minor so requires.

3. In most cases, however, the measures to be adopted are not  
specified in the Covenant and it is for each State to determine them in the light of  
the protection needs of children in its territory and within its  
jurisdiction.

The Committee notes in this regard that such measures, although intended  
enunciated in primarily to ensure that children fully enjoy the other rights  
every the Covenant, may also be economic, social and cultural. For example,  
them possible economic and social measure should be taken to reduce infant  
or mortality and to eradicate malnutrition among children and to prevent  
their from being subjected to acts of violence and cruel and inhuman treatment  
In from being exploited by means of forced labour or prostitution, or by  
education use in the illicit trafficking of narcotic drugs, or by any other means.

In the cultural field, every possible measure should be taken to foster the  
development of their personality and to provide them with a level of  
education that will enable them to enjoy the rights recognized in the Covenant,  
the particularly the right to freedom of opinion and expression. Moreover,  
Committee wishes to draw the attention of States parties to the need to  
include in their reports information on measures adopted to ensure that  
children do not take a direct part in armed conflicts.

4. The right to special measures of protection belongs to every child  
determined because of his status as a minor. Nevertheless, the Covenant does not  
the age indicate the age at which he attains his majority. This is to be  
criminal at which the child attains his majority in civil matters and assumes  
is responsibility. States should also indicate the age at which a child  
legally entitled to work and the age at which he is treated as an adult



under labour law. States should further indicate the age at which a child is considered adult for the purposes of article 10, paragraphs 2 and 3. However, the Committee notes that the age for the above purposes should not be set unreasonably low and that in any case a State party cannot absolve itself from its obligations under the Covenant regarding persons under the age of 18, notwithstanding that they have reached the age of majority under domestic law.

5. The Covenant requires that children should be protected against religion, discrimination on any grounds such as race, colour, sex, language, national or social origin, property or birth. In this connection, the Committee notes that, whereas non-discrimination in the enjoyment of the from rights provided for in the Covenant also stems, in the case of children, to the article 2 and their equality before the law from article 26, the non-discrimination clause contained in article 24 relates specifically to the measures of protection referred to in that provision. Reports by States measures of parties should indicate how legislation and practice ensure that including protection are aimed at removing all discrimination in every field, children inheritance, particularly as between children who are nationals and of who are aliens or as between legitimate children and children born out wedlock.

6. Responsibility for guaranteeing children the necessary protection lies with the family, society and the State. Although the Covenant does not indicate how such responsibility is to be apportioned, it is primarily incumbent on the family, which is interpreted broadly to include all persons composing it in the society of the State party concerned, and particularly on the parents, to create conditions to promote the harmonious development of the child's personality and his enjoyment of the rights recognized in the Covenant. However, since it is quite common for the father and mother to be gainfully employed outside the home, reports by States parties should indicate how society, social institutions and the State are discharging their responsibility to assist the family in ensuring the protection of the child. Moreover, in cases where the parents and the family seriously fail in their duties, ill-treat or neglect the child, the State should intervene to restrict parental authority and the child may be separated from his family when circumstances so require. If the marriage is dissolved, steps should be taken, keeping in view the paramount interest of the children, to give them necessary protection and, so far as is possible, to guarantee personal relations with both parents. The Committee considers it useful that reports by States parties should provide information on the special measures of their protection adopted to protect children who are abandoned or deprived of their family environment in order to enable them to develop in conditions that most closely resemble those characterizing the family environment.

7. Under article 24, paragraph 2, every child has the right to be registered immediately after birth and to have a name. In the Committee's opinion, this provision should be interpreted as being closely linked to the provision concerning the right to special measures of protection and it is designed to promote recognition of the child's legal personality. Providing for the right to have a name is of special importance in the case of children born out of wedlock. The main purpose of the obligation to register children after birth is to reduce the danger of abduction, sale of or traffic in children, or of other types of treatment that are incompatible with the enjoyment of the rights provided for in the Covenant. Reports by States parties should indicate in detail the measures that ensure the immediate registration of

children born in their territory.

8. Special attention should also be paid, in the context of the protection to be granted to children, to the right of every child to acquire a nationality, as provided for in article 24, paragraph 3. While the purpose of this provision is to prevent a child from being afforded less protection by society and the State because he is stateless, it does not necessarily make it an obligation for States to give their nationality to every child born in their territory. However, States are required to adopt every appropriate measure, both internally and in cooperation with other States, to ensure that every child has a nationality when he is born. In this connection, no discrimination with regard to the acquisition of nationality should be admissible under internal law as between legitimate children and children born out of wedlock or of stateless parents or based on the nationality status of one or both of the parents. The measures adopted to ensure that children have a nationality should always be referred to in reports by States parties.

GENERAL COMMENT 18 Non-discrimination (Thirty-seventh session, 1989)

Political  
Rights  
within  
the  
language,  
property,  
equality  
any  
effective  
sex,  
origin,

1. Non-discrimination, together with equality before the law and equal protection of the law without any discrimination, constitute a basic and general principle relating to the protection of human rights. Thus, article 2, paragraph 1, of the International Covenant on Civil and Rights obligates each State party to respect and ensure to all persons its territory and subject to its jurisdiction the rights recognized in the Covenant without distinction of any kind, such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status. Article 26 not only entitles all persons to equality before the law as well as equal protection of the law but also prohibits any discrimination under the law and guarantees to all persons equal and effective protection against discrimination on any ground such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status.

article 3  
to the  
certain  
article  
discrimination  
to  
which

2. Indeed, the principle of non-discrimination is so basic that obligates each State party to ensure the equal right of men and women to the enjoyment of the rights set forth in the Covenant. While article 4, paragraph 1, allows States parties to take measures derogating from certain obligations under the Covenant in time of public emergency, the same article requires, inter alia, that those measures should not involve discrimination solely on the ground of race, colour, sex, language, religion or social origin. Furthermore, article 20, paragraph 2, obligates States parties to prohibit, by law, any advocacy of national, racial or religious hatred which constitutes incitement to discrimination.

relating  
provides

3. Because of their basic and general character, the principle of non-discrimination as well as that of equality before the law and equal protection of the law are sometimes expressly referred to in articles relating to particular categories of human rights. Article 14, paragraph 1, provides that all persons shall be equal before the courts and tribunals, and

any paragraph 3 of the same article provides that, in the determination of  
equality, to criminal charge against him, everyone shall be entitled, in full  
paragraph 3. the minimum guarantees enumerated in subparagraphs (a) to (g) of  
life of paragraph 3. Similarly, article 25 provides for the equal participation in public  
all citizens, without any of the distinctions mentioned in article 2.

informed 4. It is for the States parties to determine appropriate measures to  
principles of implement the relevant provisions. However, the Committee is to be  
the law. about the nature of such measures and their conformity with the  
non-discrimination and equality before the law and equal protection of

fact 5. The Committee wishes to draw the attention of States parties to the  
appropriate that the Covenant sometimes expressly requires them to take measures to  
spouses as guarantee the equality of rights of the persons concerned. For example,  
take the article 23, paragraph 4, stipulates that States parties shall take  
positive steps to ensure equality of rights as well as responsibilities of  
as to marriage, during marriage and at its dissolution. Such steps may  
that form of legislative, administrative or other measures, but it is a  
duty of States parties to make certain that spouses have equal rights  
required by the Covenant. In relation to children, article 24 provides

all children, without any discrimination as to race, colour, sex, language, religion, national or social origin, property or birth, have the right to such measures of protection as are required by their status as minors, on the part of their family, society and the State.

6. The Committee notes that the Covenant neither defines the term "discrimination" nor indicates what constitutes discrimination. However, article 1 of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination provides that the term "racial discrimination" shall mean any distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference based on race, colour, descent, or national or ethnic origin which has the purpose or effect of nullifying or impairing the recognition, enjoyment or exercise, on an equal footing, of human rights and fundamental freedoms in the political, economic, social, cultural or any other field of public life. Similarly, article 1 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women provides that "discrimination against women" shall mean any distinction, exclusion or restriction made on the basis of sex which has the effect or purpose of impairing or nullifying the recognition, enjoyment or exercise by women, irrespective of their marital status, on a basis of equality of men and women, of human rights and fundamental freedoms in the political, economic, social, cultural, civil or any other field.

7. While these conventions deal only with cases of discrimination on specific grounds, the Committee believes that the term "discrimination" as used in the Covenant should be understood to imply any distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference which is based on any ground such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status, and which has the purpose or effect of nullifying or impairing the recognition, enjoyment or exercise by all persons, on an equal footing, of all rights and freedoms.

8. The enjoyment of rights and freedoms on an equal footing, however, does not mean identical treatment in every instance. In this connection, the provisions of the Covenant are explicit. For example, article 6, paragraph 5,

prohibits the death sentence from being imposed on persons below 18 years of age. The same paragraph prohibits that sentence from being carried out on pregnant women. Similarly, article 10, paragraph 3, requires the segregation of juvenile offenders from adults. Furthermore, article 25 guarantees certain political rights, differentiating on grounds of citizenship.

9. Reports of many States parties contain information regarding legislative as well as administrative measures and court decisions which relate to protection against discrimination in law, but they very often lack information which would reveal discrimination in fact. When reporting on articles 2 (1), 3 and 26 of the Covenant, States parties usually cite provisions of their constitution or equal opportunity laws with respect to equality of persons. While such information is of course useful, the Committee wishes to know if there remain any problems of discrimination in fact, which may be practised either by public authorities, by the community, or by private persons or bodies. The Committee wishes to be informed about legal provisions and administrative measures directed at diminishing or eliminating such discrimination.

equality  
to  
where the  
their  
correct  
part of  
matters as  
action is

10. The Committee also wishes to point out that the principle of sometimes requires States parties to take affirmative action in order to diminish or eliminate conditions which cause or help to perpetuate discrimination prohibited by the Covenant. For example, in a State where the general conditions of a certain part of the population prevent or impair their enjoyment of human rights, the State should take specific action to correct those conditions. Such action may involve granting for a time to the part of the population concerned certain preferential treatment in specific matters as compared with the rest of the population. However, as long as such action is needed to correct discrimination in fact, it is a case of legitimate differentiation under the Covenant.

or  
status.  
not all  
2,  
receive  
omissions.

11. Both article 2, paragraph 1, and article 26 enumerate grounds of discrimination such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status. The Committee has observed that in a number of constitutions and laws not all the grounds on which discrimination is prohibited, as cited in article 2, paragraph 1, are enumerated. The Committee would therefore like to receive information from States parties as to the significance of such omissions.

against  
not  
of the  
persons  
enumerated  
duplicate  
an  
field

12. While article 2 limits the scope of the rights to be protected against discrimination to those provided for in the Covenant, article 26 does not specify such limitations. That is to say, article 26 provides that all persons are equal before the law and are entitled to equal protection of the law without discrimination, and that the law shall guarantee to all persons equal and effective protection against discrimination on any of the enumerated grounds. In the view of the Committee, article 26 does not merely duplicate the guarantee already provided for in article 2 but provides in itself an autonomous right. It prohibits discrimination in law or in fact in any field regulated and protected by public authorities. Article 26 is therefore



concerned with the obligations imposed on States parties in regard to their legislation and the application thereof. Thus, when legislation is adopted by a State party, it must comply with the requirement of article 26 that its content should not be discriminatory. In other words, the application of the principle of non-discrimination contained in article 26 is not limited to those rights which are provided for in the Covenant.

13. Finally, the Committee observes that not every differentiation of treatment will constitute discrimination, if the criteria for such differentiation are reasonable and objective and if the aim is to achieve a purpose which is legitimate under the Covenant.

GENERAL COMMENT 19 Article 23 (Thirty-ninth session, 1990)

1. Article 23 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights recognizes that the family is the natural and fundamental group unit of society and is entitled to protection by society and the State. Protection of the family and its members is also guaranteed, directly or indirectly, by other provisions of the Covenant. Thus, article 17 establishes a prohibition on arbitrary or unlawful interference with the family. In addition, article 24 of the Covenant specifically addresses the protection of the rights of the child, as such or as a member of a family. In their reports, States

parties often fail to give enough information on how the State and society are discharging their obligation to provide protection to the family and the persons composing it.

2. The Committee notes that the concept of the family may differ in some respects from State to State, and even from region to region within a State, and that it is therefore not possible to give the concept a standard definition. However, the Committee emphasizes that, when a group of persons is regarded as a family under the legislation and practice of a State, it must be given the protection referred to in article 23. Consequently, States parties should report on how the concept and scope of the family is construed or defined in their own society and legal system. Where diverse concepts of the family, "nuclear" and "extended", exist within a State, this should be indicated with an explanation of the degree of protection afforded to each. In view of the existence of various forms of family, such as unmarried couples and their children or single parents and their children, States parties should also indicate whether and to what extent such types of family and their members are recognized and protected by domestic law and practice.

3. Ensuring the protection provided for under article 23 of the Covenant requires that States parties should adopt legislative, administrative or other measures. States parties should provide detailed information concerning the nature of such measures and the means whereby their effective implementation is assured. In fact, since the Covenant also recognizes the right of the family to protection by society, States parties' reports should indicate how the necessary protection is granted to the family by the State and other social institutions, whether and to what extent the State gives financial or other support to the activities of such institutions, and how it ensures that these activities are compatible with the Covenant.

4. Article 23, paragraph 2, of the Covenant reaffirms the right of men and women of marriageable age to marry and to found a family. Paragraph 3 of the same article provides that no marriage shall be entered into without the free and full consent of the intending spouses. States parties' reports

should  
of the  
mental  
each  
consent  
the  
with  
for  
implies  
of both  
a State  
religious

indicate whether there are restrictions or impediments to the exercise of the right to marry based on special factors such as degree of kinship or incapacity. The Covenant does not establish a specific marriageable age either for men or for women, but that age should be such as to enable each of the intending spouses to give his or her free and full personal consent in a form and under conditions prescribed by law. In this connection, the Committee wishes to note that such legal provisions must be compatible with the full exercise of the other rights guaranteed by the Covenant; thus, for instance, the right to freedom of thought, conscience and religion implies that the legislation of each State should provide for the possibility of both religious and civil marriages. In the Committee's view, however, for a State to require that a marriage, which is celebrated in accordance with religious rites, be conducted, affirmed or registered also under civil law is not incompatible with the Covenant. States are also requested to include information on this subject in their reports.

5. The right to found a family implies, in principle, the possibility to procreate and live together. When States parties adopt family planning policies, they should be compatible with the provisions of the Covenant and

the possibility to live together implies the adoption of appropriate measures, both at the internal level and as the case may be, in cooperation with other States, to ensure the unity or reunification of families, particularly when their members are separated for political, economic or similar reasons.

6. Article 23, paragraph 4, of the Covenant provides that States parties shall take appropriate steps to ensure equality of rights and responsibilities of spouses as to marriage, during marriage and at its dissolution.

With regard to equality as to marriage, the Committee wishes to note in particular that no sex-based discrimination should occur in respect of the acquisition or loss of nationality by reason of marriage. Likewise, the right of each spouse to retain the use of his or her original family name or to participate on an equal basis in the choice of a new family name should be safeguarded.

During marriage, the spouses should have equal rights and responsibilities in the family. This equality extends to all matters arising from their relationship, such as choice of residence, running of the household, education of the children and administration of assets. Such equality continues to be applicable to arrangements regarding legal separation or dissolution of the marriage.

Thus, any discriminatory treatment in regard to the grounds and procedures for separation or divorce, child custody, maintenance or alimony, visiting rights or the loss or recovery of parental authority must be prohibited, bearing in mind the paramount interest of the children in this connection. States parties should, in particular, include information in their reports concerning the provision made for the necessary protection of any children at the dissolution of a marriage or on the separation of spouses.

session, 1. This general comment replaces general comment 7 (the sixteenth session, 1982) reflecting and further developing it.

Covenant on 2. The aim of the provisions of article 7 of the International Civil and Political Rights is to protect both the dignity and the physical and mental integrity of the individual. It is the duty of the State party to afford everyone protection through legislative and other measures as may be necessary against the acts prohibited by article 7, whether inflicted by people acting in their official capacity, outside their official capacity or in a private capacity. The prohibition in article 7 is complemented by the positive requirements of article 10, paragraph 1, of the Covenant, which stipulates that "All persons deprived of their liberty shall be treated with humanity and with respect for the inherent dignity of the human person".

referred 3. The text of article 7 allows of no limitation. The Committee also article 7 to in article 4 of the Covenant, no derogation from the provision of is allowed and its provisions must remain in force. The Committee likewise

observes that no justification or extenuating circumstances may be invoked to excuse a violation of article 7 for any reasons, including those based on an order from a superior officer or public authority.

4. The Covenant does not contain any definition of the concepts covered by article 7, nor does the Committee consider it necessary to draw up a list of prohibited acts or to establish sharp distinctions between the different kinds of punishment or treatment; the distinctions depend on the nature, purpose and severity of the treatment applied.

5. The prohibition in article 7 relates not only to acts that cause physical pain but also to acts that cause mental suffering to the victim. In the Committee's view, moreover, the prohibition must extend to corporal punishment, including excessive chastisement ordered as punishment for a crime or as an educative or disciplinary measure. It is appropriate to emphasize in this regard that article 7 protects, in particular, children, pupils and patients in teaching and medical institutions.

6. The Committee notes that prolonged solitary confinement of the detained or imprisoned person may amount to acts prohibited by article 7. As the Committee has stated in its general comment No. 6 (16), article 6 of the Covenant refers generally to abolition of the death penalty in terms that strongly suggest that abolition is desirable. Moreover, when the death penalty is applied by a State party for the most serious crimes, it must not only be strictly limited in accordance with article 6 but it must be carried out in such a way as to cause the least possible physical and mental suffering.

7. Article 7 expressly prohibits medical or scientific experimentation without the free consent of the person concerned. The Committee notes that the reports of States parties generally contain little information on this point. More attention should be given to the need and means to ensure observance of this provision. The Committee also observes that special protection in regard to such experiments is necessary in the case of persons not capable of giving valid consent, and in particular those under any form of detention or imprisonment. Such persons should not be subjected to any medical or scientific experimentation that may be detrimental to their health.

8. The Committee notes that it is not sufficient for the implementation of article 7 to prohibit such treatment or punishment or to make it a crime.

States parties should inform the Committee of the legislative, administrative, judicial and other measures they take to prevent and punish acts of torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment in any territory under their jurisdiction.

9. In the view of the Committee, States parties must not expose individuals to the danger of torture or cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment upon return to another country by way of their extradition, expulsion or refoulement. States parties should indicate in their reports what measures they have adopted to that end.

10. The Committee should be informed how States parties disseminate, to the population at large, relevant information concerning the ban on torture and the treatment prohibited by article 7. Enforcement personnel, medical

or personnel, police officers and any other persons involved in the custody  
or treatment of any individual subjected to any form of arrest, detention  
or imprisonment must receive appropriate instruction and training. States  
given and parties should inform the Committee of the instruction and training  
the way in which the prohibition of article 7 forms an integral part of  
the operational rules and ethical standards to be followed by such persons.

11. In addition to describing steps to provide the general protection  
against acts prohibited under article 7 to which anyone is entitled, the State  
party should provide detailed information on safeguards for the special  
protection of particularly vulnerable persons. It should be noted that keeping  
under systematic review interrogation rules, instructions, methods and  
practices as well as arrangements for the custody and treatment of persons subjected  
to any form of arrest, detention or imprisonment is an effective means of  
preventing cases of torture and ill-treatment. To guarantee the effective  
protection of detained persons, provisions should be made for detainees to be held in  
places officially recognized as places of detention and for their names and  
places of detention, as well as for the names of persons responsible for their  
detention, to be kept in registers readily available and accessible to  
those concerned, including relatives and friends. To the same effect, the  
time and place of all interrogations should be recorded, together with the names  
of all those present and this information should also be available for purposes  
of judicial or administrative proceedings. Provisions should also be made  
should ensure that any places of detention be free from any equipment liable  
to be used for inflicting torture or ill-treatment. The protection of the  
detainee also requires that prompt and regular access be given to doctors and  
lawyers and, under appropriate supervision when the investigation so requires,  
to family members.



7 that  
of  
12. It is important for the discouragement of violations under article  
the law must prohibit the use of admissibility in judicial proceedings  
statements or confessions obtained through torture or other prohibited  
treatment.

inhuman and  
to such  
behalf  
whether by  
be  
must  
13. States parties should indicate when presenting their reports the  
provisions of their criminal law which penalize torture and cruel,  
degrading treatment or punishment, specifying the penalties applicable  
acts, whether committed by public officials or other persons acting on  
of the State, or by private persons. Those who violate article 7,  
encouraging, ordering, tolerating or perpetrating prohibited acts, must  
held responsible. Consequently, those who have refused to obey orders  
not be punished or subjected to any adverse treatment.

3, of  
their  
acts  
lodge  
recognized in  
impartially by  
of  
available  
14. Article 7 should be read in conjunction with article 2, paragraph  
the Covenant. In their reports, States parties should indicate how  
legal system effectively guarantees the immediate termination of all the  
prohibited by article 7 as well as appropriate redress. The right to  
complaints against maltreatment prohibited by article 7 must be  
the domestic law. Complaints must be investigated promptly and  
competent authorities so as to make the remedy effective. The reports  
States parties should provide specific information on the remedies

to victims of maltreatment and the procedure that complainants must follow, and statistics on the number of complaints and how they have been dealt with.

15. The Committee has noted that some States have granted amnesty in respect of acts of torture. Amnesties are generally incompatible with the duty of States to investigate such acts; to guarantee freedom from such acts within their jurisdiction; and to ensure that they do not occur in the future. States may not deprive individuals of the right to an effective remedy, including compensation and such full rehabilitation as may be possible.

GENERAL COMMENT 21 Article 10 (Forty-fourth session, 1992)

1. This general comment replaces general comment 9 (the sixteenth session, 1982) reflecting and further developing it.

2. Article 10, paragraph 1, of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights applies to any one deprived of liberty under the laws and authority of the State who is held in prisons, hospitals - particularly psychiatric hospitals - detention camps or correctional institutions or elsewhere. States parties should ensure that the principle stipulated therein is observed in all institutions and establishments within their jurisdiction where persons are being held.

3. Article 10, paragraph 1, imposes on States parties a positive obligation as or persons deprived of liberty, and complements for them the ban on torture or other cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment contained in article 7 of the Covenant. Thus, not only may persons deprived of their liberty not be subjected to treatment that is contrary to article 7, including medical or scientific experimentation, but neither may they be subjected to any hardship or constraint other than that resulting from the deprivation of liberty; respect for the dignity of such persons must be guaranteed under the same conditions as for that of free persons. Persons deprived of their liberty enjoy all the rights set forth in the Covenant, subject to the restrictions that are unavoidable in a closed environment.

4. Treating all persons deprived of their liberty with humanity and with respect for their dignity is a fundamental and universally applicable rule.

Consequently, the application of this rule, as a minimum, cannot be dependent on the material resources available in the State party. This rule must be applied without distinction of any kind, such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status.

5. States parties are invited to indicate in their reports to what extent they are applying the relevant United Nations standards applicable to the treatment of prisoners: the Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners (1957), the Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under Any Form of Detention or Imprisonment (1988), the Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials (1978) and the Principles of Medical Ethics relevant to the Role of Health Personnel, particularly Physicians, in the Protection of Prisoners and Detainees against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (1982).

6. The Committee recalls that reports should provide detailed information on national legislative and administrative provisions that have a bearing on the right provided for in article 10, paragraph 1. The Committee also considers that it is necessary for reports to specify what concrete measures have been taken by the competent authorities to monitor the effective application of the rules regarding the treatment of persons deprived of their liberty. States parties should include in their reports information concerning the system for supervising penitentiary establishments, the specific measures to prevent torture and cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment, and how impartial supervision is ensured.

7. Furthermore, the Committee recalls that reports should indicate whether the various applicable provisions form an integral part of the instruction and training of the personnel who have authority over persons deprived of their liberty and whether they are strictly adhered to by such personnel in the discharge of their duties. It would also be appropriate to specify whether arrested or detained persons have access to such information and have effective legal means enabling them to ensure that those rules are respected, to complain if the rules are ignored and to obtain adequate compensation in the event of a violation.

8. The Committee recalls that the principle set forth in article 10, paragraph 1, constitutes the basis for the more specific obligations of States parties in respect of criminal justice, which are set forth in article 10, paragraphs 2 and 3.

9. Article 10, paragraph 2 (a), provides for the segregation, save in exceptional circumstances, of accused persons from convicted ones. Such segregation is required in order to emphasize their status as unconvicted persons who at the same time enjoy the right to be presumed innocent as stated in article 14, paragraph 2. The reports of States parties should indicate how the separation of accused persons from convicted persons is effected and

convicted explain how the treatment of accused persons differs from that of persons.

the 10. As to article 10, paragraph 3, which concerns convicted persons, the Committee wishes to have detailed information on the operation of the penitentiary system of the State party. No penitentiary system should be only retributory; it should essentially seek the reformation and social rehabilitation of the prisoner. States parties are invited to specify whether they have a system to provide assistance after release and to give information as to its success.

convicted 11. In a number of cases, the information furnished by the State party contains no specific reference either to legislative or administrative measures provisions or to practical measures to ensure the re-education of persons. The Committee requests specific information concerning the measures taken to provide teaching, education and re-education, vocational guidance and training and also concerning work programmes for prisoners inside the penitentiary establishment as well as outside.

10, 12. In order to determine whether the principle set forth in article information paragraph 3, is being fully respected, the Committee also requests

persons on the specific measures applied during detention, e.g., how convicted  
disciplinarily are dealt with individually and how they are categorized, the  
conditions system, solitary confinement and high-security detention and the  
under which contacts are ensured with the outside world (family, lawyer,  
social and medical services, non-governmental organizations).

parties 13. Moreover, the Committee notes that in the reports of some States  
accused no information has been provided concerning the treatment accorded to  
juvenile persons and juvenile offenders. Article 10, paragraph 2 (b),  
provides that accused juvenile persons shall be separated from adults.

The information given in reports shows that some States parties are not  
paying the necessary attention to the fact that this is a mandatory provision of  
the Covenant. The text also provides that cases involving juveniles must  
be considered as speedily as possible. Reports should specify the measures  
taken by States parties to give effect to that provision. Lastly, under

article 10, paragraph 3, juvenile offenders shall be segregated from adults and be  
as accorded treatment appropriate to their age and legal status in so far

conditions of detention are concerned, such as shorter working hours and  
age. contact with relatives, with the aim of furthering their reformation and  
rehabilitation. Article 10 does not indicate any limits of juvenile

relevant While this is to be determined by each State party in the light of  
that social, cultural and other conditions, the Committee is of the opinion

should article 6, paragraph 5, suggests that all persons under the age of 18  
justice. be treated as juveniles, at least in matters relating to criminal

States should give relevant information about the age groups of persons  
indicate treated as juveniles. In that regard, States parties are invited to

the whether they are applying the United Nations Standard Minimum Rules for  
Administration of Juvenile Justice, known as the Beijing Rules (1987).

II

GENERAL COMMENTS

adopted by the Committee on Economic,  
Social and Cultural Rights

Introduction: the purpose of general comments\*

1. At its second session, in 1988, the Committee decided (E/1988/14, paras. 366 and 367), pursuant to an invitation addressed to it by the Economic and Social Council (resolution 1987/5) and endorsed by the General Assembly (resolution 42/102), to begin, as from its third session, the preparation of general comments based on the various articles and provisions of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights with a view to assisting the States parties in fulfilling their reporting obligations.

2. The Committee, and the sessional working group of governmental experts which existed prior to the creation of the Committee, have examined 138 initial reports and 44 second periodic reports concerning rights covered by articles 6 to 9, 10 to 12 and 13 to 15 of the Covenant as of the end of its third session. This experience covers a significant number of States parties to the Covenant, currently consisting of 92 States. They represent all regions of the world, with different socio-economic, cultural, political and legal systems. Their reports submitted so far illustrate many of the problems which might arise in implementing the Covenant although they have not yet provided any complete picture as to the global situation with regard to the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights. The introduction to annex III (General Comments) of the Committee's 1989 report to the Economic and Social Council (E/1989/22) explains the purpose of the general comments as follows:

3. "The Committee endeavours, through its general comments, to make the experience gained so far through the examination of these reports available for the benefit of all States parties in order to assist and promote their

States further implementation of the Covenant; to draw the attention of the  
parties to insufficiencies disclosed by a large number of reports; to  
suggest improvements in the reporting procedures and to stimulate the activities  
of the States parties, the international organizations and the specialized  
agencies concerned in achieving progressively and effectively the full  
necessary, the realization of the rights recognized in the Covenant. Whenever  
the Committee may, in the light of the experience of States parties and of  
conclusions which it has drawn therefrom, revise and update its general  
comments."

---

\* Contained in document E/1989/22.



GENERAL COMMENT 1 (Third session, 1989)\*

Reporting by States parties

Covenant  
which  
responsibilities for  
that  
On the  
indeed  
report  
force  
is  
and  
undertaken  
different  
actual  
thus  
enjoyed  
the  
national  
given to  
which

1. The reporting obligations which are contained in part IV of the Covenant are designed principally to assist each State party in fulfilling its obligations under the Covenant and, in addition, to provide a basis on which the Council, assisted by the Committee, can discharge its responsibilities for monitoring States parties' compliance with their obligations and for facilitating the realization of economic, social and cultural rights in accordance with the provisions of the Covenant. The Committee considers that it would be incorrect to assume that reporting is essentially only a procedural matter designed solely to satisfy each State party's formal obligation to report to the appropriate international monitoring body. On the contrary, in accordance with the letter and spirit of the Covenant, the processes of preparation and submission of reports by States can, and indeed should, serve to achieve a variety of objectives.

2. A first objective, which is of particular relevance to the initial report required to be submitted within two years of the Covenant's entry into force for the State party concerned, is to ensure that a comprehensive review is undertaken with respect to national legislation, administrative rules and procedures, and practices in an effort to ensure the fullest possible conformity with the Covenant. Such a review might, for example, be undertaken in conjunction with each of the relevant national ministries or other authorities responsible for policy-making and implementation in the different fields covered by the Covenant.

3. A second objective is to ensure that the State party monitors the actual situation with respect to each of the rights on a regular basis and is thus aware of the extent to which the various rights are, or are not, being enjoyed by all individuals within its territory or under its jurisdiction. From the Committee's experience to date, it is clear that the fulfilment of this objective cannot be achieved only by the preparation of aggregate national statistics or estimates, but also requires that special attention be given to any worse-off regions or areas and to any specific groups or subgroups which appear to be particularly vulnerable or disadvantaged. Thus, the

essential first step towards promoting the realization of economic, social and  
cultural rights is diagnosis and knowledge of the existing situation. The  
Committee is aware that this process of monitoring and gathering information is a  
potentially time-consuming and costly one and that international  
assistance and cooperation, as provided for in article 2, paragraph 1 and articles  
22 and 23 of the Covenant, may well be required in order to enable some  
States parties to fulfil the relevant obligations. If that is the case, and  
the State party concludes that it does not have the capacity to undertake  
the monitoring process which is an integral part of any process designed to  
promote accepted goals of public policy and is indispensable to the  
effective

---

\* Contained in document E/1989/22.

the implementation of the Covenant, it may note this fact in its report to the Committee and indicate the nature and extent of any international assistance that it may need.

4. While monitoring is designed to give a detailed overview of the existing situation, the principal value of such an overview is to provide the basis for the elaboration of clearly stated and carefully targeted policies, including the establishment of priorities which reflect the provisions of the Covenant. Therefore, a third objective of the reporting process is to enable the Government to demonstrate that such principled policy-making has in fact been undertaken. While the Covenant makes this obligation explicit only in article 14 in cases where "compulsory primary education, free of charge" has not yet been secured for all, a comparable obligation "to work out and adopt a detailed plan of action for the progressive implementation" of each of the rights contained in the Covenant is clearly implied by the obligation in article 2, paragraph 1 "to take steps ... by all appropriate means ...".

5. A fourth objective of the reporting process is to facilitate public scrutiny of government policies with respect to economic, social and cultural rights and to encourage the involvement of the various economic, social and cultural sectors of society in the formulation, implementation and review of the relevant policies. In examining reports submitted to it to date, the Committee has welcomed the fact that a number of States parties, reflecting different political and economic systems, have encouraged inputs by such non-governmental groups into the preparation of their reports under the Covenant. Other States have ensured the widespread dissemination of their reports with a view to enabling comments to be made by the public at large. In these ways, the preparation of the report, and its consideration at the national level can come to be of at least as much value as the constructive dialogue conducted at the international level between the Committee and representatives of the reporting State.

itself,  
contained in  
area  
per  
of these  
more  
progress.

6. A fifth objective is to provide a basis on which the State party, as well as the Committee, can effectively evaluate the extent to which progress has been made towards the realization of the obligations the Covenant. For this purpose, it may be useful for States to identify specific benchmarks or goals against which their performance in a given area can be assessed. Thus, for example, it is generally agreed that it is important to set specific goals with respect to the reduction of infant mortality, the extent of vaccination of children, the intake of calories per person, the number of persons per health-care provider, etc. In many of these areas, global benchmarks are of limited use, whereas national or other more specific benchmarks can provide an extremely valuable indication of progress.

attaches  
to  
over  
By  
data  
made.

7. In this regard, the Committee wishes to note that the Covenant attaches particular importance to the concept of "progressive realization" of the relevant rights and, for that reason, the Committee urges States parties to include in their periodic reports information which shows the progress over time, with respect to the effective realization of the relevant rights. By the same token, it is clear that qualitative, as well as quantitative, data are required in order for an adequate assessment of the situation to be made.

a better  
to  
rights.  
on the  
of  
provides the

8. A sixth objective is to enable the State party itself to develop understanding of the problems and shortcomings encountered in efforts to realize progressively the full range of economic, social and cultural rights. For this reason, it is essential that States parties report in detail "factors and difficulties" inhibiting such realization. This process of identification and recognition of the relevant difficulties then provides the framework within which more appropriate policies can be devised.

parties as  
develop  
fuller  
effective  
of the  
means by  
with  
importance  
comment on

9. A seventh objective is to enable the Committee, and the States a whole, to facilitate the exchange of information among States and to develop a better understanding of the common problems faced by States and a fuller appreciation of the type of measures which might be taken to promote effective realization of each of the rights contained in the Covenant. This part of the process also enables the Committee to identify the most appropriate means by which the international community might assist States, in accordance with articles 22 and 23 of the Covenant. In order to underline the importance which the Committee attaches to this objective, a separate general comment on those articles will be discussed by the Committee at its fourth session.

GENERAL COMMENT 2 (Fourth session, 1990)\*

International technical assistance measures (art. 22 of the Covenant)

Economic  
"which  
on  
primary  
to play

1. Article 22 of the Covenant establishes a mechanism by which the and Social Council may bring to the attention of relevant United Nations bodies any matters arising out of reports submitted under the Covenant may assist such bodies in deciding, each within its field of competence, the advisability of international measures likely to contribute to the effective progressive implementation of the ... Covenant". While the responsibility under article 22 is vested in the Council, it is clearly appropriate for the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultrual Rights an active role in advising and assisting the Council in this regard.

"organs  
considers that  
international  
alia, to  
Commission  
on  
such  
such as

2. Recommendations in accordance with article 22 may be made to any of the United Nations, their subsidiary organs and specialized agencies concerned with furnishing technical assistance". The Committee this provision should be interpreted so as to include virtually all United Nations organs and agencies involved in any aspect of development cooperation. It would therefore be appropriate for recommendations in accordance with article 22 to be addressed, inter the Secretary-General, subsidiary organs of the Council such as the Commission on Human Rights, the Commission on Social Development and the Commission on the Status of Women, other bodies such as UNDP, UNICEF and CDP, agencies such as the World Bank and IMF, and any of the other specialized agencies ILO, FAO, UNESCO and WHO.

specific  
would  
economic,  
development  
that the

3. Article 22 could lead either to recommendations of a general policy nature or to more narrowly focused recommendations relating to a situation. In the former context, the principal role of the Committee seem to be to encourage greater attention to efforts to promote social and cultural rights within the framework of international cooperation activities undertaken by, or with the assistance of, the United Nations and its agencies. In this regard the Committee notes

invited Commission on Human Rights, in its resolution 1989/13 of 2 March 1989,  
measures it "to give consideration to means by which the various United Nations  
rights in agencies working in the field of development could best integrate  
designed to promote full respect for economic, social and cultural  
their activities".

better 4. As a preliminary practical matter, the Committee notes that its own  
endeavours would be assisted, and the relevant agencies would also be  
in a informed, if they were to take a greater interest in the work of the  
Committee. While recognizing that such an interest can be demonstrated  
representatives of variety of ways, the Committee observes that attendance by  
with the the appropriate United Nations bodies at its first four sessions has,  
a very notable exceptions of ILO, UNESCO and WHO, been very low. Similarly,  
pertinent materials and written information had been received from only

---

\* Contained in document E/1990/23.

limited number of agencies. The Committee considers that a deeper understanding of the relevance of economic, social and cultural rights in the context of international development cooperation activities would be considerably facilitated through greater interaction between the Committee and the appropriate agencies. At the very least, the day of general discussion on a specific issue, which the Committee undertakes at each of its sessions, provides an ideal context in which a potentially productive exchange of views can be undertaken.

5. On the broader issues of the promotion of respect for human rights in the context of development activities, the Committee has so far seen only rather limited evidence of specific efforts by United Nations bodies. It notes with satisfaction in this regard the initiative taken jointly by the Centre for Human Rights and UNDP in writing to United Nations Resident Representatives and other field-based officials, inviting their "suggestions and advice, in particular with respect to possible forms of cooperation in ongoing projects [identified] as having a human rights dimension or in new ones in response to a specific Government's request". The Committee has also been informed of longstanding efforts undertaken by ILO to link its own human rights and other international labour standards to its technical cooperation activities.

6. With respect to such activities, two general principles are important. The first is that the two sets of human rights are indivisible and interdependent. This means that efforts to promote one set of rights should also take full account of the other. United Nations agencies involved in the promotion of economic, social and cultural rights should do their utmost to ensure that their activities are fully consistent with the enjoyment of civil and political rights. In negative terms this means that the international agencies should scrupulously avoid involvement in projects which, for example, involve the use of forced labour in contravention of international standards, or promote or reinforce discrimination against individuals or groups contrary to the provisions of the Covenant, or involve large-scale evictions or



displacement of persons without the provision of all appropriate protection and compensation. In positive terms, it means that, wherever possible, the agencies should act as advocates of projects and approaches which contribute not only to economic growth or other broadly defined objectives, but also to enhanced enjoyment of the full range of human rights.

7. The second principle of general relevance is that development cooperation activities do not automatically contribute to the promotion of respect for economic, social and cultural rights. Many activities undertaken in the name of "development" have subsequently been recognized as ill-conceived and even counter-productive in human rights terms. In order to reduce the incidence of such problems, the whole range of issues dealt with in the Covenant should, wherever possible and appropriate, be given specific and careful consideration.

8. Despite the importance of seeking to integrate human rights concerns into development activities, it is true that proposals for such integration can too easily remain at a level of generality. Thus, in an effort to encourage the operationalization of the principle contained in article 22 of the Covenant, the Committee wishes to draw attention to the following specific measures which merit consideration by the relevant bodies:

organs and  
should  
respect  
in  
the  
that  
1990,

(a) As a matter of principle, the appropriate United Nations agencies should specifically recognize the intimate relationship which should be established between development activities and efforts to promote respect for human rights in general, and economic, social and cultural rights in particular. The Committee notes in this regard the failure of each of the first three United Nations Development Decade Strategies to recognize that relationship and urges that the fourth such strategy, to be adopted in 1990, should rectify that omission;

the  
"human  
all

(b) Consideration should be given by United Nations agencies to the proposal, made by the Secretary-General in a report of 1979 a/ that a "human rights impact statement" be required to be prepared in connection with all major development cooperation activities;

with

(c) The training or briefing given to project and other personnel employed by United Nations agencies should include a component dealing with human rights standards and principles.

project,  
the  
particular  
in its

(d) Every effort should be made, at each phase of a development project, to ensure that the rights contained in the Covenants are duly taken into account. This would apply, for example, in the initial assessment of the priority needs of a particular country, in the identification of projects, in project design, in the implementation of the project, and in its final evaluation.

the  
the debt  
economic,  
that  
frequently  
however,

9. A matter which has been of particular concern to the Committee in the examination of the reports of States parties is the adverse impact of the debt burden and of the relevant adjustment measures on the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights in many countries. The Committee recognizes that adjustment programmes will often be unavoidable and that these will frequently involve a major element of austerity. Under such circumstances,

endeavours to protect the most basic economic, social and cultural rights become more, rather than less, urgent. States parties to the Covenant, as well as the relevant United Nations agencies, should thus make a particular effort to ensure that such protection is, to the maximum extent possible, built-in to programmes and policies designed to promote adjustment. Such an approach, which is sometimes referred to as "adjustment with a human face" or as promoting "the human dimension of development" requires that the goal of protecting the rights of the poor and vulnerable should become a basic objective of economic adjustment. Similarly, international measures to deal

---

a/ "The international dimensions of the right to development as a human right in relation with other human rights based on international cooperation, including the right to peace, taking into account the requirements of the new international economic order and the fundamental human needs" (E/CN.4/1334, para. 314).

with the debt crisis should take full account of the need to protect economic, social and cultural rights through, inter alia, international cooperation. In many situations, this might point to the need for major debt relief initiatives.

10. Finally, the Committee wishes to draw attention to the important opportunity provided to States parties, in accordance with article 22 of the Covenant, to identify in their reports any particular needs they might have for technical assistance or development cooperation.

GENERAL COMMENT 3 (Fifth session, 1990)\*

The nature of States parties obligations (art. 2, para. 1 of the Covenant)

1. Article 2 is of particular importance to a full understanding of the Covenant and must be seen as having a dynamic relationship with all of the other provisions of the Covenant. It describes the nature of the general legal obligations undertaken by States parties to the Covenant. Those obligations include both what may be termed (following the work of the International Law Commission) obligations of conduct and obligations of result. While great emphasis has sometimes been placed on the difference between the formulations used in this provision and that contained in the equivalent article 2 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, it is not always recognized that there are also significant similarities. In particular, while the Covenant provides for progressive realization and acknowledges the constraints due to the limits of available resources, it also imposes various obligations which are of immediate effect. Of these, two are of particular importance in understanding the precise nature of States parties obligations. One of these, which is dealt with in a separate General Comment, and which is to be considered by the Committee at its sixth session, is the "undertaking to guarantee" that relevant rights "will be exercised without discrimination ...".

2. The other is the undertaking in article 2 (1) "to take steps", which in itself, is not qualified or limited by other considerations. The full meaning of the phrase can also be gauged by noting some of the different language versions. In English the undertaking is "to take steps", in French it is "to act" ("s'engage à agir") and in Spanish it is "to adopt measures" ("adoptar medidas"). Thus while the full realization of the relevant rights may be achieved progressively, steps towards that goal must be taken within a reasonably short time after the Covenant's entry into force for the States concerned. Such steps should be deliberate, concrete and targeted as

clearly

as possible towards meeting the obligations recognized in the Covenant.

to take

3. The means which should be used in order to satisfy the obligation

including

steps are stated in article 2 (1) to be "all appropriate means,

recognizes

particularly the adoption of legislative measures". The Committee

may

that in many instances legislation is highly desirable and in some cases

foundation

even be indispensable. For example, it may be difficult to combat  
discrimination effectively in the absence of a sound legislative

of

for the necessary measures. In fields such as health, the protection

matters

children and mothers, and education, as well as in respect of the

dealt with in articles 6 to 9, legislation may also be an indispensable  
element for many purposes.

---

\* Contained in document E/1991/23.

4. The Committee notes that States parties have generally been conscientious in detailing at least some of the legislative measures that they have taken in this regard. It wishes to emphasize, however, that the adoption of legislative measures, as specifically foreseen by the Covenant, is by no means exhaustive of the obligations of States parties. Rather, the phrase "by all appropriate means" must be given its full and natural meaning. While each State party must decide for itself which means are the most appropriate under the circumstances with respect to each of the rights, the "appropriateness" of the means chosen will not always be self-evident. It is therefore desirable that States parties' reports should indicate not only the measures that have been taken but also the basis on which they are considered to be the most "appropriate" under the circumstances. However, the ultimate determination as to whether all appropriate measures have been taken remains one for the Committee to make.

5. Among the measures which might be considered appropriate, in addition to legislation, is the provision of judicial remedies with respect to rights which may, in accordance with the national legal system, be considered the justiciable. The Committee notes, for example, that the enjoyment of rights recognized, without discrimination, will often be appropriately promoted, in part, through the provision of judicial or other effective remedies. Indeed, those States parties which are also parties to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights are already obligated (by virtue of arts. 2 (paras. 1 and 3), 3 and 26) of that Covenant to ensure that any person whose rights or freedoms (including the right to equality and non-discrimination) recognized in that Covenant are violated, "shall have an effective remedy" (art. 2 (3) (a)). In addition, there are a number of other provisions in the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, including articles 3, 7 (a) (i), 8, 10 (3), 13 (2) (a), (3) and (4) and 15 (3) which would seem to be capable of immediate application by judicial and other organs in many national legal systems. Any suggestion that the provisions indicated are inherently non-self-executing would seem to be difficult to sustain.

rights  
that  
constitutional  
information as  
wish to  
rights

6. Where specific policies aimed directly at the realization of the recognized in the Covenant have been adopted in legislative form, the Committee would wish to be informed, inter alia, as to whether such laws create any right of action on behalf of individuals or groups who feel their rights are not being fully realized. In cases where recognition has been accorded to specific economic, social and cultural rights, or where the provisions of the Covenant have been incorporated directly into national law, the Committee would wish to receive information as to the extent to which these rights are considered to be justiciable (i.e. able to be invoked before the courts). The Committee would also wish to receive specific information as to any instances in which existing constitutional provisions relating to economic, social and cultural rights have been weakened or significantly changed.

administrative,

7. Other measures which may also be considered "appropriate" for the purposes of article 2 (1) include, but are not limited to, financial, educational and social measures.



8. The Committee notes that the undertaking "to take steps ... by all appropriate means including particularly the adoption of legislative measures" neither requires nor precludes any particular form of government or economic system being used as the vehicle for the steps in question, provided only that it is democratic and that all human rights are thereby respected. Thus, in terms of political and economic systems the Covenant is neutral and its principles cannot accurately be described as being predicated exclusively upon the need for, or the desirability of a socialist or a capitalist system, or a mixed, centrally planned, or laissez-faire economy, or upon any other particular approach. In this regard, the Committee reaffirms that the rights recognized in the Covenant are susceptible of realization within the context of a wide variety of economic and political systems, provided only that the interdependence and indivisibility of the two sets of human rights, as affirmed inter alia in the preamble to the Covenant, is recognized and reflected in the system in question. The Committee also notes the relevance in this regard of other human rights and in particular the right to development.

9. The principal obligation of result reflected in article 2 (1) is to take steps "with a view to achieving progressively the full realization of the rights recognized" in the Covenant. The term "progressive realization" is often used to describe the intent of this phrase. The concept of progressive realization constitutes a recognition of the fact that full realization of all economic, social and cultural rights will generally not be able to be achieved in a short period of time. In this sense the obligation differs significantly from that contained in article 2 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights which embodies an immediate obligation to respect and ensure all of the relevant rights. Nevertheless, the fact that realization over time, or in other words progressively, is foreseen under the Covenant should not be misinterpreted as depriving the obligation of all meaningful content.

It is on the one hand a necessary flexibility device, reflecting the realities of the real world and the difficulties involved for any country in ensuring full realization of economic, social and cultural rights. On the other hand, the phrase must be read in the light of the overall objective, indeed the raison d'être, of the Covenant which is to establish clear obligations for States parties in respect of the full realization of the rights in question. It thus imposes an obligation to move as expeditiously and effectively as possible towards that goal. Moreover, any deliberately retrogressive measures in that regard would require the most careful consideration and would need to be fully justified by reference to the totality of the rights provided for in the Covenant and in the context of the full use of the maximum available resources.

10. On the basis of the extensive experience gained by the Committee, as well as by the body that preceded it, over a period of more than a decade of examining States parties' reports the Committee is of the view that a minimum core obligation to ensure the satisfaction of, at the very least, minimum essential levels of each of the rights is incumbent upon every State party. Thus, for example, a State party in which any significant number of individuals is deprived of essential foodstuffs, of essential primary health care, of basic shelter and housing, or of the most basic forms of education is, prima facie, failing to discharge its obligations under the Covenant. If the Covenant were to be read in such a way as not to establish such a minimum

the core obligation, it would be largely deprived of its raison d'être. By the same token, it must be noted that any assessment as to whether a State has discharged its minimum core obligation must also take account of resource constraints applying within the country concerned. Article 2 (1) obligates each State party to take the necessary steps "to the maximum of its available resources". In order for a State party to be able to attribute its failure to meet at least its minimum core obligations to a lack of available resources it must demonstrate that every effort has been made to use all resources that are at its disposition in an effort to satisfy, as a matter of priority, those minimum obligations.

11. The Committee wishes to emphasize, however, that even where the available resources are demonstrably inadequate, the obligation remains for a State party to strive to ensure the widest possible enjoyment of the relevant rights under the prevailing circumstances. Moreover, the obligations to monitor the extent of the realization, or more especially of the non-realization, of economic, social and cultural rights, and to devise strategies and programmes for their promotion, are not in any way eliminated as a result of resource constraints. The Committee has already dealt with these issues in its General Comment 1 (1989).

12. Similarly, the Committee underlines the fact that even in times of severe economic recession, or by other factors the vulnerable members of society can and indeed must be protected by the adoption of relatively low-cost targeted programmes. In support of this approach the Committee takes note of the analysis prepared by UNICEF entitled "Adjustment with a human face: protecting the vulnerable and promoting growth, a/ the analysis by UNDP in its Human Development Report 1990 b/ and the analysis by the World Bank in the World Development Report 1990. c/

13. A final element of article 2 (1), to which attention must be drawn, is that the undertaking given by all States parties is "to take steps, individually and through international assistance and cooperation,

especially economic and technical ...". The Committee notes that the phrase "to  
the maximum of its available resources" was intended by the drafters of the  
Covenant to refer to both the resources existing within a State and  
those available from the international community through international  
cooperation and assistance. Moreover, the essential role of such cooperation in  
facilitating the full realization of the relevant rights is further  
underlined

---

a/ G.A. Cornia, R. Jolly and F. Stewart, eds., Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1987.

b/ Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1990.

c/ Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1990.

With General exist  
55 principles  
of  
It is assist  
of  
Assembly in  
to  
emphasizes  
and  
rights  
respect, the

by the specific provisions contained in articles 11, 15, 22 and 23. respect to article 22 the Committee has already drawn attention, in Comment 2 (1990), to some of the opportunities and responsibilities that in relation to international cooperation. Article 23 also specifically identifies "the furnishing of technical assistance" as well as other activities, as being among the means of "international action for the achievement of the rights recognized ...".

14. The Committee wishes to emphasize that in accordance with Articles and 56 of the Charter of the United Nations, with well-established of international law, and with the provisions of the Covenant itself, international cooperation for development and thus for the realization economic, social and cultural rights is an obligation of all States. particularly incumbent upon those States which are in a position to assist others in this regard. The Committee notes in particular the importance of the Declaration on the Right to Development adopted by the General Assembly in its resolution 41/128 of 4 December 1986 and the need for States parties to take full account of all of the principles recognized therein. It emphasizes that, in the absence of an active programme of international assistance and cooperation on the part of all those States that are in a position to undertake one, the full realization of economic, social and cultural rights will remain an unfulfilled aspiration in many countries. In this respect, the Committee also recalls the terms of its General Comment 2 (1990).

GENERAL COMMENT 4 (Sixth session, 1991)\*

The right to adequate housing (art. 11 (1) of the Covenant)

1. Pursuant to article 11 (1) of the Covenant, States parties "recognize the right of everyone to an adequate standard of living for himself and his family, including adequate food, clothing and housing, and to the continuous improvement of living conditions". The human right to adequate housing, which is thus derived from the right to an adequate standard of living, is of central importance for the enjoyment of all economic, social and cultural rights.

2. The Committee has been able to accumulate a large amount of information pertaining to this right. Since 1979, the Committee and its predecessors have examined 75 reports dealing with the right to adequate housing. The Committee has also devoted a day of general discussion to the issue at each of its third (see E/1989/22, para. 312) and fourth sessions (E/1990/23, paras. 281-285). In addition, the Committee has taken careful note of information generated by the International Year of Shelter for the Homeless (1987) including the Global Strategy for Shelter to the Year 2000 adopted by the General Assembly in its resolution 42/191 of 11 December 1987. a/ The Committee has also reviewed relevant reports and other documentation of the Commission on Human Rights and the Sub-Commission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities. b/

3. Although a wide variety of international instruments address the different dimensions of the right to adequate housing c/ article 11 (1) of the Covenant is the most comprehensive and perhaps the most important of the relevant provisions.

---

\* Contained in document E/1992/23.

a/ Official Records of the General Assembly, Forty-third Session, Supplement No. 8, addendum (A/43/8/Add.1).

b/ Commission on Human Rights resolutions 1986/36 and 1987/22; reports by Mr. Danilo Türk, Special Rapporteur of the Sub-Commission

137-139); (E/CN.4/Sub.2/1990/19, paras. 108-120; E/CN.4/Sub.2/1991/17, paras. see also Sub-Commission resolution 1991/26.

on  
Women,  
of the  
publication,  
Concerning

c/ See, for example, article 25 (1) of the Universal Declaration Human Rights, article 5 (e) (iii) of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, article 14 (2) of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against article 27 (3) of the Convention on the Rights of the Child, article 10 Declaration on Social Progress and Development, section III (8) of the Vancouver Declaration on Human Settlements, 1976 (Report of Habitat: United Nations Conference on Human Settlements (United Nations Sales No. E.76.IV.7 and corrigendum), chap. I), article 8 (1) of the Declaration on the Right to Development and the ILO Recommendation Workers' Housing, 1961 (No. 115).

4. Despite the fact that the international community has frequently reaffirmed the importance of full respect for the right to adequate housing, there remains a disturbingly large gap between the standards set in article 11 (1) of the Covenant and the situation prevailing in many parts of the world. While the problems are often particularly acute in some developing countries which confront major resource and other constraints, the Committee observes that significant problems of homelessness and inadequate housing also exist in some of the most economically developed societies. The United Nations estimates that there are over 100 million persons homeless worldwide and over 1 billion inadequately housed. d/ There is no indication that this number is decreasing. It seems clear that no State party is free of significant problems of one kind or another in relation to the right to housing.

5. In some instances, the reports of States parties examined by the Committee have acknowledged and described difficulties in ensuring the right to adequate housing. For the most part, however, the information provided has been insufficient to enable the Committee to obtain an adequate picture of the situation prevailing in the State concerned. This General Comment thus aims to identify some of the principal issues which the Committee considers to be important in relation to this right.

6. The right to adequate housing applies to everyone. While the reference to "himself and his family" reflects assumptions as to gender roles and economic activity patterns commonly accepted in 1966 when the Covenant was adopted, the phrase cannot be read today as implying any limitations upon the applicability of the right to individuals or to female-headed households or other such groups. Thus, the concept of "family" must be understood in a wide sense. Further, individuals, as well as families, are entitled to adequate housing regardless of age, economic status, group or other affiliation or status and other such factors. In particular, enjoyment of this right must,



in accordance with article 2 (2) of the Covenant, not be subject to any form of discrimination.

7. In the Committee's view, the right to housing should not be interpreted in a narrow or restrictive sense which equates it with, for example, the shelter provided by merely having a roof over one's head or views exclusively as a commodity. Rather it should be seen as the right to live somewhere in security, peace and dignity. This is appropriate for at least two reasons. In the first place, the right to housing is integrally linked to other human rights and to the fundamental principles upon which the Covenant is premised. This "the inherent dignity of the human person" from which the rights in the Covenant are said to derive requires that the term "housing" be interpreted so as to take account of a variety of other considerations, most importantly that the right to housing should be ensured to all persons irrespective of income or access to economic resources. Secondly, the reference in article 11 (1) must be read as referring not just to housing but

---

d/ See footnote a/.

the shelter location to adequate housing. As both the Commission on Human Settlements and Global Strategy for Shelter to the Year 2000 have stated: "Adequate means ... adequate privacy, adequate space, adequate security, adequate lighting and ventilation, adequate basic infrastructure and adequate with regard to work and basic facilities - all at a reasonable cost".

8. Thus the concept of adequacy is particularly significant in relation to the right to housing since it serves to underline a number of factors which must be taken into account in determining whether particular forms of shelter can be considered to constitute "adequate housing" for the purposes of the Covenant. While adequacy is determined in part by social, economic, cultural, climatic, ecological and other factors, the Committee believes that it is nevertheless possible to identify certain aspects of the right that must be taken into account for this purpose in any particular context. They include the following:

housing, including legal States legal such (a) Legal security of tenure. Tenure takes a variety of forms, including rental (public and private) accommodation, cooperative lease, owner-occupation, emergency housing and informal settlements, occupation of land or property. Notwithstanding the type of tenure, all persons should possess a degree of security of tenure which guarantees protection against forced eviction, harassment and other threats. parties should consequently take immediate measures aimed at conferring security of tenure upon those persons and households currently lacking protection, in genuine consultation with affected persons and groups;

infrastructure. (b) Availability of services, materials, facilities and infrastructure. An adequate house must contain certain facilities essential for health, security, comfort and nutrition. All beneficiaries of the right to adequate housing should have sustainable access to natural and common resources, safe drinking water, energy for cooking, heating and lighting, sanitation and washing facilities, means of food storage, refuse disposal, site drainage and emergency services;

(c) Affordability. Personal or household financial costs

associated

with housing should be at such a level that the attainment and satisfaction of

other basic needs are not threatened or compromised. Steps should be taken by

States parties to ensure that the percentage of housing-related costs is, in

general, commensurate with income levels. States parties should establish

housing subsidies for those unable to obtain affordable housing, as well as

forms and levels of housing finance which adequately reflect housing needs.

In accordance with the principle of affordability, tenants should be protected

by appropriate means against unreasonable rent levels or rent increases. In

societies where natural materials constitute the chief sources of building

materials for housing, steps should be taken by States parties to ensure the

availability of such materials;

(d) Habitability. Adequate housing must be habitable, in terms of

providing the inhabitants with adequate space and protecting them from cold,

damp, heat, rain, wind or other threats to health, structural hazards, and

disease vectors. The physical safety of occupants must be guaranteed as

well. The Committee encourages States parties to comprehensively apply the

the Health Principles of Housing e/ prepared by WHO which view housing as the environmental factor most frequently associated with conditions for disease in epidemiological analyses; i.e. inadequate and deficient housing and living conditions are invariably associated with higher mortality and morbidity rates;

(e) Accessibility. Adequate housing must be accessible to those entitled to it. Disadvantaged groups must be accorded full and sustainable access to adequate housing resources. Thus, such disadvantaged groups as the elderly, children, the physically disabled, the terminally ill, HIV-positive individuals, persons with persistent medical problems, the mentally ill, other victims of natural disasters, people living in disaster-prone areas and groups should be ensured some degree of priority consideration in the housing sphere. Both housing law and policy should take fully into account the increasing special housing needs of these groups. Within many States parties should access to land by landless or impoverished segments of the society need constitute a central policy goal. Discernible governmental obligations place to be developed aiming to substantiate the right of all to a secure live in peace and dignity, including access to land as an entitlement;

(f) Location. Adequate housing must be in a location which allows and in access to employment options, health-care services, schools, child-care from the centres and other social facilities. This is true both in large cities rural areas where the temporal and financial costs of getting to and nor in place of work can place excessive demands upon the budgets of poor households. Similarly, housing should not be built on polluted sites health of immediate proximity to pollution sources that threaten the right to the inhabitants;

(g) Cultural adequacy. The way housing is constructed, the building materials used and the policies supporting these must appropriately enable the expression of cultural identity and diversity of housing. Activities geared towards development or modernization in the housing sphere should ensure

that  
alia,  
Covenants  
been  
of  
such as  
(such  
of  
subjected  
or  
right to

the cultural dimensions of housing are not sacrificed, and that, inter  
modern technological facilities, as appropriate are also ensured.

9. As noted above, the right to adequate housing cannot be viewed in isolation from other human rights contained in the two International and other applicable international instruments. Reference has already been made in this regard to the concept of human dignity and the principle of non-discrimination. In addition, the full enjoyment of other rights - the right to freedom of expression, the right to freedom of association (such as for tenants and other community-based groups), the right to freedom of residence and the right to participate in public decision-making - is indispensable if the right to adequate housing is to be realized and maintained by all groups in society. Similarly, the right not to be subjected to arbitrary or unlawful interference with one's privacy, family, home or correspondence constitutes a very important dimension in defining the right to adequate housing.

---

e/ Geneva, World Health Organization, 1990.

10. Regardless of the state of development of any country, there are certain steps which must be taken immediately. As recognized in the Global Strategy for Shelter and in other international analyses, many of the measures required to promote the right to housing would only require the abstention by the Government from certain practices and a commitment to facilitating "self-help" by affected groups. To the extent that any such steps are considered to be beyond the maximum resources available to a State party, it is appropriate that a request be made as soon as possible for international cooperation in accordance with articles 11 (1), 22 and 23 of the Covenant, and that the Committee be informed thereof.

11. States parties must give due priority to those social groups living in unfavourable conditions by giving them particular consideration. Policies and legislation should correspondingly not be designed to benefit already advantaged social groups at the expense of others. The Committee is aware that external factors can affect the right to a continuous improvement of living conditions, and that in many States parties overall living conditions declined during the 1980s. However, as noted by the Committee in its General Comment 2 (1990) (E/1990/23, annex III), despite externally caused problems, the obligations under the Covenant continue to apply and are perhaps even more pertinent during times of economic contraction. It would thus appear to the Committee that a general decline in living and housing conditions, directly attributable to policy and legislative decisions by States parties, and in the absence of accompanying compensatory measures, would be inconsistent with the obligations under the Covenant.

12. While the most appropriate means of achieving the full realization of the right to adequate housing will inevitably vary significantly from one State party to another, the Covenant clearly requires that each State party take whatever steps are necessary for that purpose. This will almost invariably require the adoption of a national housing strategy which, as stated in paragraph 32 of the Global Strategy for Shelter, "defines the objectives for

the development of shelter conditions, identifies the resources available to meet these goals and the most cost-effective way of using them and sets out the responsibilities and time-frame for the implementation of the necessary measures". Both for reasons of relevance and effectiveness, as well as in order to ensure respect for other human rights, such a strategy should reflect extensive genuine consultation with, and participation by, all of those affected, including the homeless, the inadequately housed and their representatives. Furthermore, steps should be taken to ensure coordination between ministries and regional and local authorities in order to reconcile related policies (economics, agriculture, environment, energy, etc.) with the obligations under article 11 of the Covenant.

13. Effective monitoring of the situation with respect to housing is another obligation of immediate effect. For a State party to satisfy its obligations under article 11 (1) it must demonstrate, inter alia, that it has taken whatever steps are necessary, either alone or on the basis of international cooperation, to ascertain the full extent of homelessness and inadequate housing within its jurisdiction. In this regard, the revised general guidelines regarding the form and contents of reports adopted by the Committee (E/C.12/1991/1) emphasize the need to "provide detailed information about those groups within ... society that are vulnerable and disadvantaged with

regard to housing". They include, in particular, homeless persons and families, those inadequately housed and without ready access to basic amenities, those living in "illegal" settlements, those subject to forced evictions and low-income groups.

14. Measures designed to satisfy a State party's obligations in respect of the right to adequate housing may reflect whatever mix of public and private sector measures considered appropriate. While in some States public financing of housing might most usefully be spent on direct construction of new housing, in most cases, experience has shown the inability of Governments to fully satisfy housing deficits with publicly built housing. The promotion by States parties of "enabling strategies", combined with a full commitment to obligations under the right to adequate housing, should thus be encouraged. In essence, the obligation is to demonstrate that, in aggregate, the measures being taken are sufficient to realize the right for every individual in the shortest possible time in accordance with the maximum of available resources.

15. Many of the measures that will be required will involve resource allocations and policy initiatives of a general kind. Nevertheless, the role of formal legislative and administrative measures should not be underestimated in this context. The Global Strategy for Shelter (paras. 66-67) has drawn attention to the types of measures that might be taken in this regard and to their importance.

16. In some States, the right to adequate housing is constitutionally entrenched. In such cases the Committee is particularly interested in learning of the legal and practical significance of such an approach. Details of specific cases and of other ways in which entrenchment has proved helpful should thus be provided.

17. The Committee views many component elements of the right to adequate housing as being at least consistent with the provision of domestic legal remedies. Depending on the legal system, such areas might include, but



are not limited to: (a) legal appeals aimed at preventing planned evictions  
or demolitions through the issuance of court-ordered injunctions; (b) legal  
complaints procedures seeking compensation following an illegal eviction; (c)  
public against illegal actions carried out or supported by landlords (whether  
or private) in relation to rent levels, dwelling maintenance, and racial  
discrimination other forms of discrimination; (d) allegations of any form of  
complaints in the allocation and availability of access to housing; and (e)  
In against landlords concerning unhealthy or inadequate housing conditions.  
possibility of some legal systems it would also be appropriate to explore the  
facilitating class action suits in situations involving significantly  
increased levels of homelessness.

18. In this regard, the Committee considers that instances of forced  
eviction are prima facie incompatible with the requirements of the Covenant and  
can only be justified in the most exceptional circumstances, and in  
accordance with the relevant principles of international law.

19. Finally, article 11 (1) concludes with the obligation of States  
parties to recognize "the essential importance of international cooperation  
based on free consent". Traditionally, less than 5 per cent of all international

often assistance has been directed towards housing or human settlements, and  
the manner by which such funding is provided does little to address the  
housing needs of disadvantaged groups. States parties, both recipients  
and providers, should ensure that a substantial proportion of financing is  
devoted to creating conditions leading to a higher number of persons being  
adequately housed. International financial institutions promoting measures of  
structural adjustment should ensure that such measures do not compromise the  
enjoyment of the right to adequate housing. States parties should, when  
contemplating international financial cooperation, seek to indicate areas relevant to  
the right to adequate housing where external financing would have the most  
effect. Such requests should take full account of the needs and views  
of the affected groups.

III

GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS

adopted by the Committee on the  
Elimination of Racial Discrimination

According to article 9, paragraph 2, of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, the Committee may make suggestions and general recommendations based on the examination of the reports and information received from the States parties. Such suggestions and general recommendations shall be reported to the General Assembly together with comments, if any, from States parties. The Committee has so far adopted a total of 10 general recommendations.

General Recommendation I (Fifth session, 1972)\*

On the basis of the consideration at its fifth session of reports submitted by States Parties under article 9 of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, the Committee found that the legislation of a number of States Parties did not include the provisions envisaged in article 4 (a) and (b) of the Convention, the implementation of which (with due regard to the principles embodied in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the rights expressly set forth in article 5 of the Convention) is obligatory under the Convention for all States Parties.

The Committee accordingly recommends that the States Parties whose legislation was deficient in this respect should consider, in accordance with their national legislative procedures, the question of supplementing their legislation with provisions conforming to the requirements of article 4 (a) and (b) of the Convention.

General Recommendation II (Fifth session, 1972)\*

The Committee has considered some reports from States Parties which expressed or implied the belief that the information mentioned in the Committee's communication of 28 January 1970 (CERD/C/R.12), 24/ need not be

does not supplied by States Parties on whose territories racial discrimination exist.

of the However, inasmuch as, in accordance with article 9, paragraph 1, International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, all States Parties undertake to submit reports on the measures that they have adopted and that give effect to the provisions of the Convention and, since all the categories of information listed in the Committee's communication of 28 January 1970 refer to obligations undertaken by the States Parties under the Convention, that communication is addressed to

---

\* Contained in document A/8718.

all States Parties without distinction, whether or not racial  
discrimination  
exists in their respective territories. The Committee welcomes the  
inclusion  
in the reports from all States Parties, which have not done so, of the  
necessary information in conformity with all the headings set out in the  
aforementioned communication of the Committee.

General Recommendation III (Sixth session, 1972)\*

The Committee has considered some reports from States Parties  
containing  
information about measures taken to implement resolutions of United  
Nations  
organs concerning relations with the racist regimes in southern Africa.

The Committee notes that, in the tenth paragraph of the preamble  
to the  
International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial  
Discrimination, States Parties have "resolved", inter alia, "to build  
an  
international community free from all forms of racial segregation and  
racial  
discrimination".

It notes also that, in article 3 of the Convention, "States Parties  
particularly condemn racial segregation and apartheid".

Furthermore, the Committee notes that, in resolution 2784 (XXVI),  
section III, the General Assembly, immediately after taking note with  
appreciation of the Committee's second annual report and endorsing  
certain  
opinions and recommendations, submitted by it, proceeded to call upon  
"all the  
trading partners of South Africa to abstain from any action that  
constitutes  
an encouragement to the continued violation of the principles and  
objectives  
of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of  
Racial  
Discrimination by South Africa and the illegal regime in Southern  
Rhodesia".

The Committee expresses the view that measures adopted on the  
national  
level to give effect to the provisions of the Convention are  
interrelated with  
measures taken on the international level to encourage respect  
everywhere for  
the principles of the Convention.

The Committee welcomes the inclusion in the reports submitted under  
article 9, paragraph 1, of the Convention, by any State Party which  
chooses to  
do so, of information regarding the status of its diplomatic, economic  
and

other relations with the racist regimes in southern Africa.

General Recommendation IV (Eighth session, 1973)\*\*

The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination,

9 of

Having considered reports submitted by States parties under article  
the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial  
Discrimination at its seventh and eighth sessions,

---

\* Contained in document A/8718.

\*\* Contained in document A/9018.

the Bearing in mind the need for the reports sent by States parties to the Committee to be as informative as possible,

under Invites States parties to endeavour to include in their reports article 9 relevant information on the demographic composition of the population referred to in the provisions of article 1 of the Convention.

General Recommendation V (Fifteenth session, 1977)\*

International The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination,  
Bearing in mind the provisions of articles 7 and 9 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination,

discrimination, Convinced that combating prejudices which lead to racial promoting understanding, tolerance and friendship among racial and ethnic groups, and propagating the principles and purposes of the Charter of the United Nations and of the human rights declarations and other relevant instruments adopted by the General Assembly of the United Nations, are important and effective means of eliminating racial discrimination,

which Considering that the obligations under article 7 of the Convention, States are binding on all States parties, must be fulfilled by them, including territories which declare that racial discrimination is not practised on the required under their jurisdiction, and that therefore all States parties are paragraph 1, to include information on their implementation of the provisions of that article in the reports they submit in accordance with article 9, of the Convention,

reports Noting with regret that few States parties have included, in the they have submitted in accordance with article 9 of the Convention, effect to information on the measures which they have adopted and which give has the provisions of article 7 of the Convention, and that that information often been general and perfunctory,

States Recalling that, in accordance with article 9, paragraph 1, of the Convention, the Committee may request further information from the

parties,

9 of  
becomes  
which give

1. Requests every State party which has not already done so to include - in the next report it will submit in accordance with article the Convention, or in a special report before its next periodic report due - adequate information on the measures which it has adopted and effect to the provisions of article 7 of the Convention;

the  
and

2. Invites the attention of States parties to the fact that, in accordance with article 7 of the Convention, the information to which preceding paragraph refers should include information on the "immediate

---

\* Contained in document A/32/18.



effective measures" which they have adopted, "in the fields of teaching, education, culture and information", with a view to:

(a) "combating prejudices which lead to racial discrimination";

nations and

(b) "Promoting understanding, tolerance and friendship among racial or ethnical groups";

Nations

(c) "Propagating the purposes and principles of the Charter of the United Nations, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, the United Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination" as well as the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination.

as well

Racial

General Recommendation VI (Twenty-fifth session, 1982)\*

The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination,

ratified, or  
of

Recognizing the fact that an impressive number of States has acceded to, the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination,

the

Bearing in mind, however, that ratification alone does not enable the control system set up by the Convention to function effectively,

to  
the

Recalling that article 9 of the Convention obliges States parties to submit initial and periodic reports on the measures that give effect to the provisions of the Convention,

62  
two  
due

Stating that at present no less than 89 reports are overdue from States, that 42 of those reports are overdue from 15 States, each with or more outstanding reports, and that four initial reports which were due between 1973 and 1978 have not been received,

desired

Noting with regret that neither reminders sent through the Secretary-General to States parties nor the inclusion of the relevant information in the annual reports to the General Assembly has had the desired effect, in all cases,

Invites the General Assembly:

(a) To take note of the situation;

could (b) to use its authority in order to ensure that the Committee more effectively fulfil its obligations under the Convention.

---

\* Contained in document A/37/18.

of the General Recommendation VII relating to the implementation of article 4  
Convention (Thirty-second session, 1985)\*

The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination,  
Having considered periodic reports of States parties for a period  
of 16 years, and in over 100 cases sixth, seventh and eighth periodic  
reports of States parties,

Recalling and reaffirming its General Recommendation I of  
24 February 1972 and its decision 3 (VII) of 4 May 1973,

Noting with satisfaction that in a number of reports States parties  
have provided information on specific cases dealing with the implementation  
of article 4 of the Convention with regard to acts of racial  
discrimination,

Noting, however, that in a number of States parties the necessary  
enacted, and legislation to implement article 4 of the Convention has not been  
that many States parties have not yet fulfilled all the requirements of  
article 4 (a) and (b) of the Convention,

Further recalling that, in accordance with the first paragraph of  
measures article 4, States parties "undertake to adopt immediate and positive  
discrimination",  
of designed to eradicate all incitement to, or acts of, such  
with due regard to the principles embodied in the Universal Declaration  
of Human Rights and the rights expressly set forth in article 5 of the  
Convention,

Bearing in mind the preventive aspects of article 4 to deter racism  
and racial discrimination as well as activities aimed at their promotion or  
incitement,

1. Recommends that those States parties whose legislation does  
not satisfy the provisions of article 4 (a) and (b) of the Convention take  
the necessary steps with a view to satisfying the mandatory requirements of  
that article;

2. Requests that those States parties which have not yet done so

inform

the Committee more fully in their periodic reports of the manner and extent to which the provisions of article 4 (a) and (b) are effectively implemented and quote the relevant parts of the texts in their reports;

3. Further requests those States parties which have not yet done so to endeavour to provide in their periodic reports more information concerning decisions taken by the competent national tribunals and other State institutions regarding acts of racial discrimination and in particular those offences dealt with in article 4 (a) and (b).

---

\* Contained in document A/40/18.

General Recommendation VIII concerning the interpretation and application of article 1, paragraphs 1 and 4, of the Convention (Thirty-eighth session, 1990)\*

The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination,

information  
a  
Having considered reports from States parties concerning about the ways in which individuals are identified as being members of particular racial or ethnic groups or groups,

justification  
individual  
Is of the opinion that such identification shall, if no exists to the contrary, be based upon self-identification by the concerned.

General Recommendation IX concerning the application of article 8, paragraph 1, of the Convention (Thirty-eighth session, 1990)\*

The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination,

essential  
to secure full observance of human rights and fundamental freedoms,

on the  
Recalling article 8, paragraph 1, of the International Convention Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination,

organizations  
country  
Alarmed by the tendency of the representatives of States, and groups to put pressure upon experts, especially those serving as rapporteurs,

its  
their  
Strongly recommends that they respect unreservedly the status of members as independent experts of acknowledged impartiality serving in personal capacity,

---

\* Contained in document A/45/18.

General Recommendation X concerning technical assistance  
(Thirty-ninth session, 1991)\*

The Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination,

of  
reports,  
Taking note of the recommendation of the third meeting of persons chairing the human rights treaty bodies, 6/ as endorsed by the General Assembly at its forty-fifth session, to the effect that a series of seminars or workshops should be organized at the national level for the purpose of training those involved in the preparation of State party reports,

the  
Concerned over the continued failure of certain States parties to the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination to meet their reporting obligations under the Convention,

national  
for the  
Believing that training courses and workshops organized on the level might prove of immeasurable assistance to officials responsible for the preparation of such State party reports,

with the  
workshops  
1. Requests the Secretary-General to organize, in consultation States parties concerned, appropriate national training courses and for their reporting officials as soon as practicable;

Human  
Racial  
such  
2. Recommends that the services of the staff of the Centre for Rights as well as of the experts of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination should be utilized, as appropriate, in the conduct of training courses and workshops.

---

\* Contained in document A/46/18.

IV

GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS

adopted by the Committee on the Elimination  
of Racial Discrimination against Women

According to article 21, paragraph 1, of the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, the Committee may make suggestions and general recommendations based on the examination of the reports and information received from the States parties. Such suggestions and general recommendations shall be included in the report of the Committee together with comments, if any, from States parties. The Committee has so far adopted a total of 20 general recommendations.

General Recommendation No. 1 (Fifth session, 1986)\*

"Initial reports submitted under article 18 of the Convention should cover the situation up to the date of submission. Thereafter, reports should be submitted at least every four years after the first report was due and should include obstacles encountered in implementing the Convention fully and the measures adopted to overcome such obstacles."\*

General Recommendation No. 2 (Sixth session, 1987)\*\*

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, Bearing in mind that the Committee had been faced with difficulties in its work because some initial reports of States parties under article 18 of the Convention did not reflect adequately the information available in the State party concerned in accordance with the guidelines,

Recommends:

(a) That the States parties, in preparing reports under article 18 of the Convention, should follow the general guidelines adopted in August 1983 (CEDAW/C/7) 4/ as to the form, content and date of reports;

(b) That the States parties should follow the general recommendation adopted in 1986 in these terms: 5/

"Initial reports submitted under article 18 of the Convention should

reports cover the situation up to the date of submission. Thereafter,  
report was should be submitted at least every four years after the first  
obstacles."6/ due and should include obstacles encountered in implementing the  
Convention fully and the measures adopted to overcome such

---

\* Contained in document A/41/45.

\*\* Contained in document A/42/38.



State (c) That additional information supplementing the report of a party should be sent to the Secretariat at least three months before the session at which the report is due to be considered.

General Recommendation No. 3 (Sixth session, 1987)\*

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,

Considering that the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women has considered 34 reports from States parties since 1983,

States with Further considering that, although the reports have come from different levels of development, they present features in varying degrees showing the existence of stereotyped conceptions of women, owing to socio-cultural factors, that perpetuate discrimination based on sex and hinder the implementation of article 5 of the Convention,

Urges all States parties effectively to adopt education and public information programmes, which will help eliminate prejudices and current practices that hinder the full operation of the principle of the social equality of women.

General Recommendation No. 4 (Sixth session, 1987)\*

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women

Having examined reports from States parties at its sessions,

reservations Expressed concern in relation to the significant number of that appeared to be incompatible with the object and purpose of the Convention,

reservations at Welcomes the decision of the States parties to consider its next meeting in New York in 1988, and to that end suggests that all States parties concerned reconsider such reservations with a view to withdrawing them.

General Recommendation No. 5 (Seventh session, 1988)\*\*

Temporary special measures

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,

Taking note that the reports, the introductory remarks and the replies by

in  
need

States parties reveal that while significant progress has been achieved regard to repealing or modifying discriminatory laws, there is still a need for action to be taken to implement fully the Convention by introducing measures to promote de facto equality between men and women,

Recalling article 4.1 of the Convention,

---

\* Contained in document A/42/38.

\*\* Contained in document A/43/38.

systems to  
advance women's integration into education, the economy, politics and employment.

General Recommendation No. 6 (Seventh session, 1988)\*

Effective national machinery and publicity

on the  
Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women,

Having considered the reports of States parties to the Convention  
Noting United Nations General Assembly resolution 42/60 of 30 November 1987,

Recommends that States parties:

adequate  
resources, commitment and authority to:

- strategies and  
measures to eliminate discrimination;
- (a) Advise on the impact on women of all government policies;
  - (b) Monitor the situation of women comprehensively;
  - (c) Help formulate new policies and effectively carry out

reports  
of the Committee in the language of the States concerned;

of  
reports  
of the Committee;

in  
respect of this recommendation.

General Recommendation No. 7 (Seventh session, 1988)\*

Resources

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,  
Noting General Assembly resolutions 40/39, 41/108 and in particular

42/60, paragraph 14, which invited the Committee and the States parties  
to  
consider the question of holding future sessions of the Committee at  
Vienna,

---

\* Contained in document A/43/38.

particular,  
coordination  
Social  
the

Bearing in mind General Assembly resolution 42/105 and, in paragraph 11, which requests the Secretary-General to strengthen between the United Nations Centre for Human Rights and the Centre for Development and Humanitarian Affairs of the secretariat in relation to the implementation of human rights treaties and servicing treaty bodies,

Recommends to the States parties:

Centre for  
the

1. That they continue to support proposals for strengthening the coordination between the Centre for Human Rights at Geneva and the Social Development and Humanitarian Affairs at Vienna, in relation to the servicing of the Committee;

York and  
Vienna;

2. That they support proposals that the Committee meet in New

that  
it in  
staff are  
its

3. That they take all necessary and appropriate steps to ensure adequate resources and services are available to the Committee to assist its functions under the Convention and in particular that full-time staff are available to help the Committee to prepare for its sessions and during its session;

official  
consideration by

4. That they ensure that supplementary reports and materials are submitted to the Secretariat in due time to be translated into the languages of the United Nations in time for distribution and consideration by the Committee.

General Recommendation No. 8 (Seventh session, 1988)\*

Implementation of article 8 of the Convention

accordance

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,  
Having considered the reports of States parties submitted in accordance with article 18 of the Convention,

accordance

Recommends that States parties take further direct measures in

with article 4 of the Convention to ensure the full implementation of  
men and article 8 of the Convention and to ensure to women on equal terms with  
Government at without any discrimination the oportunities to represent their  
the international level and to participate in the work of international  
organizations.

---

\* Contained in document A/43/38.

General Recommendation No. 9 (Eighth session, 1989)\*

Statistical data concerning the situation of women

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,

in order  
to the  
Convention,  
Considering that statistical information is absolutely necessary to understand the real situation of women in each of the States parties

Having observed that many of the States parties that present their reports for consideration by the Committee do not provide statistics,

that  
censuses  
such a  
both  
obtain  
they  
are interested.  
Recommends that States parties should make every effort to ensure their national statistical services responsible for planning national and other social and economic surveys formulate their questionnaires in way that data can be disaggregated according to gender, with regard to absolute numbers and percentages, so that interested users can easily information on the situation of women in the particular sector in which they are interested.

General Recommendation No. 10 (Eighth session, 1989)\*

Tenth anniversary of the adoption of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,

the  
Discrimination  
against Women,  
Considering that 18 December 1989 marks the tenth anniversary of the adoption of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of

proved to  
adopted  
Members,  
Considering further that in those 10 years the Convention has be one of the most effective instruments that the United Nations has to promote equality between the sexes in the societies of its States

Recalling general recommendation No. 6 (seventh session 1988) on effective national machinery and publicity,

adoption  
of the Convention, the States parties should consider:

1. Undertaking programmes including conferences and seminars to publicize the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women in the main languages of and providing information on the Convention in their respective countries;

---

\* Contained in document A/44/38.



the  
2. Inviting their national women's organizations to cooperate in  
publicity campaigns regarding the Convention and its implementation and  
encouraging non-governmental organizations at the national, regional and  
international levels to publicize the Convention and its implementation;

to  
3. Encouraging action to ensure the full implementation of the  
principles of the Convention, and in particular article 8, which relates  
the participation of women at all levels of activity of the United  
Nations and  
the United Nations system;

4. Requesting the Secretary-General to commemorate the tenth  
anniversary of the adoption of the Convention by publishing and  
disseminating,  
in cooperation with the specialized agencies, printed and other  
materials  
regarding the Convention and its implementation in all official  
languages of  
the United Nations, preparing television documentaries about the  
Convention,  
and making the necessary resources available to the Division for the  
Advancement of Women, Centre for Social Development and Humanitarian  
Affairs  
of the United Nations Office at Vienna, to prepare an analysis of the  
information provided by States parties in order to update and publish  
the  
report of the Committee (A/CONF.116/13), which was first published for  
the  
World Conference to Review and Appraise the Achievements of the United  
Nations  
Decade for Women: Equality, Development and Peace, held at Nairobi in  
1985.

General Recommendation No. 11 (Eighth session, 1989)

Technical advisory services for reporting obligations

the  
Women,  
The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,  
Bearing in mind that, as at 3 March 1989, 96 States had ratified  
Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against

second  
Taking into account the fact that by that date 60 initial and 19  
periodic reports had been received,

Noting that 36 initial and 36 second periodic reports were due by  
3 March 1989 and had not yet been received,

Welcoming the request in General Assembly resolution 43/115,  
paragraph 9,  
that the Secretary-General should arrange, within existing resources and  
services, taking into account the priorities of the programme of advisory  
further training courses for those countries experiencing the most  
serious  
difficulties in meeting their reporting obligations under international  
instruments on human rights,

Recommends to States parties that they should encourage, support  
and  
cooperate in projects for technical advisory services, including  
training  
seminars, to assist States parties on their request in fulfilling their  
reporting obligations under article 18 of the Convention.

General Recommendation No. 12 (Eighth session, 1989)

Violence against women

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,

require

Considering that articles 2, 5, 11, 12 and 16 of the Convention

social

the States parties to act to protect women against violence of any kind occurring within the family, at the workplace or in any other area of life,

Taking into account Economic and Social Council resolution 1988/27,

Recommends to the States parties that they should include in their periodic reports to the Committee information about:

incidence of  
abuses in

1. The legislation in force to protect women against the all kinds of violence in everyday life (including sexual violence, the family, sexual harassment at the workplace, etc.);

2. Other measures adopted to eradicate this violence;

victims of

3. The existence of support services for women who are the aggression or abuses;

against

4. Statistical data on the incidence of violence of all kinds women and on women who are the victims of violence.

General Recommendation No. 13 (Eighth session, 1989)\*

Equal remuneration for work of equal value

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,

concerning

Recalling International Labour Organisation Convention No. 100

which

Equal Remuneration for Men and Women Workers for Work of Equal Value, has been ratified by a large majority of States parties to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women,

periodic

Recalling also that it has considered 51 initial and 5 second reports of States parties since 1983,

\* Contained in document A/44/38.

even though the principle of equal remuneration for work of equal value has been accepted in the legislation of many countries, more remains to be done to ensure the application of that principle in practice, in order to overcome the gender-segregation in the labour market,

Recommends to the States parties to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women that:

1. In order to implement fully the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, those States parties that have not yet ratified ILO Convention No. 100 should be encouraged to do so;

2. They should consider the study, development and adoption of job evaluation systems based on gender-neutral criteria that would facilitate the comparison of the value of those jobs of a different nature, in which women presently predominate, with those jobs in which men presently predominate, and they should include the results achieved in their reports to the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women;

3. They should support, as far as practicable, the creation of implementation machinery and encourage the efforts of the parties to collective agreements, where they apply, to ensure the application of the principle of equal remuneration for work of equal value.

General Recommendation No. 14 (Ninth session, 1990)\*

Female circumcision

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,  
Concerned about the continuation of the practice of female circumcision and other traditional practices harmful to the health of women,

Noting with satisfaction that Governments, where such practices exist, national women's organizations, non-governmental organizations, specialized

Children's  
on  
of  
as  
and

agencies, such as the World Health Organization, the United Nations Fund, as well as the Commission on Human Rights and its Sub-Commission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities, remain seized of the issue having particularly recognized that such traditional practices as female circumcision have serious health and other consequences for women and children,

Traditional  
study

Noting with interest the study of the Special Rapporteur on Practices Affecting the Health of Women and Children, 1/ as well as the of the Special Working Group on Traditional Practices, 2/

---

\* Contained in document A/45/38 and Corrigendum.

identify and to combat practices that are prejudicial to the health and well-being of women and children,

and by Convinced that the important action that is being taken by women all interested groups needs to be supported and encouraged by Governments,

traditional and economic pressures which help to perpetuate harmful practices, such as Noting with grave concern that there are continuing cultural, female circumcision,

Recommends to States parties:

with a (a) That States parties take appropriate and effective measures could view to eradicating the practice of female circumcision. Such measures include:

or (i) The collection and dissemination by universities, medical nursing associations, national women's organizations or other bodies of basic data about such traditional practices;

local (ii) The support of women's organizations at the national and and levels working for the elimination of female circumcision other practices harmful to women;

religious and (iii) The encouragement of politicians, professionals, the community leaders at all levels including the media and arts to cooperate in influencing attitudes towards the eradication of female circumcision;

the (iv) The introduction of appropriate educational and training programmes and seminars based on research findings about problems arising from female circumcision;

public (b) That States parties include in their national health policies of health care. Such strategies could include the special responsibility harmful health personnel including traditional birth attendants to explain the

effects of female circumcision;

from (c) That States parties invite assistance, information and advice  
and the appropriate organizations of the United Nations system to support  
practices; assist efforts being deployed to eliminate harmful traditional

under (d) That States parties include in their reports to the Committee  
eliminate articles 10 and 12 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of  
Discrimination against Women information about measures taken to  
female circumcision.



General Recommendation No. 15 (Ninth session, 1990)\*

Avoidance of discrimination against women in national strategies for the prevention and control of acquired immunodeficiency syndrome (AIDS)

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,

Having considered information brought to its attention on the potential effects of both the global pandemic of acquired immunodeficiency syndrome (AIDS) and strategies to control it on the exercise of the rights of women,

Having regard to the reports and materials prepared by the World Health Organization and other United Nations organizations, organs and bodies in relation to human immunodeficiency virus (HIV), and, in particular, the note by the Secretary-General to the Commission on the Status of Women on the effects of AIDS on the advancement of women 3/ and the Final Document of the International Consultation on AIDS and Human Rights, held at Geneva from 26 to 28 July 1989, 4/

Noting World Health Assembly resolution WHA 41.24 on the avoidance of discrimination in relation to HIV-infected people and people with AIDS of 13 May 1988, resolution 1989/11 of the Commission on Human Rights on non-discrimination in the field of health, of 2 March 1989, and in particular the Paris Declaration on Women, Children and AIDS, of 30 November 1989,

Noting that the World Health Organization has announced that the theme of World Aids Day, 1 December 1990, will be "Women and Aids".

Recommends:

(a) That States parties intensify efforts in disseminating information to increase public awareness of the risk of HIV infection and AIDS, especially in women and children, and of its effects on them;

(b) That programmes to combat AIDS should give special attention to the rights and needs of women and children, and to the factors relating to

the reproductive role of women and their subordinate position in some societies which make them especially vulnerable to HIV infection;

in (c) That States parties ensure the active participation of women primary health care and take measures to enhance their role as care providers, health workers and educators in the prevention of infection with HIV;

12 of (d) That all States parties include in their reports under article the Convention information on the effects of AIDS on the situation of women and on the action taken to cater to the needs of those women who are infected and to prevent specific discrimination against women in response to AIDS.

---

\* Contained in document A/45/38.

General Recommendation No. 16 (Tenth session, 1991)

Unpaid women workers in rural and urban family enterprises\*

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,  
Bearing in mind articles 2 (c) and 11 (c), (d) and (e) of the  
Convention  
on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women and  
general  
concerning the  
situation of women,

Taking into consideration that a high percentage of women in the  
States  
parties work without payment, social security and social benefits in  
enterprises owned usually by a male member of the family,

Noting that the reports presented to the Committee on the  
Elimination of  
Discrimination against Women generally do not refer to the problem of  
unpaid  
women workers of family enterprises,

Affirming that unpaid work constitutes a form of women's  
exploitation  
that is contrary to the Convention,

Recommends that States parties:

(a) Include in their reports to the Committee information on the  
legal  
and social situation of unpaid women working in family enterprises;

(b) Collect statistical data on women who work without payment,  
social  
and  
security and social benefits in enterprises owned by a family member,  
include these data in their report to the Committee;

(c) Take the necessary steps to guarantee payment, social security  
and  
social benefits for women who work without such benefits in enterprises  
owned  
by a family member.

General Recommendation No. 17 (Tenth session, 1991)

Measurement and quantification of the unremunerated  
domestic activities of women and their recognition  
in the gross national product\*

The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,  
Bearing in mind article 11 of the Convention on the Elimination of

All

Forms of Discrimination against Women,

for the

Recalling paragraph 120 of the Nairobi Forward-looking Strategies  
Advancement of Women, 1/

---

\* Contained in document A/46/38.

unremunerated  
country,  
domestic activities of women, which contribute to development in each  
will help to reveal the de facto economic role of women,

for the  
formulation of further policies related to the advancement of women,

twenty-first  
the  
session, on the current revision of the System of National Accounts and  
development of statistics on women,

Recommends that States parties:

measure  
by  
spent  
(a) Encourage and support research and experimental studies to  
and value the unremunerated domestic activities of women; for example,  
conducting time-use surveys as part of their national household survey  
programmes and by collecting statistics disaggregated by gender on time  
on activities both in the household and on the labour market;

Convention on  
Nairobi  
national  
product;  
(b) Take steps, in accordance with the provisions of the  
the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women and the  
Forward-looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women, to quantify and  
include the unremunerated domestic activities of women in the gross

undertaken to  
activities of  
women in national accounts.  
(c) Include in their reports submitted under article 18 of the  
Convention information on the research and experimental studies  
measure and value unremunerated domestic activities, as well as on the  
progress made in the incorporation of the unremunerated domestic

General Recommendation No. 18 (Tenth session, 1991)

Disabled women\*

on the  
The Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women,  
Taking into consideration particularly article 3 of the Convention

Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women,

and  
women,  
Having considered more than 60 periodic reports of States parties,  
having recognized that they provide scarce information on disabled

a double  
discrimination linked to their special living conditions,  
Concerned about the situation of disabled women, who suffer from

for the  
Advancement of Women, 1/ in which disabled women are considered as a  
vulnerable group under the heading "areas of special concern",  
Recalling paragraph 296 of the Nairobi Forward-looking Strategies

---

\* Contained in document A/46/38.

Affirming its support for the World Programme of Action concerning Disabled Persons (1982), 2/

women in particular access to ensure  
that they can participate in all areas of social and cultural life.

General Recommendation No. 19 (Eleventh session, 1992): Violence against women\*

Background

inhibits men.  
1. Gender-based violence is a form of discrimination that seriously

their it  
2. In 1989, the Committee recommended that States should include in reports information on violence and on measures introduced to deal with (General recommendation 12, eighth session).

the articles of harassment the by its  
3. At its tenth session in 1991, it was decided to allocate part of the eleventh session to a discussion and study on article 6 and other the Convention relating to violence towards women and the sexual and exploitation of women. That subject was chosen in anticipation of the 1993 World Conference on Human Rights, convened by the General Assembly by its resolution 45/155 of 18 December 1990.

fundamental take  
4. The Committee concluded that not all the reports of States parties adequately reflected the close connection between discrimination against women, gender-based violence, and violations of human rights and freedoms. The full implementation of the Convention required States to take positive measures to eliminate all forms of violence against women.

laws regard violence.  
5. The Committee suggested to States parties that in reviewing their laws and policies, and in reporting under the Convention, they should have regard to the following comments of the Committee concerning gender-based violence.

General comments

The  
violence  
women  
sexual  
of  
violence.

6. The Convention in article 1 defines discrimination against women. definition of discrimination includes gender-based violence, that is, that is directed against a woman because she is a woman or that affects disproportionately. It includes acts that inflict physical, mental or harm or suffering, threats of such acts, coercion and other deprivations liberty. Gender-based violence may breach specific provisions of the Convention, regardless of whether those provisions expressly mention violence.

---

\* Contained in document A/47/38.



women  
or  
7. Gender-based violence, which impairs or nullifies the enjoyment by of human rights and fundamental freedoms under general international law under human rights conventions, is discrimination within the meaning of article 1 of the Convention. These rights and freedoms include:

(a) The right to life;

or  
degrading treatment or punishment;

in  
time of international or internal armed conflict;

(d) The right to liberty and security of person;

(e) The right to equal protection under the law;

(f) The right to equality in the family;

mental  
health;

(h) The right to just and favourable conditions of work.

8. The Convention applies to violence perpetrated by public authorities.

to  
breaching this Convention.

is  
2 (e),  
States  
against  
international  
for  
violations of  
9. It is emphasized, however, that discrimination under the Convention not restricted to action by or on behalf of Governments (see articles 2 (f) and 5). For example, under article 2 (e) the Convention calls on parties to take all appropriate measures to eliminate discrimination women by any person, organization or enterprise. Under general law and specific human rights covenants, States may also be responsible private acts if they fail to act with due diligence to prevent rights or to investigate and punish acts of violence, and for providing compensation.

Comments on specific articles of the Convention

Articles 2 and 3

under 10. Articles 2 and 3 establish a comprehensive obligation to eliminate discrimination in all its forms in addition to the specific obligations articles 5-16.

Articles 2 (f), 5 and 10 (c)

to men 11. Traditional attitudes by which women are regarded as subordinate or as having stereotyped roles perpetuate widespread practices involving violence or coercion, such as family violence and abuse, forced marriage, dowry deaths, acid attacks and female circumcision. Such prejudices and

control of women. The effect of such violence on the physical and mental integrity of women is to deprive them of the equal enjoyment, exercise and knowledge of human rights and fundamental freedoms. While this comment addresses mainly actual or threatened violence the underlying consequences of these forms of gender-based violence help to maintain women in subordinate roles and contribute to their low level of political participation and to their lower level of education, skills and work opportunities.

12. These attitudes also contribute to the propagation of pornography and the depiction and other commercial exploitation of women as sexual objects, rather than as individuals. This in turn contributes to gender-based violence.

#### Article 6

13. States parties are required by article 6 to take measures to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of the prostitution of women.

14. Poverty and unemployment increase opportunities for trafficking in women. In addition to established forms of trafficking there are new forms of sexual exploitation, such as sex tourism, the recruitment of domestic labour from developing countries to work in developed countries, and organized marriages between women from developing countries and foreign nationals. These practices are incompatible with the equal enjoyment of rights by women and with respect for their rights and dignity. They put women at special risk of violence and abuse.

15. Poverty and unemployment force many women, including young girls, into prostitution. Prostitutes are especially vulnerable to violence because their status, which may be unlawful, tends to marginalize them. They need the equal protection of laws against rape and other forms of violence.

16. Wars, armed conflicts and the occupation of territories often lead to increased prostitution, trafficking in women and sexual assault of women, which require specific protective and punitive measures.

#### Article 11

17. Equality in employment can be seriously impaired when women are subjected to gender-specific violence, such as sexual harassment in the workplace.

18. Sexual harassment includes such unwelcome sexually determined behaviour as physical contact and advances, sexually coloured remarks, showing pornography and sexual demands, whether by words or actions. Such conduct can be humiliating and may constitute a health and safety problem; it is discriminatory when the woman has reasonable ground to believe that her objection would disadvantage her in connection with her employment, including recruitment or promotion, or when it creates a hostile working environment.

#### Article 12

19. States parties are required by article 12 to take measures to ensure equal access to health care. Violence against women puts their health and lives at risk.

20. In some States there are traditional practices perpetuated by culture and tradition that are harmful to the health of women and children. These practices include dietary restrictions for pregnant women, preference for male children and female circumcision or genital mutilation.

Article 14

21. Rural women are at risk of gender-based violence because traditional attitudes regarding the subordinate role of women that persist in many rural communities. Girls from rural communities are at special risk of violence and sexual exploitation when they leave the rural community to seek employment in towns.

Article 16 (and article 5)

22. Compulsory sterilization or abortion adversely affects women's physical and mental health, and infringes the right of women to decide on the number and spacing of their children.

23. Family violence is one of the most insidious forms of violence against women. It is prevalent in all societies. Within family relationships of all ages are subjected to violence of all kinds, including battering, rape, other forms of sexual assault, mental and other forms of violence, which are perpetuated by traditional attitudes. Lack of economic independence forces many women to stay in violent relationships. The abrogation of their family responsibilities by men can be a form of violence, and coercion. These forms of violence put women's health at risk and impair their ability to participate in family life and public life on a basis of equality.

Specific recommendations

24. In light of these comments, the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women recommends:

(a) States parties should take appropriate and effective measures to

overcome all forms of gender-based violence, whether by public or private act;

and  
adequate  
Appropriate  
other

(b) States parties should ensure that laws against family violence abuse, rape, sexual assault and other gender-based violence give protection to all women, and respect their integrity and dignity. Appropriate protective and support services should be provided for victims. Gender-sensitive training of judicial and law enforcement officers and other public officials is essential for the effective implementation of the Convention;

and

(c) States parties should encourage the compilation of statistics and research on the extent, causes and effects of violence, and on the effectiveness of measures to prevent and deal with violence;

respect

(d) Effective measures should be taken to ensure that the media and promote respect for women;

extent  
women,  
that  
measures;

(e) States parties in their report should identify the nature and of attitudes, customs and practices that perpetuate violence against and the kinds of violence that result. They should report the measures they have undertaken to overcome violence, and the effect of those

and

(f) Effective measures should be taken to overcome these attitudes and practices. States should introduce education and public information programmes to help eliminate prejudices which hinder women's equality (recommendation No. 3, 1987);

overcome

(g) Specific preventive and punitive measures are necessary to trafficking and sexual exploitation;

all  
and  
in  
described;

(h) States parties in their reports should describe the extent of these problems and the measures, including penal provisions, preventive and rehabilitation measures, that have been taken to protect women engaged in prostitution or subject to trafficking and other forms of sexual exploitation. The effectiveness of these measures should also be

(i) Effective complaints procedures and remedies, including compensation, should be provided;

sexual  
other

(j) States parties should include in their reports information on harassment, and on measures to protect women from sexual harassment and forms of violence of coercion in the workplace;

victims of  
violence,

(k) States parties should establish or support services for family violence, rape, sex assault and other forms of gender-based including refuges, specially trained health workers, rehabilitation and counselling;

and  
circumcision

(l) States parties should take measures to overcome such practices and should take account of the Committee's recommendation on female (recommendation No. 14) in reporting on health issues;

prevent  
women are

(m) States parties should ensure that measures are taken to coercion in regard to fertility and reproduction, and to ensure that not forced to seek unsafe medical procedures such as illegal abortion

because

of lack of appropriate services in regard to fertility control;

these

(n) States parties in their reports should state the extent of problems and should indicate the measures that have been taken and their effect;

violence

are

(o) States parties should ensure that services for victims of violence are accessible to rural women and that where necessary special services are provided to isolated communities;

and

of

(p) Measures to protect them from violence should include training employment opportunities and the monitoring of the employment conditions of domestic workers;



extent  
for and  
to

(q) States parties should report on the risks to rural women, the and nature of violence and abuse to which they are subject, their need access to support and other services and the effectiveness of measures overcome violence;

(r) Measures that are necessary to overcome family violence should include:

case

(i) Criminal penalties where necessary and civil remedies in of domestic violence;

the

(ii) Legislation to remove the defence of honour in regard to assault or murder of a female family member;

family  
rehabilitation

(iii) Services to ensure the safety and security of victims of violence, including refuges, counselling and programmes;

violence;

(iv) Rehabilitation programmes for perpetrators of domestic

abuse has

(v) Support services for families where incest or sexual occurred;

violence and  
have

(s) States parties should report on the extent of domestic sexual abuse, and on the preventive, punitive and remedial measures that been taken;

that  
gender-based

(t) That States parties should take all legal and other measures are necessary to provide effective protection of women against violence, including, inter alia:

civil  
against  
and  
in

(i) Effective legal measures, including penal sanctions, remedies and compensatory provisions to protect women all kinds of violence, including, inter alia, violence abuse in the family, sexual assault and sexual harassment

the workplace;

education  
status

(ii) Preventive measures, including public information and programmes to change attitudes concerning the roles and of men and women;

(iii) Protective measures, including refuges, counselling, rehabilitation and support services for women who are the victims of violence or who are at risk of violence;

on the

(u) That States parties should report on all forms of gender-based violence, and that such reports should include all available data on the incidence of each form of violence, and on the effects of such violence women who are victims;

on the  
overcome

(v) That the reports of States parties should include information legal, preventive and protective measures that have been taken to violence against women, and on the effectiveness of such measures.

to the General recommendation No. 20 (Eleventh session, 1992): Reservations  
Convention\*

which 1. The Committee recalled the decision of the Fourth Meeting of States parties on reservations to the Convention with regard to article 28.2, was welcomed in General recommendation No. 4 of the Committee.

the 2. The Committee recommended that, in connection with preparations for World Conference on Human Rights in 1993, States parties should:

human (a) Raise the question of the validity and the legal effect of reservations to the Convention in the context of reservations to other rights treaties;

(b) Reconsider such reservations with a view to strengthening the implementation of all human rights treaties;

Convention (c) Consider introducing a procedure on reservations to the comparable with that of other human rights treaties;

---

\* Contained in document A/47/38.

Annex I

LIST OF GENERAL COMMENTS ADOPTED BY THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMITTEE\*

Thirteenth session (1981)

- |                     |  |
|---------------------|--|
| - General comment 1 | <u>Reporting obligation</u>                            |
| - General comment 2 | <u>Reporting guidelines</u>                            |
| - General comment 3 | <u>Article 2: Implementation at the national level</u> |
| - General comment 4 | <u>Article 3</u>                                       |
| - General comment 5 | <u>Article 4</u>                                       |

Sixteenth session (1982)

- |                     |                     |
|---------------------|---------------------|
| - General comment 6 | <u>Article 6</u>    |
| - General comment 7 | <u>Article 7**</u>  |
| - General comment 8 | <u>Article 9</u>    |
| - General comment 9 | <u>Article 10**</u> |

Nineteenth session (1983)

- |                      |                   |
|----------------------|-------------------|
| - General comment 10 | <u>Article 19</u> |
| - General comment 11 | <u>Article 20</u> |

---

\* For the text of the general comments already adopted by the Committee, see ibid., Thirty-sixth Session, Supplement No. 40 (A/36/40), annex VII; ibid., Thirty-seventh Session, Supplement No. 40 (A/37/40), annex V; ibid., Thirty-eighth Session, Supplement No. 40 (A/38/40), annex VI; ibid., Thirty-ninth Session, Supplement No. 40 (A/39/40 and Corr.1 and 2), annex VI; ibid., Fortieth Session, Supplement No. 40 (A/40/40), annex VI; ibid., Forty-first Session, Supplement No. 40 (A/41/40), annex VI; ibid., Forty-third Session, Supplement No. 40 (A/43/40), annex VI; ibid., Forty-fourth Session, Supplement No. 40 (A/44/40), annex VI and ibid., Forty-fifth Session, Supplement No. 40 (A/45/40), annex VI. Also issued in documents CCPR/C/21/Rev.1 and CCPR/C/21/Rev.1/Add.1, 2 and 3.

and 21,           \*\* General comments 7 and 9 were replaced by General comments 20  
respectively.

Twenty-first session (1984)

- General comment 12                    Article 1
- General comment 13                    Article 14

Twenty-third session (1984)

- General comment 14                    Article 6

Twenty-seventh session (1986)

- General comment 15                    The position of aliens under the

Covenant

Thirty-second session (1988)

- General comment 16                    Article 17

Thirty-fifth session (1989)

- General comment 17                    Article 24

Thirty-seventh session (1989)

- General comment 18                    Non-discrimination

Thirty-ninth session (1990)

- General comment 19                    Article 23

Forty-fourth session (1992)

- General comment 20                    Article 7
- General comment 21                    Article 10

Annex II

LIST OF GENERAL COMMENTS ADOPTED BY THE COMMITTEE  
ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS

Third session (1989)

- General comment 1

Reporting by States parties

Fourth session (1990)

- General comment 2

measures

International technical assistance  
(art. 22 of the Covenant)

Fifth session (1990)

- General comment 3

obligations

The nature of States parties  
(art. 2, para. 1 of the Covenant)

Sixth session (1991)

- General comment 4

11 (1)

The right to adequate housing (art.  
of the Covenant)

Annex III

LIST OF GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS ADOPTED BY THE COMMITTEE  
ON THE ELIMINATION OF RACIAL DISCRIMINATION

Fifth session (1972)

4 of - General recommendation I States parties' obligations (art. the Convention)

- General recommendation II States parties obligations

Sixth session (1972)

- General recommendation III Reporting by States parties

Eighth session (1973)

1 of - General recommendation IV Reporting by States parties (art. the Convention)

Fifteenth session (1977)

7 of - General recommendation V Reporting by States parties (art. the Convention)

Twenty-fifth session (1982)

- General recommendation VI Overdue reports

Thirty-second session (1985)

- General recommendation VII Implementation of article 4 of the Convention

Thirty-eighth session (1990)

the - General recommendation VIII Interpretation and Application of article 1, paragraphs 1 and 4, of Convention

1 of - General recommendation IX Application of article 8, paragraph the Convention

Thirty-ninth session (1991)

- General recommendation X Technical assistance



Annex IV

LIST OF GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS ADOPTED BY THE COMMITTEE  
ON THE ELIMINATION OF DISCRIMINATION AGAINST WOMEN

Fifth session (1986)

- General recommendation No. 1 Reporting by States parties

Sixth session (1987)

- General recommendation No. 2 Reporting by States parties
- General recommendation No. 3 Education and Public Campaigns
- General recommendation No. 4 Reservations

Information

Seventh session (1988)

- General recommendation No. 5 Temporary Special Measures
- General recommendation No. 6 Effective national machinery  
publicity
- General recommendation No. 7 Resources
- General recommendation No. 8 Implementation of article 8 of  
Convention

and

the

Eighth session (1989)

- General recommendation No. 9 Statistical data concerning the  
situation of women
- General recommendation No. 10 Tenth anniversary of the  
the Convention on the  
All Forms of Discrimination  
Women
- General recommendation No. 11 Technical advisory services for  
reporting obligations
- General recommendation No. 12 Violence against women
- General recommendation No. 13 Equal remuneration for work of

adoption of

Elimination of

against

equal

value

Ninth session (1990)

- General recommendation No. 14

Female Circumcision

against  
for the  
acquired  
(AIDS)

- General recommendation No. 15

Avoidance of discrimination  
women in national strategies  
prevention and control of  
immunodeficiency syndrome

Tenth session (1991)

and

- General recommendation No. 16

Unpaid women workers in rural  
urban family enterprises

of the  
activities of  
the

- General recommendation No. 17

Measurement and quantification  
unremunerated domestic  
women and their recognition in  
gross national product

- General recommendation No. 18

Disabled women

Eleventh session (1992)

- General recommendation No. 19

Violence Against Women

- General recommendation No. 20

Reservations to the Convention

-----